## NOTICE OF APPEAL FROM A FINAL ORDER OF THE JACKSONVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION

## I. INSTRUCTIONS

As provided in $\S 656.140$, Ordinance Code, any person with standing may appeal a Jacksonville Planning Commission final order with respect to an application for zoning exception, variance, or waiver to the City Council. An appeal must be filed within 21 calendar days after the order granting, granting with conditions, or denying an application is signed by the Commission Chairman. To appeal a Commission final order, complete and submit this form to the Legislative Services Division, Suite 430, City Hall-St. James, 117 W. Duval Street, Jacksonville, Florida 32202 with the supporting documents (see Section III) and appropriate fees (see Section IV). A copy of the order and the list of persons who testified before or wrote to the Commission about the application (see Sec. III (1) and (4)) may be obtained from the Secretary to the Planning Commission at the Planning and Development Department, $3^{\text {rd }}$ Floor, Edward Ball Building, 2814 North Hogan Street, Suite 300, Jacksonville, Florida 32202. For questions regarding the Appeal process, please contact the Secretary to the Planning Commission at (904) 255-7800.

## II. NOTICE OF APPEAL

I, __Yahya Shabazz $\qquad$ , hereby file this Notice of Appeal from the final order of PRINT NAME CLEARLY

WLD-22-13 the City of Jacksonville Planning Commission concerning Exception/Variance/Waiver Number $\qquad$ .

I am (Please circle one):
(a) The person who filed the application for the zoning exception, variance, or waiver;
(b)
 A person who owns, lives, or operates a business on property within 350 feet of the property which has been granted or denied a zoning exception, variance, or waiver;
(c) $\square$

A person, other than a member of the City Council, who provided a qualifying written statement or who testified before the Planning Commission. The statement must have been in writing, expressing a position on the merits of the application for zoning exception, variance, or waiver, other than a petition, such as a letter, a memo or an e-mail, containing a reference to the specific application number and the name and mailing address of the person making the statement. The statement must have been specifically addressed to the City's Chief, Current Planning Division, or any member of the Planning Commission (with a copy to the Chief, Comprehensive Planning Division), and which was delivered to and received by the City's Planning and Development Department by hand delivery, mail, facsimile, or e-mail at least two working days before the public hearing at which the Commission took final action on the application, or which is read into the record at the public hearing, or distributed to the Commission at the hearing with a copy to the Commission's staff.

## III. SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS

To complete your Notice of Appeal, you must submit the following documents with this form:
(1) A copy of the Final Order you are appealing.
(2) If you circled II(c) above, you must provide a statement of your interest sufficient to show how you are or will be adversely affected by the Commission's decision. Please provide this statement in the space below:
(3) A description of the specific error(s) you believe the Commission committed. Please provide this description in the space below:

```
See Exhibit "A".
```

> If you need additional space, please attach a separate sheet.
(4) The list of the persons (names and complete addresses), certified by the Secretary of the Planning Commission, who testified before the Commission about the application, or who provided a qualifying written statement to the Commission about the application. (You must pay a $\$ 7.00$ notification fee for each person on the list.)
(5) A list of the persons (names and complete addresses), certified by the Secretary of the Planning Commission, who own real property within three hundred and fifty feet of the boundaries of the land which is the subject of the appeal, and if the appeal concerns an application for a waiver of the minimum distance requirements from a church or school for a liquor license, the list shall include all churches and schools within one thousand five hundred feet identified pursuant to Section 656.804. (You must pay a $\$ 7.00$ notification fee for each person on the list.)

## IV. FILING AND NOTIFICATION FEES

Section 656.147, Ordinance Code, requires persons appealing Final Orders to pay filing and notification fees. These fees must be paid at the time you file your Notice of Appeal with the Legislative Services Division or your Appeal will not be accepted. You may include the filing and notification fees in one payment. Make checks payable to TAX COLLECTOR.

## Filing Fee: $\quad \$ 1,161.00$

## Notification Fee: $\quad \$ 7.00$ for each notification.

V. Contact Information

Name (Printed):
Jessica Cappock Attn: Yahya Shabazz 4655 Salisbury Road
Address:
Jacksonville, FL 32256

Daytime Phone:
904-822-8001

Evening Phone:
E-mail address:
904-822-8001
jcappock@cobbgonzalez.com

## VI. CERTIFICATION (Please read, sign and date the following statement)

I have read and understand the information contained in this Notice of Appeal. I hereby certify that I have provided all the information required under $\S 656.141$, Ordinance Code, and I understand that if this Notice of Appeal is incomplete, my appeal will not processed until it is complete, and that it may be rejected for incompleteness. I further certify that all my statements in this Notice of Appeal gre true andedreft to the best of my knowledge.


## EXHIBIT

## "A"

CobB
GoNZALEZ

VIA HAND DELIVERY

Attn: Legislative Services Division
City Hall-St. James
117 W. Duval Street
Suite 430
Jacksonville, FL 32202

## Re: Yahya Shabazz's Appeal of Final Order on Application No WLD-22-13

Legislative Services Division:
In response to the Final Order of WLD-22-13, ("Final Order") of the Jacksonville Planning Commission ("Planning Commission"), pursuant to Section 656.140 of the City of Jacksonville Ordinance Code, Yahya Shabazz, ("Mr. Shabazz"), appeals the Final Order and in support states the following:

In its Final Order, the Planning Commission approves with condition, Royal House Liquors, Inc.'s ("Liquors") Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-22-13, ("Application"), filed by Anwar's Properties, Inc. ("Owner"), owner of real property located at 5522 Soutel Drive, Jacksonville, FL 32219, on behalf of Liquors. The City Council Committee should reverse the Final Order, because (1) the Application misrepresents Section 656.133(a) and therefore unduly prejudiced the vote of the King/Soutel Advisory Board; (2) the Application misrepresents Section 656.133(a) and therefore unduly prejudiced the vote of the Planning Commission ("Commission"); (3) the Property is within 500 feet of Friendship Missionary Baptist Church (the "Church") in violation of Section 656.805; (4) prior Planning Commission precedent, final orders WLD-12-05, WLD-19-13, and WLD-19-24 are in favor of denial of the Application; (5) Liquors will be directly visible along the line of measurement as defined in Section 656.806; and (6) the detriment to the community outweighs the benefit of the approval of the Application.

This Appeal is filed after the following sequence of events. The Owner filed the Application on March 4 ${ }^{\text {th }}$, 2022. Although the Application was filed in March 2022, the Application submitted was a prior version, last updated in 2017 and a misrepresentation of the current applicable version of Section 656.113(a). Multiple advisory boards reviewed the Application, including the Northwest Citizens Planning Advisory Committee ("NWCPAC") and the King/Soutel Advisory Board ("KSAB"). On April 44, 2022, the NWCPAC issued its opposition to the approval of the Application. The KSAB however voted in favor of the approval of the Application, largely based upon the outdated compulsory language in the Application.

On April $7^{\text {th }}, 2022$, the Commission reviewed the Application and heard community input and discussion at the Planning Commission Meeting ("First Meeting"). The First Meeting resulted in a four (4) to three (3) vote in favor of approval of the Application, however fell short of the

# Legislative Services Division 

May 11, 2022
Page 2
affirmative five (5) vote requirement. For that reason, the Application was again reviewed at the April 21 ${ }^{\text {st }}, 2022$, Planning Commission Meeting ("Second Meeting"). At that meeting, the Planning Commission, in a five (5) to three (3) vote, voted in favor of approval of the Application. Mr. Shabazz files this Appeal in response to the above.

## A. The Application Misrepresents Section 656.133

The Application, submitted on March $4^{\text {th }}, 2022$, attached herein, pages 65-68 of the Appeal Packet, includes a last updated date of January $10^{\text {th }}, 2017$. The Application date is significant because the criteria language included in the Application was no longer applicable at the time of Application submission. Particularly, the Application criteria requires that:

Section 656.11(a)1 through 5, Ordinance Code, provides that, with respect to action upon Applications for Waivers, the Planning Commission shall grant a waiver for minimum distance requirements from a church or school for a liquor license, if there exist one or more circumstances which negate the necessity for compliance with the distance requirements.... (Emphasis added).

Despite the foregoing language in the Application, and used for the Planning Commission and respective advisory board's review, Section 656.133(a) actually requires that:

The Waiver for minimum distance requirements from a church or school for a liquor license location may be granted if there exist one or more circumstances which negate the necessity for compliance with the distance requirements.... (Emphasis added).

The significance of Liquor and Owner's misrepresentation in the outdated Application submittal is substantial. While pursuant to Section 656.133(a) the Planning Commission and respective advisory board's have the discretion to weigh their options in making a decision on approval of an application, the outdated criteria as referenced in the Application does not allow for that discretion. Instead, under the outdate criteria, the Planning Commission merely acts as fact finder, bound to approve if any of the exempting criteria is met.

The foregoing misrepresentation was discussed at length in the First and Second Meetings and referenced as largely to blame for KSAB's recommendation to approve the Application. At the Second Meeting, Ms. Cullins-Hopkins, referring to the KSAB, stated that "we were bamboozled by the application we received that used the word 'shall' and not 'may'. And that's the only reason why the advisory board recommended the passage. The community does not want another liquor store." (emphasis added) (Second Meeting Transcript p. 188). The Planning Commission's reliance on the outdated Application language, together with reliance on KSAB's recommendation, with an improper basis pursuant to the misrepresented ordinance code language,


Phone: (904) 822-8001 |4655 Salisbury Road, Suite 200, Jacksonville, FL 32256 | www.cobbgonzalez.com
as such, renders the Final Order improper. The Planning Commission's vote was taken based upon a detrimentally flawed KSAB recommendation, rooted in the misrepresented language on the outdated Application.

## B. The Property is Within 500 feet of the Church in Violation of Section 656.805

Section $656.805(b)$ limits the distance for on and off premises consumption of alcohol, beer, and/or wine, requiring that " $[t]$ here shall not be less than 500 feet from an established school or church for the off-premises consumption of alcoholic beverages, including beer and wine...." Pursuant to Section 656.806, "distance shall be measured by following a straight line from the nearest point of the building or portion of the building used as part of the proposed location to the nearest point of the grounds used as part of the church, school facilities, or adult entertainment facility." (emphasis added).

While there was much discussion regarding the measurement from the Church grounds to the proposed Liquors store, the language is clear. Attorney Harden, on behalf of the Owner and Liquors compared the measurement here to an opinion written by Fred Franklin in which the court held that "it's the opinion of this office, that mere ownership of property of that church is not sufficient to render vacant property grounds as used by the established church." At the Second Meeting, Mr. Harden made a bold claim, stating that "the facts in that case were similar. That particular church had 52 acres between the facility and the church. And they claimed that whole 52 acres." (Second Meeting Transcript p. 239-240). Moreover, Mr. Harden defined "grounds" through the same opinion as "an area of land designated for a particular purpose, the land surrounding or forming part of the building." (Second Meeting Transcript p. 239).

Clearly the case upon which the Owners and Liquors relies is distinguishable from the facts in this case. A 52-acre unused parcel is hardly analogous to the Church grounds in this action. Here the Church grounds are directly attached and extend outward from the Church building itself. Most importantly, the use of the Church grounds, extending through its legal property perimeter, is set aside for a specific purpose. The Church regularly holds organized church activity on the grounds adjacent to the Property, such as youth events, family events, and even church services throughout the year. As a result of the Covid-19 pandemic, the grounds have become an even more integral part of the Church. There is no doubt that this land does not serve as a mere buffer, but is for the regular use of the Church and its members in furtherance of their mission in the community.

The next distinction is the starting point of measurement from the Property. Under Section 656.806, as referenced above, measurement requires a "straight line from the nearest point of the building...." Here, there is a distance of 401 feet between the Property and the Church grounds, used regularly for worship and youth activities. Therefore, under Sections 656.805(b) and 656.806, the Property is within 500 feet of the Church and approval of the Application is improper.


Phone: (904) 822-8001|4655 Salisbury Road, Suite 200, Jacksonville, FL 32256 | www.cobbgonzalez.com

## C. The Prospective Liquors Store will be Directly Visible from the Church

In the Report of the Planning and Development Department Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License WLD-22-13, (the "Report"), the Planning Commission answered that the "front door of the license location is not visible from the Greater New Hope Missionary Baptist Church.... The Zoning Code requires the measurement be from the proposed business to the nearest property line of the church. However, the nearest church property is an undeveloped grassy knoll.... Additionally, to drive or walk to the license location is a distance of 1,000 feet via Soutel Drive then along New Kings Road."

The foregoing language is littered with errors of fact and application of the zoning code. First and foremost, as referenced throughout the First and Second Meeting transcripts, attached maps, and this Appeal, the church appurtenant to the Property is Friendship Missionary Baptist Church, not Greater New Hope Missionary Baptist Church. Moreover, looking at Section 656.806, and even the language as cited from the Report, the visible line of site is to follow the line of measurement as laid out in detail in Section C of this Appeal above. With that being said, it is not from the front door, nor to the actual church building, but, instead, whether the Property, where the alcoholic beverages are sold is visible from the Church grounds, which is clearly the case here. The sale and consumption of alcohol is by nature not limited to the front door of a liquor store building but instead extends throughout the premises.

## D. Prior Planning Commission Precedent, Final Orders WLD-12-05, WLD-19-13, and WLD-19-24 are in Favor of Denial of the Application

In the WLD-19-13 Report (attached herein as Appeal Exhibit "A"), denying an application requesting a reduction from 500 feet to 400 feet from a church for a proposed liquor store, nearly identical to this action, the Staff recommended that "Planning Commission uphold the precedent previously established with WLD-12-05 and promote more transitional and neighborhoodfriendly uses that will complement the abutting residential properties...." (emphasis added). The Staff made this recommendation to deny, adopted in the Planning Commission's final order, despite a finding that the proposed liquor store would not be directly visible from the church. While Mr. Shabazz disagrees that the Property is not directly visible from the Church, pursuant to WLD-19-13, this should have no determinative value on the decision for approval of the Application.

Moreover, in the WLD-19-13 Report, the Staff recognized a "similar liquor location directly across the street from the subject property...." but ultimately determined that this finding was in favor of denial, not approval, stating that "granting the proposed waiver at this location will unduly promote a saturation of liquor license locations within the Moncrief commercial node and further exacerbate intensive commercial uses that conflict with the $29^{\text {th }}$ and Chase Neighborhood Action Plan." Here, in the KingSoutel Crossing Community Redevelopment Plan, 2017 Update, one of the strategic objectives, in response to the high rate of crime incidence in the area is to


Legislative Services Division
May 11, 2022
Page 5
"support innovative team policing and explore other avenues to leverage resources to creatively address these issues." In fact, the KingSoutel Crossing Community Redevelopment Plan, 2017 Update, dedicates numerous pages to Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design. Surely an additional liquor store cannot be aligned with this objective of the community.

In addition to the WLD-19-13 Report, the WLD-19-24 Report (attached herein as Appeal Exhibit "B"), denying an application requesting a reduction from 500 feet to 150 feet from a church for a proposed liquor store, the Staff stated that the "proposed waiver of liquor distance will not promote economic viability in the... neighborhood." The Final Order should be denied in line with the foregoing final orders.

## E. The Detriment to the Community Outweighs the Benefit in Favor of Approval of the Application

Under the current version of Section 656.133(a), the Commission did have, and now under Sections 656.133(a) and 656.140, the City Council Committee does have, the benefit of discretion in its decision to reverse or remand the Final Order. With this discretion, the Planning Commission was able to weigh the detriment to the community against the benefit of the approval of the Application. From a cursory review of the First and Second Meeting transcripts, the support in the community against the approval of the Application is significant, with nearly sixty (60) initial statements made at the hearing and one hundred and sixty (160) signatures on the petition against the approval. The issue has been one riddled with news coverage and an ongoing stream of concern and outcry from the affected community, of which Mr. Shabazz is a member.

The Crime Data, (attached herein as Appeal Exhibit "C") from November $12{ }^{\text {th }}, 2021$ through the current date, a period of merely six (6) months, shows thirteen significant crimes, including, but not limited to, a murder and numerous armed burglaries and robberies with a deadly weapon. The Property is clearly a high crime area, that will only be exasperated by the approval of the improper Application as discussed at length above.

Moreover, the community expressed its growing distress regarding the close proximity to not only S.A. Hull Elementary School but also to the school bus stop located across the street from the Property. Numerous speakers voiced their concern for the adverse effect of the approval upon elementary age children within the community. Particularly, Warren Jones stated in the First Meeting, regarding having a liquor store open during school and bus hours, that it was "a major concern for us, having kids wait there in the morning and - to catch a bus and looking at a liquor store." (First Meeting Transcript p. 60). Another speaker, Dana Kriznar, the deputy superintendent of Duval County Public Schools, stated that "[ t$]$ he students will have to walk down Soutel on the same side of the street as the liquor store because the crosswalk...." (First Meeting Transcript p. 69). The benefit to the elementary age children within the community as a result of denial of the Application, coupled together with the aforementioned community concerns, such as crime rates within the neighborhood, and overall community support is in favor of reversal of the Final Order.


## Legislative Services Division

May 11, 2022
Page 6

Therefore, pursuant to the foregoing reasons, reversal, and in the alternative remand, of the Final Order is proper.

On behalf of our client, we thank you for the time and attention you give to this serious matter. Please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned if we may be of further assistance.

## Very Respectfully,



## JAC

Enclosures:
Appeal Exhibits "A"-"C"
Notice of Appeal
Appeal Packet
cc: Clients (via email)

Phone: (904) 822-8001 |4655 Salisbury Road, Suite 200, Jacksonville, FL 32256 | www.cobbgonzalez.com

## APPEAL PACKET

## APPEAL EXHIBIT

"A"

IN RE: The Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location of

BANNER LIQUOR, INC.

## ORDER DENYING APPLICATION FOR ZONING WAIVER <br> OF MIINIMUM DISTANCE REOUIREMENTS FOR LIOUOR LICENSE LOCATION WLD-19-13

This matter came to be heard upon the Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-19-13 filed by the Malih Properties, LLC, the owner of certain real property located at 4250 Moncrief Road, on behalf of Banner Liquor, Inc., seeking a waiver to reduce the required minimum distance between a liquor license location to a church or school from 500 feet to 400 feet in the CCG-2 Zoning District.

Having duly considered both the testimonial and documentary evidence presented at the public hearing on May 23, 2019, including the Report of the Planning and Development Department on Application WLD-19-13 and all attachments thereto ("Staff Report"), a copy of which is altached as Exhibit "A", the Planning Commission of the City of Jacksonville hereby adopts and incorporates herein the recommendations of the Staff Report, and,

## FINDS AND DETERMINES:

1. That the applicant has complied with all application requirements set forth in Section 656.133 of the Zoning Code.
2. That the land which is the subject of application WLD-19-13 is owned by the Malih Properties, LLC. A copy of the legal description of the subject property is attached as part of the Exhibit " $A$ " and incorporated herein by reference.
3. That substantial competent evidence fails to demonstrate that the application WLD-19-13 meets, to the extent applicable, the standards and criteria set forth in Section 656.133(a) of the Zoning Code.

NOW THEREFORE, it is ORDERED by the Planning Commission:

1. Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-19-13 is hereby DENIED.

Executed this 23rd day of May, 2019.

## FORM APPROVED:



Assistant General Counsel



Copies to:
Zach Miller, Esquire
501 Riverside Avenue, Suite 901
Jacksonville, FL 32202
Agent
Malih Properties, LLC
11399 Glen Laurel Oaks Circle
Jacksonville, FL 32257
Owner

NOTICE: This Order does not become final until the expiration of the twenty-one (21) day appeal period provided in the Zoning Code.

# REPORT OF THE PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT <br> APPLICATION FOR WAIVER OF MINIMIUM DISTANCE REQUIREMENTS <br> FOR LIQUOR LICENSE LOCATION WLD-19-13 

MAY 23, 2019

| Location: | 4250 Moncrief Road |
| :--- | :--- |
| Real Estate Number: | $085106-0000$ |
| Waiver Sought: | Reduce required minimum distance between a <br> liquor license location to a church/school from 500 <br> feet to 400 feet |
| Current Zoning District: | Commercial Community General-2 (CCG-2) |
| Current Land Use Category: | Community General Commercial (CGC) |
| Planning District: | Urban Core, District 1 |
| Agent: | Zach Miller, Esq. <br> 501 Riverside Avenue, Suite 901 <br> Jacksonville, Florida 32202 |
| Owner: | Malih Properties, LLC |
|  | I1399 Glen Laurel Oaks Circle <br> Jacksonville, Florida 32257 |
| Staff Recominendation: | DENY |

## GENERAL INFORMATION

Application or Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-19-13 seeks to reduce the required minimum distance between an existing alcohol package sales store and the Harmony Missionary Baptist Church from 500 feet to 400 feet. The agent indicates the existing liquor store at 4220 Moncrief Road will relocate to 4250 Moncrief Road if the application is approved.

In 2018, a waiver of liquor distance was applied for on the same address. The applicant later withdrew the application.

A waiver of liquor distance was applied for in March 2016 for 4220 Moncrief Road. The Current Planning Division was not in support, however the Planning Commission granted the waiver with the following conditions.

- The package store shall not be open for business before 12:00 noon on Sundays.
- A six foot tall, $95 \%$ opaque fence shall be constructed along the southem property line.

It does not appear the establishment opened for business.
The property is located along a commercial corridor within the boundaries of the 29th and Chase Neighborhood Action Plan (NAP) area. In conjunction with other uses typically found in CCG-2, the intensity of a proposed liquor store raises an immediate conflict with the overall goals of the NAP and its pursuit of "viable revitalization strategies for the community" and "providing retail and neighborhood services that invest in the community."

The Plan pointed to the fact that a majority of Moncrief Road is zoned Commercial Community General-2 (CCG-2), the most intensive commercial zoning district and recommended zoning changes for the Moncrief Road corridor. CCG-2 is appropriate along arterial roadways, however Moncrief Road is a collector roadway and the appropriate zoning is Commercial Neighborhood (CN) or Commercial Community General-1 (CCG-1). The Therefore, the proposed waiver is inconsistent with the 29th and Chase Neighborhood Action Plan because it will permit the commercial intensification and sale of alcohol less than 500 feet from a church, which inherently conflicts with the economic goals and objectives outlined in the NAP.

## DEFINITION

According to Section 656.1601 of the Zoning Code, the term waiver means a relaxation of the Zoning Code minimum distance requirements for liquor license locations, pursuant to Section 656.805 of the Zoning Code, and for minimum street frontage, pursuant to Section 656.407 of the Zoning Code. Waivers are authorized to be granted by the Planning Commission pursuant to the criteria set forth in Section 656.133 of the Zoning Code.

## STANDARDS, CRITERIA AND FINDINGS

Pursuant to the provisions of Section 656.133 of the Zoning Code, a waiver of minimum distance requirements for liquor license location may be granted if the Planning Commission makes a positive finding based on substantial, competent evidence that the application meets one or more of the following criteria:

1) Is the commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverage use of a lesser intensity than the commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverage use which previously existed; e.g., there has been a reduction in the number of seats or square footage or type of license?

No. The location will operate at a higher intensity than the previous uses, which was a restaurant. The applicant wishes to intensify the use to a commercial establishment with a 4COP (beer, wine and distilled liquor consumed on premises) license.

Given the current saturation of liquor licenses within the vicinity ( 4211 Moncrief Road convenience store with 2COP; 4220 Moncrief Road - internet café with 4COP), Staff recommends Planning Commission uphold the precedent previously established with WLD-1205 and promote more transitional and neighborhood-friendly uses that will complement the abutting residential properties situated along the periphery of Moncrief Road.

## 2) Is the alcoholic beverage use designed to be an integral part of a mixed planned unit development?

No. The surrounding neighborhood was platted as a single-family subdivision (Moncrief Heights) in 1912. Some lots along Moncrief were subsequently subjected to commercial development without regard to protection of the surrounding residential character and are currently designated CCG-2. The sale of alcoholic beverages at this location is not designed to be an integral part of a mixed Planned Unit Development. Additionally, the site abuts single-family residences and lacks the uncomplimentary landscape buffer provisions of Part 12.
3) Is the alcoholic beverage use to be located within a shopping center with an aggregate gross leasable area of 50,000 square feet or more, inclusive of all out parcels, and meets the definition of a Restaurant as defined in Section 656.805?

No. While the proposed alcoholic beverage use will be located within a shopping center, the aggregate gross leasable area of that shopping center is less than 50,000 square feet and the alcoholic beverage use will not be part of a bona fide restaurant.
4) Is the alcoholic beverage use directly visible along the line of measurement defined in s.656.806 and physically separated from a church or school, thereby negating the distance requirement as a result of the extra travel time?

Yes. The proposed will be physically separated by other building structures and will not be directly visible along the line of measurement.

No, the alcoholic beverage use is not directly visible from the church noted in the attached liquor distance survey.
5) Are there are other existing liquor license locations of a similar nature in the immediate vicinity of the proposed location; provided, however, that no waiver shall be granted pursuant to this criterion if the proposed liquor license location is closer to the church or school than other existing locations?

Yes. There is a similar liquor license location directly across the street from the subject property at 4211 Moncrief Road (WLD-12-05). Known as "M \& A Foodmart," the store currently holds a 2APS (beer and wine package sales) but has also requested a license change to 4COP with

WLD-12-05-which was denied by Planning Commission because it is located closer to a church. Moreover, granting the proposed waiver at this location will unduly promote a saturation of liquor license locations within the Moncrief commercial node and further exacerbate intensive commercial uses that conflict with the 29th and Chase Neighborhood Action Plan.

No, there are no other existing liquor license locations of a similar nature in the immediate vicinity of the proposed location.

## SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION

Upon visual inspection of the subject property May 10, 2019, the Planning and Development Department staff observed that the required Notice of Public Hearing signs were posted.


## RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing, it is the recommendation of the Planning and Development Department that Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-19-13 be DENEID.


4250 Moncrief Road, proposed location of liquor store


View of 4220 Moncrief Road. Waiver, WLD-16-01 was approved.

Page 6


Aerial view of subject property

Page 7
$\bigcirc$


| Date Submitted: | $4-24-19$ |
| :--- | :--- |
| Date Filed: | $4-29-19$ |


| Application Number: |
| :---: |
| W L |
| Public Hearing: |

## Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location

City of Jacksonville, Florida<br>Planning and Development Department

Please type or print in ink, Instructions regarding the completion and submittal of this application are located at the end of this form. For additional information, please contact the Planning and Development Department at (904) 255-7865.


| PROPERTY INFORMATION |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1. Complete Property Address: 4250 Moncrief Road | 2. Real Estate Number: 0851060000 |
| 3. Land Area (Acres): 0.25 | 4. Date Lot was Recorded: 10/30/19 |
| 5. Property Located Between Streets: 33rd and 32nd Street West | 6. Utility Services Provider: <br> City Water / City Sewer $\square$ $x$ Well / Septic $\square$ |
| 7. Waiver Sought: <br> Reduce Required Minimum Distance between liquor license location and church or school from 500 $\qquad$ feet to $\qquad$ feet. |  |
| 8. In whose name will the Waiver be granted? | nner Liquor, Inc. |


| OWNER'S INFORMATION (please attach separate sheet if more than one owner) |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 9. Name: <br> Malih Properties, LLC | 10. E-mail: <br> zach_miller@bellsouth.net |
| 11. Address (including city, state, zip): | 12. Preferred Telephone: <br> 904-396-5731 |
| 11399 Glen Laurel Oaks Circle <br> Jacksonville, Florida 32257 |  |


| APPLICANT'S INFORMATION (if different from owner) |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 13. Name: | 14. E-mail: |
| 15. Address (including city, state, zip): | 16. Preferred Telephone: |
|  |  |

## CRITERIA

Section 656.101(I), Ordinance Code, defines a waiver as "a relaxation of the Zoning Code minimum distance requirements for liquor license locations, pursuant to Section 656.805, Ordinance Code."

Section 656.133(a)1 through 5, Ordinance Code, provides that, with respect to action upon Applications for Waivers, the Planning Commission shall grant a waiver for minimum distance requirements from a church or school for a liquor license location, if there exist one or more circumstances which negate the necessity for compliance with the distance requirements, included but not limited to the following:

1. The commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverage use is of a lesser intensity than the commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverage use which previously existed; e.g., there has been a reduction in the number of seats or square footage or type of license;
2. The alcoholic beverage use is designed to be an integral part of a mixed planned unit development;
3. The alcoholic beverage use is located within a shopping center with an aggregate gross leasable area of 50,000 square feet or more, inclusive of all outparcels, and meets the definition of a bona-fide restaurant as defined in Section 656.805(c);
4. The alcoholic beverage use is not directly visible along the line of measurement defined in Section 656.806 and is physically separated from the church or school, thereby negating the distance requirement as a result of the extra travel time; or
5. There are other existing liquor license locations of a similar nature in the immediate vicinity of the proposed location; provided however, that no waiver shall be granted pursuant to this criterion if the proposed liquor license location is closer to the church or school than other existing locations.
6. Given the above definition of a "waiver" and the aforementioned criteria by which the request will be reviewed against, please describe the reason that the waiver is being sought. Provide as much information as you can; you may attach a separate sheet if necessary. Please note that failure by the applicant to adequately substantiate the need for the request and to meet the criteria set forth may result in a denial.

## PLEASE SEE ATTACHED

## ATTACHMENTS

The foliowing attachments must accompany each copy of the application.
$X$ Survey
X Site Plan - two (2) copies on $81 / 2 \times 11$ and two (2) copies on $11 \times 17$ or larger
X Property Ownership Affidavit (Exhibit A)
X Agent Authorization if application is made by any person other than the property owner (Exhibit B)
X Legal Description - may be written as either lot and block, or metes and bounds (Exhibit 1)
X Proof of property ownership - may be print-out of property appraiser record card if individual owner, http://apps.coi.net/pao propertySearch/Basic/Search.aspx, or print-out of entry from the Florida Department of State Division of Corporations if a corporate owner, http://search.sunbiz.org/Inquir/CorporationSearch/ByName.

## FILING FEES

*Applications filed to correct existing zoning violations are subject to a double fee.

| Base Fee | Public Notices | Advertisement |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Non-resldential Districts: $\$ 1,173.00$ | $\$ 7.00$ per Addressee | Billed directly to owner/agent |

## AUTHORIZATION

Please review your application. No application will be accepted until all of the requested information has been supplied and the required fee has been paid. The acceptance of an applicatlon as being complete does not guarantee its approval by the Planning Commission. The owner and/or authorized agent must be present at the public hearing.

The required public notice signs must be posted on the property within five ( 5 ) working days after the filing of this appllcation. Sign(s) must remain posted and maintained until a final determination has been made on the application.

I hereby certify that i have read and understand the information contained in this application, that I am the owner or authorized agent for the owner with authority to make this application, and that all of the information contalned in this application, including the attachments, is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

| Owner(s) |
| :--- |
| Print name: |
| Signature: |
| Owner(s) |
| Print name: |
| Signature: |

Applicant or Agent (if different than owner) Print name: Zach Miller
Signature: $\qquad$
*An agent authorization letter is required if the application is made by any person other than the property owner.

## SUBMITTAL

This application must be typed or printed in ink and submitted along with three (3) copies for a total of four (4) applications. Each application must include all required attachments.

## Submit applications to:

Planning and Development Department, Zoning Section
214 North Hogan Street, $2^{\text {nd }}$ Floor
Jacksonville, Florida 32202
(904) 255-8300

The applicant is requesting a waiver of liquor distance from 500 feet to 400 feet in order to allow the sale of liquor for off premises consumption, as allowed by right under the CCG-2 zoning.

The applicant is the same applicant (albeit a different entity) that was granted a waiver of liquor distance from 500 feet to 310 feet for the property immediately to the south ( 4220 Moncrief Road) by WLD 16-01. (See Exhibit G). As to that application, the planning commission found competent substantial evldence that 4220 Moncrief Road was not visible from the Harmony Baptist Church located at 4110 Moncrief Road and thereby met the criteria for a waiver. See attached final order (Exhibit D) and transcript from planning commission.(Exhibit E).

Like the property in WLD 16-01, the subject property in this applitation is also not visible from the Harmony Missionary Baptist Church. As such, the subject property meets one of the criteria under Section 656.133, Ordinance Code and the need for the distance is negated.

It should be noted that the subject property is within 500 feet of the property boundary of a school. However, as shown on the liquor distance survey, this area is not part of the "grounds" of the school, which are more than 800 feet away.

It also should be noted that the Harmony Missionary Baptist Church is zoned CCG-2 and does not hold church services during the times listed. (See Exhibit H).

The "29th and Chase" Neighborhood Action Plan is not one of the listed criteria for evaluation of a waiver of liquor distance application. However, "package store" is not listed as an undesirable use under the NAP. Moreover, the NAP lists as one of its objectives as providing resources to buildings that, "would like to improve the appearance of their buildings." The NAP sets forth as a goal the improvement of lighting and landscaping. (See Exhibit I). The NAP lists that one of the biggest problems in the area is vacant lots and buildings. The subject property currently houses a vacant former restaurant. (See Exhibit G). As part of this application, the applicant would condition approval upon the landscaping plan attached.

Despite the majority of this section of Moncrief Road being zoned CCG-2, the nearest business which sells liquor for off-premises consumption is located in a shopping center approximately 7 miles away near Moncrief and 20th Street West. Max Liquor near Moncrief Road, Edgewood Avenue is approximately 1.5 miles from the subject property and Moncrief Liquor and Lounge (which has on premises consumption) is approximately 1.1 miles from the subject property.

## EXHIBIT 1

Legal Description


#### Abstract

           - -ofBegivalut


LIGSTANDRXCEPT:
Tuncos 336










 Beghailug.

# AUTHORIZATIONS/PROPERTY OWNERSHIP COMPOSITE EXHIBIT A 

## EXHIBIT A - Property Ownership Affidavit

Date: 3/25/19
City of Jacksonville
Planning and Development Department
214 North Hogan Street, Suite 300,
Jacksonville, Florida 32202
Re: Property Owner Affidavit for the following site location:
4250 moncrief $R d$ tax FL 32209
To Whom it May Concern:

- EYadMalih/Malih properties LLC Hereby certify that lam the Owner of the property described in Exhibit 1 in connection with filing applications) for Banner's Liquor submitted to the Jacksonville Planning and Development Department. Distance waiver for Liquor Stere

If Owner is Individual:

By $\qquad$
Print Name: $\qquad$
If Owner is Corporate Entity:*
Print Corporate Name:


Print Name: Eyad Malibu__
Its: $\qquad$



## STATE OF FLORIDA

 COUNTY OF DUVALSworn to and subscribed and acknowledged before me this $\qquad$ Math 2014 by $\qquad$ ipad Mali $\qquad$ who is personally known to me or who has produced $\qquad$ as identification and who took an oath. FO

(Printed name of NOTARY PUBLIC)
State of Florida at Large.
My commission expires:


## River City Tinde, LLC

11512 Lake Mcad Ave. Suite 801
Jacksonville, Florida 32256
File Number: RCI8-06-45
18105509

* $265000^{\circ}$


## General Warranty Deed

Made this December 20, 2018 A.D. By Atef Jabbar and Fakhreddine Ifaouatl, 27607 Skyelake Cir, Wesley Chnpel, Florids 33544, hereinifier called the grantor, to Malih Properties, LLC. whose post office oudress is: 11399 GLEN LAUREL OAKS CIR. Jacksonvilte, Florids 32257, hereinafier called the grantee:

Witnesseth, that the grantor, for ond in consideration of the sum of Ten Dollars, ( $\$ 10.00$ ) and other valuable considerations, receipt whereor is hereby aeknowledged, hercby grants, bargains, sells, aliens, remiscs, releases, conveys and confins unto the grantee, all that certain land situate in Duval County. Flarids, viz:

A PART OF LOT 1, BLOCK 13, REPLAT NO. 2 OF ROYAL TERRACE, ACCORDING TO PLAT THEREOF, RECORDED IN PLAT BOOK 7 PAGE 19, CURRENT PUELIC RECORDS OF DUVAL COUNTY, FLORIDA. ALSO, PART OF 32ND STREET, AS CLOSED BY CITY ORDINANCE BB-232 AND A PART OF THE CHARLES F. SIBBALD GRANT. SECTION 55. TOWNSHIP 2 SOUTH, RANGE 26 EAST, ALL bEING MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED AS FOLLOWS; BEGIN AT THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF LOT I, TIIENCE EAST ALONG THE NORTIERLY LINE OF SAID LOT $1,76.29$ FEET TO A POINT IN THE WESTERLY LINE OF MONCRIEF ROAD, AS NOW ESTABLISHED, TIIENCE SOUTHERLY ALONG SAID WESTERLY LINE OF MONCRIEF ROAD IO2.II FEET TO A POINT IN TIJE NORTHERLY LINE OF IVEST 32ND STREET AS NOW ESTABLISHED; THENCE WESTERLY ALONG THE NORTIIERLY LINE OF SAID WEST 32ND STREET 117.05 FEET TO A PONT: THENCE NORTHERLY PARALLEL WITHI TIIE WESTERLY LINE OF SAID LOT I, 43.13 FEET TO A PONT: THENCE WESTERLY PARALLEL WITH THE NORTHERLY LINE OF SAID LOT 1,38 FEET TO A PONTT; THENCE NORTHERLY ALONG THE WESTERLY LINE OF SAID LOT I AND A PROLONGATION THEREOF, 100 FEET TO THE POINT OF BEGINNNG.

LESS AND EXCEPT:
PARCEL 136
A Part of Lot t, block 13, replat number 2 OF royal terrace, as silown on plat recorded in plat BOOK 7. PAGE 19 OF THE CURRENT PUBLIC RECORDS OF DUVAL COUNTY. FLORIDA AND MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED AS FOLLOWS: BEGIN AT THE SOUTHIVEST INTERSECTION OF MONCRIEF ROAD (AN 80 FOOT RIGHT-OF-WAY AS NOW EXISTS) AND IJRD SIREET (A SO FOOT RIGIIT-OF-WAY AS NOW EXISTS); RUN THENCE SOUTH $33^{\circ} 1924^{\prime \prime}$ EAST, A LONG THE WEST RIGHT-OF-WAY LINE OF MONCRIEF ROAD 102.23 FEET : THENCE NORTH 37"2718" WEST 91.20 FEET TO THE POINT OF CURVATURE OF A CURVE TO THE LEFT, CONCAVE SOUTIIWESTERLY AND HAVING A RADIUS OF 10 FEET AND A CENTRAL ANGLE OF 52"3638"; THENCE NORTHWESTERLY ALONG THE ARC OF SADD CURVE 9.18 FEET SAID ARC IS SUBTENDED BY A CHORD BEARING A DISTANCE OF NORTH $63^{\circ} 45^{\prime} 36^{\prime \prime}$ WEST 8.86 FEET TO THE POINT OF TANGENT; THENCE SOUTH 8956'06" WEST, 67.71 FEET TO THE WEST LINE OF LOT 1 ; THENCE ALONG SAID WEST LINE, NORTH $00{ }^{\circ} 32^{\circ} 36^{\prime \prime}$ WEST, 9.1 FEET TO THE SOUTH RIGHT-OF-WAY LINE OF 33RD STREET; THENCE NORTH 8905600" EAST ALONG SAID SOUTH LINE 75.04 FEET TO THE POINT OF BEGINNNGG.

Said property is not the homestead of the Grantor(s) under the laws and constitution of the State of Florida in that neither Gramor(s) or any members of the houschoid of Ginitor(s) reside thereon.

Pareel ID Number: 085106-0000
Together with all the tenements, hereditaments and appurtenances thereto belonging or in anywise appertinining.
To Have and to Held, the same in fee simple Forever.
And the grantor hereby covenants with said grantee that the gantor is lawfully seized of said land in fee simple; that the grantor has good right and lawful auboricy to sell and convey said lend; that the grantor hereby fully warrants the titte to suid land and will defend the same against the lawtul claims of oll persons whomsocver; and that said land is free of all encumbrances except taxes accruing subsequent to December 31, 2017.

## Date: 3/25/19

City of Jacksonville
Planning and Development Department
214 North Hogan Street, Suite 300,
Jacksonville, Florida 32202
Re: Agent Authorization for the following site location:

# 4250 moncrief Rd . 

$\operatorname{sax}$ FL 32209
To Whom it May Concern:
You are hereby advised that the undersigned is the owner of the property described in Exhibit 1 attached hereto. Said owner hereby authorizes and empowers Zach miller to act as agent to file applications) for waiver of liquor distance for the above-referenced property and in connection with such authorization to file such applications, papers, documents, requests and other matters necessary for such requested change.

If Owner is Individual:

By $\qquad$
Print Name: $\qquad$
If Owner is Corporate Entity:*
Print Corporate Name:




## STATE OF FLORIDA COUNTY OF DUCAL

20ヶ Sworn to and subscribed and acknowledged before me this $\qquad$ day of Perch zens by $\qquad$ as identification and who took an oath.

(Signature of NOTARY PUBLIC)

(Printed name of NOTARY PUBLIC)

Expmes: dur 2,2082
State of florida at Large.
My commission expires:_3, 9, 2022

| Detall by Entity Name |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Florida Umited Liability Company |  |
| MALIH PROPERTIES, LLC |  |
| Elling infonmation |  |
| Document Numbar | L18000222956 |
| FEluEIN Numbar | APPLIED FOR |
| Date Filed | 09/19/2018 |
| Efrectiva Data | 09/19/2018 |
| State | FL |
| Status | ACtive |
| Erinolpalatdress |  |
| 11399 GLEN LAUREL OAKS CIR |  |
| JACKSONMLLE, FL 32257 |  |
| Malling Addnss |  |
| 11399 GLEN LAUREL OAKS CIR |  |
| JACKSONVILLE, FL 32257 |  |
|  |  |
| ISAAC, BRETT |  |
| 2151 UNIVERSITY BLVD S |  |
| JACKSONVUE, FL 32216 |  |
| Authortad Remsonimil Datall |  |
| Name in Addruss |  |
| THE AMER |  |
| MALIH, EYAD |  |
| 11399 GLEN LAUREL OAKS CIR |  |
| JACKSONVILLE, FL 32257 |  |
| Annut Reports |  |
| Report Yoar | Filos Date |
| 2019 | 03/21/2019 |
| Decumantimages |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |



## MAP SHOWING SPECIFIC PURPOSE SURVEY FOR A LIQUOR LICENSE






NOT VALD WMHOUT THE SGGNTURE AND THE ORIGINAL RASED SEAL OF A FLORIDA LLCENSED SURVEYOR AND MAOOR File

0

## SURVEY EXHIBIT B

# LANDSCAPE PLAN/SITE PLAN EXHIBIT C 





0

# WLD 16-01 FINAL ORDER EXHIBIT D 

0

APPLICATION NO: WLD-16-01
IN RE: The Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Lacation of

## H AND E BROTHERS, LLC

## QRDER GRANTLNG APPILCATION FOR ZONING WAIVER OF MINTMUM DISTANCE REOUREMENTS FOR HOUOR LICENSE LOCATION WLD-16-01 WITH CONDITIONS

This matter came to be heard upon the Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-16-01 filed by George Safar, the owners of certain real property located at 4220 Moncrief Road, on behalf of H and E Brothers, LLC, seeking a waiver to reduce the required minimum distance between the subject property and a church or school from 500 feet to 310 feet in the CCG-2 Zoning District.

Having duly considered both the testimonial and documentary evidence presented at the public hearing on March 17, 2016, including the Report of the Planning and Development Department on Application WLD-16-01 and all attachments thereto ("Staff Report"), a copy of which is atlached as Exhibit "A", the Planning Commission of the City of Jacksonville hereby adopts and incorporates herein the recommendations of the Staff Report, and,

## FINDS AND DETERMINES:

1. That the applicant has complied with all application requirements set forth in Section 656.133 of the Zoning Code.
2. That substantial competent evidence demonstrates that the application WLD-1601 meets, to the extent applicable, the standards and criteria set forth in Section 656.133(a) of the Zoning Code.
3. The land to which this waiver is granted is owned by George Safar. A copy of the legal description of the subject property is attached as part of Exhibit "A" and incorporated by reference herein.

NOW THEREFORE, it is ORDERED by the Planning Commission:

1. A Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-15-18 is hereby granted to H and E Brothers, LLC, thereby reducing the required minimum dislance between the subject property and a church or school from 500 feet to 310 feet in the CCG21 Zoning District. The request is for the package sales of beer and wine for offite consumption.
2. In conformity with state licensing requirements, the waiver hereby granted shall be personal to H and E Brothers, LLC, the license applicantholder, nontransferable, and shall not run with the land as provided by Section 656.136(c) of the Zoning Code.
3. The waiver granted herein is subject to the following conditions:
(a) The package store shall not be open for business before 12:00 noon on Sundays; and
(b) A six foot tall $95 \%$ opaque fence shall be constructed along the southern property line.
4. Failure to exercise the waiver herein granted by commencement of the use or action herein approved within one (1) year of the effective date of this onder shall render this waiver invalid and all rights arising hereunder shall terminate.
5. The Waiver herein shall not be construed as an exemption from any other applicable local, state or federal laws, regulations, requirements, permits or approvals. All other applicable local, state or federal permits or approvals shall be obtained before commencement of the development or use and issuance of this Waiver is based upon acknowledgement, representation and confirmation made by the applicant(s), owner(s), developer(s) and/or any authorized agent(s) or designee(s) that the subject business, development and/or use will be operated in strict compliance with all laws. Issuance of this Waiver does not approve, promote or condone any practice or act that is prohibited or restricted by any federal, state or local faws.
6. The approval granted herein shall not interfere with or abrogate or annul any easement, covenant or other agreement between any parties. In the event that the provisions of this Order impose a greater restriction upon the use, structures or development of the property than are imposed or required by other ordinances, rules, regulations or by easements, covenants or agreements, the provisions of this Order shall control.

Executed this 17th day of March, 2016.

## FORM APPROVED:



## Copies to:

George Safar
2715 Alvarado Avenue
Jacksonville, FL 32217
Owners/Applicants

Paul M. Harden, Esquire
501 Riverside Avenue, Suite 901
Jacksonville, FL 32202
Agents
NOTICE: This Order does not become final until the expiration of the twenty-one (21) day appeal period provided in the Zoning Code. Any work commenced during this appeal period is done at the risk of the applicant, and a building permit will only be issued after an Acknowledgement of the appeal period has been obtained from the Zoning Counter and returned to same executed properly by the applicant(s) or their agent(s).

G:LLand UselPlanning Cammissionl2016 Ordersi03.17.1603.17 WLD-16-01 AC.docx

0

## PLANNING COMMISSION TRANSCRIPT WLD 16-01 EXHIBIT E


as the City Planning and Development staff and General Counsel staff as well.

Thank you for being here.
And, Dr. Gaffney, thank you for being here from the mayor's office.

And let me recognize Councilman Love belng here. We have quite a -- quite a group up here today. Y'all are privileged.

Time is granted by this body that each member of the public who wishes to speak before the Commission is limited to a three-minute presentation.

And as we go along and we get into the -the last item on the agenda today, we will alter that a little bit, that I've dlscussed with several of the audience members.

It is important that an accurate record must be kept of what the speakers say. So everybody that wishes to fill out -- wishes to speak, please fill out a blue speaker's card. That's up there, with Ms. Patricia Sales. And If you'll put that in her basket, she wifl give that to me. And so when your item comes up, we will be able to call your name out.

Your testimony is taken down by the court Diane M. Tropia. Inc., P.O. Box 2375. Jacksonville. FL 32723 (904) $821-0300$
reporter, Ms. Dlane Tropia. And she does not take anything from anybody, so only one person at a time. And she stops typing after three minutes, right? That's not true. She doesn't. She'll take everything down.

Any tangible material submitted with a speaker's presentation will become part of the public record and will be kept by this
Eommission. Therefore, please retain a copy of anything submitted if it is needed.

Decisions by the Commission on rezonings and land use amendments are recommendations oniy. The recommendations are then transmilted to the Jacksonvilie City Council's Land Use and Zoning Committee which ultmately votes on these matters.

LUZ may or may not follow the recommendation of the Planning Commission. Unless specifically deferred by LUZ, items voted on by the Pianning Cornmission today are heard before the LUZ Committee in two weeks, on Tuesday, April 15th, 2016, for another public hearing. And that meeting is in these council chambers at 5:00 p.m.

Any questions an a specific application,
Oiane M. Tropia, inc., P.O. Box 2375. Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) $821-0300$
of the five criteria. We find that it is positive on that one. So with that, we recommend to approve. THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Folks. Do you want to -- you did both of them. All right.

Charlle Mann.
(Mr. Harden approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: You want to --
MR. HARDEN: I'll just cover for him, unless anybody has any questions.

THE CHAIRMAN: I appreciate that.
MR. HARDEN: Paul Harden.
I'm here for Charlie because it looks like the Planning Department recommended approval, there's nobody in opposition. Even I couldn't lose this.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Anybody else in the audience wishing to speak on E-15-80 or WLD-15-18?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, I will close the public hearing on both those items and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Mr. Chairman, I
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
move approval of $\mathrm{E}-15-80$.
COMMISSIONER HARDING: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: Do you want to -- do you have that condition?

COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: With the one condition as stated in the staff report.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. I've got a motion and a second for approval of E-15-80 as conditioned.

Discussion from the Commission?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, all those in
favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Opposed?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Mr. Chairman, I move approval of WLD-15-18.

COMMISSIONER HARDING: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a
second for approval of WLD-15-18.
Discussion from the Commission?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, all those in
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Opposed?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes.
All right. WLD-16-01. And before staff introduces this item, if you want to take this opportunity to declare ex-parte communication, I think this is a great opportunity to kind of -- to speak about this now.

We need to -- there will be another Item coming up, Commissioners, that we need to make sure that all of our ex-parte communication Is -- is specific to the matter, and then go into a detailed description of what was talked about in the ex-parte communication.

So I will start by saying, I had ex-parte communication with Mr. Harden today on this item. We talked about the line-of-sight issue. And I made some recommendations that I would like to see -- conditions that I would like to see within the waiver of liquor -- waiver of liquor distance application. So those are -that's what Mr. Harden and I talked about. We talked about that today.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Mr. Harding.
COMMISSIONER HARDING: Mr. Chair, I aiso had a brief conversation with Mr. Harden this morning and speciffe to the line-of-sight issue.

COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: I had a brief conversation with Mr. Harden on the phone yesterday regarding the same issues.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: I had the same issue, talked to Mr. Harden this morning, line of sight.

THE CHAIRMAN: Great. Any others? Any others? Any others?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Folks, do you want to give us a summary?

MR. HUXFORD: I feel left out. Mr. Harden didn't talk to me today.

All right. Application for Waiver of Liquor Distance WLD-16-01 is for property at 4220 Moncrief Road. The request is to reduce the distance from a package store to a nearby church from 500 feet to 310 feet.

The property is zoned CCG-2. And so the use of the liquor store is allowed by right

Diane M. Tropia, Ine., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) $821-0300$
anyway, but they still have to meet the
distance requirement. The church in question
is on the same side of the road as the proposed
liquor store. I have been out to the site.
I know that in our staff report we -- we have recommended denial. And we maintain that, but in fairness, I would say that from the church property to the physical location of the building that's going to house the package store, it could potentially meet criteria number 4 by -- by way of it meeting the line-of-sight requirement; meaning, it's not directly visible.

However, it is within the boundarles of a Neighborhood Action Plan, and that's the 29th and Chase Neighborhood Action Plan. We feel that this would be -- granting this would be inconsistent with that. So for that reason, we are maintalning our recommendation to deny.

Thank you,
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Folks.
Mr. Harden.
(Mr. Harden approaches the podlurn.)
MR. HARDEN: Aaron, could I get you to pass out some photographs?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375، Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

MR. GLICK: (Complies.)
(Brief pause in the proceedings.)
MR. HARDEN: One for everybody and Folks.
Paul Harden, 501 Riverside Avenue, and representing the applicant.

Interestingly enough, the last item you considered has the exact same issue, and the line of sight is the exact same thing. So I have some quandary as to why the recommendation of denlal on the line-of-sight issue.

There is one issue and but one issue for your consideration on this request: is the alcoholic beverage use directly visible along the line of measurement defined in 656.806 and physically separated from the church? I'm passing out some photographs, and I'm going to ask you to -- to look at that, actually confirm that fact.

By the way, I'm going to talk about the 29th and Chase plan, but the alcohol use itself is settled. This site is zoned CCG-2. Retail sale of alcohol is allowed by right in this location. And it was before the 29th and Chase plan -- which, by the way, was 14 years ago -and after the 29th and Chase plan. So the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
actual use is not required for an exception. It's allowed by right in the location.

While the report suggests the buliding is directly visible on the site, I think Mr. Huxford conceded, after his visit yesterday -- and that's when I talked to him, not today -- that you can, in fact, not see the location.

And I'd like to walk quickly through these -- these photographs. The first photograph is a Google Earth depiction -- not depiction, photograph standing at the street, not even the line-of-sight location. And you can see, you cannot see the buliding that we are requesting because it's stralght down Moncrief, on the same side of the road. But for your consideration, the line-of-sight is to be taken from the property line of the church.

So you have to move back to that fence, look through the brick building, look through the empty lot, look through the car -- used car location, look through a visual barrier on our site, and you still -- you can't see the site.

The next photograph is a photograph of the church that's an old house converted to a

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 322 n2 (904) 821-0300
church that they use, just to give you the setting. And, by the way, the church itself is zoned CCG-2, so alcohol sale is allowed by right on that site as well, as long as every -as well as everything else in CCG-2 which, as you know, is the most intensive zoning in the commercial category.

The next photograph is a photograph of the building that we intend to purchase. And I will talk to you about that when I talk to you about the -- the plan.

Across the street is the next photograph, which allows retail sale of alcohol. Now, that's important because if you go back to the first photograph and you look, you can't see our building, but you can look straight at the building that does, in fact, sell the alcohol. And there's alcohol sales signs there. They sell alcohol. They sell it on Sunday morning. And that's an existing facility across from our property.

The last one is a photograph looking back at the church, to show that you can't see the church building from -- it's not visible in the line of sight from the existing facil- --

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
proposed Facility.
And the last map is just to call to your attention this area (indicating). Everything in red Is zoned CCG-2. Alcohol sales are allowed by right in everything that's red on that map. That's the -- you see where the site's located. And there are numerous retail sale of alcohol in the CCG-2 area, but it's an unusual tocation because typically, you might see CN or even CCG-2. This is the most intense commercial category in the zoning code. It allows retail sale of alcohol by right.

So I believe with Mr. Huxford conceding that the line of sight, we meet that, and you just having voted on one of similar ilk, the Planning Department report was exactly the opposite.

I would like for you to turn -- I'd like to turn to the other issue that they have raised, although I belleve it not to be an appropriate issue in this case because once the line of sight is determined, your inquiry should be finished.

The Planning Department raises the Neighborhood Plan called 29th and Chase.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

That -- that plan was done -- I said 14 years ago; It was 12 years ago - in 2004.

All of these activities that have occurred in this area have taken place since the 29th and Chase plan, but just to give you some perspective, 29th Street is five blocks back south, and Chase is five blocks further to the east. This is -- this is remote from the 29th and Chase plan.

There's no map in their plan. They call this the commercial corridor for 29th and Chase. It's -- it's very, very remote, but in that plan, right now, you have retall sale of alcohol. And it has occurred since the -since the implementation of the plan some -some 12 years ago.

I'd like to go through the 29th and Chase plan because I believe we comply with that plan. It's in your report package. It's on about the third page. Well, the -- the report is deep in there, but I'm going to refer to some memo from Aaron Glick -- to Aaron Glick, from Lisa Ransom, showing the plan passed in 2004, but they say that they don't want to put this because -- and this is language that I --

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821.0300

I find disconcerting: Although not identified as an undesirable use, the intensity of a package store could be allowed -- to be allowed would be -- could be inconsistent with the plan.

How in the world could it be inconsistent with the plan when the site is zoned for that use, has been before the plan, has been for after the plan? I think it -- It's -- it's an opinion of the planner writing this as to the undesirability of -- of retail sales. I hope they don't discover that's the case down by the football stadium. I hope they don't discover that's the case along Bay Street. I hope they don't discover it's the case, you know, at Town Center because those are locations where similar uses have occurred.

Retail sale of alcohol is not an undesirable use. It's a regulated use and one that's specifically designated for this site that we're on.

So turning to the next two pages that they cite on the -- on the 29th and Chase plan, the goal is to provide retail and neighborhood services through attractive businesses that

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropla, inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Invest in the community.
My client is investing in a bullding that was not in use, that they're going to landscape, they're going to clean up, and they're going to invest in the committee -- I mean in the community. That's meeting the goal of the 29th and Chase.

And then the objectives are to improve the appearance of the building. You see our building now. We're going to clean it up. We're going to landscape it. We're going to put in signage, It's -- it's -- it's not dilapidated because it's a brick bullding. It's a pretty nice-looking building, but we're going to spend money changing the appearance of it.

Create business opportunities within the community. It's going to be an owner within that community.

Increase retail-level opportunities. This is a retall-level opportunity in this community.

So in -- in -- in fairness, we meet the goals of the 29th and Chase plan. For some reason, a particular planner believes that
retall sale of alcohol is an undesirable use. All I can say is, I beg to differ.

The last thing I want to point out is, there's already alcohol sales within 500 feet of the church, straight across the street from -- from our location, and -- and that is vislble. Ours is not.

And I belleve with the concession of the Planning Department that we're not on the visible line of sight and the fact that the other Inquires are not appropriate, that I respectfully request your support, but if you want to Inquire into the 29th and Chase plan, we meet those goals.

And, by the way, the City zoned this site, and as you can see from that red map, about 50 other propertles in this area, and it allows retall sales by right.

With that, I'll sit down and respond to any comments anybody else has.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Harden.
I do not have any more speaker cards on this Item. Is there anybody else in the audience that wishes to speak on WLD-16-01?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821.0300

22
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, I will close the public hearing and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER HARDING: Mr. Chairman, I make a motion that we approve WLD-16-01.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I've got a motion and a second for approval of WLD-16-01.

Discussion from the Commlssion?
Mr. Harding.
COMMISSIONER HARDING: Mr. Chalrman, I guess you know I am very familiar with this. This is, obviously, my planning district. $\mathrm{I}^{\prime} \mathrm{m}$ very familiar with this neighborhood and this area.

And, you know, I think Mr. Harden makes a very compelling case. The fact is that it would appear, based on the zoning, that this pastor could sell this church tomorrow and someone could put a package store in that site.

So -- so it seems a litile disingenuous to deny something. I mean, I think you can make a compelling case with the line of sight issue, that it is not within the line of sight, but I think it's a little disingenuous to deny

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
approval based on the fact that a church exists just down the street, which is not -- was not necessarlly built as a church, obviously, if you look at it, and could easily turn around and sell tomorrow and become a package store Itself. So that's why I've chosen to support it.

THE CHAIRMAN: Very good comments.
Commissioner Blanchard.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you,
Mr. Chairman.
Through the Chair to the applicant, you know, I'm not thrilled with the idea of a package store in this location, but I think that that's more of a personal opinion of mine. And I think that based on the technical arguments that you've made, I would tend to be in support of the WLD.

MR. HARDEN: Mr. Chairman, may I make one point that I didn't make?

I represented toMr. Blanchard and to you and to Mr. Huxford that If it were passed, we would agree to a condition that it doesn't open before noon on Sunday.

So even though there's nobody else here,
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

I'll -- I'm agreeable to that condition, because I've made that representation.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Any other comments?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Well, then I'll make a couple of comments.

You know, a lot of times when we have applications come in front of us, you know, I'll look at the staff report. You know, this appllcation, I actually drove out there because I was trying to wrap my head around it. And I can honestly say, I've never been to -- down that street or around that -- where that application is being proposed. So, you know, I wanted to go out there and actually look at it for myself.

And, you know, I did have a hard time with the line of sight. You know, I didn't actually get out and put -- stand in front of the church, but if you did, I would have a hard time seeing if there's a line of sight.

I did see a lot of activity across the street from where this application is, which I saw more of a nuisance than anything, but wher you talk about an individual that's trying to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300


# SOUTHEAST BOUNDARY OF A. PHILLIP RANDOPH ACADEMIES OF TECHNOLOGY EXHIBIT F 



# WLD 16-01 LOCATION v. SUBJECT PROPERTY EXHIBIT G 





4．
歮青

## 4110 MONCRIEF ROAD EXHIBIT H





[^0]

## 29th and Chase <br> NAP EXHIBIT I



The $29^{\text {th }}$ \& Chase
Neighborhood Action Plan
Planning \& Development Department
Director Jeannie Fewell

January 2004
Prepared by
APD, Inc.
ZONING
The zoning districts follow the land use pattems closely, and do not seem to impede or hinder development (refer to Map 6). Most of the zoning districts are associated with neighborhood related commercial uses and residential development. Industrial related districts are restricted to the western portion of the Study Area.

| Zoning Category | Description of Uses |
| :---: | :---: |
| RLD-G | Single-family uses only, 6000 sq. ft. minimum lot size |
| RMD-A | Single-family uses only, 5000 sq. ft. minimum lot size |
| RMD-B | Single-family uses and multi-family up to 4 units |
| RMD-E | Multb-family use only |
| CCG-1 | Most commercial related uses with the exception of warehouses and wholesale retall |
| CCG-2 | Most intense commerclal category |
| P8F-1 | Public buildings \& uses, large structures (over $40,000 \mathrm{sq}$. ft.), essential services, solld waste, and multiple building development by exception |
| PUD | Planned Unit Development |
| IL | Industrial uses with less objectionable impacts, such as odors, noise, and toxlc wastes |

There are two major zoning issues affecting the nelghborhood: the intrusion of mult-farmlly buildings throughout the neighborhood and the current residential designation of RLD-G has a minimum lot size that is too large for the existing parcels. The multi-family structures are typically one to eight units, and were built in the 19505 and

## INDUSTRYAL DISTRICT

The western portion of the Study Area has a significant amount of industrial related uses. These uses do not appear to be overly intruslve to the neighborhood. However, there is a portion of residential uses that have not converted to Industrial remaining. This area is maintained and appears to be a successful industrial park.

## SCHOOLS, PARKS, \& PUBLIC BUILDINGS

There is one school located in the neighborhood. However, this school has been closed due to ash contamination before the 19992000 school year.

Simonds-Johnson Park is located along Moncrief Road, just north of the Myrtle Avenue intersection. The park has a basketball court and
 only public use in the Study Area is the public golf course located in the northern portion.


Simonds-Sohnson Park entrance

1960s. The buildings are concrete block construction and are architecturally incompatible with the nelghborhood. Additionally, the units are not allowable uses under the current zoning district and present problems to the surrounding homes because of parking issues and a general lack of maintenance.

The RLD-G minimum lot size of 6000 square feet is not consistent with the typical lot size of 5000 square feet. There are many vacant lots throughout the Study Area, and any new housing construction project would have to obtain a waiver for the lot slze inconsistency.

## CIRCULATION

Traffic circulation in the neighborhood does not seem to be compromised with the exception of the Myrtle Avenue and Moncrief Road intersection. Myrtie Avenue is a two-lane collector roadway with peak traffic counts of 8,713 and a Level of Service (LOS) of "C." Moncrief Road is a more traveled two-lane collector with peak traffic counts of 12,652 and a LOS of "D." Both of these corridors are north/south collectors, although Myrtle Avenue ends at the northern boundary of the Study Area. These roadways intersect at the center of the community, and the intersection can be confusing to newcomers.

Most of the roadways in the neighborhood that run east/west can travel the length of the neighborhood uninterrupted with the exception of $27^{\text {th }}$ through $31^{\text {st }}$ Streets due to the park and commercial development. The largest of these roadways is $26^{\text {th }}$ Street, which is wider than the other local roads.

In terms of bicycle and pedestrian traffic, there are not many sidewalks and no bike lanes. Since there is a general lack of
 The areas surrounding the Study Area are similar in both housing types and conditions. The Kings Road/Beaver Street area is located
 This group of neighborhoods was the first area to receive a neighborhood plan, and is currently in the implementation stages. The $45^{\circ}$ \& Moncrief area has less deteriorated conditions and much more vacant land. The community has completed its neigh
plan and will be continuing with implementation initiatives.

Asset Property Disposition, Inc. Map Six
Conclusions
The following major condusions can be drawn from the data and analysis discussed above.

- Population decreasing, with a loss of approximately 670 people Ethric composition has remained falily the same;
All poverty indicators have decreased, including female headed households and poverty rates, with an increase in median esidential and Vacant land are the largest land uses, with vacant land scattered throughout the Sbudy Area; Commercial Uses concentrated in the center of the Study Area
along Moncrief Road \& Myrtle Avenue; and Substandard housing scattered throughout, with standard housing concentrated in the northwestern portion of the Study Area.

Asset Property Disposition, Inc.


## INTRODUCTION

The $29^{\text {th }}$ \& Chase Neighborhood Action Plan began with a public meeting and the creation of the Citizens Planning Team (CPT). The CPT was formed through the board of the NWUCDC, with representatives from the $29^{\text {th }}$ \& Chase Neighborhood Association.

 team made presentations to the Urban Core Citizens Planning Advisory Council when requested.

The CPT members were asked to participate in two separate workshops: one workshop to address goals and objectives, and one workshop to discuss design elements. In terms of the goals and objectives, the workshop was combined with the efforts of the 45 and Moncrief Neighborhood Action Plan to consistency between adjacent Study Areas.

Goals and Objectives were determined through an Asset and Constraints analysis, in which community residents were asked to discuss the strengths and weaknesses of their neighborhood. The responses were collapsed to ellminate repetition (refer to Table 7). The CPT members then formed the goals and objectives for the future development of the Study Area (refer to Table 8).

The $29^{\text {th }}$ \& Chase Study Area had a unique opportunity to receive the help of a landscape architecture class from the University of Florida. The class partcipants based their final projects for the semester on the Study Area, using the research that had been completed, in addition to their research and observations. The students then provided design recommendations through maps and renderings


| 29 | Analysis Results |
| :---: | :---: |
| Strengths | - Well kept homes <br> - Clean \& Quilet <br> - Community Meetings/Groups <br> - BBIC <br> - Simonds-Johnson Park |
| Weaknesses | - Vacant Homes <br> - Hazardous Housing <br> - Drainage Probtems <br> - Waste Areas (Bethune Elementary) <br> - The dilaptdated condition of Moncrief Road |
| Opportunities | - Vacant lots <br> - Housing Repairs <br> - New Façade Improvements |
| Threats | - People in the streets that are not from the neighborhood (drug dealers) <br> - Wrong type of people that move into the neighborhood <br> - Declining housing conditions <br> - Property values not increasing <br> - Drugs <br> - Prostitution |


|  | Goals | Objectives |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Housing | Promote homeownership and stable housing condilions, and preserve the historical character of the housing stock | - Enfarce the housing code <br> - Provide resources to homeowners to repalr code vilataions <br> - Provide housing to attract a mix of income levels <br> - Repair and resole vacant homes to homeowners <br> - Provide homeownership and home repair training to new and existing homeowners |
| Transportation | Greate safe and attractive streets | - Beautify the major commencial corridors <br> - Provide amerities for pubblic transportation <br> - Provide curb and gutter in interior streets to define the street and pubilc realm <br> - Increase llghting along interior roads <br> - Explore traffic calming along interior roadways <br> - Reduce litter and dumping along neighborhood streets |
| Parks \% Open Space | Provide safe and attractive recreational facilities for residents of all ages | - Upgrade existing parks to include family-related amenities <br> - Create open space that is available to families and children <br> - Link open space to community landmarks or areas of community pride and history |
| Economic Development | Provide retail and other nelghborhood services through attractive businesses that invest in the community | - Provide resources to businesses that would like to improve the appearance of their buildings <br> - Create opportundities for businesses that hire from within the community <br> - Explore job training and business trinining for new and existing residents <br> - Increase neighborthood level retall opportunities <br> - Buffer heavy commercial and industrial businesses from new and existing restdential areas |
| Community Pride \& Aesthetics | Buld cormmunity pride through beautifying the neighborhood | - Increase communily copacity and ownership <br> - Organkze community dean-ups <br> - Encourage community pride through beauticication of parks and open space, as well as along major corridors |

RESIDENTIAL AREAS
$29^{\text {th }}$ \& Chase is a historic community with a dense pattern of
development. The lot sizes are very small, approximately 3000 to
5000 square feet and the current zoning designation requires a 6000
square feet lot. All developers now must apply for a variance to
build on the lots.
Therefore, it is recommended that all residential areas currently
zoned for RLD-G should be rezoned to RMD-A. Since RLD-G requires
a minimum lot size of 6000 square feet, this zoning change will
account for the smaller lots in the communlty of 5000 square feet.
This zoning change would prevent builders from having to seek a
walver for each property. It should be noted that the zoning change
would require an amendment to the 2010 Comprehensive Plan.
RECOMMENDATIONS

- All property currentiy zoned CCG-2 that does not share a
boundary wlth the Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. Expressway
should be rezoned to CN or CCG-1.
All residential areas currently zoned for RLD-G should be
rezoned to RMD-A.
Zoning districts can be strong tools for redevelopment and
revitalization. This section recommends zoning changes that will
encourage appropriate commercial uses, and will allow for the
construction of single-family homes.
MONCRIEF ROAD
The current zoning along Moncrief Road is Community Commercial General-2, which is the most intense zoning category for commercial uses. This category allows for uses such as retall, automotive repair and service, restaurants, light warehousing, and other commercial related uses. This category, however, is more appropriate for have a zoning category more appropriate for neighborhood oriented
commercial uses. have a zoning category more appropriate for neighborhood oriented
commercial uses.

> It is recommended that all property currently zoned CCG-2 that does not share a boundary with the Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. Expressway be rezoned to CN or CCG-1. This would reflect the fact that Moncrief Road and Myrtle Avenue are not arterial roadways that should not support the larger scale and more Intense commerclal uses as altowed under CCG-2. It should be noted that the recommended zoning change to CN would require an amendment to the 2010 Comprehensive Plan.

## ZONING

 $\angle O N I N G$Zoning districts can be strong tools for redevelopment and
revitalization. This section recommends zoning changes that will
encourage appropriate commercial uses, and will allow for the
construction of single-family homes.
MONCRIEF ROAD CONING
Zoning districts can be strong tools for redevelopment and
revitalization. This section recommends zoning changes that will
encourage appropriate commercial uses, and will allow for the
construction of single-family homes.
MONCRIEF ROAD $\angle O N I N G$
Zoning districts can be strong tools for redevelopment and
revitalization. This section recommends zoning changes that will
encourage appropriate commercial uses, and will allow for the
construction of single-family homes.
MONCRIEF ROAD $\angle O N I N G$
Zoning districts can be strong tools for redevelopment and
revitalization. This section recommends zoning changes that will
encourage appropriate commercial uses, and will allow for the
construction of single-family homes.
MONCRIEF ROAD
The curtat zoning tis

## APPEAL EXHIBIT

 "B"
## APPLICATION NO: WLD-19-24

IN RE: The Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location of

## LIQUORS HOUSE, INC.

## ORDER DENYING APPLICATION FOR ZONING WAIVER <br> OF MINIMUM DISTANCE REOUIREMENTS FOR LIOUOR LICENSE LOCATION WLD-19-24

This matter came to be heard upon the Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-19-24 filed by Fla Trust Services, LLC, as Trustee of Florida Land Trust No. 576 Edgewood Ave. South, Jacksonville, Florida, the owner of certain real property located at 576 South Edgewood Avenue, on behalf of Liquors House, Inc., seeking a waiver to reduce the required minimum distance between a liquor license location (3APS) and church or school from 500 feet to 150 feet in the CCG-1 Zoning District.

Having duly considered both the testimonial and documentary evidence presented at the public hearing on October 17, 2019, including the Report of the Planning and Development Department on Application WLD-19-24 and all attachments thereto ("Staff Report"), a copy of which is attached as Exhibit "A", the Planning Commission of the City of Jacksonville hereby adopts and incorporates herein the recommendations of the Staff Report, and,

## FINDS AND DETERMINES:

1. That the applicant has complied with all application requirements set forth in Section 656.133 of the Zoning Code.
2. That the land which is the subject of application WLD-19-24 is owned by Florida Land Trust No. 576 Edgewood Ave. South, Jacksonville, Florida. A copy of the legal description of the subject property is attached as part of the Exhibit " $A$ " and incorporated herein by reference.
3. That substantial competent evidence fails to demonstrate that the application WLD-19-24 meets, to the extent applicable, the standards and criteria set forth in Section 656.133(a) of the Zoning Code.

NOW THEREFORE, it is ORDERED by the Planning Commission:

1. Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-19-24 is hereby DENIED.


Joshua Garrison
Chairman, Planning Commission
FORM APPROVED:


Copies to:
Anwar Dakhil
1817 Putney Circle
Orlando, FL 32837
Agent
FLA Trust Services, LLC
Tribhuvan A Patel
6545 Ramona Boulevard
Jacksonville, FL 32205
Owner

NOTICE: This Order does not become final until the expiration of the twenty-one (21) day appeal period provided in the Zoning Code.

WLD-19-24
(Companion E-19-57)

## REPORT OF THE PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

## APPLICATION FOR WAIVER OF MINIMUM DISTANCE REQUIREMENTS

## FOR LIQUOR LICENSE LOCATION WLD-19-24

OCTOBER 17, 2019

| Location: | 576 Edgewood Avenue South; between Roselyn Street and Hamilton Street |
| :---: | :---: |
| Real Estate Number(s): | 061987-0000 |
| Waiver Sought: | Reduce required minimum distance between liquor license location (3APS) and church or school from 500 feet to 150 feet |
| Present Zoning: | Community Commercial/General-1 (CCG-1) |
| Current Land Use Category: | Commercial General Community (CGC) |
| Planning District: | Northwest, District 5 |
| Agent(s): | Anwar Dakhil 1817 Putney Circle Orlando, Florida 32837 |
| Owner: | FLA Trust Services LLC <br> Tribhuvan A Patel 6545 Ramona Blvd Jacksonville, Florida 32205 |
| Staff Recommendation: | DENY |

## GENERAL INFORMATION

Application or Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-19-24 seeks to reduce the required minimum distance between the proposed use and the Faith's Realm Ministry International at 597 Edgewood Avenue South from 500 feet to 150 feet to allow for the retail sales of all alcoholic beverages for off-premises consumption. The applicant proposes to convert a convenience store to a liquor store. The site is within a commercial corridor along Edgewood Avenue. Other uses within the area include hair salons, restaurants, movie theatre, offices, churches, and retail shops.

The goal of infill development is to integrate with, maintain, and improve commercial and residential areas as they have historically existed and to aid in commercial development issues including, but not limited to, site improvements. The proposed waiver of liquor distance will not promote economic viability in the Murray Hill neighborhood. The Faith's Realm Ministry International is separated from the site by only 150 feet, and across the 4 -lane Edgewood Avenue.

This waiver has a companion Exception (E-19-57) application that seeks to allow for an establishment with full alcohol sales for off-premises consumption (3APS license). Staff is recommending denial of the exception application.

The property is zoned CCG-1 and is within the CGC functional land use category as defined by the Future Land Use Map series (FLUMs) contained within the Future Land Use Element (FLUE) adopted as part of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan.

## DEFINITION

According to Section 656.1601 of the Zoning Code, the term waiver means a relaxation of the Zoning Code minimum distance requirements for liquor license locations, pursuant to Section 656.805 of the Zoning Code, and for minimum street frontage, pursuant to Section 656.407 of the Zoning Code. Waivers are authorized to be granted by the Planning Commission pursuant to the criteria set forth in Section 656.133 of the Zoning Code.

## STANDARDS, CRITERIA AND FINDINGS

Pursuant to the provisions of Section 656.133 of the Zoning Code, a waiver of minimum distance requirements for liquor license location may be granted if the Planning Commission makes a positive finding based on substantial, competent evidence that the application meets one or more of the following criteria:

1) Is the commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverage use of a lesser intensity than the commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverage use, which previously existed; e.g., there has been a reduction in the number of seats or square footage or type of license?

No. The historical use for the site was a convenience store (mini-mart) and has been vacant for almost 5 years. The proposed use for the site will be a package store (3APS license). There are no other bars, restaurants or businesses with full liquor licenses in the immediate vicinity. The introduction of this alcohol sales use is no more intense than those existing in the area and will integrate with, maintain, and improve this commercial area. There has never been an Exception granted for a liquor store at this location.

## 2) Is the alcoholic beverage use designed to be an integral part of a mixed planned unit development?

No. The subject property is located within the CCG-1 zoning district and is not part of a Planned Unit Development (PUD) district. The subject property is development with a standalone building that was developed as a convenience store in the 1960s. The grant of this waiver does not furthers the goals of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan, as described in the companion Exception application.
3) Is the alcoholic beverage use to be located within a shopping center with an aggregate gross leasable area of 50,000 square feet or more, inclusive of all out parcels, and meets the definition of a Restaurant as defined in Section 656.805?

No. The subject property is development with a standalone building that was developed as a convenience store in the 1960s. The site has historically been utilized by a convenience store along a commercial corridor in the Murray Hill neighborhood. The general character of the area along this portion of Edgewood Avenue is commercially zoned, and developed with a variety of permitted uses.
4) Is the alcoholic beverage use directly visible along the line of measurement defined in s. 656.806 and physically separated from a church or school, thereby negating the distance requirement as a result of the extra travel time?

Yes. The proposed establishment is directly visible along the line of measurement defined in Section. 656.806, and is physically separated from the church by Edgewood Avenue; the site can be seen by the public from the front door of Faith's Realm Ministry International. There is no added travel time because of the physical separation.
5) Are there are other existing liquor license locations of a similar nature in the immediate vicinity of the proposed location; provided, however, that no waiver shall be granted pursuant to this criterion if the proposed liquor license location is closer to the church or school than other existing locations?

No. There are no other existing liquor license locations of a similar nature closer to the church.

## SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION

Upon visual inspection of the subject property on October 8, 2019, the Planning and Development Department staff observed that the required Notice of Public Hearing sign was posted. Staff did relocate the sign from its original location as it was not easily visible from the City ROW.


## RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing, it is the recommendation of the Planning and Development Department that Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-19-24 be DENIED.


Aerial


## Subject Property



View from subject property parking lot toward Church


On File
Page 82 of 328

| Date Submitted e. $30: 19$ |
| :--- |
| Date Filed: |


| Application Number: |
| :--- | :--- |
| Public Hearing: $10 \backslash 19-2719$ |

# Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance <br> Requirements for Liquor License Location 



| PROPERTY INFORMATION |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 1. Complete Property Address: <br> 576 Edgewood ave, Jacksonville FL 32205 | 2. Real Estate Number: <br> O61987-0000 |
| 3. Land Area (Acres): | 4. Date Lot was Recorded: <br> 0.241 |
| 5. Property Located Between Streets: <br> Lenox Street and Hamilton/Quincy Streets | 6. Utility Services Provider: <br> City Water / City Sewer <br> Well / Septic <br> $\square$ |

Page 1 of 4
PLANNING AV DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

last update: 1/10/17

| OWNER'S INFORMATION (please attach separate sheet if more than one owner) |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 9. Name: | 10. E-mall: |
| Rudra Rentals LLC | naren0004@gmail.com |
| 11. Address (including city, state, zip): | 12. Preferred Telephone; |
| P. O. Box 6367 |  |
| Jacksonville, FL 32236 | $904-233-1997$ |
|  |  |


| APPLICANT'S INFORMATION (if different from owner) |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 13. Name: | 14. E-mail: <br> Anwar Dakhil |
| anwraz818@hotmail.com |  |
| 15. Address (including city, state, zip): | 16. Preferred Telephone: <br> 1817 Putney Cir <br> Orlando, FL 32837 |

## CRITERIA

Section 656.101(), Ordinance Code, defines a waiver as "a relaxation of the Zoning Code minimum distance requirements for liquor license locations, pursuant to Section 656.805, Ordinance Code."

Section 656.133(a) 1 through 5, Ordinance Code, provides that, with respect to action upon Applications for Waivers, the Planning Commission shall grant a waiver for minimum distance requirements from a church or school for a liquor license location, if there exist one or more circumstances which negate the necessity for complance with the distance requirements, included but not limited to the following:

1. The commercial activity associated with the aleoholic beverage use is of a lesser intensity than the commercial activity assoclated with the alcoholic beverage use which previously existed; e.g., there has been a reduction in the number of seats or square footage or type of license;
2. The alcoholic beverage use is designed to be on integral part of a mixed planned unit development;
3. The alcoholic beverage use is located within a shopping center with an aggregate gross leasable area of 50,000 square feet or more, inclusive of all outparcels, and meets the definition of a bona-fide restourant as defined in Section $656.805(\mathrm{c})$;
4. The alcoholic beverage use is not directly visible along the line of measurement defined in Section 656.805 and is physically separoted from the church or schoal, thereby negating the distonce requirement as a result of the extra travel time; or
5. There are other existing liquor license locotions of a similar nature in the immediate vicinity of the proposed location; provided however, thot no waiver shall be granted pursuant to this criterion if the proposed liquor license location is closer to the church or school than other existing locations.

Page 2 of 4
PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEINRTMENT
 last update: 1/10/17
17. Given the above definition of a "waiver" and the aforementioned criteria by which the request will be reviewed against, please describe the reason that the waiver is being sought. Provide as much information as you can; you may attach a separate sheet if necessary. Please note that failure by the applicant to adequately substantiate the need for the request and to meet the criteria set forth may result in a denial.
Please see Addendum A

## ATTACHMENTS

The following attachments must accompany each copy of the application.
$\square$ Survey
Site Plan - two (2) copies on $81 / 2 \times 11$ and two (2) copies on $11 \times 17$ or larger
Property Ownership Affidavit (Exhibit A)
Agent Authorization if application is made by any person other than the property owner (Exhibit 8)
Legal Description - may be written as either lot and block, or metes and bounds (Exhibit 1)
Proof of property ownership - may be print-out of property appraiser record card if individual owner, htto://apps.cai.net/pao propertySearch/Basic/Search.aspx, or print-out of entry from the Florida Department of State Division of Corporations if a corporate owner, http://search.sunbiz.ore/Inquiry/CorporationSearch/ByName.

## FILING FEES

*Applications filed to correct existing zoning violations are subject to a double fee.

| Base Fee <br> Non-residential District5: $\$ 1,173.00$ | Public Notices <br> $\$ 7.00$ per Addressee | Billed directly to owner/agent |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |

## AUTHORIZATION

please review your application. No application will be accepted until all of the requested information has been supplied and the required fee has been paid. The acceptance of an application as being complete does not guarantee its approval by the Planning Commission. The owner and/or authorized agent must be present at the public hearing.

The required public notice signs must be posted on the property within five $\{5\}$ working days after the filing of this application. Sign(s) must remain posted and maintained until a final determination has been made on the application.

I hereby certify that I have read and understand the information contained in this application, that I am the owner or authorized agent for the owner with authority to make this application, and that all of the information contained in this application, including the attachments, is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.


## SUBMITTAL

This application must be typed or printed in ink and submitted along with three (3) copies for a total of four (4) applications. Each application must include all required attachments.

Submit applications to:
Planning and Development Department, Zoning Section
214 North Hogan Street, $2^{\text {nd }}$ Floor
Jacksonville, Florida 32202
(904) 255-8300

## Addendum A

The property is located at 576 Edgewood ave South Jacksonville FL 32205
This area of Edgewood ave is a 4-lane roadway. There are numerous of other retail and commercial uses in the vicinity. And the package store would be in character with other retail commercial use in the vicinity.
It's a one stand building The proposed new use is for the retail sale of alcoholic beverages for off premises consumption only ( package store) the land use and zoning classification for the property is CCG1, respectively.
-The commercial activity associated with alcoholic beverages purchases is a lesser intensity than the commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverages use in an on premise consumption places. -Since it's a package store only which the customers will purchase the products then go home to consume it so there will not be any alcoholic beverages consumption on the premises.
All alcoholic beverages will not directly be visible along the line of measurement defined in section 656.806 and is physically separated from the church or school thereby negating the distance requirements . The store is approximately 3166 square feet in size. The building is comprised of one story one unit with total of approximately 3166 square feet of space. The building has 9 parking spaces plus 2 handicap spaces. Ingress and egress on Edgewood ave.
The use is limited to the retail of alcoholic beverages for off premises consumption only. And will not create any objectionable noise, lights or nuisance to the surrounding community or any close churches or schools.

## EXHIBITA

## Property Ownership Affidavit-Limited Liability Company (LLC)

Date: ${ }^{8 / 24 / 2019}$
City of Jacksonville
Planning and Development Department
214 North Hagan Street, Suite 300,
Jacksonville, Florida 32202
Re: Property Owner Affidavit for the following site location in Jacksonville, Florida:
Address: 576 Edgewood Ave S, Jacksonville FL 32205 RE\#(s): 061987-0000
To Whom it May Concern:
1 Tribhuvan Patel as President of

Rudra Rentals LLC , a Limited Llability Company organized under the laws of the
state of Florida $\qquad$ , hereby certify that said LLC is the Owner of the property described in Exhibit 1 in connection with filing application(s) for rezoning DisTance LuqiveV submitted to the Jacksonville Planning and Development Department
(signature)

(print name) TRIBHUVAN PATEL
Please provide documentation illustrating that signatory is an authorized representative of the LIC. This may be shown through a printout from sunbiz.org showing that the person is either a "sole member:" or a "managing member." Other persons may be authorized through a resolution, power of attorney, etc.

## STATE OF FLORIDA

## COUNTY OF DUVAL

Sworn to and subscribed and acknowledged before me this 5 Acrust 20 日, by Iribhuvan Patel as Presiclent , of Rudra Rentals LLC, a Limited Liability Company, who is personally known to me or who has produced $F L$ as identification and who took an oath.


## EXHIBIT B

## Agent Authorization - Limited Liability Company (LLC)

Date: 8
City of Jacksonville
Planning and Development Department
214 North Hogan Street, Suite 300,
Jacksonville, Florida 32202
Re: Agent Authorization for the following site location in Jacksonville, Florida:
Address: 576 Edgawood Ave S, Jacksonville FL 32205 REH(5): 061987-0000
To Whom It May Concern:
You are hereby advised that $\quad$ Tribhuvan Patel $\quad$ as President $\quad$ of
Rudra Rentals LLC Rudra Rentals LLC a Limited Liability Company organized under the laws of the state of Florida , hereby certify that said LLC is the Owner of the property described in Exhibit 1. Said owner hereby authorizes and empowers Anwar Dakhit Rezoning to act as agent to file applications) for with such authorization to file such applications, papers, documents, requests and other matters necessary for such requested change as submitted to the Jacksonville Planning and Development Department.
(signature) $\qquad$
(print name) TRIBHUVAN PATEL

## STATE OF FLORIDA

## COUNTY OF DUVAL


$\qquad$ Rudra Rentals LLC, a Limited Liability Company, who is personally known to me or who has produced FL as identification and who took an oath.

(Signature of NOTARY PUBLIC)
(Printed name of NOTARY PUBLIC)
State of Florida at Large. My commission expires: $0<0 / 27 / 2020$


## MAP SHOWING SURVEY OF

LOTS 159 \& 180, BLOCK 78, MURRAY HILL HEIGHTS REPLAT, ACCORDING TO THE PLAT THEREOF RECORDED IN PLAT BOOK 5, PAGES 86 and 8EA, OF THE CURRENT PU日LIC RECORDS OF DUNAL COUNTY, FLORIDA.

FOR: NAREN PATEL

42


CK LAND SURVEYORS, INC.
1660 ENERSON STREFT
RJCOMS Sme 181
( 904 ) 396-8334 FAX (904) 306-61997
anol: eckjonttcoiticom

1.) Tin in ex Bounday surver.
2. Ho obeiret of Thio furition 3. Not critruted for worminats. 4.) Elole a Bavinet N/A

L1 7892


## EXHIBIT 1

Legal Description

## EXHIBIT "A"

Property

Lots 159 and 160, Block 78, REPLAT OF PART OF MURRAY HILL HEIGHTS, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 5, Pages 86 and 86A, of the current Public Records of Duval County, Florida

Property Address: 576 Edgewood Avenue S. Jacksonville, Florida 32205

## 576 tS E WOOD AVE.S. <br> APPLICATION REVIEW SHEET



Forward to Planner $\qquad$

$11 \times 17$ Site Plan (or larger)


Property Dimensions
$\square$ Adjacent Streets \& ROW
Building Location
Parking Spaces depicted
Adjacent property user

$\boxed{\Delta}$
 5
高

IHARAEZ


# APPEAL EXHIBIT 

## "C"

圱 Print

## CrimeMapping.com Map

Friday, November 12, 2021 through Tuesday, May 10, 2022
Showing crime types: Arson, Assault, Burglary, Disturbing the Peace, Drugs / Alcohol Violations, DUI, Fraud, Homicide, Motor Vehicle Theft, Robbery, Sex Crimes, Theft / Larceny, Vandalism, Vehicle Break-In / Theft, Weapons


Grab the bottom/right borders to resize the map or the handle in the bottom right corner.
All representations on this map are distributed and transmitted "AS IS" without warranties of any kind, either express or implied including without limitation, warranties of title or implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. In no event shall CrimeMapping.COM become liable to users of these data for any loss or damages, consequential or otherwise, including but not limited to time, money, goodwill, arising from the use, operation or modification of the data. The visual presentation of data is being provided strictly as a courtesy, not as an obligation to its users.


## Crime Report

| Type | Description | Incident \# | Location | Agency | Date |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| I | RESISTING OFFICER <br> WITHOUT VIOLENCE TO HIS OR HER PERSON | 202200269503 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 5/8/2022 10:40 PM |
| 58) | ASSAULT / AGG / WITH A DEADLY WEAPON WITHOUT INTENT TO KILL | 202200253314 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 5/1/2022 3:40 PM |
| Q | BURGLARY TO A CONVEYANCE - <br> ARMED/BECOMES ARMED <br> WITH DANGEROUS WEAPON | 202200223057 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 4/17/2022 2:00 AM |
| (1) | BURGLARY / CONVEYANCE <br> NOT OCCUPIED - NO <br> ASSAULT/BATTERY - NO <br> WEAPON | 202200209844 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 4/10/2022 1:30 AM |
| 0 | CRIMINAL MISCHIEF > \$1000. OR INTERRUPTION OF BUSINESS OR UTILITIES | 202200207045 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 4/9/2022 9:15 PM |
|  | CARJACKING WITH FIREARM OR DEADLY WEAPON | 202200192483 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 4/3/2022 4:10 AM |


| 5/11/22, 11:3 |  |  | eMapping.com - Helpi | uild a Safer Co |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Type | Description | Incident \# | Location | Agency | Date |
| (H) | MURDER / DANGEROUS ACT EVINCING A DEPRAVED MIND W/O PREMED / 2ND DEG. | 202200131901 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 3/5/2022 2:10 AM |
| 548) | BATTERY- TOUCH OR STRIKE- NO INJURY | 202200113802 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 2/24/2022 4:30 PM |
| \$ | PETIT THEFT - LESS THAN \$100-1ST OFFENSE | 202200100086 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 2/18/2022 2:00 AM |
| \$ | PETIT THEFT 1ST DEGREE \$100 TO LESS THAN \$750 | 202200087652 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 2/12/2022 1:35 PM |
| $\cdots$ | THEFT OF MOTOR VEHICLE LESS THAN \$100,000 | 202100751727 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 12/19/2021 4:00 AM |
| $\Theta$ | BURGLARY TO A CONVEYANCE ARMED/BECOMES ARMED WITH DANGEROUS WEAPON | 202100755634 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 12/11/2021 12:30 AM |
| 붕 | ARMED ROBBERY - FIREARM OR OTHER DEADLY WEAPON | 202100734402 | 5500 BLOCK SOUTEL DR | Jacksonville Sheriff | 12/11/2021 12:00 AM |

## APPEAL PACKET CONCLUDED

# City of Jacksonville, Florida 

## Planning and Development Department

Current Planning Division
Ed Ball Building
ONE CITY. ONE JACKSONVILLE
214 North Hogan Street, Suite 300
Jacksonville, FL 32202
(904) 255-7865
www.coj.net

## Notice of Certification

May 4, 2022

## RE: Certified Copy of Final Order

## I hereby certify that the attached is a true and accurate copy of the Final Order of

 WLD-22-13.WLD-22-13 heard on April 21, 2022


Executive Secretary, I

IN RE: The Application for Waiver of Minimum
Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location
ROYAL HOUSE LIQUORS, INC.

## ORDER APPROVING WITH CONDITION APPLICATION FOR WAIVER OF MINIMUM DISTANCE REOUIREMENTS FOR LIOUOR LICENSE LOCATION WLD-22-13

This matter came to be heard upon the Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-22-13 filed by Anwar's Properties Inc., the owner of certain real property located at 5522 Soutel Drive, RE \#042013-0000, on behalf of Royal House Liquors, Inc., seeking a waiver to reduce the required minimum distance between liquor license location and church from 500 feet to 401 feet, in the CCG-2 Zoning District.

Having duly considered both the testimonial and documentary evidence presented at the public hearing on April 21, 2022, including the Report of the Planning and Development Department on Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-22-13 and all attachments thereto ("Staff Report"), a copy of which is attached as Exhibit "A", the Planning Commission of the City of Jacksonville hereby adopts and incorporates herein the recommendations of the Staff Report, and,

## FINDS AND DETERMINES:

1. That the applicant has complied with all application requirements set forth in Section 656.133 of the Zoning Code.
2. That substantial competent evidence demonstrates that the application WLD-22-13 meets, to the extent applicable, the standards and criteria set forth in Section 656.133(a) of the Zoning Code.
3. The land to which this waiver is granted is owned by Anwar's Properties Inc. A copy of the legal description of the subject property is attached as part of Exhibit "A" and incorporated by reference herein.

NOW THEREFORE, it is ORDERED by the Planning Commission:

1. A Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-22-13 is hereby granted to Royal House Liquors, Inc., thereby reducing the required minimum distance between liquor license location and church from 500 feet to 401 feet, in the CCG-2 Zoning District.
2. In conformity with state licensing requirements, the exception hereby granted shall be personal to the license applicant/holder, non-transferable, and shall not run with the land as provided by Section 656.136(c) of the Zoning Code.
3. The waiver hereby granted is subject to the following condition:
a. The business shall not open before 1:00 PM on Sunday.
4. Failure to exercise the waiver herein granted by commencement of the use or action herein approved within one (1) year of the effective date of this order shall render this waiver invalid and all rights arising hereunder shall terminate.
5. The Waiver herein shall not be construed as an exemption from any other applicable local, state or federal laws, regulations, requirements, permits or approvals. All other applicable local, state or federal permits or approvals shall be obtained before commencement of the development or use and issuance of this Waiver is based upon acknowledgement, representation and confirmation made by the applicant(s), owner(s), developer(s) and/or any authorized agent(s) or designee(s) that the subject business, development and/or use will be operated in strict compliance with all laws. Issuance of this Waiver does not approve, promote or condone any practice or act that is prohibited or restricted by any federal, state or local laws.
6. The approval granted herein shall not interfere with or abrogate or annul any easement, covenant or other agreement between any parties. In the event that the provisions of this Order impose a greater restriction upon the use, structures or development of the property than are imposed or required by other ordinances, rules, regulations or by easements, covenants or agreements, the provisions of this Order shall control.

Executed this 21st day of April, 2022.


## FORM APPROVED:



## Copies to:

Paul M. Harden, Esquire
1431 Riverplace Boulevard, Suite 901
Jacksonville, FL, 32207
Applicant/Agent
Anwar's Properties, Inc.
5522 Soutel Drive
Jacksonville, FL 32219
Owner

NOTICE: This Order does not become final until the expiration of the twenty-one (21) day appeal period provided in the Zoning Code. Any work commenced during this appeal period is done at the risk of the applicant, and a building permit will only be issued after an Acknowledgement of the appeal period has been obtained from the Zoning Counter and returned to same executed properly by the applicant(s) or their agent(s).

# REPORT OF THE PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT <br> APPLICATION FOR WAIVER OF MINIMUM DISTANCE REQUIREMENTS 

## FOR LIQUOR LICENSE LOCATION WLD-22-13

|  | APRIL 7, 2022 |
| :---: | :---: |
| Location: | 5522 Soutel Drive between Dostie Drive South and Washington Estates Drive |
| Real Estate Number: | 042013-0000 |
| Waiver Sought: | Reduce the required minimum distance between liquor license location and church from 500 feet to 401 feet |
| Current Zoning District: | Commercial Community/General-2 (CCG-2) |
| Current Land Use Category: | Community/General Commercial (CGC) |
| Planning District: | Northwest, District 5 |
| Applicant/Agent: | Paul M. Harden, Esq. 1431 Riverplace Boulevard, Suite 901 Jacksonville, FL 32207 |
| Owner: | Anwar's Properties, Inc. 5522 Soutel Drive Jacksonville, FL 32219 |
| Staff Recommendation: | APPROVE |

## GENERAL INFORMATION

Application or Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-22-13 seeks to reduce the required minimum distance between the subject property and the Friendship Missionary Baptist Church ( 7141 New Kings Road), from 500 feet to 401 feet. The church was constructed in the 1970s.

The property is an existing retail center constructed in 1968. An establishment for the retail sale of beer, wine and liquor for off premises consumption is a permitted use in the CCG-2 Zoning District. The present property owners have been operating the business since 1993 and have owned the property since 2002. The following applications have been previously approved related to this property and its current use, E-93-134, V-93-130, E-95-134 which allowed for the sale of beer, wine and liquor for the subject property.

The property is within the King Soutel Neighborhood Action Plan (NAP) and the Kings Soutel Community Redevelopment Area (CRA). The WLD-22-13 was heard by the King Soutel Crossing CRA Advisory Board on March 24, 2022. The agent explained the application, the need for the waiver and the criteria for evaluation. After discussion, the Advisory Board voted 41 to recommend approval of the waiver with three conditions.

1. The license is made personable to the business and cannot be transferred.
2. The license is for off premises consumption only.
3. The business shall not open before 1:00 PM on Sunday's.

The first two conditions are standard with the approved Final Order issued by the Planning Commission. Staff is recommending condition \#3.

## DEFINITION

According to Section 656.1601 of the Zoning Code, the term waiver means a relaxation of the Zoning Code minimum distance requirements for liquor license locations, pursuant to Section 656.805 of the Zoning Code, and for minimum street frontage, pursuant to Section 656.407 of the Zoning Code. Waivers are authorized to be granted by the Planning Commission pursuant to the criteria set forth in Section 656.133 of the Zoning Code.

## STANDARDS, CRITERIA AND FINDINGS

Pursuant to the provisions of Section 656.133 of the Zoning Code, a waiver of minimum distance requirements for liquor license location may be granted if the Planning Commission makes a positive finding based on substantial, competent evidence that the application meets one or more of the following criteria:
(i) Is the commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverage use of a lesser intensity than the commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverage use which previously existed; e.g., there has been a reduction in the number of seats or square footage or type of license?

Yes. The existing building has three tenants. There is a restaurant that serves beer, wine and liquor for on premises consumption. The proposed package store, which is for off premises consumption, will operate in a different portion of the building.
(ii) Is the alcoholic beverage use designed to be an integral part of a mixed planned unit development?

No. The subject property is zoned CCG-2 with an existing approximately 15,000 square foot building. The building is located in a commercial corridor that offers a wide range of service garages, motel and institutional uses. The granting of this waiver would further the 2030 Comprehensive Plan by allowing infill and redevelopment of existing
commercial areas in lieu of permitting new areas to commercialize. The proposed waiver of liquor distance will promote economic viability to the New Kings Road commercial corridor.
(iii) Is the alcoholic beverage use to be located within a shopping center with an aggregate gross leasable area of 50,000 square feet or more, inclusive of all out parcels, and meets the definition of a bona fide restaurant as defined in Section 656.805?

No. The proposed use is located in a free-standing commercial structure that is approximately 15,000 square feet in size. The property is part of the commercial corridor located along New Kings Road that has historically been utilized by commercial uses.
(iv) Is the alcoholic beverage use directly visible along the line of measurement defined in s. 656.806 and physically separated from a church or school, thereby negating the distance requirement as a result of the extra travel time?

No. The front door of the license location is not visible from the Greater New Hope Missionary Baptist Church. The front door of the license location faces New Kings Road. The Zoning Code requires the measurement be from the proposed business to the nearest property line of the church. However, the nearest church property is an undeveloped grassy knoll and the church building is actually 802 feet away. Additionally, to drive or walk to the license location is a distance of 1,000 feet via Soutel Drive then along New Kings Road.
(v) Are there are other existing liquor license locations of a similar nature in the immediate vicinity of the proposed location; provided, however, that no waiver shall be granted pursuant to this criterion if the proposed liquor license location is closer to the church or school than other existing locations?

No. There are no existing liquor license locations in the immediate area. There was a restaurant which allowed the sale of all alcoholic beverages for on premises consumption. That restaurant has since closed.

## SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION

Upon visual inspection of the subject property on March 25, 2022, the Planning and Development Department staff did notice that the required Notice of Public Hearing signs were posted.


## RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing, it is the recommendation of the Planning and Development Department that Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location WLD-22-13 be APPROVED WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITION.

1. The business shall not open before 1:00 PM on Sunday.


View of subject property


View of subject property


Aerial view of subject property


On File
Page 111 of 328


## Application for Waiver of Minimum Distance Requirements for Liquor License Location <br> City of Jacksonville, Florida Planning and Development Department

Please type or print in ink. Instructions regarding the completion and submittal of this application are located at the end of this form. For additional information, please contact the Planning and Development Department at (904) 255-7865.


| OWNER'S INFORMATION (please attach separate sheet if more than one owner) |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 9. Name: <br> AnWar's Properties, Inc. | 10. E-mail: |
| 11. Address (including city, state, zip): 12. Preferred Telephone: <br> 5522 Soutel Dr.  <br> Jacksonville, FL 32219  |  |


| APPLICANT'S INFORMATION (if different from owner) |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 13. Name: | 14. E-mail: <br> Paul M. Harden |
| paul_harden@bellsouth.net |  |
| 15. Address (including city, state, zip): <br> 1431 Riverplace Blvd., Suite 901 <br> Jacksonville, FL 32207 | 16. Preferred Telephone: <br>  |

## CRITERIA

Section 656.101(I), Ordinance Code, defines a waiver as "a relaxation of the Zoning Code minimum distance requirements for liquor license locations, pursuant to Section 656.805, Ordinance Code."

Section 656.133(a)1 through 5, Ordinance Code, provides that, with respect to action upon Applications for Waivers, the Planning Commission shall grant a waiver for minimum distance requirements from a church or school for a liquor license location, if there exist one or more circumstances which negate the necessity for compliance with the distance requirements, included but not limited to the following:

1. The commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverage use is of a lesser intensity than the commercial activity associated with the alcoholic beverage use which previously existed; e.g., there has been a reduction in the number of seats or square footage or type of license;
2. The alcoholic beverage use is designed to be an integral part of a mixed planned unit development;
3. The alcoholic beverage use is located within a shopping center with an aggregate gross leasable area of 50,000 square feet or more, inclusive of oll outparcels, and meets the definition of a bona-fide restourant as defined in Section $656.805(\mathrm{c})$;
4. The alcoholic beveroge use is not direstly visible along the line of measurement defined in Section 656.806 and is physically separated from the church or school, thereby negating the distance requirement as a result of the extra travel time; or
5. There are other existing liquor license locations of a similar noture in the immediate vicinity of the proposed location; provided however, that no waiver shall be granted pursuant to this criterion if the proposed liquor license location is closer to the church or school than other existing locations.

Page 2 of 4
PLIVVIVG AND DEVELOPNENT DEPARTVEVT

17．Given the above definition of a＂waiver＂and the aforementioned criteria by which the request will be reviewed against，please describe the reason that the waiver is being sought．Provide as much information as you can；you may attach a separate sheet if necessary．Please note that failure by the applicant to adequately substantiate the need for the request and to meet the criteria set forth may result in a denial．
The alcoholic beverage use is not directly visible along the line of measurement defined in Section 656.806 and is physically separated from the church or school，thereby negating the distance requirement as a result of the extra travel time．

## ATTACHMENTS

The following attachments must accompany each copy of the application．
Survey
Site Plan－two（2）copies on $81 / 2 \times 11$ and two（2）copies on $11 \times 17$ or larger
Property Ownership Affidavit（Exhibit A）
Agent Authorization if application is made by any person other than the property owner（Exhibit B）
Legal Description－may be written as either lot and block，or metes and bounds（Exhibit 1）
Proof of property ownership－may be print－out of property appraiser record card if individual owner，http：／／apps．coj．net／pao propertySearch／Basic／Search．aspx，or print－out of entry from the Florida Department of State Division of Corporations if a corporate owner， http：／／search．sunbiz．org／Inquiry／CorporationSearch／ByName．

## FILING FEES

*Applications filed to correct existing zoning violations are subject to a double fee.

| Base Fee | Public Notices | $\frac{\text { Advertisement }}{\text { Non-residential Districts: } \$ 1,173.00}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $\$ 7.00$ per Addressee | Billed directly to owner/agent |  |

## AUTHORIZATION

Please revlew your application. No application will be accepted until all of the requested information has been supplied and the required fee has been paid. The acceptance of an application as being complete does not guarantee its approval by the Planning Commission. The owner and/or authorized agent must be present at the public hearing.

The required public notice signs must be posted on the property within five (5) working days after the filing of this application. Sign(s) must remain posted and maintained until a final determination has been made on the application.

I hereby certify that I have read and understand the information contained in this application, that I am the owner or authorized agent for the owner with authority to make this application, and that all of the information contained in this application, including the attachments, is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

| Owner(s) | Applicant or Agent (if different than owner) |
| :---: | :---: |
| Print name: | Print name: Paul M. Harden |
| Signature: | Signature: Pane kande |
| Owner(s) | *An agent authorization letter is required if the |
| Print name: | application is made by ony person other thon the |
| Signature: | property owner. |

## SUBMITTAL <br> This application must be typed or printed in ink and submitted along with three (3) copies for a total of four (4) applications. Each application must include all required attachments. <br> Submit applications to: <br> Planning and Development Department, Zoning Section <br> 214 North Hogan Street, $2{ }^{\text {nd }}$ Floor <br> Jacksonville, Florida 32202 <br> (904) 255-8300

## Page 4 of 4

PLANNJNG AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTAENT


## EXHIBIT 1

Legal Description

Lot 1, Block 1, WASHINGTON ESTATES, UNIT 3, as recorded in Plat Book 32, pages 28 and 28A, of the current public records of Duval County, Florida, together with part of Lot 57, Lot 76, and a former road, subdivision of a part of Francis Bagley and Charles Sibbald Grants for H.H. Simmons Realty Co., as recorded in Plat Book 3, page 85, of said public records, all being more particularly described as follows:

Commencing at the intersection of the Southeasterly right-of-way line of Soutel Drive, a righ-Kof-way of varied width, with the Northwesterly prolongation of the Southwesterly right-of-way line of Dostie Drive South, a 60 foot right of way as now established; thence South $66^{\circ} 19^{\prime} 34^{\prime \prime}$ East, by and along said prolongation, a distance of 24.18 feet for a point of beginning; thence continue South $66^{\circ} 19^{\prime} 34^{\prime} 1$ East, by and along said Southwesterly right-of-way, a distance of 129.22 feet to the Southeasterly boundary of said Lot I, Block 1 ; thence South $23^{\circ} 05^{\prime} 30^{\prime \prime}$ West, by and along said Southeasterly boundary, a distance of 89.45 feet to the Southwesterly boundary of said Washington Estates, Unit 3; thence South $14^{\circ} 37^{\prime} 18^{\prime \prime}$ West, by and along the Northwesterly boundary of Lot 12, Block I, Washington Estates, Unit 4, as recorded in Plat Book 33, pages 43 and 43A, of said public records, a distance of 101.65 feet to the Northeasterly right-of-way line of Washington Estates Drive, a 60 foot right-of-way as now established; thence North $65^{\circ} 04^{\prime} 40^{\prime \prime}$ West, by and along said Northeasterly right-of-way line, a distance of 183.80 feet to the Southeasterly right-of-way line of said Soutel Drive; thence North $25^{\circ} 35^{\prime} 30^{\prime \prime}$ East, by and along said Southeasterly right-of-way line a distance of 100.00 feet to an angle point in said right-of-way line; thence South $65^{\circ}$ $04^{\prime} 40^{\prime \prime}$ East, a distance of 7.23 feet to an angle point; thence North $25^{\circ} 35^{\prime} 30^{\prime \prime}$ East, continuing by and along said right-of-way line, a distance of 61.90 feet to a point of curvature; thence around and along a curve to the right, said curve having a radius of 25.00 feet and a delta of $88^{\circ} 04^{\prime} 56^{\prime \prime}$, an arc distance of 38.43 feet (North $69^{\circ} 377^{\prime \prime} 58^{\prime \prime}$ East, 34.76 feet, chord bearing and distance) to a point of tangency and the point of beginning. (Except any portion in road right of way)

## MAP SHOWING SPECIFIC PURPOSE SURVEY OF

the location of all schools. churches and adult entertainment ESTABLISHMENTS WITHIN A 1.500 FOOT RADIUS OF 5516 SOUTEL DRIVE. JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA.

THERE ARE NO EXISTING SCHOOLS, CHURCHES, OR ADULT ENTERTAINMENT ESTABLISHMENTS WITHIN A 1,500 FOOT RADIUS OF 5516 SOUTEL DRIVE. JACKSONVILLE, FLOR DA UNLESS SHOWN HEREON.

```
CERTIFIED TO: ANWAR DAKHIL
```


A. FRIENDSHIP MISSIONARY EAPTIST CHURCH - 7141 NEW KINGS RO - 401 FT
8. S.A. HULL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL - 7528 HULL ST - 898 FT
C. ST. PAUL AFRICAN METHODIST CHURCH - 6910 NEW KINGS RD - 1435 FT
D. MISSIONARY AFRICAN UNIVERSAL CHURCH - D DABULA DR - 896 FT
E. PHILISPIAN COMMUNITY CHURCH - O NEW KINGS RD - 538 FT





# City of Jacksonville, Florida 

Planning and Development Department
Current Planning Division Ed Ball Building 214 North Hogan Street, Suite 300 Jacksonville, FL 32202
(904) 255-7865
www.coj.net

Notice of Certification
May 4, 2022

RE: Appeal of WLD-22-13

## Please find attached:

* Certified 350 ft. property owner list
* Certified speaker / provider of written statement list
* Copy of Final Order
* Copy of Meeting Transcript

If there are any further questions, please feel free to contact me at (904) 255-7829

WLD-22-13 Heard on April 21, 2022
Patricia Sales
Patrecia \&ales
Executive Secretary, I

ONE CITY. ONE JACKSONVILLE.

City of Jacksonville, Florida<br>Planning and Development Department<br>Current Planning Division<br>Ed Ball Building<br>214 North Hogan Street, Suite 300<br>Jacksonville, FL 32202<br>(904) 255-7865<br>www.coj.net

## Notice of Certification

May 4, 2022

RE: Certified 350 ft. Property Owner List

I hereby certify that the attached is a true and accurate copy of the owners of real property within three hundred and fifty feet of the boundaries of the land regarding Application:

WLD-22-13 heard on April 21, 2022


Patricia Sales
Executive Secretary, I

| 869L－8LZZE ไ＇＇3าาinNOSXכV์ 431 W甘กTIM NHOS 9Z8LI <br>  OOTO SELIDO Evtzam |  |  S y 3ilisoo 9tes S／4 甘ITIIBL 甘TIN甘ININO 0000 LTOZかO 5．28－29 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| － |  |  |
| 00Et－60zze \％＇zmitanosxวvi |  |  |
| YO 531VISE NOLONIHSVM 90ES | N1 771H $3 \mathrm{Nld} \mathrm{t} / \mathrm{SS}$ | yo ouvilog zdes |
|  | YGHOd BAVNBY VIINGOL NOS43L3d |  |
| 0000 sttzto $\mathrm{tr} \pi \mathrm{om}$ | $0000 \text { viozvo }$ | $0000 \text { SSIz }$ |
|  |  |  |
| OATG ON3 3 E9V COTLL |  |  |
| HOJS Syjuw |  | 3NLLSENY SMJHLLVW |
| $010095[z 00$ 5t：e－6w | 0000 95TZカD | $000096 \pm 2 \mathrm{tto}$ |
|  | LOOT＊50zze רษ＇3า |  |
| yo noynaizees | \％Noy＾30 05es |  |
|  | 31 V153 H 5 OOIJYyd NOSNHOT | 71535 גэราOH |
| 0000 9pOZto 51.601 m | 0000 8b0ZかO E150\％ |  |
|  |  | bSZZE 2¢＇371＾NNOSXVV＇ |
| y0 37vas |  | OY SLTVROY 2 V LS |
| ב j3kor sjnioh | 13 NBYO SNITרOH |  |
| 0000 9とtzo 0 4： 5 － 10 | $0000 \text { 9ZOZ.t0 }$ | $\begin{gathered} 0000 \text { SLOZVO } \\ \text { texolm } \end{gathered}$ |
|  |  | $96008 \forall 9$ \％Hinา o |
| 8EET－60zze ר̇＇3minnosyovi |  |  |
| צ0 ŞIVISヨ NOISNIHSVM SIEs | צ0า91nos 12 ¢ร | SJWOH YOOY日NJAVH O／כ |
| VIINOYj Niflit |  | 517 צฺMOY\％ |
| 0000 setz70 \＄1 2 Com |  cttom |  |
| 0＜8e－6izze it＇3nาunosxovi |  | 2T0t－60zze 7 ＇silinnosxovi |
| ay S9NIX M3N IDIL | S 80 כıls | S yo 3 ¢SOO＜LEs |
|  | givisa m nvor sinvo | Э $\mathrm{N} \backslash 17117 \mathrm{Y}$ צSMOD |
| 0 OtOO DE9tto Etrocm |  | $\begin{array}{r} 00008202+0 \\ \mathrm{tr} \cdot t-1 \mathrm{Am} \\ \hline \end{array}$ |
|  |  |  |
| H0 7 Minos oets | yotginos ezts | yo $731 \mathrm{nOS} \mathrm{g}\langle\mathrm{b}$ |
| H17 Taw | प7HLIINYBE NOLAVTJ | yr 3inn 38 ¢y\％io |
| 0000660270 $5 \pi$ |  | $00000 \mathrm{OELL} \mathrm{~L}$ |
|  |  |  |
|  | 7 H HLOT 15 NV OOH N tit |  |
| ya tainos slbs |  | 17 Yooyenvy szv |
| 31NN39 \％ 3 | 311／＾NOSXJVT Jo Mil | 53y073a NษHVIT\％ |
| 0000 ZELIDO \＆t 21 dim | 0000 6ZLTDO Ettrom | $0000 \text { 9tozto }$ |
|  |  |  |
|  | \％ |  |
| LSחHL 8 givi nmoug |  | כוֹy |
| 0000 TELIDO E17\％ | 0000 ELOZロO <br> nt | $\begin{gathered} 0000 \text { tzozto } \\ \text { turonm } \end{gathered}$ |
|  |  | On File |
|  |  | ge 121 of 328 |

wno 2113
0420290000
SANDERS YVONNE ET AL.
C/O SYLVIA NORWOOD
5305 DOSTIE DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1012
wLo 22.13
0420470000
SMITH ELEASE
5342 DEVRON DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209.1007

## WID. 22.13

0417370000
STORE MASTER FUNDING II LLC 9500 S DADELAND BLVD SUITE 800 MIAMI, FL 33156

## wno 22.4

0417540000
TNKG LLC
5950 DUNN AVE
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32218
WLD-22.13
O42138 0000
WILLIAMS DELL JR
S345 WASHINGTON ESTATES DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209.1338

WLD-22-13
WLD-22-13

FRIENDSHIP MISSIONARY BAPTIST CHURCH
7141 NEW KiNGS ROAD
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219
S.A. HULL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
7528 HULL STREET
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219
mid. 22.13
$04163 \pm 0010$
SHERWOOD AUTO PARTS INC 7257 NEW KINGS RD JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219-3872
w.0.12.13

0416330040
SOUTEL LS HOLDINGS LLC
5359 WASHINGTON ESTATES OR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209
mo 22.13
0421370000
SWAIN LAVERNE T
5335 WASHINGTON ESTATES DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1338
mos.3.13
0420180000
WASHINGTON MICHAEL A
1362 SUNNYMEADE DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32211
mo.12.13
0417270000
WILLIAMS EUGENE B
400 E BAY ST STE 1011
JACKSONVILLE, FL $32202-2954$

ma.23.3
KINLOCK CIVIC ASSOCIATION
EARL SIMS
6455 MANHATTAN OR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219

WLD-22-13
ANWAR'S PROPERTIES, INC 5522 SOUTEL DRIVE
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219

WLD-22-13
ANWAR'S PROPERTIES, INC 5522 SOUTEL DRIVE
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219

ST. PAUL AFRICAN METHODIST CHURCH 6910 NEW KINGS ROAD
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219
vap. $2 \mathrm{z} \cdot 1 \mathrm{l}$
0421340000
SMITH ALBIRDA E ESTATE 5305 WASHINGTON ESTATES DR JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209.1338
v 10.12 .13
0417350000
SQUARE HOME SERVICES LLC
2991 NW 44 ST
MIAMI, FL 33142
wno.2n. 13
0417360000
TBTRUST
5521 SOUTEL OR
JACKSONVILE, FL 32219.3466
who-22.21
0420450000
WELLS ULLIAN 5
5320 DEVRON DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1007
whatan
0421580000
WOODARD SHIRLEY
5316 BOILARD DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1306

M10.21.23
NORTHWEST
RHONDA BOYD
9381 ARBOR OAK LN
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32208

WLD-22-13
PAUL M HARDEN, ESQ
1431 RIVERPLACE BLVD, STE 901
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32207

WLD-22-13
PAUL M HARDEN, ESQ
1431 RIVERPLACE BLVD, STE 901
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32207

MISSIONARY AFRICAN UNIVERSAL CHURCH ODABULA DRIVE
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219
Help Us Fight! The property owner of 5516 and 5522 Soutel Drive wants to open another liquor store in our neighborhood. Unfortunately, the Planning Commission will approve his Wavier of Liquor Distance, WLD, if we don't show them that the residents want the WLD denied! By signing this petition you are telling the City of Jacksonville Planning Commission that you do not want another business in our community that sells alcoholic beverages. This document will serve no other purpose than the purpose described above.




The property owner of 5516 and 5522 Soutel Drive wants to open another liquor store in our neighborhood. Unfortunately, the Planning Commission will approve his Wavier of Liquor Distance, WLD, if we don't show them that the residents want the WLD deniedl By signing this petition you are telling the City of Jacksonville Planning Commission that you do not want another business in our community that sells alcoholic beverages. This document will serve no other purpose than the purpose described above.

Help Us Fight!
The property owner of 5516 and 5522 Soutel Drive wants to open another liquor store in our neighborhood. Unfortunately, the Planning
Help Us Fight!
The property owner of 5516 and 5522 Soutel Drive wants to open another liquor store in our neighborhood. Unfortunately, the Planning Commission will approve his Wavier of Liquor Distance, WLD, if we don't show them that the residents want the WLD deniedl By signing this petition you are telling the City of Jacksonville Planning Commission that you do not want another business in our community that sells alcoholic beverages. This document will serve no other purpose than the purpose described above.

|  | Name (Print) | Street Address | Signature | Date |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. | haphne Nance | 5702 Soutel OR Keksonvile | Mcipla y | 4119122 |
| 2. | Sared tope | 9507 Charca Vista Ct. | - 2 true | $4 / 20 / 22$ |
| 3. | Katrina Hope | 9507 Charralista ct 32228 |  | $4 / 20 / 22$ |
| 4. | DORIS BESS | 2564 Ropert st 32209 | Nusiom. Buax | $4 / 20 / 22$ |
| 5. | Versa Eoodonan | 423 dearlei jf csou 32202 | 20mel8ina | 4/20/22 |
| 6. | Sampli whatsa | 442 gl Gistarme or 27268 | Zomell whison | $4 / 20 / 22$ |
| 7. | Anithen y tarrell | Oioustranton $41 / 1 /$ Nor | Goter 7 und | 4 $1-21-72$ |
| 8. | Divayne Lactios | TO2 CHATMEFLN 52,218 | Y | 4-20-3022 |
| 9. | Jooroxluisiblei | 119 Schovier key P//32218 | 隹icrevtias enblezy | +1/20 20 |
| 10. | Jannie Lrar | 11230 Sadale club or. 32219 | Counule jane | $4 / 20 / 202$ |
| 11. | SAPARLES LANET3. | (1230 gaposes crus pr. 32219 | Exacrser | $\text { 4/20 } 22$ |
| 12. | Kachael larkins | 902 Chalmet Ln 32218 | M as rackrabers | $4 / 20 / 22$ |
| 13. | Bladus Denson - Pourh | 3501 lownsend Blual 4253 | MRap Alurson - Pouch | $04 / 20 / 22$ |
| 14. | Rosaiyn Harde | 5755 Soutel To. 32219 | Y- | C1-20-22 |
| 15. | Shirley Fi, Baker | 9804 Nortolk Blud 32208 |  | 4/20/22 |
| 16. | Marlo conble | 5710 Lendix the | VVC هre |  |
| 17. | Kevin Hartr | 9638 siumet drior lan 32097 | ginem flowed | 4/20/22 |
| 18. | - berria Uodatelk | $3(8) 1150$ | $A \sim R \rightarrow$ | 4100102 |
| 19. | Mourlsampre |  |  | 47202 |
| 2 C . | - | - 7 |  | 11 |
| 21. | $J$ |  |  |  |
| 22. |  |  |  |  |
| 23. |  |  |  |  |
| 24. |  |  |  |  |
| 25. |  |  |  |  |

The property owner of 5516 and 5522 Soutel Drive wants to open another liquor store in our neighborhood. Unfortunately, the Planning Commission will approve his Wavier of Liquor Distance, WLD, if we don't show them that the residents want the WLD denied! By signing this petition you are telling the City of Jacksonville Planning Commission that you do not want another business in our community that sells alcoholic beverages. This document will serve no other purpose than the purpose described above.

|  | Name (Print) | Street Address | Signature | pate |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. | Wichape T. Wells sk. | 12.564 Buscaune lalce D)F | Michar 2, blelle the | 411922 |
| 2. | - dalie trenter | $11291 \mathrm{ltar13}$ Fd \#2201 | coleo tivester | $4720 / 22$ |
| 3. | PATRICIA LASTER | 15868 BAXTER CRDR | Patuceifo Sjister. | $472012{ }^{2}$ |
| 4. | phyuina coleman | 15868 B4XTERCK DR | Dern | $4 / 20 / 22=$ |
| 5. | Nilliam Hurst | 158868 BAKTER CK DR | N, Sim CH | 4120122 |
| 6. | LuIS FLOWERS | $)^{1} 373$ BEAY MOFL3 | Lun $1+7$ lore | $4 / 20 / 22$ |
| 7. | Avthamy T. Themas | isc3 Ollice da. | A Siver | 4-20-22 |
| 8. | Parbara Roburtson | 2031 Danson St | Barbare Wobeitoens | 4-2v-22 |
| 9. | 佑laine Borry | 755 ralley forge ke | Helane Bely | $4-24-2$ |
| 10. | La retter les esne | 9415 Eveslum ind | cosorella $\begin{array}{r}\text { bera }\end{array}$ | 9-24-22 |
| 11. | zeredmelte Sffron | Wes 3ig9 palifue fx | - lannetive chnor | 4-22-22 |
| 12. | G Goria c. Mervin | 617.5 Yettifond inc. 14. | cer clyke. | $4-22.22$ |
| 13. | Comilacm 4 | 916412 ave | Ronumie clone Gr | $4-22.22$ |
| 14. | Cherrlly Jons | 916412 AVe | Cherrily forses | $422 \times 7$ |
| 15. | Iennif Palley | 226S-NETTLEBMDOKSTM | Temmi Talley | + 42 |
| 16. | - |  |  |  |
| 17. |  |  |  |  |
| 18. |  |  |  |  |
| 19. |  |  |  |  |
| 20. |  |  |  |  |
| 21. |  |  |  |  |
| 22. |  |  |  |  |
| 23. |  |  |  |  |
| 24. |  |  |  |  |
| 25. |  |  |  |  |

Help Us Fight!
The property owner of 5516 and 5522 Soutel Drive wants to open another liquor store in our neighborhood. Unfortunately, the Planning Commission will approve his Wavier of Liquor Distance, WLD, if we don't show them that the residents want the WLD deniedl By signing this petition you are telling the City of Jacksonville Planning Commission that you do not want another business in our community that sells alcoholic beverages. This document will serve no other purpose than the purpose described above.

|  | Name (Print) | 亃 Street Address | Signature | Date |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. | [-7) |  | - |  |
| 2. | 2tsprif (ixicolman | XO2\% in ${ }^{\text {a }}$ Wing due | Fud Coickeveruyt | $24 / 1912$ |
| 3. | Sheriul Latosa | $7388 /$ culand It | Wharal दar ma ' | N49122 |
| 4. | Tnamen E. Fral:n | 5065 sontel DR | Qumi Soptage | 41912 |
| 5. | athi blacki" | Futges $\mathrm{Cd} 322 \times 8$ | Nider Ex氏ob | 419122 |
| 6. | Deborah lidallace | 52.1 Frelormicksburcave. | (a) kath oftaliace | 4-19-22 |
| 7. | Ame w. Canten | $52 \% 1$ Freixriersburs Avir. | Cluag wo rocintar | $4-19-72$ |
| 8. | Wikki lvallace | 5221 Fredricksbura Ate. | T/ulibir Waylal | $4-19-22$ |
| 9. | Toby Johnson | Yy09 soufel prive | 20 in | 4/20/82 |
| 10. | WiluIam Sweet | 4409 Soutel Drive | W8E 1 | $4 / 20 / 32$ |
| 11. | witina bowens | 4572 PrituricdrN 3220 | TH0breen | $4-20 / 22$ |
| 12. |  |  |  |  |
| 13. |  |  |  |  |
| 14. |  |  |  |  |
| 15. |  |  |  |  |
| 16. |  |  |  |  |
| 17. |  |  |  |  |
| 18. |  |  |  |  |
| 19. |  |  |  |  |
| 2C. |  |  |  |  |
| 21. |  |  |  |  |
| 22. |  |  |  |  |
| 23. |  |  |  |  |
| 24. |  |  |  |  |
| 25. |  |  |  |  |

## The property owner of 5516 and 5522 Soutel Drive wants to open another liquo

The property owner of 5516 and 5522 Soutel Drive wants to open another liquor store in our neighborhood．Unfortunately，the Planning
Commission will approve his Wavier of Liquor Distance，WLD，if we don＇t show them that the residents want the WLD deniedl By signing this petition you are telling the City of Jacksonville Planning Commission that you do not want another business in our community that sells alcoholic beverages．This document will serve no other purpose than the purpose described above．

|  | Name（Print） | Street Address | Signature | Date |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. | Daohin Lance， | 5702 Socitel DR keksonulle | LCula ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | $4 / 19 / 22$ |
| 2. | marr 7 broond | 5934 noitic orv | duenes 10 saly | 417122 |
| 3. |  |  | 11．Hextur | $4 / 17 / 22$ |
| 4. | Sckaizis dodises | $735 \leqslant$ DOSTi心 $2 \sim$ |  | $4 / 14120$ |
| 5. | 100\％I－Ceosy | 5317 Dastie DR Soutis |  | $419 / 22$ |
| 6. | Comh Mobslech | प420 homes atherit | H2nrisalut | $4 \times 112$ |
| 7. | Heten $\sqrt{\text { tamition }}$ | 5253 Dostie Dr s | chers ${ }^{\text {chamultu }}$ | 4．19－22 |
| 8. | Mamir L Brightuas | 5263 Dostie Dr．S． | Yhanue \＆Breputzk as | $4 / 19 / 2{ }^{2}$ |
| 9. | Caver E E，aog | －3045 Dosine D2 | Afitay \％\％obon | ＋119 20 |
| 10. | Cayif ${ }^{\text {cos }}$ |  | 2．8 16 | 4．19－2， |
| 11. | $\rightarrow(1)$ | H20 TSMbs Dukasa | MRNA Fister | $1+1922$ |
| 12． | cir 71 |  | $1)^{1}(6)$ | C－6， 23 |
| 13. | Hesua 4 析 | Lu 742 ＇Toutrk I | Fnumblater |  |
| 14. | samar sualazz |  | － | f－20－22 |
| 15. | Masurase filitcone | 5264 ¢ 2 diर，人4． | $234 x$ anda delaids | 41042 |
| 16. | loslie b sopena | $53060057 l e d i s$ | Mianl 3 Saml | $4 / 20 / 22$ |
| 17. | Patricia Bnuciot | 532 PD ，stie Dr st | Platicie UPunt | $4 / 26 / 22$ |
| 18. | Johnathan trime | .7153 Richerd sun Pd | UGMab2 C P | $4 / 21 / 22$ |
| 19. |  |  | $\checkmark$ ， |  |
| 2 C. |  |  |  |  |
| 21. |  |  |  |  |
| 22. |  |  |  |  |
| 23. |  |  |  |  |
| 24. |  |  |  |  |
| 25. |  |  | $\rangle$ |  |

# City of Jacksonville, Florida 

Planning and Development Department
Current Planning Division
ONE CITY. ONE JACKSONVILLE.

## Notice of Certification

May 4, 2022

RE: Certified Speaker / Provider of Written Statement List

I hereby certify that attached are the complete names and mailing addresses of any and all persons who either provided a written statement to, or testified before, the Commission regarding Application:

WLD-22-13 heard on April 7, 2022 \& April 21, 2022


Patricia Sales
Executive Secretary, I

## WRITTEN STATEMENTS SUBMITTED FOR WLD-22-13

1. Paige Hyskell, BSN, RN
paigepruitt@bellsouth.net
2. Lela Williams
3. Tony \& Jerri Salter
4. Angie Nixon
5. Tyrona Clark-Murray
leolady2049@gmail.com tigersalt@comcast.net Angie.Nixon@myfloridahouse.gov clarkmurrt@comcast.net
```
wLD.22 23
0420240000
5522 SOUTEL DR LLC
4251 UNIVERSITY BLVD S STE 201
JACKSONVILLE, FL, 32216
```

w: D. 22.13
0420160000
CALLAHAN DELORES
425 CRANBROOK CT
ORANGE PARK, FL 32065
wo. 21.13
0417300000
CLARK BENNJE JR
S475 SOUTEL DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219-3464
w 1 - 1 - 13
0420280000
COWSER LILLIAN E
5317 DOSTIE DR S
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1012
wLo-25.13
0421570000
FYR SFR EORROWER LLC
C/O HAVENBROOK HOMES
3505 KOGER BLVD SUITE 400
DULUTH, GA 30096

## wic. 3.1$]$

0420150000
HILL MELVINA L
5742 ROYALTY RD JACKSONVILEE, FL 32254

```
wno.22.13
0421470000
HOLSEY CECIL
3683 JULIET LEIA CIR S
JACKSONVILLE, FL }3221
```

WLD 22.13
0421460000
MATTHEWS ERNESTINE
5337 BOILARD DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1305
wi-2 213
0421550000
NEWELL LATRICE
5342 BOILARD DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1306

## w $10-24.13$

0420170000
QUINTANILLA THELICIA R/S
5316 DOSTIE DR S
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1013
O42013 0000
ANWARS PROPERTIES INC
1817 PUTNEY CIR
ORLANDO, FL 32837
O41731 0000
BROWN TAYE B TRUST
5709 EARL CIR N
JACKSONVILE, FL 32219

MD 2213 0417320000 CLARK BENNIE 5475 SOUTEL DR JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219
wion 22.13 0420490000 COWART SAMUEL HI 5430 SOUTEL DR JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219.3465

## mor-22. 13

0420270000
DAVIS JOAN W ESTATE
5329 DOSTIE DR S
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1012
mp-22.13
0417340000
GLEND LAKES DEVELOPMENT \& WBD AND ASSOC
5521 SOUTEL. DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL $\mathbf{3 2 2 1 9 - 3 4 6 6 ~}$

## mor-22-13

0420260000
HOLLINS DORENE I
7257 OXFORDSHIRE AVE
JACKSONVILLE, FL. 32219-4313
mo 1213
0420480000
JOHNSON PRECIOUS H ESTATE
5350 DEVRON DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1007

```
mo.s. 15
0421560000
MCGEE SHELLY R LIFE ESTATE
5332 BOILARD DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1306
```

Ma. $22: 3$
0420140000
PETERSON JOENITA RENAYE POTTER
5574 PINE HILL LN
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32244

## mo-22. 13

0420250000
REDDISH MINNIE LEE
5349 DOSTIE DR S
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1012
mo-22-13
0421350000 GRIFFIN FRONITA
5315 WASHINGTON ESTATES DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209.1338

```
whit-2,15
0421360000
HOLMES JOYCE E
49 SCOTTSDALE DR
ALABASTER, AL 35007
```

mo-22. 13
0420460000
MATHEWS CERISS A
5332 DEVRON DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209
wa.22-13
0421560010
MYERS SCOTT
17100 EAGLE BEND GLVD
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32226-1179
wh. 22-13
0421450000
PORTER MICHAEL G
5306 WASHINGTON ESTATES DR
JACKSONVILLE, Fl 32209-1300
wno 11.13
0417350100
SAlTER JEWELENE
11826 JOHN WILLAM TER
JACKSONVILE, FL 32218-7698


0420290000
SANDERS YVONNE ET AL
C/O SYLVIA NORWOOD
5305 DOSTIE DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1012
w Lo. 22.13
0420470000
SMITH ELEASE
5342 DEVRON DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1007

WED. 22.13
0417370000
STORE MASTER FUNDING II LLC 9500 S DADELAND BLVD SUITE 800
MIAMI, FL 33156
who 22.13
0417540000
INK LLC
5950 dUNN AVE
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32218

## W10.22. 13

0421380000
WILLIAMS DELL JR
5345 WASHINGTON ESTATES DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1338
WLD-22-13

WLD-22-13


FRIENDSAHR MISSIONARY BAPTIST CHURCH 7141 NEW RAGS ROAD JACKSONVILLE, FD 32219
2
S.A. HULL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL 7528 HULL STREET JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219
wo. 2213
0416310010
SHERWOOD AUTO PARTS INC
7257 NEW KINGS RD
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219-3872

## m. 22.13

0416330040
SOUTER LB HOLDINGS LLD
5359 WASHINGTON ESTATES DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209

MD 22.13
0421370000
SWAIN LAVERNE T
5335 WASHINGTON ESTATES DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1338
mo ze2:13
0420180000
WASHINGTON MICHAEL A
1362 SUNNYMEADE OR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32211

## me :-22:13

0417270000
WILLIAMS EUGENE B
400 E BAY ST STE 1011
JACKSONVILLE, FI. 32202-2954
mo 23.13
KINLOCK CIVIC ASSOCIATION
EARL SIMS
6455 MANHATTAN DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219

WLD-22-13
ANWAR'S PROPERTIES, INC 5522 SOUTEL DRIVE
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219

WID. 22-13
ANWAR'S PROPERTIES, INC 5522 SOUTER DRIVE JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219

ST. PAUL AFRICAN METHODIST CHURCH 6910 NEW KINGS ROAD
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219
was. 22.11
0421340000
SMITH ALBIRDA E ESTATE
5305 WASHINGTON ESTATES DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1338
wa. 22.13
0417350000
SQUARE HOME SERVICES LC
2991 NW 44 ST
MIAMI, FL 33142
wee 2213
0417360000
TB TRUST
5521 SOUTER DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219-3466
wo .22.13
0420450000
WELLS LILLIAN 5
5320 DEVRON DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1007

WhD.2.11
0421580000
WOODARD SHIRLEY
5316 BOLLARD DR
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32209-1306
mD .22:19
NORTHWEST
RHONDA BOYD
9381 ARBOR OAK LN
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32208

WLD-22-13
PAUL M HARDEN, ESQ
1431 RIVERPLACE BLVD, STE 901
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32207

WLD-22-13
PAUL M HARDEN, ESQ
1431 RIVERPLACE BLVD, STE 901
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32207

MISSIONARY AFRICAN UNIVERSAL CHURCH
O DABULA DRIVE
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219

PHILIPPIAN COMMUNITY CHURCH
O NEW KINGS ROAD
JACKSONVILLE, FL 32219



On File
Page 135 of 328

# Jacksonville Planning Commission 

## SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:
2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: SUBJECT MATTER: $\qquad$

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow$

## Jacksonville Planning Commission

## SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:

NAME:


ADDRESS:


REPRESENTING:


1. APPLLCATION NUMBER

page numbr: 5
(E- 7?-7?? THIS NUMBER MUST FILLED IN) I OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION
(check if in support)
2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: SUBJECT MATTER:

PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \Rightarrow \quad \Rightarrow$


## Jacksonville Planning Commission

## SPEAKERS REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:

(example: client (Atzanization/Business/Company/yourself

2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: SUBJECT MATTER: $\qquad$

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow \quad$

## Jacksonville Planning Commission

## SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

## Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing

 PHONE:


REPRESENTING:
$\qquad$
$<2203$
[E- ₹? 7 ? ?? THIS NUMBER MUST FILED IN\}

PAGE NUMBR: $\qquad$

1. APPLICATION NUMBER

I SUPPORT THIS APPLICATION


I OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION

2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: $\qquad$

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER

## Jacksonville Planning Commission

## SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

Please print and complete item 1 below for 8oard/Committee Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:

2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC:

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER


## Jacksonville Planning Commission

SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

## Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing

 or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:
$\qquad$
SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER

## Jacksonville Planning Commission

## SPEAKERS REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:


REPRESENTING: $\qquad$

1. APPLICATION NUMBER $\underset{(E-37-? 7 ? ~ T H I S ~ N U M B E R ~ M U S T ~ F I L E D ~(N) ~}{\text { I }}$

PAGE NUMBR:
 I SUPPORT THIS APPLICATION

(Check if In support)
2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: SUBJECT MATTER: $\qquad$ OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION
 Check if in opposition

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow$

## Jacksonville Planning Commission

## SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing

2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: SUBJECT MATTER: $\qquad$

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow$
On File
Page 140 of 328

## Jacksonville Planning Commission

SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing


SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \mathrm{a} \quad \mathrm{m}$

## Jacksonville Planning Commission

## SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:


SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\Rightarrow \Rightarrow$
On File
Page 141 of 328

# Jacksonville Planning Commission 

## SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing

2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: SUBJECT MATTER: $\qquad$

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER


## Jacksonville Planning Commission

## SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing

NAME: or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:

$\qquad$ ADDRESS:

PHONE
 REPRESENTING: $\qquad$
(example: Client /Organlzation/Business/Company/Yourself)

1. APPLICATION NUMBER $112 L-23-13$
(E-77-7?7 THIS NUMBER MUST FILLED IN)
I SUPPORT THIS APPLICATION
(Check If in support)
I OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION

2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: SUBJECT MATTER: $\qquad$

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow$
On File
Page 142 of 328

Jacksonville $\mathbf{P l a n n i n g}$ Commission
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:

(E- ? ?-P?? THIS NUMBER MUST FILLED IN)
I SUPPORT THIS APPLICATION $\square$ I OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION
(Check if in support)
(Check if in apposition
2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: SUBJECT MATTER: $\qquad$
SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow$

Jacksonville Planning Commission
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing


REPRESENTING: $\qquad$
(example: Client / Oramization/Business/Campany/Yaurself)

1. APPLICATION NUMBER $\qquad$ PAGE NUMB:

(E- 7?-7?? TH LS NUMBER MUST FILLED IN)
I SUPPORT THIS APPLICATION $\square$ I OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION

(Check \# in support)
(Check If in opposition)
2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: $\qquad$
$\qquad$
SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER

## Jacksonville Planning Commission

## SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Baard/Committee Agenda:
REPRESENTING:
DUVAL COUNTY SCHOOL BOARD
PAGE NUMBR: $\qquad$
FIVE

I OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION
(Check If In apposition)
2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC:

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \mathrm{m} \quad \mathrm{m}$

## Jacksonville Planning Commission

## SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD

'Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:


REPRESENTING:
(example: Client/Organization/Business/Company/Yourseif)


I SUPPORT THIS APPLICATION
(E- 77-7?? THIS NUMBER MUST FILLED IN)

(Check it in support)
I OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION

(Check If in opposition
2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: SUBJECT MATTER: $\qquad$

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER


$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER } \\
& \text { PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD }
\end{aligned}
$$



[^1]

On File


On File


[^2]Jacksonville Planning Commission
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing
or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:


| (example: client / Organization/Business/company/Yourself) |  |
| :---: | :---: |
|  |  |
|  |  |
| I SUPPORT THIS APPLICATION | I OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION $\square$ |
| (Checkifin suppor) | (Checkifi in opposition) |
| COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLLC: |  |

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\Longrightarrow$

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \longrightarrow \quad \longrightarrow$

On File
Jacksonville Planning Commission



On File
Jacksonville Planning Commission
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee. Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \longrightarrow \quad \longrightarrow$

SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:



[^3]

Jacksonville Planning Commission
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Com mittee Public Hearing
or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Commiltee Agenda:
NAME: $\frac{\text { Cill }}{\text { or item } 2 \text { below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda: }}$
REPRESENTING:

Jacksonville
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Com mittee Public Hearing


[^4]
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public. Hearing


| 1. APPLICATION NUMBER <br> (example: Client / Organization/Business/Company/ Yourself) $\text { WL D) } 22-13$ |  | , |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| (Check H in support) |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| 2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: |  |  |  |
| Do Not wish to speak |  |  |  |

On File


Jacksonville Planning Commission
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing
or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:

PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \Longrightarrow \quad \Longrightarrow$

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
please read the rules on the reverse side of this card $\Longrightarrow$

On File
Jacksonville Planning Commission
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing
or 1 tem 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:

dacksonville Planning Commission



| Jacksonville <br> SPEAKER'S REQU <br> Please print and complete item 1 or item 2 below for Public Comm | Planning Commission <br> EQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD <br> em 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing <br> Comments Section of Board/Cammittee Agenda; |
| :---: | :---: |
| name: Mamie L Brightman$\qquad$$\text { DATE: } \frac{4 / 21 \mid 2022}{f 1}$ |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
| Community |  |
|  |  |
| 1. APPLICATION NUMBER <br> (example: Client / Drganizdion/Business/Company/Yourself) <br> WLD-22-13 <br> PAGE NUMBR: 3 |  |
|  |  |
| I SUPPort this applcation $\square$ | IOPPose this application |
|  |  |



Jacksonville Planning Commission
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD


$$
p^{*}
$$

Jacksonville Planning Commission
SPEAKER'S REQUEST TO BE HEARD CARD
Please print and complete item 1 below for Board/Committee Public Hearing
or item 2 below for Public Comments Section of Board/Committee Agenda:

SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \longrightarrow$


ONE CITY. ONE JACKSONVILLE.

City of Jacksonville, Florida<br>Planning and Development Department<br>Current Planning Division<br>Ed Ball Building<br>214 North Hogan Street, Suite 300<br>Jacksonville, FL 32202<br>(904) 255-7865<br>www.coj.net

Notice of Certification

May 4, 2022

RE: Certified Transcript of the Planning Commission Meeting

## Please find attached:

## *Certified Planning Commission Transcript on WLD-22-13

If there are any further questions, please feel free to contact me at (904) 255-7829

Public Hearing on April 7, 2022 \& April 21, 2022


Patricia Sales
Executive Secretary, I

THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a second for approval of 2021-0740.

All those in favor? COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye. THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes. And let the record reflect that Commissioner Blanchard was not here for testimony nor the vote for this matter.

MR. DUGGAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Appreciate all you do for us at the state level.

All right. Let's jump back in order, WLD-22-13, please, Bruce.

MR. LEWIS: You skipped one, E-22-22.
THE CHAIRMAN: I apologize. That was the third one on Atlantic Boulevard we're hearing today. So let's backtrack. We'll do E-22-22, and then WLD-22-13 on Soutel.
(Commissioner Blanchard reenters the proceedings.)

MR. LEWIS: Application for zoning exception E-22-22 seeks exception to allow for a daycare within the CO zoning district. This is at the corner of White Avenue and Atlantic Boulevard. It's one acre in size with an

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

46
existing 7,000-square-foot building.
DCF has indicated that this -- its
capacity is 113 children and 8 staff.
We have reviewed it, the application. We
find it does meet the criteria. We feel this proposed use is compatible with the contiguous commercial area as well as the general character of the area. The parcel is a transition from the intensive commercial properties to the west and the residential-zoned properties to the south, and so the Department is recommending approval of E-22-22.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Bruce.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Sir, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes, sir.
My name is Joe McClure. I live at 11071 Losco Pines Court, Jacksonville, 32257.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. And are you an attorney?

MR. McCLURE: No, sir.
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Ms. Tropia is going
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
to swear you in.
THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MR. McCLURE: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MR. McCLURE: Absolutely.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead.
MR. McCLURE: I'm here representing the applicant, just to answer any questions you guys have.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
Is there anyone else here today to speak on E-22-22?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, I will close the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve E-22-22.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
second for approval.
Comments from the Commission?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, I have a
motion and a second for approval of E-22-22.
All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes.
MR. MCCLURE: Thank you very much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, sir.
All right. Bruce, I think we're there now. It's WLD-22-13 on Soutel.

MR. LEWIS: Thank you.
This is application of waiver of minimum distance requirements for a liquor license location. WLD-22-13 seeks to reduce the required minimum distance between the subject property and the Friendship Missionary Baptist Church from 500 feet to 401 feet.

This property is an existing retail center constructed approximately in 1968. The property is zoned CCG-2, and so a liquor -- a package store or liquor store is a permitted use in CCG-2. The application is just to reduce the distance between the church and the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
liquor license location.
There have been other variances and exceptions approved for this property back in '90--- specifically, back in '93 and '95, which allowed for the sale of beer and wine for the subject property.

This property is also within the Kings/Soutel Neighborhood Action Plan and the Kings/Soutel Redevelopment Area. This application was heard by the KingSoutel Crossing CRA Advisory Board on March 24th of this year. The agent explained the application, the need for the waiver, and the criteria for the evaluation.

And after discussion, the advisory board voted four to one to recommend approval of this waiver with three conditions: that the license be made personal to the business and cannot be transferred; the license is for off-premises consumption only; and the business shall not open before 1 p.m. on Sunday.

The first two conditions are standard with the approval of the final order that's issued by the Planning Commission, and staff is recommending that Condition Number 3 be part of

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
this application.
We do have a letter from the Northwest CPAC that does oppose the application. But the Department finds, like I said, this is property that is zoned CCG-2; it's a permitted use in that zoning district; the front door of the license location is not visible from the Greater New Hope Missionary Baptist Church.

The zoning code requires that the measurement be from the proposed business to the nearest property line of the church. However, the nearest church property is an undeveloped grassy knoll and the church building is actually 802 feet away.
Additionally, to drive or walk to the licensed location is a distance of a thousand feet via Soutel Drive and then along New Kings Road.

With those criteria, the Department is recommending approval with the one condition that the business shall not open before $1 \mathrm{p} . \mathrm{m}$. on Sunday.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Bruce.
(Mr. Harden approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Harden, give us your
Diane M. Tropia, inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

The measurement that was taken, if you look at the Planning Department's report, was taken at the tip of the angle. It's -- Bruce said 800 feet to the church. It's another 800 feet to the church from that location. If you actually wanted to physically get from one door to the other, you go out on Soutel Drive, go down Soutel, turn left on New Kings and go down -- it's about a quarter of mile by my vehicle, not 1,000 feet.

So the waiver from 500 to 400 is a little bit of a misnomer here because of the -- the actual distance of the facility.

The second -- the fifth criteria, also we meet. It says if there's an existing liquor license of a similar nature in the immediate vicinity of the proposed location, you can grant a waiver.

Adjoining this proposed facility in a building is an existing nightclub/bar/restaurant. And you're going hear a lot of complaints about that. But that's an existing facility closer to the church. And if you read the fifth criteria, that is a basis for a waiver as well. And, again, that's been there for more than

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

40 years.
I'd like you to look at the handout I handed to you. And the first thing is -- are the criteria. I'm glad I didn't discuss these before the three of you approved at 71 feet, 150 feet, and 100 feet just recently.

But the next map is a -- is an aerial which is intended to point to the same thing you see on the Planning Department's report.

Then you have a stack of pictures. The first picture is a picture from Soutel Drive. The parcel is on the left end. As you can see, right to the right of us you can see the Tropical Bar and Grill; it's changed names over the years. And then we've taken down the colored stuff and painted it.

The second picture shows the bar next to us and then JJ's Crab House, which was formally Mr. Duke's Seafood.

Then is a picture of the strip mall that is between us and the church; again, to show that they're on the line of sight, that there's no visibility.

The third picture is the auto repair shop which is also between this facility and the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
4
church, showing you can't see. That picture also shows you the corner of Soutel and New Kings. And you can see, even in that picture looking straight down New Kings, the church is so far, you can barely see it in that picture.

The next picture is a part of the gas station.

The last two pictures are intended to show you the area that's being measured as part of the 400 feet. So if we're measured to the tip of that -- but on the last picture you can see that the church is about a thousand feet away after that measurement.

So it's not actually 500 feet. It's in a location that's been in this use for a long period of time. It's zoned CCG-2; it allows retail sale by right without an exception. It's a use that's going to go in there.

And I've attended three community meetings on the matter and some of those came out with the conditions. But I think most of the complaints you're going to hear is not related or doesn't address the criteria of the Zoning Code, which is what you're supposed to consider.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

There's complaints about other users in the area, other activity in the area, crime in the area that's apparently occurring. We're not there. We're not causing that crime. So I would ask you to focus on the criteria of the Zoning Code, which are the highlighted stuff I have in the front.

With that, I'll stand by for questions, Mr. Chairman.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Harden.
We have, I think, 15 cards in opposition,
so I'll give you an opportunity to address
those once they're done speaking.
All right, folks. We've got a
three-minute limit on this. Make sure there's no talking as we're coming up.

First, we'll call Ms. Debra Cotton.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm here. I do not want to speak. I do oppose.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you,
Ms. Cotton. Let the record reflect that Debra Cotton is in opposition.

Next, we have Velma, whose last name starts with an $R$.

Are you here? Would you like to speak?
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

| 1 |
| ---: |
| 2 |
| 3 |
| 4 |
| 5 |
| 6 |
| 7 |
| 8 |
| 9 |
| 10 |
| 11 |
| 12 |
| 13 |
| 14 |
| 15 |
| 16 |
| 17 |
| 18 |
| 19 |
| 20 |
| 21 |
| 22 |
| 23 |
| 24 |
| 25 |

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Roundsville. THE CHAIRMAN: That's it. Roundsville. All right.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: I would like to speak. THE CHAIRMAN: Come on up. And then next we're going to hear from Warren Jones.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Velma Roundsville, 3238 Sedona Trail, 32208.

THE CHAIRMAN: And Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.

THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MS. ROUNDSVILLE: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MS. ROUNDSVILLE: I do.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MS. ROUNDSVILLE: Thank you for this time.
I'm sure it's, in your mind, a waste of
time, but at least you get an opportunity to
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

58
hear from the residents within the area.
All of the criteria and those statistics
that Mr. Harden gave are wonderful, but no one is considering the people that live within that area, the residents. And that's what should be considered sometimes.

This location, retail, CCG-1, that's
wonderful, but it would be nice if there was some retail other than a liquor store. We already have a nightclub there, and he says "slash restaurant," but as a resident within the area, I can tell you it's more of a nightclub that doesn't present good --. there's not good things around there now. There have been many unfortunate incidents.

And although they say that a liquor store, there's no outside consumption, you're still going to have -- I'm sorry, but someone will be out there consuming it.

It would be nice if they brought in a nice restaurant or the lovely wine and bar that the other gentleman spoke of, but we don't have that in our area. We would love to have a nice retail in there instead of an another liquor store. There are liquor stores within the area

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
already. There's plenty. There's at least two that other people can still go to.

This particular owner, I'm sure he could come up with another retail establishment that he could put within the area that would be positive. We would like to have something positive within our area.

If you don't live in the area, which I'm sure none of you do, you don't have any idea as to what goes on. And that's what happens a lot of times. Things are approved and you really don't have any idea as to what is already there. We would like to see something positive, as I said.

I'm sure, as he said, this is just planning and you have information already, the statistics say it's a great idea. But as a resident within the area, this is not a great idea. We do not need another liquor store.

Thank you very much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Roundsville. Appreciate you being here.

Mr. Jones, would you like to speak?
MR. JONES: Yes.
THE CHAIRMAN: Come on up.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

that would allow them to open and maintain -
and remain open during school hours, which
could have a negative impact on the students
who live and catch and attend school in that
neighborhood.

So we ask that you oppose the waiver, and
I would be glad to answer any questions.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Jones.

MR. JONES: Thank you.

(Audience member approaches the podium.)

THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Hinton?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes.

THE CHAIRMAN: After Ms. Hinton, we will
hear from Charles Garrison.

Charles, are you here?

Ms. Hinton?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hi.

THE CHAIRMAN: Give us your name and
address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Iris Hinton.

I live at 7816 Marion Street, Jacksonville,

Florida 32209.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.

THE REPORTER: If you would raise your

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

62
right hand for me, please.
MS. HINTON: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MS. HINTON: Yes.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MS. HINTON: Okay. So we had a meeting on the 31st of March. Soon after the meeting, I went by -- I oppose this -- to see what was really going on up there. So I have a picture I'd like for you-all to consider. I only have two, but you have them.

I'm more concerned -- always concerned, always of the safety of our children, the elderly, and our community as a whole. As they stated, that area is a high-crime area. There's nothing nice in that community at all. So I'm asking to you consider, again, the future of our children and our community. Our community need to be lifted up, not brought down. It's enough of that.

And I'm asking you seriously to look at those pictures. And maybe -- maybe you-all

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
need to go take a drive out there and look for yourself before you approve this again.

This is serious. We have death up there. We have mothers losing their children up there. You had a man a couple of years ago who was kidnapped and someone with a machete got him out of the place. I mean, what's going on in that area?

It's not a good area, so please, I beg you all, please don't take my word. You go look at it and see for yourself.

Thank you very much.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Ms. Hinton.

MS. HINTON: You're welcome.
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Garrison, come join us.
Next, we'll hear from Shabazz Yahya.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Garrison, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Charles Garrison, 1729 North Market Street, 32206.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thanks.
Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.
THE REPORTER: If you would raise your
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
right hand for me, please.
MR. GARRISON: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MR. GARRISON: I do.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MR. GARRISON: Good afternoon, Mr. Chair, Mr. Immediate Past Chair, and commissioners.

My name is Charles Garrison, and I'm here to speak against WLD-22-13.

So I serve on the Jacksonville Environmental Protection Board, so we also hear variances, so I know what being on the south end of a northbound mule is like, right? But, you know, serving on these boards, we're entrusted to serve our neighbors and the city to the best of our ability.

This request may meet the requirements to grant the waiver, but we must also consider what the community wants. I'm here to support the community that has turned out to voice a desire to make their community into what they want to see. The variance process is in place

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

1 to allow the opportunity for a community to participate in making the sausage.

Yes, this is in a CRA, but the community is saying a liquor package store is not the type of redevelopment they want to see.

Lord knows I'm not anticapitalism. I'm not against the American dream of owning and growing your own business. I'm a leader in a local small business myself. I'm against needlessly giving waivers when the community is against it and there are other alternatives.

As a member on the Commission, you-all have the ability to help make this city into the city that we all want to see it become, so please vote no on WLD-22-13.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Garrison.
Mr. Yahya.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: And then after that, we'll hear from Dana Kriznar.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yahya Shabazz, 5316 Dostie Drive South, Jacksonville, Florida 32209.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. She's going to
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
swear you in.
THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MR. SHABAZZ: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MR. SHABAZZ: Yes, I do.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead, sir.
MR. SHABAZZ: I'm opposed to this package store, the Royal House Liquors. Anwar Owner [sic] is the owner of the property. Because the conditions they are saying they are going to meet is -- they have already proven that they cannot keep their promise. There's trash and there's enough liquor stores around in there.

We got a -- right on the other side of Washington Estates Drive, we have a beer and wine. Right at Dollar General right up the street, we also have beer and wine. And then we have a grocery store that serves beer and wine. We have a liquor store not -- further

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
down that's already have a liquor store. We have a liquor store also on Kings Road.

So I'm opposed to this. And, you know, then -- so we already have enough establishments serving beer and wine in this area. And that -- and the club that is already existing there stays open -- beer and wine. Even though it's on premises, we also have the other places that have off premises. We have enough in the area.

And they don't keep their -- it's full of trash. And then we already have a vagrant problem with peoples sleeping around that building now.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, sir.
MR. SHABAZZ: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Appreciate you being here.
Next, Ms. Dana Kriznar.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: After Ms. Kriznar, we will hear from Vanessa Hopkins.

Ms. Kriznar, good afternoon.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
THE CHAIRMAN: Give us your name and address for the record, please.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm Dana Kriznar. I'm the deputy superintendent of Duval County Public Schools, 1701 Prudential Drive.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thanks.
Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.
THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MS. KRIZNAR: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MS. KRIZNAR: I do.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MS. KRIZNAR: As I said, I'm the deputy superintendant of Duval County Public Schools, and I'm also the district's representative on the Northwest CPAC, so I attend their meetings regularly. And I'm also representing S.A. Hull Elementary and Principal Rashard Willis who cannot be here today. He's actually probably preparing for dismissal of his students right now.

We do oppose the placement of this liquor store due to the proximity of the S.A. Hull

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

1 Elementary School. According to Principal Willis, approximately 20 percent of the children walk to school. We do transport students within 1.5 miles of a school, and this is -- most of the residential community for that school is actually behind where the proposed liquor store is scheduled to be.

The students will have to walk down Soutel on same side of the street as the liquor store because the crosswalk, which is in clear view of the liquor store, is on the same side of the street to get across the street to go to the school, which is set just back off of Soutel.

In addition, as Board Member Warren Jones said, we have a bus stop that is right across the street from this proposed location. We do have Randy Gallup here, and he is well-prepared to represent the district, but we wanted to be here as well to lend our support to the Northwest CPAC in opposition to this.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Kriznar. Appreciate you being here.

Next, is Vanessa Hopkins.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

70
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Hopkins, after you, we will hear from Ms. Johnson, Tajmaus Johnson. Sorry. I butchered that. We'll figure it out in a minute.

Ms. Hopkins, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: May I also bring an exhibit?

THE CHAIRMAN: Sure.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm Vanessa Cullins Hopkins, 3283 Edgewood Avenue West, Jacksonville, Florida 32209.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.
THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MS. HOPKINS: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MS. HOPKINS: I do.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MS. HOPKINS: Thank you for allowing me to speak. I'm here to oppose yet another liquor

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
store on Soutel Drive. I, along with my neighbors, ask that the City's Planning and Development Department not grant the waiver of minimum distance.

The proposed liquor package store is physically located on a commercial strip which abuts residential subdivisions of single-family homes. Nearby churches include not only Friendship Missionary Baptist, but also St. Paul AME Church and Philippian Community Church. S.A. Hull Elementary School is a thousand feet away, as the previous speaker mentioned.

The proposed package store will be directly adjacent to ICE Lounge Bar and Grill, which serves alcoholic beverages. Less than a mile away -- in fact, 0.6 miles -- Soutel Liquors package store is found. I repeat that. There is already a package liquor store on Soutel 0.6 miles from where this proposed package store is to be.

You can also buy beer and wine at the Harvey's, which is 0.3 miles from the proposed establishment. Also, at the BP gas station, which is less than 0.4 miles away. And as I've

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
learned in listening to the testimony from my neighbor, at the Dollar General.

Now, a little more than a mile away is Shores Liquor Store, which is located at 6007 New Kings Road, and you also have American Legion Post 9, which serves liquor, and it's 1.1 miles away.

So we're surrounded by liquor stores. Emerald City Learning and Enrichment Center is one-tenth of a mile away. That's a daycare center. There are three other daycare centers that are less than a mile away: La Alpha Early Learning Center, the Playhouse of Fun, Unique Childcare and Learning Academy.

Now, the neighborhood has grown organically since the 1960s. This unplanned growth has resulted in neighborhood blight and deterioration which must be reversed. The first step in this reversal is to limit additional liquor establishments in this area. Again, I ask that you-all oppose the establishment of this package and liquor store. We don't need any more liquor establishments. We have enough.

We -- as previous speakers have mentioned,
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
we need some positive business development in our area. We need food stores that have fresh food.

Thank you so much for allowing me to speak.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Hopkins. Appreciate you being here.

Next, let's hear from Tajmaus Johnson.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: After him, we will hear from Van Moy-Henry.

All right. Tell me how I'm supposed to say your name.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: It's Tajmaus.
THE CHAIRMAN: Tajmaus, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Tajmaus Johnson, 3939
Roosevelt Boulevard, Suite G-21.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.
THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MR. JOHNSON: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MR. JOHNSON: Yes, ma'am.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MR. JOHNSON: All right. Well, I'm here
on behalf of State Representative Angie Nixon,
Florida House Representative, Florida House
District 14 on the Northside.
We stand in opposition of this feet
difference today. Within a five-mile radius there is approximately four liquor stores, not including the Dollar General and the gas station that was previously mentioned as before. However, there's only one big chain grocery store in the area.

The representative feels this will only be an oversaturation of liquor and it does nothing but harm the area within itself.

One of the big things that the
representative is working on right now is called "Northside Love." Partisan effort to clean up the neighborhood, as a lot of the residents previously just mentioned. The neighborhood is blighted with dirt and a lot of things that's going on.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

So we just challenge the sponsor to work with the existing stores there to clean up the area and just make it -- and improve the area for a better "Northside Love" initiative that we're working on right now.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Tajmaus, thank you, sir.
Next, we have Van Moy-Henry. After Van, we will hear from Kim Stephens-Perry.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Moy-Henry, give us your name and address.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Van Moy-Henry, 2731 Eventide Drive, Jacksonville 32209.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thanks.
Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.
THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MS. MOY-HENRY: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MS. MOY-HENRY: I do.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

MS. MOY-HENRY: Thank you, Commissioners.
I'm just like everyone else in which you have heard so far that oppose, and I do oppose having another liquor store in the area. I mean, the radius. I notice a lot had been said about the church. The church -- the church is there for funerals. The church is there for service on Sundays. The church is there for Bible school.

But the community is there for the duration. Those who live in the surrounding area, they're there, and they get to see all of this going on. On the weekends, you can't even get down the street, you just can't because the party spills out.

As far as the liquor store, I wanted to know about zoning, and I did ask the attorney in the meeting last Thursday: When was this zoning established? And I may not use the right term -- forgive, you-me -- however, that was back -- I think he said in the ' 80 s. This is 2022. A lot has happened since that time. And crime has definitely surged. Every time you look around, something is happening up at that corner where this strip is.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Again, I know you mentioned about the church, but my observation is the community. And I know each and every one of you-all that sit before me, you have an obligation to the growth, not to the decay and deterioration of our neighborhoods, but growth within Jacksonville. I know that's what you're here for. That's what you are volunteer -- or are appointed to do. I just ask that you not approve it.

Let me see. I got another minute. Okay.
Let me also go back to the zones and how you come up with your radius. One thing I've noticed, whenever a radius is used, usually -especially with a liquor store, liquor stores are not in the immediate [sic] of a community. It could be in the front of a community, on the side of a community.

So your radius is not considering the people who live within the area. It's not. That radius picked up that church. Okay. That's what you're looking at -- and the school. But I think it needs to go further. You need to extend that radius to consider people that are living within the area of these

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
liquor stores.
I mean, too many liquor stores. That's adding to nothing but deterioration. Russian roulette, a gun and bullet. Russian roulette. You got liquor stores everywhere in the community. Tragedy in the making.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right, Ms. Moy-Henry. Thank you.

Next, we have Kim Stephens-Perry. After Ms. Perry, we will hear from Ayesha Covington.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Perry, good afternoon.
Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Kim Stephens-Perry, and I'm here representing the Northwest CPAC. I am the chairperson for LUZ.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Appreciate you being here. Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.

THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MS. STEPHENS-PERRY: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MS. STEPHENS-PERRY: Yes.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MS. STEPHENS-PERRY: On April 5th we -the Northwest CPAC submitted a letter recommending that this waiver be denied.

So on behalf of the Northwest Citizens Planning Advisory Committee, we voted on Thursday, March 10th, 2022, to oppose this waiver located at 5522 Soutel Drive due to the following: That there are single-family residential homes located within less than 500 feet of this establishment; the proximity to a school and church; the safety and crime concerns; and the existence of already established businesses in this retail center that sells alcohol, beer, and wine.

We oppose the waiver of the liquor distance, and we would appreciate the Planning Commission would support the denial.

So since crafting this letter, I went back over to the retail establishment. And if you look at whatever document that Mr. Harden gave you with the picture of the retail space, the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
proposed liquor package store would face Soutel, along with -- Nicole's Crab House is there, and then there's the club.

But also over on Washington Estates Road, which is the side of this retail space, there's something called Jazzy Krab, and there's also Quickpic Foodmart, which you can purchase beer and wine there as well.

On the other side of the establishment, on the Dostie Drive area, the parking lot that's used for overflow is located there. There's a mound of garbage sitting there at the curb. I have a picture of it here in my phone if you would like to see it.

And also, walking away from the retail space when I pulled up on [sic] last night was a person of ill repute, someone you would not want in your communities. Also across the street were some guys hanging out.

So what we see typically when you have liquor and nothing else to offset the liquor, you have crime. And our concern as a CPAC is to see this community come back to the way it was when this zone was originally developed. What was the date? 1969 or 1999?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300 Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Perry, And appreciate all your work on the CPAC.

Next, we have Ayesha Covington, and then we'll hear from Tyrona Clark-Murray.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon, Ms. Covington. Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Sure. Good afternoon.
I'm Ayesha Covington. My address 1293
West 3rd Street.
I'm the president of the Brooklyn
Neighborhood Association.
THE CHAIRMAN: Before you get started, let Ms. Tropia swear you in.

THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MS. COVINGTON: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

MS. COVINGTON: Yes, ma'am.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MS. COVINGTON: Thank you.
I'm Ayesha Covington. I'm the president of the Brooklyn Neighborhood Association. I stand in opposition to any more bars, brewery, and the desecration of our community, the disrespect of our churches, our historic churches. Churches have been an important part of our communities since I can ever remember.

I heard Paul Harden say that this was done in the '80s. I didn't graduate until 1985, and in 1985 we still had communities. We still had pastors who were engaged with their community. We still had families that went to church.

I'm very disappointed to find out that the school -- which if you come up Soutel, the school is right there. The children have to walk across to the get the school from the neighborhood.

A good friend of mine who owned Mackinlaw (phonetic) Trucking, very prosperous man, his son was killed up there at that nightclub. I heard Paul Harden kind of allude to the crime doesn't matter. It does to us. He hadn't

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
recovered from the loss of his only son who was murdered.

If we continue to put breweries, bars, and all kinds of debauchery in those small, contained areas, we will never get out of the poverty, crime and the murder that we endure. We're tired of it. Maybe in the ' 80 s they didn't know that this would happen, but we know today, this is not a good decision. We already have one club there that we did not want to reopen. Against the community's wishes, they opened that club again, and the crime rate went right back up.

We want this commission to listen to the community. You do not have to do this exception, this waiver. There's a reason why you have the 500 feet. The 500 feet is to protect the public. You don't know what kind of people come through there, predators, the sex predators. You don't know what kind of offenders are coming through there. You don't know what drunk is going to get his morning fix, going to go and buy some beer and run over someone.

They don't have to drink it there. They Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
will drink it in the car and then they will go and get some more and they'll drink some more there in their car.

So the fact that they're going to say I'm going serve and they're going to go on, they're never going to go on.

All throughout the community, you see them lingering around. We see the alcoholics hanging around. They hang out in the laundromat, by the way. I used to live -- my daughter used to live in that area, and I would go late night to do laundry. You had drunks in there. You had -- I mean, people on drugs there at night.

At some point you have to give us some relief. We want to live clean, wholesome lives. We deserve to have those services. I'm not against the business owner putting a business, but he has to work in cooperation with the community. The community is saying no. I say no. And I'm standing with the church. I'm standing with the schools.

Thank you for your time. Have a great day.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Covington.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
testimony you are about to give will be the
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MS. CLARK-MURRAY: Yes.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MS. CLARK-MURRAY: You're welcome.
I have a lot to add to what has been said, but I want to begin with the fact that I know this body, you're listening to our subjective stories, the -- and not necessarily untrue stories, but you're listening to the subjective aspects of why you should not approve this particular measure.

I know that you're going to look at actually the elements, that the ordinance -- or that the coding says that you need to -- that you need to consider in order to -- whether or not to approve.

Mr. Brown, who happens to be our representative for Planning District 5, he said it best. If you're going to approve this measure, you're going to exacerbate an existing problem.

A little more than a month ago, two people lost their lives in that same area because of
5 the existing nightclub. About a
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
week-and-a-half ago, a young lady's body was found on Washington Estates to the right of where the owner of this building and applicant wants to establish an additional liquor and package store. About five years ago, there was a club in that same building where five people were shot, two died.

Currently, whenever that lounge/bar is open, parking is filled in their lot, and it's not a large lot. The overflow goes to across the street. Then across New Kings Road at the Dollar Tree, all the way down to Lonnie C. Miller Park. We heard at our community meeting on Monday how the parking and the -- those who want to attend the club, how they walk from the park to the club and how they are parking at the park has created a problem.

The other things I want to talk about that are more objective, if you look at the application -- well, first of all, let's talk about the CRA. I talked to some of the members who are members of the CRA, the Kings Road/Soutel CRA. When I held a community meeting about two weeks ago, they said they did not have the documents that I provided at that

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

88
meeting to make a -- a solid decision. So I would venture that they did not receive all the documents.

In addition to that, if you look at the survey, there are two addresses used. There's one used for the actual application, and then there's one used for -- actually, for the survey. So I want you to consider those particular aspects as you decide on this particular measure.

And I'm also with those who oppose this measure.

Thank you so much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Murray. We appreciate you being here.

All right. Next, let's hear from Leola Williams. And after that, we'll hear from Ms. Eunice Barnum.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Williams, good afternoon. Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Leola Williams, 5012 Princely Avenue 32208.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.
THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MS. WILLIAMS: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MS. WILLIAMS: I do.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MS. WILLIAMS: I live in the area, the Soutel area. I'm also a member of the CRA, Kings/Soutel board. At the time we had our meeting, I was not privy to all of the information we have now about what's happening in the area. I did not know about the murders or the shootings and the killing. People have died up there at that club. I was not aware of that.

And I believe some information was sent to you-all by Councilman Al Ferraro's office about an article that was in the Times-Union from 2019. And some other information, I don't know whether you-all received it, but I was told that she was going to send it. His secretary,

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

90
Ms. Connie Holt, was going to send you-all that information.

Mr. Harden said it's only a package store in our meeting, but it's more than just a package store because it affects our children. It affects the community. The community is going down in value when we have the club up there and they party all night or whatever.

I was coming through around 1 o'clock or 2 o'clock in the morning after working with my son, coming through that area. There were people up there just parked, drinking. The policemen were up there. They leave their trash on the ground. The next day, someone has to come pick it up.

The gentleman on the corner who has a -he used to be a service station, but now it's a repair -- a car repair place, near the ATM for VyStar, all of that was trashed. All near the club, trashed, where people put their trash. I don't believe that this owner has a dumpster to put the trash in. We've seen trash that hasn't been picked up set to the side. We've had to call the City to pick it up.

Also, you-all just approved, I think it
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
was -- well, anyway, it was the Post Street.
You-all just looked at the Post Street and there -- I guess the measure for their waiver was 1,500 feet. So why do we have 500 feet? Why is that -- why is there a difference? We're all here in Jacksonville. They had a measure of 1,500 feet that they reduced, but we only have 500. So I question that.

The club in the area is already a problem. So if the club is a problem, if we bring a liquor store, it's going to be more of a problem. We already have a liquor store up the street.

Also, on Sundays, because of the club and the people that come, it's a traffic jam. It's a safety issue. People will park up and down Soutel Drive. They going to the Lonnie Miller Park and to the -- well, anyway, they just partying in the area. You can't get up and down the street.

It's a safety issue. If there was an emergency, then the people couldn't get through who are coming to take care of the emergency, the fire department or whatever, because of all the traffic.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: I got to stop you there, Ms. Williams.

MS. WILLIAMS: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you for being here.
Next, Ms. Eunice Barnum, And then, finally, we'll hear from Aloysious Denard.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Eunice Barnum, 9121 Spottswood Road, Jacksonville, Florida.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.

THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MS. BARNUM: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MS. BARNUM: I do.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MS. BARNUM: And with that being said, let me begin and talk about what nobody else seems to talk about, the disparities.

I've sat and I watched disparities, even among you-all, all white males, do not live in

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

1 my area. Then I look at the disparity:

2

Someone's sworn in, some are not; some get three minutes; some do not.

Then Attorney Paul Harden, I listen to him talk about the pros for the establishment, but he didn't mention the murder, the murder rate. He talks about the owner, but I want to know, does the owner have insurance? Did the owner pay the families who lost their loved ones? There was a murder. They closed it down in 2019. I don't know why you-all didn't know that.

Again, I sit here and I watch you-all make decisions about us without us. I don't make decisions where you live, and you shouldn't make any for where I live without coming and listening and taking in consideration what we have to say.

When Mr. Harden was there, he talked about his law office. I just wonder how many lawsuits did he file for any of the people in that area.

Also, I would love to take you-all on a tour. I'm the community president, and I am the one who requested that the CRA -- that we

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
was given an opportunity to have a board because we were neglected in that area as well.

So when you're trying to make a decision, it would help you a whole lot if you would see, you would witness what we live through and see.
And they talked about how bad the area is.
Well, let me tell you something good about where we are.

We fought for the four-lane highway. And the area is full of brick homes, nice brick homes. Elderly people been there years, donated taxes to the City that pays your salaries. They're there. They are still there. I went by, I went and visited, I went and talked to them. And they, too, are in opposition.

So I'm saying, as your boss, listen to we, the people.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Barnum.
Next, we have Aloysious Denard.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Denard, tell me how I mispronounced that first name.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: You actually have it.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) $821-0300$

THE CHAIRMAN: Nailed it? All right. Thank you.

Give us your name and address for the record, and then Ms. Tropia is going to swear you in.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Aloysious Denard, 16284 Magnolia Grove Way, Jacksonville, Florida 32218.

THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MR. DENARD: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MR. DENARD: I do.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MR. DENARD: Without exhaustion of what's already been said, you've heard from several members of the community, which have all stated facts.

I stand in opposition today as the leadership giver, as being pastor of the Friendship Missionary Baptist Church that is in that community.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

I am sad to say that I did not have a lot of knowledge earlier on considering what was going on. But I'm kind of a fine-line person. I think all of us, we may play ignorant to a lot of things such as the murder, the crime rate.

The fact are, you cannot drive up that street, whether it's Soutel, whether it's New Kings Road, whatever, that is the parking lot. There is no parking around there. I police the area all the time. Find already liquor cartons, condoms. Anything you want to name, you can find it on property.

But as I said, I'm a fine-line kind of person. I believe the big question is, what's to come? Because as the gentleman gave the facts concerning the waiver and what the distance is, he factually said that there's a distance between our church of 800 and, I believe, 2 or 3 feet from New Kings to Soutel, 1,000 feet from our church.

But the waiver is to reduce it to a minimum of 401 feet. What is so significant about that 99 feet if it's well above the distance?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

The thing is with 400 feet, it says "off-premises consumption." But off-premises consumption becomes a parking lot. It becomes to these people behind me their communities. So I could easily go in a package store and buy and walk down 400 feet or a parking lot that is in the form of a gas station or ex-gas station that is now close to proximity of my church, or I could pass it through a window of a package store where, on the other end, there's a strip club or another club or whatever the case may be, because it's only 400-and-whatever feet away from whatever that is.

I ask this committee, although you don't live in these areas that these people live in, the people that I give leadership to, majority of, 250 -plus. Do I live in that community? No. But I know that community because I worship with the very people on a weekly basis.

The other thing was, based on one condition that it do not open before 1:00 p.m. Well, who says that church ended at 1:00 p.m.?

I mean, there's other things. That field that's referred to as the grassy knoll, I have

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

## 98

got youth that play in that field. I've got elderly people that walk to church across the highway. I've got elderly people all around that community, and it does affect them. It does affect those in the community.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right, Mr. Denard, thank you for being here this afternoon.

All right. Is there anyone else here today to speak on WLD-22-13?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Harden, why don't you come back up here address some of these concerns.
(Mr. Harden approaches the podium.)
MR. HARDEN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
Paul Harden, 1431 Riverplace.
I tried to keep good notes and to go through each of the issues.

The first issue that -- the lady spoke, talked about CCG-1. It's not CCG-1; it's CCG-2. It's the most intense zoning category in the commercial category. This piece of property is at the intersection of two arterial highways. It's where commercial activity occurs. Alcohol sales, package stores are Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
allowed by right in the CCG-2 zoning category. And it was zoned CCG-2, respectfully, before the pastor's church was built there at that location.

That was part of the original growth management in the area, where commercial went in and they designated it as the most intense commercial use in the area, which is -- allows for this use.

My friend Warren Jones talked about bus stops. If you hedged on requirements for bus stops, you wouldn't be able to put retail sales anywhere in the city of Jacksonville. The Zoning Code sets rules.

What I do for a living is protect people's property rights. There is a property right at issue here. My client has a piece of property that's designated for a particular use, albeit a use some people apparently don't like. It's a legal use in the city of Jacksonville and the state of Florida and the United States. It's a legal use.

And so we look at the Zoning Code, and the Zoning Code says for off-premises consumption, you have to be 500 feet away. But then you

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
look over and notice that we're not 500 feet away, we're a quarter of a mile away if you drive the location. And it says here's how you do the waiver, and I gave you the criteria, and it was -- no one spoke to any of the criteria that spoke in opposition. We meet two of the criteria dead on.

My client doesn't own the club. That's an existing facility that apparently is not a terrific neighbor. Those are existing activities on the site.

I guess you're wondering why Mr. Garrison was here, an environmental -- he is running for City Council in that district. In fact, we've had several of the candidates, which is certainly their right to do, but no one of those people who spoke spoke about the criteria that you're required to look at to make a decision.

Second criteria, of course, is the location of an existing facility closer to the church and which is actually in the line of sight than my client. They have -- and the reason for the difference between 1,500 and 500 feet is if it's on-premises consumption,

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
then it's the 1,500 feet. This is off-premises consumption. That's why -- to answer the last lady's question.

People spoke about trash and stuff in the area. That's an existing problem now. That's not a problem that's being caused by my client. I have talked to him, and he's agreed that he'll police it or have someone out there to police it every day that they're open.

The lady from the school board, her issue was that there's a crosswalk there. Again, if you had a crosswalk distance, you couldn't put a Publix anywhere in Duval County because they all sell beer and wine.

Ms. Hopkins spoke about other churches in the area. But we have a map. There was a survey that was filed. None of those are within 500 feet, and S.A. Hull is not within 500 feet. Again, the map has to show 1,500 as well. We don't have to meet 1,500 , but it shows the 1,500 on there. Most of them are outside of 1,500 feet.

Representative Nixon's aide spoke about other uses in the area. I don't think of it as that bad of an area. I don't live there

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
anymore. I don't -- I do go there on a lot of occasions. I go to the Legends Gym that's out there and go to meetings, so I do know the area well. But add an area [sic] at this location, the uses that you're going to get there are limited.

My client proposes to put a legal use at that site. It's allowed by the Zoning Code. He meets the criteria -- two, actually, of the criteria of the Zoning Code for waiver of the distance. I'd ask you to protect his property rights.

I'd be happy to answer any questions.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Mr. Harden.

Anyone else here today to speak on WLD-22-13?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, I will close the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve application WLD-22-13 with the first two conditions that were recommended and the advisory board report.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: We have a motion and second for approval.

Before we kick it off with comments from the Commission, Mr. Gallup, our school district representative, has a couple of comments.

Go ahead, Mr. Gallup.
MR. GALLUP: Just to reiterate some of the comments from the school district speakers earlier, when we're mentioning 20 percent of the walkers are coming from the area, that's approximately 48 elementary-school-age students that are coming from the direction of Washington Estates Drive, Dostie Drive, and Devron Drive.

The other issue we have is the bus stop that is across the street is approximately 180 feet to the front door of this facility. This bus stops serves as a pick-up and drop-off for magnet, middle, and high school. So it addresses three different areas of students in the district.

And under this waiver, since it is discretionary, you may choose to deny this. So just remember that we have "may" as a

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
discretionary term in the waiver process.
I also have some exhibits I could pass out to you that I would like to put in for the public record.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Gallup.
Pass those document over.
So comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Blanchard.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you, Chairman.

This is an interesting one, and I appreciate all the compelling testimony from the community. You know, from my perspective on this, do I think that the community needs another liquor store there? No, I do not. Do I think it negatively impacts the community? Perhaps it does.

Clearly, there's some bad neighbors and a fair amount of shenanigans and crime issues and things like that. Generally, I don't think it is in the best interest of the community.

From a technical standpoint, do I think it meets the criteria for a waiver? Yes, I do.

The important thing here is that we're not Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
here to decide whether this site should be a liquor store. That is not why we're here. That's a zoning function, and they already have that right. We're here to decide whether the waiver of liquor distance from the store to the church is appropriate. That's it.

So respectfully, the school board has sort of this emotional pull or, you know, this logical concern of the kids and things. That's not part of the criteria. We're not supposed to consider that. It's not part of the law and the ordinance.

I think the bigger issue here is that there's probably some reform that's needed in the Zoning Code. And maybe that's something you can get with your City Council member or your future City Council member or whoever and come up with some strategies to change the rules.

Because we don't write the rules; we enforce the rules. City Council writes the rules. So maybe it's tied to crime, that says if there's crime greater than $X$, then, you know, liquor stores are prohibited. Or maybe there's an overlay in certain areas that are

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

106 challenged that says "no new liquor stores" or something.

But the bottom line today is that we're here to decide whether or not the distance of 401 feet instead of 500 is acceptable. And the fact that there is other liquor providers that are closer means that it is.

And I don't want there to be a liquor store there, but based on the rules, I'm really compelled to vote to allow that waiver because that's what we're voting on today. Not the use, but just whether that distance is okay. And the fact that there are other uses that are closer means that that distance is, then, acceptable.

So I will vote for it today. I don't think a liquor store is the right use for that community or the right use for that site because of the community. And perhaps greater reform will help avoid some of the those concerns in the future.

But it's -- I feel like we're trying to prohibit the liquor store from that location by using a technicality because of distance when the greater concern is really should that place

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
be a liquor store at all? And the answer is probably no, but that's the Zoning Code. That's not this waiver today.

So I apologize for voting yes. I will vote yes, but I want you to understand why.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Blanchard.

Further comments?
Commissioner Elsbury.
COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Just before I talk about my position, I just want to ask one clarification question. Simply just because of what Commissioner Blanchard said, a lot of the testimony relayed today is unrelated to the facts that we're considering.

So I do want to lay out one fact that I've noticed in reviewing these documents. Could I just get clarification that the distance requirement that we're looking at isn't actually related to the physical building of the church; it's more of a parking lot that the church owns?

MR. LEWIS: So the Zoning Code -- and let
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
me read it because I knew this was probably going to come up -- has how to measure the distance. And it's the distance following a straight line from the nearest point of the building or portion of the building used as the location to the nearest point of the grounds used as part of the church.

So there is some -- you know, the church has a large property in this -- the nearest point is 401 feet from the location.

COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: Which is a parking lot, correct?

MR. LEWIS: I couldn't tell if it's a parking lot or just a grassy area.

COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: My point being is this: We're not being asked to waive the distance between the front end of a church to a liquor store. The church happens to own a very large piece of property that includes a parking lot that gets closer and encroaches on this distance requirement.

I'm not inclined to deny someone opening a business because an adjacent property owns a large parking lot. And our Zoning Code, for whatever reason, puts us in this position.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) $821-0300$

But I do want to go over, again, what Commissioner Blanchard mentioned. You know, we're asked to consider a variety of facts, and, you know, the applicant mentioned it.

And, Mr. Garrison, who is in attendance, I appreciate your commentary, but I appreciate the neighbors' commentary a lot more. Also appreciate you name-dropping that you're on a regulatory board. And I hope that you understand that what you presented to us is not anything that we're required to weigh in on.

And I hope, as a regulatory board representative, you exercise due diligence and actually weigh out what you're prescribed to do by Ordinance Code and not facts that are unrelated to the mission statement of your board.

Second, let me close with this. As government, thank God we're not in a position where we regulate new businesses because of bad neighbors, adjacent property owners that are bad actors. I'm never going to be in a position where I tell an applicant coming before this commission that they can't start a business simply because people around them

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

110
commit crimes and do illegal things. That's not fair to them; that's not what government is supposed to do.

I'll be supporting the application, and I encourage my colleagues to do the same.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Elsbury.

Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

I need to declare ex-parte communications. I spoke with Ms. Tyrona Clark-Murray on Monday, the 4th of April. She was kind enough to provide me with this packet and highlighted some of the most recent fatal incidents in this area. Thank you for that.

There's a few things I want to address. I want to answer some of the questions that the community had.

Through the Chair to staff, could you help us understand why this application needs to be -- why are we looking at 500 feet as opposed to 1,500 on this application?

MR. LEWIS: Again, the Zoning Code classifies different types of alcohol use by Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
distance requirements.
So off-premises consumption of beer and wine is $5-$-- and liquor is only 500 feet. If you have a restaurant that serves beer, wine, and liquor, then distance is 1,500 feet.
That's for on-premises. So this is
off-premises consumption. It is a 500 -foot limitation.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Lewis.

So if this were a restaurant serving beer and wine, it would have a greater distance requirement. So that's why we're looking at 500 on this one.

I also heard a comment -- and I hear this pretty often, that we have already made up our minds. And I can assure you, I would not be on this board if we operated in that manner. That's not ethical; it's nothing that I would volunteer to do.

There was another comment -- and, of course, this is about this application, but I just want to clear up some concerns. There was another comment about our salary. I don't know if this is widely known, but we are absolutely

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
volunteers. We're not paid a dime for being here. We're not expensed for travel, expensed for our time, any of that. So we're here to serve, and I truly mean that.

This application is tough for me. I realize that there are some issues in this neighborhood, and alcohol may not be the best thing or even close to a solution for some of these issues. But as my other commissioners have mentioned, you know, we are to look at the ordinance on this.

Commissioner Elsbury summed it up perfectly. If we were ever in a position where we're denying new business based on old business that's not related in any way, how would that be fair? I'm a small business owner, and if I -- you know, and opened up in Murray Hill where it's known -- it's got a history for issues. And if I were declined my opportunity based on its history, you know, how do we get that neighborhood moving forward?

You know -- and I'll just reference -- and I'm going to paraphrase the code here that Mr. Harden provided us. The Planning
Commission shall -- and that's "shall." It's
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
not "should." It's not, you know, "could, if they'd like."

We shall grant a waiver for minimum distance from a church or school for a liquor license location if there exists one or more circumstances. He's highlighted two circumstances where it's fact. This is evident that it's not directly visible. And now, no matter how we measure this, we're 99 feet off. But it's not directly visible. I'm looking at the map. It's absolutely not directly visible.

And then many of you mentioned there are already liquor stores all throughout this area. I would argue that it's not proliferation at this point. But you've filled that fifth criteria. You have provided that evidence to us that there are already liquor stores in that area.

So Criteria Number 5 says we shall grant this liquor distance if other existing liquor licenses of similar nature or more intense exist in this area.

So there are two criteria here that are met, and we have a fiduciary duty to uphold the ordinance. As much as I don't want to see this

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
go in -- I'm right with you guys. I don't want to see this go in. I don't see how it would be anything in the right path to helping the community. But, you know, I signed up to uphold the ordinance.

So I'll yield right now. I'd like to hear from my other commissioners, but as of right now, I feel like I'm obligated to support this application.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Moldovan.

I was going to leave this alone, but it was called out. So let me do a code check with Paige on OGC as we have a version that says the Planning Commission shall grant a waiver for minimum distance.

Is it "shall" or "may"?
(Discussion held off the record.)
MS. JOHNSTON: Thank you for the question.
I was prompted to look at the Municipal
Code as you were having your conversation.
I didn't see what was circulated to you
from Mr. Harden, but 656.133(a) talks about waivers for minimum distance for a liquor

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

## i.e., something else outweighs that, then you

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
would want to focus on the impacts for the church or the school, which you have heard testimony on potential impacts. But I would not advise to focus on general community concerns as that is not part of the language in the code.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Paige.
Further comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Porter.
COMMISSIONER PORTER: Thank you, Chairman.
I'd like to stay on this for a second.
Through the Chair to Paige, in our packet, Page 2 of 4 of the Planning and Development Department's package to us, it says "The Planning Commission shall grant a waiver for minimum distance if it meets one of the five criteria."

It specifically says "shall."
MS. JOHNSTON: Are you looking at the staff report or the application itself?

COMMISSIONER PORTER: The application.
MS. JOHNSTON: The staff report has the criteria that includes "may." If the application states "shall," that's incorrect.

And I believe this actually came up --
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Bruce, this was an issue that came up with another applicant where another applicant said you have to find in our favor because it says "shall." And this was supposed to be corrected, in fact, on the administrative side, to update the application because that is not the language in the Code. Obviously, you go with the language in the code.

COMMISSIONER PORTER: Thank you.
First of all, putting a liquor store in this area, I just put out that I do not agree with putting a liquor store in this area.

What's in our application package needs to be corrected. Several of us have already spoken based off this word "shall," that we're going to put this through. And it just -there's got to be some level of accountability that our package needs to be correct.

I'll be voting no on this because the area where children play at the church is within 500 feet of the liquor store. I don't have anything else to say.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Porter.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

118
Further comments?
Commissioner Brown.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: I'd like to thank Commissioner Moldovan, first, for opening this up because it's what I've been staring at highlighted for the better part of an hour or whatever this has been.

I didn't see a way out of voting this through because it was it was a "shall." I don't flex about being a lawyer very often, but I'm not going to vote because I'm going to follow the "shall." I can read a code.

But anyway, if it is a "may," then I am a no, because I now have discretion. I think it has too much impact on churches and school and I'll leave it at that.

THE CHAIRMAN: Further comments?
Commissioner Elsbury.
COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Let me just make one last point related to this on the "shall" versus "may" thing. Yes, explicitly I believe now we have referenced it as -- say "may," but none of my commentary changes.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

I was not basing my decision on that. The basis of my decision is what's clearly articulated in the code which permits this as an allowable use. It comes to this board and we look at those facts. A lot of people are talking about schools. Are we asking for a waiver for anything related to a school in this? It's a church. There is a school in the vicinity, but there is a school in the vicinity of every single liquor store in Duval County.

Again, the majority of the facts being presented to this body are about crime in the area. I am not declining an application simply because there are bad actors who are breaking existing law. This is an applicant that's trying to follow the law.

If you come down here and ask us to deny every single use that's potentially going to drive people to an area where there is existing crime, there would be no development, period. And I'm not going to speak as boldly as some my colleagues and say there shouldn't be a liquor store here.

I'm a property-rights/free-market guy. If there's a market for a liquor store, if it's an

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

120
allowable use, I think it should come to us. I think we should weigh facts. That's what we've done, and the facts clearly say that this should be an approved use.

I'll be supporting yes, and I ask my colleagues to do the same.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

And thank you, Commissioner Elsbury. I appreciate your opinion on this.

You know -- and I apologize. I mean, I'm reading the paper in front of me, and it really did weigh heavily on my opinion on this application.

I do think it's unfair to the applicant. I know that if I'm getting ready to activate a property and I've got ideas of what I would like to put in there and open up, and I look at the ordinance or an application for what I'm intending to use it for and it says the board "shall grant with one or more criteria," well, then I'm going to pay the application fee and roll the dice with the application. I think

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
it's a good bet. So it's unfair to the applicant to have this incorrect application.

But furthermore, I don't think that we can prohibit this building being activated due to the history of the area. I truly don't. There are liquor stores in my community. I don't think that they have a direct correlation to the crime that occurs, and I'm going have to support this.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Moldovan.

Any other comments from the Commission?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. I really appreciate all the testimony from the residents. The rest of the Commission did a good job putting it in perspective.

Ms. Barnum, you came up and were throwing stones. I guess none of these guys get paid; I get paid up here. I'm just kidding. I don't. I don't.

But what we saw today, we don't see often.
MS. BARNUM: Thank you for educating me because I thought you-all were City employees.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: It's not a conversation, but thank you. I got you.

We saw a couple of things today that we don't normally see. We got emails from State reps, we got staff people for State reps, assistant school board director, people on the school board. Mr. Gallup had -- certainly had some color to add. We don't normally see this.

I'm not going to beat a dead horse with what my fellow commissioners have already said. You want my technical reason? It's what Mr. Porter said, that kids do play at this church within the 500 foot rule.

But the reality is, I agree with Commissioner Blanchard, this Zoning Code probably needs an overhaul for us to say that the school is outside of what the zoning should be, yet there's a student bus stop across the street. I mean, is it the school we're measuring from? It's the students we're trying to protect them from.

So it's a neighborhood that already has issues. This will not improve those issues, and that's my perspective on this.

So my technical position is that this is
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
within the 500 feet. And as we have mentioned time and time again, we aren't owed to give this waiver. It's still subjective. That's why I appreciate everyone's color coming in today.

Any other comments from the Commission before we call a vote?

Commissioner Garrison.
COMMISSIONER GARRISON: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

I would just like to go on record. It seems appropriate as everyone else has gone on record.

I'm compelled to believe that -- I mean, this is -- the church is -- you know, by vehicle, is about, you know, probably 1,400 feet, being a quarter mile away. You know, there's a lot owned next door with a cul-de-sac going into it from behind the church. So it -I mean, it is a lot. To me, it looks like an asset owned by the church that is contiguous to the church.

I would beat a dead horse to say I think there should be tons of community uplift and involvement. It should be nonprofits,

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

## 124

churches, schools doing everything they can to improve the community.

I am sympathetic to the plight of the community. I have worked in Soutel, physically doing labor, throwing sod, and busting up concrete. As a teenager, I have been to Soutel. I know the area fairly well.

I've heard a lot of things, and I'm going gloss over as far as things that, you know, are implying unfairly, you know, of us that -we're not here to fix the moral -- to fix the moral situation in areas of town. That's not what we're appointed to do here. We're enforcing the Code. And it's -- I'd be first in line to help, you know, to volunteer or do whatever else to help a community. I care about people.

But this is about 99 feet from the front door of a church. And this is far greater, in my opinion, than 99 feet from that front door of that church, and it meets the criteria. It is, in fact, further away than the club that is -- that has been complained about so much.

And I'm going to side with the criteria. I can separate, you know, following the letter

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
of the law and balancing the property owners'
rights from being sympathetic and civically involved in helping Northeast Florida and Jacksonville getting rid of its crime and thrive.

So it's a hard decision. It's not one I make easily, but that's where I'm at.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Garrison.

Final thoughts from the Commission?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll call the question.

All those in favor of WLD-22-13, signify by saying aye.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Aye.
COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: Aye.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Aye.
COMMISSIONER GARRISON: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Let's see the hands up.

Commissioner Moldovan, Commissioner Elsbury, Commissioner Blanchard, and Commissioner Garrison.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Okay. All those opposed?
Aye.
COMMISSIONER PORTER: Aye.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Porter, Commissioner Hacker, and Commissioner Brown.

Okay. So the wise Paige says we need five in one direction to move this out of Planning Commission.

So, Paige, where do we go?
MS. JOHNSTON: Per the ordinance code -- a
different section of the ordinance code -- a
final decision of the Planning Commission requires five in one direction. Since you
don't have five in one direction, it's
deferred to be taken up again at the next
meeting unless someone wants to reconsider their vote.

THE CHAIRMAN: Would anyone like to reconsider their vote?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll move this to the next Planning Commission meeting.
So this will be deferred.
All right. That seems like a good segue
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
to take a break.
Let's take a 15 -minute break. We'll reconvene at $3: 25$.
(Brief recess.)
(Mr. Schellhorn exits the proceedings.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We've got some ground to cover. We've got a quorum here. Commissioner Porter will be back. He's walking in now.

Let's move to WLD-22-14, please.
MR. LEWIS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
This is for application for a waiver of minimum liquor distance. WLD-22-14 seeks to reduce the distance from the restaurant located at 10244 Atlantic Boulevard to the Atlantic Boulevard Baptist Church from 500 feet to 275 feet. This will allow for retail sales and service of alcohol for on-premises consumption in conjunction with a restaurant in the CCG-2 zoning district.

The subject property is approximately 3 acres and developed with a 39,000-square-foot neighborhood shopping center. It will have 150 seats -- or I believe -- with the capacity of 150 seats.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Staff has reviewed it. We find that this is an appropriate location for this type of use, and we are recommending approval. This proposed establishment is not directly visible along the line of measurement from the church. And so with that, we feel it does meet the criteria and we are recommending approval of WLD-22-14.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Bruce.
(Mr. Yancy approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Yancy, thank you for being ready to roll.

Give us your name and address for the record.

MR. YANCY: 1309 St. Johns Bluff Road North, Jacksonville, Florida 32225.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Ms. Tropia will swear you in.

THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MR. YANCY: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
 PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING

Proceedings held on Thursday, April 21, 2022, commencing at 1:00 p.m., at City Hall, Council Chambers, 117 West Duval Street, Jacksonville, Florida, before Diane M. Tropia, FPR, a Notary Public in and for the State of Florida at Large.

PRESENT:
DAVID HACKER, Chairman.
ALEX MOLDOVAN, Vice Chair
MARSHALL ADKISON, COM.
DANIEL BLANCHARD, Comission Member.
JOSHUA GARRISON, Commission Member.
JASON PORTER, COmmission Member.
JORDAN ELSBURY, Commission Member.

ALSO RRESENT:

FOLKS HUXFORD, Chief, Current Planning.
KRISTEN REED, Chief, Community Planning Div
BRUCE LEWIS, Planning and Develop Planning
PAIGE JOHNSTON, Office of General Counsel.
MATT SCHELLHORN, Military Representative.
RANDY GALLUP, Duval County public Schools
PATRICIA SALES, Planning and Development Dept.

Dione M. Tropla , Ine., post Offlec Box 2375 . Jecksonville , Fi 32203 (907) $821-0300$
presentation. It is important that an accurate record must be kept of the speakers and what is said. Everyone who wishes to speak must fill out a blue speaker's card, place them in the basket beside the speakers' podium. The cards are located near the podium and in the back of the room.

The speaker's testimony is taken down by the court reporter and it is important that participants speak clearly into the microphone and only one person should speak at a time,

Any tangible material submitted with a speaker's presentation will become a part of the public record and will be kept by this commission; therefore, please retain a copy of anything that is submitted if it's needed.

The public hearings on exceptions, variances, waivers, administrative deviations and minor modifications are quasi-judicial where you will be sworn in prior to your testimony and the decisions by the Planning Commission today will be final.

Decisions by this commission on rezonings and land use amendments are recommendations only. The recommendations are transmitted to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

April 21, 2022
PROCEEDINGS

THE CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon, everybody.
Welcome to the April 21st meeting of the Jacksonville Planning Commission.

As a courtesy, please place any mobile phones, tablets or audible devices on silent mode.

Please join me now as we stand and recite the Pledge of Allegiance and remain standing for a brief moment of silence.
(Recitation of the Pledge of Allegiance.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let the record reflect that we have quorum with Commissioners Adkison, Blanchard, Brown, Garrison, Elsbury, Hacker, Moldovan and Porter present.

In attendance are also our Duval County Public Schools representative, Mr. Randy Gallup; our military representative, Mr. Matt Schellhorn; and members of the City's Planning and Development Department and the Office of General Counsel.

This commission's bylaws provide that each member of the public who speaks before this commission is limited to a three-minute

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. I have a motion and a second.

Any comments from the Commission? COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.) THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we have a motion and a second.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye. THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes. All right. Now let's go over the order of today's agenda. We are first going to hear the four ordinances. 2022-0122, 2022-0170, 2022-0220, and 2022-0221 are the four ordinances, and then we'll follow the typical order of the agenda, starting with E-22-18, Old St. Augustine Road, WLD-22-13 on Soutel Drive, E-22-23 on Philips Highway, V-22-05 on Caldwell Road, MM-22-06 on Main Street, 2021-0572 and -0573 on Ramona Boulevard West, 2022-0189 and -0190 on Florida Avenue, 2022-0191 and -0192 on Dunn Avenue, 2022-0193 and -0194 on 103rd Street, 2022-0195 and -0196 on Broward Road, 2022-0197 and -0198 on North Main Street, 2022-0201 on Lenox Avenue. And

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
then we have two PUDs, 2022-0199 on Spring Glen Road and 2022-0200 on Lem Turner Road.

All right. We have a lot of people in the audience today. We have a lot of people in the audience today for sure. Glad we're in Council Chambers instead of the Ed Ball Building.

Just a reminder, everyone's testimony will be kept to three minutes today. Any of the applicants will have three minutes initially when they present the application. They'll also have an opportunity to address any concerns that were raised by the public following the public comment.

So please keep an eye on your time. We have timers up here, three minutes per person.

And with that, let's get started with the ordinances. We'll start with 2022-0122, the package liquor store review procedure.

MR. HUXFORD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
This is Ordinance 2022-0122. It would amend the Zoning Code specifically so that the chief of Current Planning would be responsible for initiating direct contact with the district council member whenever we receive a zoning application dealing with a liquor store.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Staff has reviewed the application -- or not the application, but the legislation. And it's my suggestion, since I'm the one that would be on the hook for that phone call, I think it would be better to document and -- as a matter of practice, we already send copies of every zoning application to the district council member when we receive it. So what I would suggest is, in lieu of a phone call, which may or may not be successful, I would recommend that we digitize and send a PDF to the district councilperson, as well as their assistant. That way we have a paper trail, an electronic paper trail, to verify that we have initiated contact with the district councilman, but that -- that is our recommendation going forward.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Folks.

We had someone here from staff or OGC to speak on that.

Ms. Grandin, are you coming up?
(Ms. Grandin approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Grandin, give us your name and address, please.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

MS. GRANDIN: Thank you very much. Is this on?
Susan Grandin, Office of General Counsel.
Thank you and good afternoon,
Commissioners.
So this is Ordinance -0122, and it's -- as
Mr. Huxford said, it requires -- what the ordinance says is it requires Mr. Huxford, currently, the Current Planning chief, to actually call the district council member whenever there's a rezoning, an exception or distance waiver just for package stores. So that's all that it pertains to is just package stores.

And I heard him -- we see in the Planning Commission -- I mean, the Planning Department report to the Commission, to what they would prefer, so -- but the position of the council member is he would like a phone call or a meeting.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Ms. Grandin.

Ms. Tropia, can you hear that microphone okay?

THE REPORTER: No.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: No.
THE CHAIRMAN: No.
MS. GRANDIN: Wow. Okay. Do I need to push something?

THE CHAIRMAN: That sounds better.
MS. GRANDIN: Somebody pushed something.
Should I start over?
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Grandin, just for the sake of -- an abundance of caution, let's take it from the top if you don't mind.

Thank you.
MS. GRANDIN: Sure. So this ordinance, 2022-0122, is creating a new subsection in the Zoning Code and it would require the chief of Current Planning, which is currently Mr. Huxford, to give the district council member a phone call or even have a meeting whenever there's a rezoning application, exception or a distance waiver for a package store. So it just relates to package stores, but that's what they've asked for.

And the Planning Department recommended an amendment to make that a -- an email with the -- a digitized application instead of the meeting, but the council member would rather

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

10
have a meeting or a phone call.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Ms. Grandin.

That's a bit of a sensitive subject on today's agenda, so thank you for doing that again.

MS. GRANDIN: Sure.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Is there anyone else here today to speak on 2022-0122?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll close
the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve application 2022-0122.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We have a motion and second.

Any comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Blanchard.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you, Chairman.

This is really strange to me for a couple
of reasons. One -- and no disrespect to the
councilman, whoever that is, who has put this
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
forward, but if he says, "Hey, give me a special heads up when a package store variance or ordinance comes through," then it makes it sound like he's not reading the other ones. It makes it sound like he's not reading them or she's not reading them. I mean, their job is to review each and every one. And, you know, each one is important in its own way.

So that's a red flag to me that says something's not going right, so -- or maybe that person's not following through. I mean, their aide's job is to review these. Staff already sends them to each and every councilperson. So to have to waive the flag and say, oh, be sure and read this one, I think that's silly.

And the other thing is that, if a councilperson wanted the staff to do that, that should happen administratively. It's bizarre to me that this is an ordinance. So we're creating an ordinance that says that the Planning Department has to remind the City Councilman to do their job and they also have to give them a phone call. And that is strange and it has no place being an ordinance and it

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
is complete nonsense in my opinion.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Blanchard.

Further comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Adkison.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Through the Chair to everybody, I sort of agree, exactly what was said. The only thing I was going to say, if this thing goes forward, council personnel and their secretaries seem to be out of office a lot or are on vacation and -- all the time. To limit five days to make this requirement -- I think the word "email" does need to go in there to give to the Department so they're not spending all their time trying to remember to make phone calls or remind the councilman to look in -- look into their district and see what's going on.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Adkison.

Further comments?
Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

I agree with Commissioner Blanchard. I think that this prioritizes package stores over other applications. I don't feel that it's necessary. I think that it -- it ties up several people's time, wastes resources, taxpayers' dollars. I won't be supporting it.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Moldovan.

Further comments?
Commissioner Garrison.
COMMISSIONER GARRISON: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

I'd like to make a friendly motion to amend the current motion on the floor to a denial.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We have a
motion and second for denial of 2022-0122.
Any comments?
Commissioner Elsbury.
COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Just a brief thought. I don't necessarily disagree with what you guys are saying

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
ultimately. I think this probably belongs just
in a negotiation between the Land Use and
Zoning Committee, Council and the
administration so that Folks and the Planning
Department can have a conversation at LUZ and at Council about how to best transmit information with one another, but I'll support it just to get it out, to get it to council.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Elsbury.

Final comments from the Commission?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We have a motion and a second on the floor for denial of 2022-0122.

All those in favor?
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Aye.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Aye.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Aye.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Aye.
COMMISSIONER PORTER: Aye.
COMMISSIONER GARRISON: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Aye.
Any opposed?
COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: (Indicating.)
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Let the record reflect that Commissioner Elsbury was the only vote opposed. So that motion passes, recommendation of denial.

All right. Let's move to 2022-0170.
MR. LEWIS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
2022-0170 legislation is to amend the Zoning Code, particularly the Part 15 wireless communication section, to require that cell tower -- or tower companies place on a cell tower their contact information.

I won't -- we went into this last session, and the Department doesn't have any objections to that, but -- and so we recommended approval of this.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Bruce.
Mr. Boylan, would you like to speak on this?
(Council Member Boylan approaches the podium.)

THE CHAIRMAN: Councilman, we appreciate you being here, adding some context to this legislation -- proposed legislation.

Can you give us your name and address, please?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

16
COUNCIL MEMBER BOYLAN: Certainly. Thank you, Mr. Chair.
Michael Boylan, 1829 Melrose Plantation
Drive, District 6, council member.
A number of my constituents over the course of the past six months or so have contacted me about some disrepair at various cell tower sites in their general area, but they didn't have specific information as to address or who to contact in that process.

A number of those instances, I would turn them over to Code Enforcement, who basically said they don't really have a hand in that area, so I took it upon myself to try and track down some of these cell tower owners and came to realize it's a very difficult proposition to do. It's a fair amount of change in ownership. And then even when you are able to identify the owner of a particular tower, the identification of that tower is difficult to pin down many times, even in the communications with those folks.

So the suggestion of asking the cell tower owners to have conspicuous signage on property so that people have -- know where -- who to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
contact and where to contact them so they can report any kind of condition issues that they may be experiencing in the neighborhood.

I've had a number of conversations with various cell tower owners and -- and wireless communication companies. They didn't feel this was an issue for them or an overbearing issue for them to do, so just want to put a -- codify the habit of getting that information, reported on an annual basis, and it's actually making it available to constituents who can contact the cell tower owner directly.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Very good. Thank you.

Is there anyone else here today to speak on 2022-0170?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Seeing none, we'll close the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve application 2022-0170.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: We have a motion and a second.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Any comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Blanchard.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you, Chairman.

Just quickly, I had -- I guess that would be considered ex parte communication with Councilman Boylan last week. He called me on this matter. And, you know, when it came up a couple of weeks ago, I was kind of scratching my head on it. And, you know, the question is, why do we need it? And, you know, his -- his point was that, you know, if they had some towers where the -- the branches were falling or -- falling down or -- or maybe the -- the generator there may be in disrepair or making noise or something. And -- and I thought, well, yeah, that -- that's a pretty good reason, so I'm -- I'm in favor of this.

It's not onerous. It's a $\$ 30$ sign. It's not a big deal either way, but I think he -- he has a pretty good reason why it should be done and I appreciate the explanation.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Blanchard.

Commissioner Brown.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Thank you.
Through the Chair, just a point of clarification, either staff or Councilman Boylan.

Is this going to apply to all existing towers?

COUNCIL MEMBER BOYLAN: Yes, sir, it is, through the Chair.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Okay. And, again, I don't think it's too onerous. I tend to not have much of an issue with it. You know, I -I do have a 16 -year commercial real estate career. And a lot of these towers -- I'm not a cell tower guy, but many of them are on the tops of office towers, deep on private property. You'd have to, like, trespass to see them or be on top of them, you know, five-, six-plus-story buildings, so I just -pragmatically, it seems a little funny to be placing signage in these locations on as-built towers, but I'm just bringing that up.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOYLAN: Sure. Well -- and actually I'm focusing largely on residential towers, towers located in residential areas, which typically are on-the-ground towers.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

I didn't think to qualify it for those on top of other buildings, but I think the idea of having the annual notification of ownership is probably still a good idea.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: I don't have heartburn over it. I was just thinking about the ones that I've seen in my career that are -- they're usually, like, in the deep corner -- because you don't want to put them in the middle of your parcel; you can't develop it, so they're usually back in a corner, top of buildings, usually private properties. So I was just thinking it would be hard to even see a sign with the location of many of these, so -- I was just thinking through it.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOYLAN: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Brown.

Further comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

The first time this came through I did not support it, I didn't understand the necessity of it. I appreciate Councilman Boylan for

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
being here and better clarifying the need for this. I have no problem with it. I'll go ahead and support it.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Moldovan.

Further comments?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: I'll just quickly echo what
my fellow commissioners have said. The cell towers are one of those things we don't hear of often. They're a little bit out of the ordinary. This makes a lot of sense. If you're getting more than one phone call, the path of least resistance is for these residents to call the owner of the tower directly, so I'm in full support of it.

Mr. Boylan, I appreciate you being here and adding some context.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOYLAN: Thank you for taking the time. Appreciate it.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. So we have a
motion and a second for approval of 2022-0170.
All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

22

THE CHAIRMAN: Any opposed? COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.) THE CHAIRMAN: All right. That motion passes.

Thanks again.
All right. Let's move to 2022-0220 on Renew Arlington.

MR. HUXFORD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
This is Ordinance 2022-0220. This is amending a portion of the Renew Arlington zoning overlay. The overlay has been in place for a few years now and we've seen some tweaks to try to address unintended consequences.

In this case, that -- that part of Arlington is known for having businesses that may very well have parking lots that are physically separated perhaps by a street or another property, as well as our service garages out there that can't comply with the -some of the zoning requirements.

The goal is to -- of the overlay is to increase the aesthetics and make the place look better, but it is not with the intent of making it where people are afraid to invest in their businesses, or even run them out of business, Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
we don't want that. So this is a tweak that's trying to address some of the issues and hardships that we're seeing with regard to parking spaces and service garages.

That's just kind of teeing it up, and Susan Grandin with the Office of General Counsel is here to provide a little deeper context as to what -- what caused the need for the legislation.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Folks.

Ms. Grandin, give us your name and address, please.

MS. GRANDIN: Susan Grandin, Office of General Counsel.

Can you hear me?
THE CHAIRMAN: Yes, ma'am.
MS. GRANDIN: Okay.
All right. So in -0220, Folks did a great job of explaining what it is. It does a couple of things. The first thing it does is - - the parking lot -- it's a -- it's a change to what's required in parking lots in the way they calculate their vehicular use area and the trees and buffers that go in there.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

So the first thing that it does, chronologically, in the ordinance, is it -because the -- the overlay requires properties to also adhere to the landscape code. The landscape code talks about, if you have over 25 parking spaces, then you have to do certain things. All the little lots that Mr. Huxford rereferred to in the Renew Arlington overlay are very small.

So what we've done here is provide in each character area the ability to --- if it's a geographically separated parking lot -- like, for instance, if there's a -- about four spaces in the front and then in the back there's four spaces and maybe across a right-of-way there's some more spaces, you don't combine those into 25 or more, you take them separately so that it doesn't put you into a higher requirement for these smaller lots.

So it's really -- the code was kind of vague on it, so we wanted to make sure that it was understood that, for these smaller lots in this area, you don't have to go to the larger amount of landscaping that you would typically have to do anywhere else in Jacksonville just

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
because of the smaller lots. So that's one thing it does.

The other thing, because of the smaller lots again, in the high-intensity uses, of which an auto service facility is, you don't -currently, you're prohibited from trying to get an administrative deviation for lot size. And because all the lot sizes for auto service facilities existing in the CRA are less than an acre, which is what is the required size, at least -- we are adding the ability for them to at least request an administrative deviation to go through that process, to have a smaller lot size.

And it does -- I might add, too, that it does -- it requires that they have to meet all the other criteria within the overlay. So if somebody is trying to do a good job and they've done everything else but the lot size is just too small and you can't really do much about your lot size, then at least it gives them an administrative deviation too as an escape valve for that.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Ms. Grandin.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

## 26

```
Anyone else here today to speak on 2022-0220?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll close the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I
``` move to approve 2022-0220.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a second.

Comments from the Commission?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Grandin, I've got a
couple of questions for you. Out of curiosity,
how many properties does this parking rule affect?

MS. GRANDIN: We have Karen Nasrallah with the Office of Economic Development and she's the staff person for all the CRAs, so she's got the answer.
(Ms. Nasrallah approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: There she is.
Ms. Nasrallah, good to see you again.
Give us your name and address --

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

MS. NASRALLAH: Good to see you. Good afternoon.

Karen Nasrallah, OED staff.
There are approximately 133 parcels within the CRA that -- that the overlay applies to. They are nonresidential commercial properties. A huge number of them are service garages.

And the reason this is before you today is because when the overlay was passed, it was mandated that we put together a grant program that would help these property owners come into compliance, that the CRA would reimburse them for their costs for this. And, therefore, not being too burdensome on them.

John's Automotive came to us, and they are not only meeting but exceeding what we're asking in the overlay. It is -- they are actually demolishing their existing building. They are building a new structure, which is exactly what we want in a CRA. It's redevelopment at the -- at the highest order. However, they're limited by this one acre parcel rule.

It's a -- as Mr. Huxford said, it is an unintended consequence, and we'd like to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
correct that for this mechanic and auto shop, as well as others. We don't want to burden them any further but want to help them, those that are really abiding by what we have asked them to do.

THE CHAIRMAN: Fair enough. Thank you.
While I got you, Ms. Nasrallah, what -give me the -- give me the temperature on the success of the CRA as you see it at this point.

MS. NASRALLAH: Well, if you haven't driven up Arlington Road and Merrill Road, it's amazing, what's going on out there.

The Commission approved the redevelopment plan in 2015. If you drive up Arlington -- or drive up Arlington Expressway, get off at University boulevard, you will see College Park coming to life, which was the former Town and Country. Wawa has started. We have a new academy going on out there. We are flooded with applications for this grant program. It has been a huge success and we have not had to market it at all.

THE CHAIRMAN: That's awesome.
MS. NASRALLAH: Property owners are coming to us. I mean, you can drive from one corner

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
to the next and see the redevelopment beginning to unfold.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. I appreciate you being here. I know you have a lot of hard work gone into this CRA, so -- sounds like this is a good tweak.

MS. NASRALLAH: Thank you very much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Any other comments from the Commission?

Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

I've always liked this overlay. I went to
JU and -- and I firsthand have seen the
improvements that it's made.
Some of these auto shops, they look like restaurants at this point. They look like little cafes. I mean, the -- the landscaping that's going on around them, so --I like what it's done, but I -- I do see that -- that there's a need for fine-tuning the parking lot matrix, so I'm in support of this.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Moldovan.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

30
Final comments from the Commission? COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Again, I think
this is a great idea. Once everyone figures out how the heck to use that roundabout in front of JU without hopping the curb, we're going to be in a great, great spot.

All right. We have a motion and a second for approval of 2022-0220.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Any opposed?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes.
All right. Ms. Grandin, last one for you, I believe, 2022-0221.

MR. HUXFORD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
This is Ordinance 2022-0221. This is an amendment to Chapter 654. You're used to dealing with 656, which is the Zoning Code. But any changes to Chapter 654, the Code of Subdivision Regulations, also require review and comment by the Planning Commission.

In this case, this is a bill by Councilman
Randy White which would revive a program that
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
existed until about seven years ago for the sidewalk construction deferral program.

The goal of rejuvenating this is so that people can -- if -- they wouldn't have to install a sidewalk to nowhere. When it doesn't make sense to install the sidewalk, there would be agreement with the planning director. And at the appropriate time, the property owner or the successor, whoever buys the property, if it changes hands, would be required to install the sidewalk when it's finally deemed to be appropriate, subject to certain standards.

But right now there are occasions when it just doesn't make any sense for someone to put in a sidewalk when it doesn't go anywhere because the other properties are undeveloped and it doesn't -- especially in areas where it's not immediately on the horizon where development is coming, so --

It's an old program. It seemed to work fine. I don't know why it was repealed seven years ago, but this would simply put something back on the books that appeared to have been a success and hopefully that will help spur development.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

32

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Folks.
Ms. Grandin.
MS. GRANDIN: Susan Grandin, Office of General Counsel.

Again, this is 2022-0221-- -0221 is the bill number.

So one of the things that it does -- and I don't know, I guess you guys have a copy of the ordinance there in front of you. I just wanted to direct your attention to -- first, on Pages 4 and 5 there's definitions of infill development. And it's not a new definition. It's actually a definition that was just taken out of the Comprehensive Plan but placed in here because what we're going to be talking about is infill development.

So the really pertinent part starts on Pages -- 14, and goes on.

So one of the things that it does, in order to get the old program back that Mr. Huxford referenced is we -- well, I'm -let me just say one other quick thing.

One of the things that it does on Page 15 is it -- there's a table that requires a certain sidewalk width, depending on what

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
development area you're in. And there are five development areas in Jacksonville. There's downtown, there's the Urban Priority Area which covers actually the Renew Arlington area that Ms. Nasrallah was just talking about. The Urban Area, the Suburban Area, and the Rural Area.

So as you kind of go out from the center of town, that's generally where the development areas fall, but the Urban Priority Area actually takes in the CRA area, and one of the issues that actually came up through the CRA area in Arlington is that we were requiring even residential roads that -- just imagine a single-family residential road hitting Merrill Road or University Boulevard. They were being required to put in an 8 -foot-wide sidewalk in front of residential property, which doesn't really make any sense. That's not what this was supposed to do.

So they've changed that. What we're trying to do here is change that back down to 6 feet, which is going to be the minimum sidewalk width all throughout Jacksonville. So that's one of the things it does that's

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
important. That's on Page 15.
But then the rest of it is -- goes into the deviations. So there are -- what we've done is created three different types of deviations. There's a waiver of sidewalk construction, in which you would pay into what's called the "in lieu sidewalk fund." For whatever it would cost, there's a -- there's a per-linear-foot cost that the City has come up with in terms of what you would pay to construct a sidewalk.

If you don't construct the sidewalk and are approved to go through this program, then that's what you pay into the in lieu sidewalk fund. So that's one deviation, is the waiver of construction immediately.

The second one is a deferral. So there are set -- set out criteria for -- if you're going to ask for a deferral, here are the criteria that the director would consider in determining whether or not you could get a deferral.

And a deferral really means a deferral, so you wouldn't have to pay it right now and you wouldn't have to construct it right now, but

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
the developer, the owner, whoever that is -and it's for residential -- single-family residential infill lots. Let me-- I should have said that in the beginning. It's not for commercial properties. It's not for subdivisions that are coming in. It's not for -- if you're going to do three lots or more. It's for individual infill lots, single-family residential.

So if you meet the criteria and the director agrees, what the developer or owner would do is sign an affidavit, and it would be recorded in the public records and so it would run with the land, basically saying we don't -the City of Jacksonville doesn't believe that you need to have a sidewalk now, but in the future, things change, you know, things get developed out, and we may make you come in and put a sidewalk.

So that would run with the land. Whenever somebody sold the property, it would go on the title report, the title commitment, and whoever buys it would realize -- they'd be on notice that they may be responsible for putting in a sidewalk in the future.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

So that was one way to try to give a release valve to this because, as Mr. Huxford says, you don't -- currently, because it -- the code was changed several years ago. There's no relief valve at all for a piece of property way out in the hinterlands that gets redeveloped -and I'm talking about redevelopment, not -- not new properties, not a whole new neighborhood, but an infill lot that's going to have to put in a sidewalk and there's no connecting sidewalk for miles around. So that's kind of the idea for it.

And the last type of deviation is a variance. So that has to do with physical constraints. There's a huge tree in the way, there's a bridge, there's something, so it's a physical constraint.

So this went to the Context Sensitive Streets Standards Committee this morning and they had a lot of comments about, you know, why are you giving a deferral for this, why are you giving a deferral for that, and wanted some changes. So they're going to meet about it again, but it's here for your comment if you care to have any comment for it.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

That's it.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Ms. Grandin.

Anyone else here today to speak 2022-0221?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll close the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve 2022-0221.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a second.

Comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Blanchard.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you, Chairman.

I'm encouraged to see some changes to this code because I felt that our sidewalk rules were a bit onerous, especially when compared to some of the other municipalities across the state.

Ms. Grandin, I've got a question or two that -- something I didn't quite understand. So -- so the deferral only -- would potentially

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

38
apply to just a single-family lot, not like a subdivision or anything like that?

MS. GRANDIN: Correct.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: The waiver and
payment into the fund, would that be eligible
for a new subdivision or just for a
single-family lot as well?
MS. GRANDIN: The waiver is for any -it's not limited to the infill lot.

COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Okay.
MS. GRANDIN: And Lurise Bannister is really the expert on that. So in case you have any, really, questions, look at Lurise. We can ask her.

COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Okay. So -- and that's good. And the -- the example why is that, I built a community on -- in Northwest Jacksonville and we were required to put a sidewalk down the entire length of the road and there were giant oak trees there. And we didn't want to cut them down. The sidewalk would lead to a closed dump on one side and an industrial facility on the other, so it went nowhere.

So the City made us do that. And, of
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
course, the neighbors are coming out, you know, why are you cutting down the oak trees? And we don't want to. We don't want to put in that sidewalk. So I think this is a fantastic opportunity to -- to avoid those types of conflicts where it -- when you look at it, the code's not one size fits all. It just really didn't make sense in this instance. Most instances it does. And I'm not a huge fan of sidewalks because they're so expensive and they're hard to maintain for the City, but there's instances where you just don't need them, and so I'm -- I'm really encouraged by this.

The only thing that I would recommend -and I'll look to staff to put this in the notes, if you would, is -- and Bill won't -Bill won't like this, but instead of the waiver being administrative, it should go to the Planning Commission like the other waivers do so that -- so that the community can have a chance to be heard on those items and that it can be voted on and not up to just one person who's a staff member to decide whether or not it should happen.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

No further comments, Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Blanchard.

Further comments?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Grandin, I'm going to
take a step back and then ask you something you probably already said, but does this apply to -- in any way to new developments, so more than one parcel, or is this all just infill, single-lot parcels?

MS. GRANDIN: Currently, if it's three lots -- and I -- that's actually in the application for the in lieu sidewalk fund, though I might get with Council Member White and ask him if I can put that in this ordinance, but basically if it's three or more lots that you're redeveloping that are adjacent to each other, then you would have to put in a sidewalk. You couldn't get a deferral or that type -- you might be able to get an in lieu sidewalk application done. You might. But if it's three or more, then this wouldn't apply, the deferral wouldn't apply.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Gotcha.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

I don't do this on a day-to-day basis, so I'm a little -- I feel like I'm a little bit out of the loop, but it seems really subjective, though, how -- and, you know, what rate do you pay into this fund? I mean, the -the pricing of concrete is dynamic right now. You don't know when that's actually going to get built. And then deferring it until it's ready, that seems -- I guess there will be criteria there, but that just seems really subjective, but -- but I do think that there was definitely an issue there in some of the -in the neighborhoods surrounding our office, there was some infill houses that were built and, yeah, that's the only sidewalk, is in front of this brand-new single-family home on this entire road, so there's certainly a need there.

I guess this is a step in the right direction, but my only comment is that some of the criteria seems a little -- a little subjective, but -- but I'm with it.

Any other comments from the Commission? COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: We have a motion and a
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

42
second for approval of 2022-0221.
All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Any opposed? COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes.
Ms. Grandin, thank you for being here.
Okay. So that got through our ordinances.
Now it's -- this is where it should get fun.
The good news is we have this all figured out. So we have two main things today and one is the school on Old St. Augustine Road that a lot of the residents are in opposition for.
The second one is a package liquor store on Soutel Drive that, again, a lot of the residents are in opposition for. So what we're going to do is we're going to put the liquor store in Mandarin and we're going to put the school on the Northside, and I think we would all leave here in a pretty good is spot, so -is that all right? Paige helped me out with that yesterday.

Okay. So that's what we're up against.
We've got a lot of speakers. I think that's
what the majority of you guys are here to speak
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
on, so -- so just a reminder. You've got three minutes to speak. The applicants will also have three minutes to speak at the beginning. I'm going to let their time run at the end so they can try to address all the concerns that you guys have.

After we get all of the public comments, we will -- we will make a motion one way or the other. That doesn't necessarily mean that's how we're going to vote. So it's not a done deal.

And one of these we did hear last meeting, so to hopefully save you guys some time, none of us get paid up here, none of us are making any money on any of these projects. We'd have to recuse ourself. There were some accusations thrown last meeting, so -- so now we got that out of the way.

Any other housekeeping stuff? Folks, we had one other -- one other thing.

MR. HUXFORD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
Just a general announcement. It appears there's been some confusion about the -whether or not the Planning Department will validate parking passes. It appears that

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821~0300
somebody on our staff might have said that we do. I just want to clarify that we are not authorized to validate people's parking passes. So I don't want you to sit there and have an expectation that we're going to stamp something when we're not allowed to do so. Just wanted to clarify that. And I'll figure out who on staff said that and get it corrected.

THE CHAIRMAN: Better yet, Folks, how do we get their parking validated? I mean, they're -- not to put you on the spot, but that's what I'm doing. It seems like if they're coming -- you know, spending part of their day here to have public comment, we should at least cover their parking tab.

Don't they do that for Council meetings?
MR. HUXFORD: Yeah, I believe they do. But I'm not City Council. That may be rolled into the Council budget. I can't say for certain.

THE CHAIRMAN: Do we have a Planning Commission budget?

MR. HUXFORD: Do you want one?
THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah, I think so. I think it would be an appropriate time for that.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

MR. HUXFORD: I'll get with the administration on that.

THE CHAIRMAN: Is it the chairman's privilege? We could use that?

Okay. Not the news you guys were hoping for. I don't like it either, but nonetheless, let's move on. So we're going to take these in order. We'll start with E-22-18 on Old St. Augustine Road.

MR. HUXFORD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
This is application for zoning exception E-22-18 for property at 12265 Old St. Augustine Road. This is in the Mandarin area, approximately a half mile east of St. Joseph's Catholic Church there at Greenland Road.

The request is for a school, meeting the performance standards of Part 4, which is our development criteria for schools. The property is zoned -- split zoned RR-Acre and RLD-70. And in our residential zoning districts, we do allow schools, but they have to get a zoning exception first. We do have other zoning districts that allow schools by right, but in this case they need the exception.

Staff has reviewed the application.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

And I will acknowledge receipt of numerous emails, which we have forwarded to the Planning Commission as well as put in the master file for the official record. And a lot of it seems to be centered on the intensity of the traffic and activities that are out on Old St. Augustine Road.

We have reviewed it, and we do have our Transportation chief with us here today if y'all have any questions. But as part of our review, it did include the traffic review, and it was determined that there is capacity on the road, whether it seems like it or not. And again, staff is here to provide clarity on that.

There are numerous institutional uses. There's over a half a dozen churches out there. This is the major corridor between that part of Mandarin, near St. Joseph's, going out to Bartram Park. And I know it's a very busy roadway, but it is also where we have a lot of our institutional uses. And viewed in that capacity, we felt that it was appropriate. And so at this time staff is forwarding to you a recommendation to approve.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Folks.
(Mr. Hainline approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: T.R., are you going to --
MR. HAINLINE: T.R. Hainline, 1301
Riverplace Boulevard.
THE CHAIRMAN: Let me stop you there real quick.

MR. HAINLINE: Sure.
THE CHAIRMAN: I want to go ahead and -we're going to go down the line and declare ex parte. Commissioner Moldovan is supposed to remind me of that and he stepped out.

Commissioner Porter, do you have any ex-parte communication you'd like to declare?

COMMISSIONER PORTER: I do not.
THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Elsbury.
COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: I do not.
THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Garrison, immediate past chair.

COMMISSIONER GARRISON: I do, Chairman.
I spoke with T.R. Hainline. He called me and simply explained the matter would be coming before us.

Thank you.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Brown.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: I spoke to T.R. Hainline in the past couple of days, just discussing the matter coming before us.

THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Adkison.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Negative.
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Blanchard.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Yes, Mr. Hainline is still mad at me for a comment I made four or five months ago, so he had Mr. Jeremy Callaway call me and I had a brief conversation with him about it a few weeks ago.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Blanchard.

Commissioner Moldovan, we're going over the ex parte. This is the thing you were going to help me remember.

Go ahead.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you,
Mr. Chairman.
I do need to declare ex-parte communications. I spoke with Mr. Michaelis yesterday. He informed me of some of the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
concerns from the community, tried his best to demonstrate how they're addressing those concerns, and -- and informed me of what would be before us today.

Thank you, sir.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Moldovan.

I also spoke with Mr. Michaelis yesterday on this matter and read all the residents' emails.

All right. Mr. Hainline, you're up. Give us your name and address for the record, please.

MR. HAINLINE: T.R. Hainline, 1301
Riverplace Boulevard, here representing Summit Construction Group.

Mr. Chairman, what I'd like to do first is hand out some things. If -- could you all stop the clock while I hand out some things?

THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.
MR. HAINLINE: One is just a presentation outline, kind of like a slide show, only there's no slide show.

Mr. Michaelis is going to help me here.
And then we have their site plan in the
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

50
show, but we have larger copies of the site plan there as well for everybody, and then the third item is a list of proposed conditions to go with the exception.

And just for the record, I'd also like to submit this traffic study just as part of the record.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
We'll take a look at those as they come around. Do you want to start the testimony?

MR. HAINLINE: Yes, sir.
Let me go through some process first. We were scheduled for a hearing on April 7th. And at Councilman Boylan's request, we agreed to defer to allow for a community meeting on April the 14th. We attended that meeting. We made a presentation when we answered questions for about two hours.

Since the community meeting, we've made revisions to the exception's site plan, primarily to enhance a buffer along the western boundary of the site, adjacent to a residential subdivision.

We are also proposing conditions to the exception today, conditions which are

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
consistent with the commitments we made at the community meeting.

We sent the revised site plan and the conditions to Councilman Boylan's office late yesterday. He said that he would hopefully be able to distribute those by email to the people who attended the community meeting.

So we've been through a good process with citizen input on this.

We're going to cover three issues, basically traffic, site design, and why this site. And I'm going to talk about traffic and some others are going to talk about the other issues.

So on traffic, throughout this process we have worked closely with the City's
Transportation Planning Division, that's Ms. Santana, and the City traffic engineer, Chris LeDew. We did a detailed traffic study, including counts, an analysis of peak hours. And we submitted that to Transportation Planning and Traffic Engineering during the process.

The traffic study showed that that current -- currently, that link of Old St.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Augustine is operating at level of service \(C\), level of service C.

The study recommended improvements, namely installation of a traffic signal, which will maintain level of service \(C\) at the site. Signalized pedestrian crossing and a right-turn lane about 290 feet in length. The total cost of those improvements is \(\$ 1\) million.

The study also recommended on-site queuing capacity to be about 1,700 linear feet, but actual queuing capacity on the site provided is about 3,322 linear feet. That's more than double the queuing capacity recommended in the study.

The Transportation Planning Division and the traffic engineer have reviewed the study and agree with its conclusions. These improvements and the queuing capacity recommended in the study are included in our proposed conditions.

Additionally -- and as a last point, Mr. Chairman, additionally, we propose a later start time for the school and a staggered drop-off time so as not to conflict with a.m. peak hour. Per the traffic counts, the a.m.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
peak hour is \(7: 30\). Our school start time will be no earlier than \(8: 15\). And that later start time is specified in our conditions.

So just to summarize the traffic, we're addressing traffic through a million dollars of improvements at Old St. Augustine; on-site queuing, more than double the recommended length; and a later school start time so as not to conflict with peak-hour traffic.

Todd Lucas will now address site design and then Chris Klotz will address why this site.

Thank you very much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Hainline.
Let me pause for a second and ask Paige a question.

Can we swear everybody in at once?
MS. JOHNSTON: Through the Chair, it has been done before, if you would like to do that. Otherwise, you would have to swear in anyone who's not an attorney.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. And how do we do that? I would like to do that.

MS. JOHNSTON: You would ask everyone -are you going to do that for the waiver as well

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
or just for this item?
THE CHAIRMAN: Both of them, both items.
MS. JOHNSTON: Okay. I would suggest that you ask anyone who has filled out speakers cards and/or intends to speak on these matters coming before you that are not attorneys for them to stand up, raise their right hand, and then Diane can recite that and they can affirm it.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Let's --
MS. JOHNSTON: And she can -- and she'll put that in the record, that the audience did it in a combine sense.

THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Tropia, you okay with that?

THE REPORTER: Yes.
THE CHAIRMAN: Here's what we're going to do. We have final action on both of these items. That means everyone who speaks -- and I have, like, 50 speaker cards just for this one -- is going to need to be sworn in. So for the sake of expediency, we're all going to take a stretch, stand up if you're going to speak if -- whether it's this item or the next item or any of them in the future -- this is a good

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
looking crew here -- and Ms. Tropia is going to swear all of us in at one time.

Real quick, if you guys -- you all have the same shirts on, I'm assuming y'all are going to speak, whether it's this one or the second -- the liquor store, the waiver, if you're going to speak at all, we need you to stand up now so we can swear you in.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: It's another item.
THE CHAIRMAN: That's exactly what I'm saying. If it's another item, I need you to go ahead and stand up now. If you're going to speak at all this meeting, let's go ahead and do it, stand up now.

I've got a feeling I need you guys in front to stand up. This sounded good in theory.

Let me rephrase. If you're sitting down, you're not going to be able to speak as we move forward.

We never had this problem when Commissioner Blanchard was chair.

All right. Let's do this, Ms. Tropia.
THE REPORTER: I need everyone to raise their right hand for me, please.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

56
you -- as you look at the queuing around our property, you'll see that there's a recreation area defined. That recreation area is 54,028 square feet. In addition to that, we have a covered recreation area that is another 8,000 square feet, and then an indoor recreation area that's 9,081 square feet, totaling 1.44 acres. And I bring that up because on the second slide, I thought it was important to point out that in this area we have -- we've talked to, verified, and actually built six of these schools.

And the -- I went through and broke down the acreages of open space and recreation area on these properties. You'll see at the top of that sheet it shows our project, and then there are 11 schools after that. Note that it only looks like there are nine. That's because there's a couple of \(K\) to 8 s and then high schools that are combined because they use the same rec area even though they're a different building on a different piece of the property.

So if you look at that, you're -- your average is -- you're between . 47 acres and 3.9, so pretty good spread. But when you average

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

58
1 that out, all of the schools that I've got on this list in the area have a total of
1.13 acres, so we're quite a bit higher than that.

Additionally, if you take the highest and the lowest out of that, it actually decreases the average acreage to .89 . Just want to point out that we're exceeding all of those metrics on that for our open area for our children.

The next page is focused on the buffering area. We -- I had the pleasure of talking to some of the community after the community meeting who were specifically concerned about this as they were the adjacent neighbors.

What I'm showing in this slide is a small plan showing the actual site plan circling the area that I'm referencing here, which is the west boundary, and then I rotated that on this document so it's a little easier to see because it's hard to blow up a big site plan.

But I think the high points of this are that -- is that the -- when we went to the -to the community meeting we had a 10 -foot buffer, which is a code requirement. We've now come in and done a couple of things. We've

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
added an 8 -foot-high sound wall -- a decorative sound wall that will run from the beginning of the front of the property all the way past the fields and the -- the drive aisle area to the -- to the retention area.

Secondly, we've increased the landscaping in this area, not only beyond code, but we're -- we're exceeding code. And it's a mix of fast-growing canopy trees, of hedges along the property, fast-growing hedges and a number of shrubs in multi-layers.

The distance for that buffer was -- as I said, was at 10 feet. We've now adjusted this plan and pushed it enough to allow, at the smallest point, 25 feet of buffering, and at a larger area, and more of the average is at 52 feet of buffering.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Lucas. We appreciate you being here, sir.

MR. LUCAS: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Next, we have Nataliya Safronova.

MR. LUCAS: I'm sorry, we have one more -Chris Klotz is speaking on why we chose -- why this location.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

60

\section*{THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. I don't --} Mr. Klotz, come on up here.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Did you fill out a blue speaker's card, sir?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: I did.
THE CHAIRMAN: You did. Okay. It must be in here somewhere.

Okay. Go ahead. And then after you, we'll hear from Nataliya Safronova.

Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Chris Klotz. I'm at 4154 Coquina Drive in Jacksonville.

THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead.
MR. KLOTZ: My part of the presentation here is in your packet. It's a little bit after the one you just heard. It's titled Why Here.

So I'm -- I'm with Summit, with the development company. I chose this site for this charter school. The main reason why we started looking at southeast Duval County, the Mandarin area, is the overwhelming population of both general population and school age, 5 to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

14 population, so that drew us to this area.
We were also looking for an area with a large school choice demand and few school choice options. We're also looking at areas that have high employment. This area in particular has over 110,000 jobs. And also owner-occupied housing percentage is something else that we look at.

So on your first slide there's a -- really demonstrates the school choice options in the area. So we had to go out to over 12 schools. I was looking for at least one charter school that had open capacity. You'll see there on your slide that none have any capacity anywhere within this school [sic].

So there's, again, 12 schools on that slide, zero open capacity in those charter schools, and over 3,000 on the waiting list. That wait list is a little deceiving because if parents do what I did this week and they call each one of those charter schools, they're quick to tell them that they're full. So often parents don't make it on the waiting list. So these 3,257 children that are waiting, there's really much more than that -- that want school

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

62
choice in this area, that don't have it now.
Further in the packet we demonstrate that there is an 8 percent growth anticipated in this market over the next five years. To highlight that, we've got listed all of the coming projects, projects that are under construction, and -- and different pockets of massive growth.

This site in particular is right in the epicenter of that growth. There's more than 3,000 homes that are scheduled, in -- in construction or at the tail end of planning that are noted on the map there.

One of the last things -- not the last things, but the last thing I'll mention here that we look at is site accessibility. We were thrilled to find a site that was well-positioned on a main roadway between two highways. So that gives us good access for parents to come in, drop their kids, and head off to work in the area.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Klotz, thank you for being here.

Next, let's hear from Nataliya
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Safronova --
AUDIENCE MEMBER: May I be the last person, please?

THE CHAIRMAN: I don't have a problem with that, sure.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: If possible.
Thank you so much.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We'll hear from David Fritsch, and then Donna Perry, and then Theodore Centerwall.

Those next two, if you guys want to come on up close to the microphone so we can -- we can get through these pretty quick, that would be great.
(Audience member approaches the podium.) THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Fritsch?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes. My name is David Fritsch. I live at 4609 Silverthorn Drive, which is right across from this proposed site.

THE CHAIRMAN: Did you stand up when we swore you in earlier?

MR. FRITSCH: Yes, I did.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Well done.
Go ahead, sir.
MR. FRITSCH: First, I'd like to ask
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Mr. Shinelan [sic] a question. In the meeting last week you said that there was \(\$ 800,000\) improvements for the traffic light and the right turn --

THE CHAIRMAN: Sir --
MR. FRITSCH: -- and today he says it's a million dollars. So I was wondering where the extra \(\$ 200,000\) was coming from, just from last week.

Secondly, there are several teachers in our neighborhood, one at a public school, elementary, and the other at a charter school, and both of them have told me last week at the charter school they're nowhere near capacity. And the other one, the -- the public elementary school, they are not at capacity. So I don't know where this information is coming from, but from the teachers I spoke to, the schools are not at capacity.

We have 14 schools within a four-mile radius, and that -- they're saying that there's access to both main highways. This charter school doesn't require people to send their kids that live in the neighborhood. You can live in Orange Park, you can live in St. Johns

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

County, it doesn't matter, you can send your kid to this school.

I want to see what kind of planning they did for the residents that have children in our area that have to go to school, not for people that live in St. Johns or Orange Park or north -- northern Jacksonville.

The developer is planning this because he found a cheap plot of land to build it on. There's no consideration for any of the residents in the neighborhood.

That's all I have to say.
Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Fritsch, thank you for being here.

Next, we have Donna Perry.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: That would be me.
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Perry, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Donna Perry, and I live at 12121 Plummer Grant Road, which is right across the street where the school is going to be built.

First thing I'm really concerned about is
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
the fact that Plummer Grant Road itself is just a two-lane road with no sidewalks, nothing. And if children have to walk or ride a bicycle to school, there is not a safe area at all. As a matter of fact, it's gotten to the point that I have to stand back away from my mailbox and my -- when I put out my garbage can, I have to stand back away from the street or somebody's going to run over me. They love just kind of whizzing right by you.

The second thing is that -- I've been out there for 46 years, so I certainly know what's going on. Been there, seen it, done it.

Second thing is -- is that there's a Baptist South hospital right down the road from us. And because of that, there are many, many ambulances going up and down that road all day long. I'm talking about Old St. Augustine Road.

It doesn't justify -- I mean, the school doesn't justify having that road just beyond because it's just already very dense, more than you could possibly imagine. So I'd like for you to at least consider that because it is dangerous out there. Everybody that goes down Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Old St. Augustine treats it like it's
Daytona 500. The people that go down Plummer Grant Road do the same thing. It's very dangerous, and you can't -- and you don't even feel safe walking the sidewalks out there.

So I'm asking you please to just consider the safety of it, the fact that we've got ambulances running up and down the road all day long and into the night and that there's a lot of school buses and that sort of thing where the kids are jumping off and -- and going to their homes.

So it's going to be a nightmare practic-wise [sic] because it already is a traffic-wise nightmare. So if you would consider that, I'd certainly appreciate it.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Perry. Appreciate you being here.

Next, Theodore Centerwall, and then we'll hear from Chandler [sic] Hamilton, and then Ashish F.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Okay. My name is Theodore Hornoi-Centerwall. My address is

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

11166 Cloverhill Circle East, 32257.
I'm here as a member of the Mandarin community. I've only been there for five years. Before that, I lived on the Southside. But let me tell you even at five years, Old St. Augustine Road has become largely unmanageable at certain times of the day because of the sheer volume of the traffic of people dropping off or picking up children from the various schools that are already there on this site.

So what I'm saying is, we have a lot of schools already. And to add another one at this point does not really make sense, especially in this location.

The purpose of Old St. Augustine Road is to give people access to a lot of the important things on there, including the South Baptist Medical Center, but also it gives them access to a lot of other healthcare facilities in that -- in that part. A lot of them for elderly people. And it also gives access to the churches.

So there's a lot of institutions that are benefitting from what is there now, but let me tell you in the five years that I lived in

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Mandarin, I have seen a steady deterioration in the quality of the traffic in that location. And when I drive through there at certain times of the day, it's almost impossible.

I really, really would urge that we not do this, not just for convenience, but it could actually result in some serious problems because there's a lot of school buses that go through there for the public schools and there's a lot of emergency vehicles, fire trucks, ambulances that need this access.

And I live just off of Losco Road, actually, and that has a lot of traffic. So there's a lot of traffic coming in Losco, there's a lot of traffic coming on Old St. Augustine Road. I think we could do something better than what we're proposing here.

Thank you very much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, sir. Appreciate you being here.

Next, we have Chandler [sic] Hamilton, and then Ashish F., and then Caitlyn Tomazinis.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm Candace Hamilton.
THE CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

MS. HAMILTON: And I'd like to say -- ask \({ }^{70}\) you to reject this application. It's not the highest and best use for the --

THE CHAIRMAN: Ma'am, let me get your name and address for the record, please, before you start.

MS. HAMILTON: Oh, 11150 Zephyr Way.
That's in Mandarin.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you.
MS. HAMILTON: This is not the highest and best use for this property. I think it's zoned just as it is, residential, is the best use for this property given the fact that there are 13 elementary schools within a four-mile radius of this site. There is plenty of school choice; religious, nonreligious, public, private.

And as has already been mentioned, traffic grinds to a halt in Mandarin two times a day during drop-off and pick-up, and I just see this additional charter school as unnecessary.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Hamilton.
Next, we have Ashish.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Sir, I apologize. I'm not
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
even going to take a stab at your last name, but tell me how to say it.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: It's three syllables, Fulgavkar.

THE CHAIRMAN: Give us your address for the record as well, please.

MR. FULGAVKAR: My name is Ashish Fulgavkar. My address 4704 Silverthorn Drive, and I'm here to ask you to reconsider this -this application that has been submitted.

The reason behind that is, my property is right across from this neighborhood. The proposed traffic light is going to be there. And I have -- I just started looking for how people behave in the vicinity of schools. And what is going to happen is, if the traffic goes there, people who cannot or don't have the time to wait to make the left turn towards the school, they're going to enter my property and make U-turns right there.

This entire Silverthorn neighborhood is just a 43-house community. And I have never seen somebody put a major intersection across a small neighborhood like ours. That makes us -that makes this community unsafe. That makes

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
the lives of our children unsafe. And, practically, it will be a nightmare for every resident who stays there, but I feel that I will be the person who will bear the most burden of this.

The other thing that I wanted to point out was the traffic study that was done. We have just gotten out of the pandemic. I -- I
seriously wanted to understand how they have accounted for all the traffic counts that have -- that they have summed up and then kind of presented to this board saying that there -this will not pose a traffic hazard because --

Because of the pandemic, people are not going to offices, working from home. If we get to -- get to a normal routine, we don't know whether this is going to be -- going to cause any issues for safety issues, primarily, for this community.

The other thing that I kind of felt that I should bring up is -- you know, I come from India, and there -- there are times when people -- I've seen people grabbing major portions of land in prime real estate areas. They buy something which is considered as -- as Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
a social cause or school, et cetera, and then when the prices shoot up, they say that the school is not doing well, so they sell and then they -- then they basically get the profits.

I just wanted to understand what would happen in this case if something like this happens over here, whether this will be a big community, a rental community that will revert or -- in case that particular thing happens.

So I just -- I just wanted us all to consider these -- these aspects that I felt were important. There are many more, but I'm out of time, so thank you for the opportunity.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Ashish. Appreciate you being here.

Next, we have Caitlyn Tomazinis and then we'll hear from Jimmy Tomazinis.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Caitlyn, good afternoon. Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hi. I'm Caitlyn Tomazinis. My address is 12661 Del Rio Drive.

THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead.
MS. TOMAZINIS: So I'm here because I
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
oppose this. The number of issues that arise with this potential development in my community are endless; traffic, safety, environmental protection, already plenty of public education choice options, and the overall quality of life. The list could really go on. However, in my opinion, the biggest and most concerning is the idea that this applicant truly believes that this will benefit Mandarin.

Last Thursday at our town hall meeting, it was told to me that even though the need for this charter school is not there, the applicant loves Mandarin and wants to bring this to our community.

As someone who does love Mandarin and lives in Mandarin, I find that this is an act that is truly of selfishness -- excuse me -selfishness and greed. If the applicant wanted to bring something positive to our community, why not provide more greenspace, like a park that the public can enjoy.

In my opinion, this charter school that claims to be nonprofit is, in fact, the complete opposite. The community has spoken and you'll continue to hear more reasons, but

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
for countless reasons there is an overwhelming no.

I really hope that the people on this commission really consider the quality of life of all the people who came today and those who couldn't.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Tomazinis.
Next, we have Jimmy Tomazinis, and then we'll hear from Richard Rukab, and then Ray Evans.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Jimmy, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yeah. My name is Jimmy Tomazinis. I live at 12661 Del Rio Drive.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Go ahead.
MR. TOMAZINIS: Thank you for this opportunity today.

As a multigenerational Jacksonville area resident, I am well aware of the slow decline and gnawing of your quality of life depending on where you choose to stay in this city.

And unfortunately -- well, maybe, we'll
see -- my wife and I chose Mandarin because of
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
the roots, the historical aspect, and the ruralness of that area while still being in the city, yet here I am today trying to advocate and protect my quality of life, her quality of life as we try to have a life together there, but I will sit here and tell you that our quality of life, really, you can't put a value on it to anybody except us.

However, you're going to hear from the developer and their civil engineers, traffic engineers, they have something to benefit from this. I do not.

We have lots of school opportunities in the Mandarin area. This school is not needed. It's going to introduce way more traffic than we already have. It's going to put a new traffic light on Old St. Augustine that we do not need.

As much as they want to tell you that it's not going to impact traffic, they have no accountability there. If it does, it's already been built, it's our problem, we live with it for the rest of our lives until we decide we're going to move.

Also, I want to talk about environmental
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
issues. There are some large, mature live oaks as well as other things on that property. The stormwater pond is going to discharge directly to wetlands that have no outfall. There's no creek or tributary where those wetlands lead.

There's a number of flooding issues that we're concerned about for the neighboring communities when you introduce that much impervious surface area. And they're going to say there's calculations done and everything else. However, those are all based on assumptions. And like I said, when those are wrong, the residents pay the price; they do not. They have made their money and they have left. And that's what they're trying to do here.

They have identified it as an affordable piece of property that they think they can come in and build a school on and make money and then go -- and then move on. We have to live with all of those mistakes.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Mr. Tomazinis.

Next, we have Richard Rukab, and then
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
we'll hear from Ray Evans, and then Linda Deshauteurs.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hi. Richard Rukab,
12108 Backwind Drive.
Yeah, I'm against the development of this
charter school at -- at this location for a
couple of reasons. An extra school is not
required in the area. I would just like to
give a little perspective.
I didn't have to Google search this. I know this. I'm a Mandarin resident. I can name two each -- two private schools, two public schools, two charter schools within a five-mile radius of this site. St. Joseph Catholic School is one private school. You have Christ Church, which is across the street from the River City Science Academy, which is -- so that's another private school, and then you have River City Science Academy.

As you know, there's a traffic officer that has to be in the road over there directing traffic for both of those schools. I'm not sure if that's included in the traffic study.

Also, St. Joe's Catholic School also has
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
traffic issues as well. I think the right turning lane to go to Loretto is -- serves as a parking lot for people going in to pick up their children there. So I'm not sure if that's in the traffic study either.

The other public schools, Loretto Elementary and then Greenland Pines -- you could also count Crown Point Elementary and also Mandarin Oaks, those are just .2 miles away from the five-mile radius that I checked.

So that's one reason -- one reason that schools -- a school is not required in that area.

The second reason is the feasibility of the site. I looked at COJ maps just today, and out of a hundred-acre area, wooded -- wooded area, that includes the development I live in, Arbor Glade, and also Arbor Oaks, and this site -- it appears to me that wetlands and swamps make up most of this property in question.

So there's one property that's a 10-acre parcel. It says on COJ that eight units is swamp, and so there are no other -- it doesn't seem to me, just from general observance, that

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
there are other wetlands in the other hundred-acre area. So that -- that would be a concern.

And the third concern is -- as far as feasibility, is that the 230 KV JEA corridor that encompasses this property as well has to have a 24 -hour maintenance access. And I believe that retention ponds or anything like that cannot be built under these transmission lines, so this -- this property is really a hodgepodge of -- of different uses, and I'm against the charter school being in that area for that reason.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Rukab. Appreciate you being here.

Next, we have Ray Evans, and then Lisa Deshauteurs, and then Dave Hollingshode [sic].
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm Ray Evans, 5171 Trailing Oaks Court in Mandarin.

I'm here basically to -- you know, because I would like to - - this project to be denied, mainly because we already have more than enough schools there. And some of you may not be

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
aware that currently Christ Academy, which is across from River City Science, at that intersection, they're moving to a new structure that they have built, and we're going to have another charter school coming in called Seaside Academy, moving from San Jose, moving to that location this summer. So there's another school already coming in. We have more than enough schools in that area.

We don't need to add to that traffic any more. We don't need to add a traffic light to that -- where this school is going to be built. We don't need the headache.

I drive on that -- Old St. Augustine a lot, and most people will speed through that area going 55, 60 miles an hour, 45 limit. And where I go -- I access St. Augustine Road at Karen Drive [sic]. There's a traffic light there now. We have to be very careful pulling out of the green light because people speed through the red lights there often.

Now, I'd hate for this to happen down where -- across the street from the school where children may be crossing. I'd hate to see a tragic accident happen there, so please

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

82
consider denying this.
Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Evans.
Appreciate you being here.
Next, we have Linda --
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Tell me how I should be pronouncing your last name.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Certainly. I'm just
fixing this for short people.
It's Deshauteurs. I know it's nothing
like it's written. Just eliminate most of the vowels.

THE CHAIRMAN: Got it. I'm working on it. I'm not good at it.

Give us your address as well, ma'am.
MS. DESHAUTEURS: 5349 Pond View Drive, Jacksonville 32258, and I did the "I do."

THE CHAIRMAN: Perfect, Thank you.
You're off to the races. Go ahead.
MS. DESHAUTEURS: All right. In 1998, when I bought my home in Mandarin, I fulfilled a lifelong dream of home ownership. I purchased a modest home on . 46 acres with tall pines, mighty oaks, and lots of wildlife.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

As a single mom, I often work long hours to pay the mortgage. However, my reward was the drive home late in the evening along Old St. Augustine Road. At that time, it was just a two-lane road lined by huge old oaks, creating a green canopy, and where in the still of the night I could actually smell jasmine. A big city girl like me, I thought this must be what heaven was like.

Over the nearly 25 years I've been here, Mandarin has grown, and Old St. Augustine Road is now five lanes with more houses and shops and, of course, traffic congestion. Heck, we even have our own exit on I-95.

There are now about 3,800 houses zoned Low Density Residential, and we keep it that way for a reason.

I get it. Lots of people have discovered the beautiful Mandarin neighborhoods. They also want their kids to grow up with clean, sweet air, lots of trees and the occasional bunny rabbit across their front lawn.

Coming from a big city, I recognize the need for these sometimes intangible features. What I don't see a need for is another school

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
when, as you've heard, we already have 14
K through 8 schools that are underutilized. And, frankly, we were told exactly that by Mr. Hemline [sic] of Rogers Towers, the legal representation -- I went to that community meeting, and he told us it wasn't about need, that Mr. Cortis (phonetic), the builder, liked the neighborhood.

So let me ask, if there's no need, why would we want nearly a thousand vehicles tramping through the area twice a day, creating congestion? If there's no need, why would we want the air pollution that those hundreds of cars idling twice a day would release? If there's no need, why would we subject the adjoining neighborhoods to flooding issues? If there's no need, why would I or any of us wanted to jeopardize our beautiful homes and their property values?

I ask you good people, on behalf of the needs of Mandarin, not to rubber-stamp this approved, but to think about our needs and not the greed of these builders.

Thank you.
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (Applause.)
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: Well done. I'm reading your address again. I want to find out where that is.

All right. Dave Hollingshood [sic], please, and Deborah Desipio, and then Henry Glover.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm only slightly taller than her, so I'll raise it.

THE CHAIRMAN: Fair enough.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: And the name is Hollingshead, by the way.

THE CHAIRMAN: Got it.
MR. HOLLINGSHEAD: I've been called a lot of things. Hollingshood wasn't one of them.

First thing I'm going to do is say thank you for your service. I doubt you often get thanked for serving us, but I do appreciate what you do. I know it is not an easy job.

I appreciate also the opportunity to speak today in regard to this issue.

I've lived in our home off of Old St. Augustine Road now for 20-plus years, which, compared to Linda, makes me one of the newcomers, not an old timer. But what made me

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821 -0300
choose to stay there was the nature of that surrounding. Old growth oak trees has been mentioned by others, teeming and abundant wildlife. For an old country boy like me, this was heaven on earth. Truthfully, I can't imagine anyplace else I really want to live. Not only that, but it's a paradise that is still to this day affordable, and those are rare and hard to find.

We, though, now have a rezoning request that is before you. And it is coming from a school that is a for-profit charter school. And guess how they fund most of their payments? It's by taxes collected from Duval County taxpayers like all of us. Thus, this building will be primarily paid for by the Duval County taxpayers, owned by a private school.

If there was a need for the school, as many have mentioned, I might take a different point of view on this. However, as has been pointed out, there simply is no need. That's by the builder's own admission, by his -- by his representative.

Now, if it's not needed, that makes it unnecessary. So for us residents, what do we Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
get out of this deal? They get a paid-for school, paid for by us. What do we get? More traffic congestion, more pollution, another light that we have to contend with, increased rainwater runoff resulting from three acres of asphalt and concrete, which was formerly tree canopy and grasslands.

And God have mercy on the wildlife. We have ducks in our backyard, one of the few places where they feel safe to be able to come. Where are they going to go? Where is it going to be pushed to? There's no place left.

The owner gets the building, as I've mentioned, paid for by us. We get from it slower emergency vehicle response times, higher taxes, more pollution, increased flooding. I'm an old country boy, but I'm smart enough to know I'd never agree to a one-sided deal like that.

Ladies and gentlemen, I appreciate what you do for us, but I humbly request that you listen to your constituents and do not approve this rezoning request.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you,
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

88
Mr. Hollingshead.
Next, we have Deborah Desipio, and then Henry Glover, Barry Young.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Desipio, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Debbie Desipio, 4525 Crosstie Road North, Jacksonville 32257.

I oppose this charter school. The location of the charter school -- I'm all for school choice, but this is a bad location. As it's already been stated, just north on Old St. Augustine there's Christ Church and River City Science Academy. And if you're trying to get out in the mornings and either go right or go left on Old St. Augustine, you -- you have a hard time getting through because people stack up in the intersection because they want to get to wherever they're going as well.

We do have a number of schools in our area. Something that hasn't been mentioned yet is that parents are going to make these -their children walkers. So they can drop their kids off, they're going to go across Old St.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

\section*{Augustine Road.}

I don't know if you've been out there or not, but it's a wide road. The traffic does not slow down. It's fast-moving traffic. And then the parents are going to be sitting in the neighborhoods, in front of people's homes, and have their children walk across Old St. Augustine Road.

I don't want somebody sitting in front of my house waiting for their child, so I -anyway, that's -- that's not good.

Even if there is a change in school time -- and I do appreciate that the -- that the developer really has tried to accommodate the concerns that have been brought to them. That's the middle school bus time, so you're still going to have a lot of traffic. That's -- it's a bad area for a school.

They mentioned the churches in the area. Well, churches meet on Wednesday mornings -Sunday mornings and Wednesday evenings, so I don't know how they calculated that into their equation.

There's a lot of area south on Old St. Augustine Road, down where Kohl's is. Somebody

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
suggested eTown, that there's a lot of
property, there's a lot of area, and there's not charter schools over there. So there's a lot of places that are available. This is just a really bad location.

Another thing is -- I listened to one of the school board meetings this week. Parents line up an hour and a half before school is let out. They're -- they sit there and they wait. So where are these people going to be? They're going to start lining up. I know they've tried to accommodate that. Are they going to be parked on Old St. Augustine Road?

So it's just a really bad area for another school. So I'm a no vote. I'm a hard no on that one.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Desipio.
Next, Henry Glover, then we'll hear from
Barry Young, and then Sara Pack.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Glover, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes. Henry Glover, 4639 Silverthorn Drive.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Thank you very much for being here. I do also oppose this charter school.
I've been in Jacksonville all my life, 35 percent of it -- actually, North Florida, but 35 percent in Duval County. My wife and I moved to Mandarin for many of the reasons you've heard today.

We know that the traffic on Oid St. Augustine Road is bad. We're all telling you that.

Traffic signals make people run yellow lights and run red lights rather than stop at them, and I think we all know that.

Someone mentioned that it's a level C traffic pattern or capacity on Old St.
Augustine Road right now, something like that. Coming into our neighborhood and leaving our neighborhood, Silverthorn, it will be a level F maybe, or \(Z, I\) don't know how bad it can get, but us trying to get out of that neighborhood will be terrible.

Again, people coming into that neighborhood to drop off their children, to walk across -- because me, as a parent, I don't want to wait for that light, get onto the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
property, drop off my child, get back off the property, turn right or left and go to work. It's just easier to queue up, as we've all said.

A lot of institutional uses on that -- on
that street was mentioned, but none of them have a major intersection in front of a 43-count small neighborhood. It -- this is -it's got to be unprecedented. I haven't found any like that, so I think that is wrong.

And I suspect, if you guys allow this and it is built, in two years from now I'm selling my house, I doubt any of you would want to come and buy my house in that neighborhood with that situation. I could guarantee that.

So thank you for hearing me and please deny this.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Glover. Appreciate you being here.

Next, Barry Young, then Sara Pack, and then John-Pierre Comeaux.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
Barry Young. I reside at 4638 Silverthorn
Drive in the Mandarin area.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

I live in the Silverthorn community, which will be impacted in a more unique way than some of our other neighbors, who will definitely be impacted as well. Our community, based on the renderings that I've seen, is going to be directly across.

As my friend Ashish said, he lives at the entrance of our subdivision, which is where, as the previous young lady mentioned, parents line up at a minimum an hour and a half before, at all of the local elementary schools. So that means you have a line of traffic either on Old St. Augustine or on Silverthorn Drive where we reside, and that leads to potential damage of property, litter on the property, and then just an unwanted presence in front of your home, where if you do have guests, Amazon deliveries, anything of that practical nature, it impedes that and creates more congestion on the -- on the -- the main street and in the subdivision itself.

And the question I pose is -- some things never change. One of those concepts is supply and demand. So based on all the testimonies that you've heard, there's no demand for this

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
school. So if that is the case, who is it
being supplied for? If the people in the area don't want it, who are they building it for? Who's going to go to this school?

There are many communities in our city that are in dire need of a school, but Mandarin is not one of them, not in this immediate area, nor, as been mentioned, within a five-mile radius.

The last thing I want to leave you with is the term of "quality of life," which someone mentioned. And I state that not from an elitist standpoint of trying to hold on to what we have, because we all know that time brings change and change comes with time. But when I say "quality of life," I mean it from a concerned resident standpoint by not wanting to go to a certain quality of life that no one wants.

So I thank you for your time and I strongly admonish you to vote this down.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, sir.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Sara Pack.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hi. I was told that I
Diane M. Tropia, inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
was going to be able to have a presentation, so I had a video ready. And since they gave you handouts, could you just see a still shot of 60 feet from my house yesterday where I'm standing in at least two-and-a-half feet of water?

I live directly behind where they're proposing to put this school in. My land now is flooded.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Name and address for the record.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm sorry.
Sara Pack, 4917 Joseph Creek Drive, 32258.
So can I give this to you guys?
THE CHAIRMAN: So let's see -- Paige, can she give that to us?

MS. PACK: I'm not asking you to see the video, but I'd like for you to see the water.

THE CHAIRMAN: Don't do that yet because I think we've got to keep that. But it's your tablet, I don't want to do that. So email it to Ms. Sales. She will give you an email address.

MS. PACK: Can you see? I mean, do you --
THE CHAIRMAN: We can't -- just get her
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
email address, email it to her, and she will blast it to all of us up here.

In fact, I'm going to go ahead and move to the next guy and you guys can get the picture over to her so we have a minute to review that.

Is that okay with you?
MS. PACK: Of course.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you.
John-Pierre.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
THE CHAIRMAN: Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: John-Pierre Comeaux, 12102 Backwind Drive.

I'm a resident of Arbor Glade. I'm on the board and also president of the board. We're a small community of 56 houses. We're adjacent to the school property. We question the need for the school like everyone else does. We already have so many schools in the area. Many of these schools have vacancies. Even the charter schools do have vacancies, maybe not every grade level, but there are vacancies.

As represented at the last town hall
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
headmaster for the start of the ' 23 school year, and it says that the school will be \(K\) to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

98
8, as previously stated, but they have a desire
meeting, it was admitted that there was not a need, as we said before, just a desire to build there. Why not build at another location that's already zoned commercial, such as the old Kmart on San Jose Boulevard and Old St. Augustine Road? Or better yet, like we said earlier, to -- to the City of St. Augustine, St. Johns County, where the building out there is infinite.

For these reasons, you know -- we're the residents here in our neighborhood, and the residents in this meeting, you know, ask you, the council members, to vote no on this unless there can be a justified reason that it's -there's a necessity for the school.

We were also told in the meeting they were there to hear our thoughts and concerns. I think it was pretty unanimous that there was no need or desire for the school was expressed by everyone in the meeting.

Another concern we found is -- we searched for the headmaster of the school. We found an ad online that they're hiring for the to make it K through 12.

If the school was going to be a thousand kids in round numbers now, K to 12 would expand year by year and become 1,500 students. The plans don't quite cover all that traffic and all those kids.

We've already addressed the safety.
The biggest concern we have are the cars in the neighborhood, the quality of life in our neighborhood. Like everyone else has said, you know, Mandarin is known for the oak trees, the quiet (inaudible) of the residential area. We just don't want to see that change.

And as the prior lady was stating too, we had that same problem. In the back of Arbor Glade, it backs up to Arbor Oaks. All the nature preserve back there is a wetlands. It does flood. The homes in the back of our neighborhood on (inaudible) do have water encroaching upon their backyards whenever it does rain. The JEA easement floods.

When you build a school there -- we asked in the last meeting as well -- where would the water go? And they kept saying in the pond.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

And then the pond overflows. That's the problem we have now. There's no other place for it to go.

We ask you to vote no. Thank you for your time.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Comeaux. Appreciate you being here.

All right. Ms. Pack --
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (Applause.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Guys, hold back on the applause. We're not -- that is not our rule. It's -- we're in the chambers. You're not supposed to have any -- we don't want any display -- just hold off on the applause, please. Paige can articulate that if we need to.

Ms. Pack, did we get all that -- get that worked out?

MS. PACK: Yeah. I sent it to her.
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Excellent. Thank you for doing that.

MS. PACK: Yeah, definitely.
I had to -- Sara Pack, 4917 Joseph Creek Drive. I did it this time.

So there's a dirt road directly behind my
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
house and I had to put on waiters up to here (indicating) yesterday to walk on the dirt road. I'll start with that.

Around 2007, when Lazarette Court was constructed, and the homes, that -- it created a flooding issue on the land behind my home. Again, it's a dirt road. And now every time it rains, it -- it gets really deep. I mean, really, really deep. There's -. it's within 60 feet of my house.

And in 2015, they -- they built another road right next to where this proposed school is going to be. So the school is in the center. These roads are on either side. And every time they built these roads, all this flooding is coming back there.

Now they're talking about taking this land for the proposed charter school, covering it with this huge building, with two to three acres worth of structure and parking lot, and then saying that this pond that they're going to put there is going to solve all our problems.

They told us last week in the meeting that we were going to be equal or better with

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
flooding because of this pond they're putting in. They just kept saying that to us over and over and over again. Well, it's not true. When they put in these other roads we were told we wouldn't have flooding. And you'll see the picture. It's crazy, the amount of flooding we have. So now you're going to tell me you're going to put in this school, but I'm not going to have flooding problems? I'm sorry, I just find that ludicrous.

And then who is going to be responsible for this after the school is built and I have this flooding problem? And then who is going to pay me for the value of my home that I'm going to lose? Because, you know, how am I going to sell a house that has stagnant water on all of my land behind it?

Anyway, so mine is a different view from everybody else. And everybody's talking about traffic. I have a huge problem with that also. For me, personally, this is affecting me by flooding. And I vehemently vote no.

Thank you very much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Pack. Appreciate you being here, and the picture as

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

102

\section*{well.}

Chris Hoiberg, hear from you next, and then Stacey Walker, and then Darren Schmidt.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Hoiberg, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Chris Hoiberg, it's pronounced "i" like a " y ," 12148 Backwind Drive.

THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead, sir.
MR. HOIBERG: Good afternoon.
I've been living in Mandarin since 1983, currently off Old St. Augustine Road since ' 99.
So I've been in this area for about 20 years.
We chose this area for a reason. It's a quiet,
untouched residential area surrounded by plenty
of established schools in the vicinity, public and charter.

This past Thursday, as many of you are hearing, we -- we were in attendance at the meeting. We were told several things that were factually incorrect. The representatives had told us there was no need for this school, that they were actually doing this because they wanted to. There was not a need.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

As mentioned earlier by one of the other residents in our neighborhood, this was advertised as a \(K\) through 8 campus. In reality, they're hiring for a \(K\) through 12 . So that's going to be increased traffic above and beyond what they've already factored for because we all know high school students drive to school.

We were not presented with budget -- plans for budget for campus security, police or traffic control, police in surrounding neighborhoods. And there's no plans to mitigate children leaving the campus to -- and entering the surrounding neighborhoods. How are these issues going to be handled once the school was built and these arise?

We know of existing issues with other charter schools in the area and they don't have mitigation plans for these types of issues and the principals have said they're unable to do anything about it.

The consensus from the surrounding community. At the public hearing, there was unanimous consent from those homeowners in attendance that this charter school was not

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
needed or wanted in this community.
Our schools in this area are not at capacity and the charter school would only be inviting traffic from other parts of town that would not normally be in our area. Specifically, this charter school would even bring in more traffic from neighboring St. Johns County by means of Bartram Park, which already has congestion issues in the morning, evenings due to the proximity of I-95 and Baptist South.

The real concern. St. Johns County is where this increased need for schools is, not Mandarin. This school is going to support St. Johns County at the expense of Duval County homeowners and residents, with the stress on our infrastructure for their out-of-control growth and lack of planning for schools to support the influx of students into their area.

Recommended solutions. (Inaudible) should be looking at property to build their charter school in St. Johns County where there is a true need for these schools and not force disruption to a long-established residential area of Mandarin where the growth is extremely

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Sure thing.
Stacey Walker, 12051 Ariana Elyse Drive.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
minimal due to the already -- the area already being built out.

They could not tell us they can control the habits of parents, the staggering start times with the queuing lines to accommodate for the -- the amount of cars that are going to be coming into this area.

And as a member of the Arbor Glade Homeowners Association, sitting on the board, we do have concerns about the lines backing onto Arbor -- onto St. Augustine Road, blocking our entrance. We have concerns with the overflow parking into our neighborhood and we have concerns with -- the easement would invite traffic from the school for kids to walk and cut through.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Mr. Hoiberg. Appreciate you being here.

Next, Stacey Walker, Darrin Schmidt, and Joseph Rossello.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Walker, give us your

I'm calling -- I'm here today. I'm from Sandpiper Cove. I'm on the west side of this property.

While I appreciate them taking into account some of the concerns we had last week about the property line and giving us the buffer and the setback -- but our biggest concern is about that pond that is actually coming right up against my property line.

I already have flooding. We had to put in French drains and redesign my backyard so the water from that property didn't come to my -onto my side of the property.

Now, with this pond, I am very concerned about that water now coming back onto my side of the property, including on their design it shows that they're putting in some upland buffers that are blocking that pond to -- now instead of going to the wetlands, is coming to my side of the property. So again, that flooding from my side of our property is a big concern for us.

The other thing is, is about the roads that are on both sides. So the people that are in front of our subdivision, they're going to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
have roads coming into our subdivision and as well as on the back of their property, so there's no buffer of where their house is. There's roads coming in and out on both sides of their land.

The traffic for that subdivision for Sandpiper Cove -- we're a small cul-de-sac of only 26 homes, and people are constantly coming in already, coming in, making U-turns. And so for people coming in that are going to be parking and doing these \(U\)-turns again, for a small subdivision, this is not going to be conducive for us.

On -- last Thursday, some of the data they did about the traffic was used prepandemic, but we know for a fact that my subdivision as well as another one called Riverton Estates was actually built around that time, and so we're a community of 26 and Riverton Estates is a community of 60 that we haven't taken into account of all the additional traffic that was coming through that area.

Again, while I appreciate the landscape of being -- put in of pine trees and live oaks, there are currently a whole bunch of pecan

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300 trees that are lined on the back of my property that they're actually now going to take away and put these pine trees up there that -- I'm not sure if that's the proper thing to do to stop sound or give us some privacy.

With the flooding, these pine trees -- I'm not sure if it is or not, but they could possibly fall because of the flooding and stuff like that. And with these large pine trees, they could potentially fall on the side of my -- side of the property.

So again, everybody's been telling you about the same things, about traffic and safety and the need for this. I just feel like we're trying to put a square peg into a round hole in this part -- in this side of town.

Thank you for your time.
THE CHAIRMAN: Next, we have Darrin Schmidt, and Joseph Rossello, and then Gregory Burton.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
I'm Darrin Schmidt. I live at 12124
Backwind Drive, Jacksonville, Florida 32258.
I've been a Jacksonville resident my whole
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
life. My wife and I decided to purchase our home in the Arbor Glades subdivision because of its location and the beauty surrounding it.

To find out that we're going to potentially have a rezoned location for a neighbor that lives adjacent to our neighborhood that recently purchased a large parcel of that property who is not from Mandarin and now is going to sell to an individual or a company that wants to put in a school -- and I'm going to kick the can and the horse again, but we have 14 schools. We really don't need another school in Mandarin.

And not to -- you know, to point any fingers, but why do we need another school? Why? And the numbers -- as my colleagues and neighbors have stated, there are openings in these other schools. There are positions available. And who -- who's this school going to cater to, truly?

Ingress and egress is going to be a very big issue for my neighborhood. If you look at where you come into my neighborhood at, we have one ingress and one egress point. That's it. And it happens to be on the northernmost side

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

110
of Old St. Augustine Road, on the same side of the road that the school will be built at.

The problem with that is, is when they line up, they're going to stack up into my neighborhood. They're going to block people's driveways, they're going to, you know, block emergency vehicles from potentially getting into my neighborhood in the event that somebody has a medical emergency.

And if we lose somebody in my neighborhood -- there's 56 homes there, and it's very small. To put a school in where it's not needed would be a travesty. Even if it slowed down an emergency vehicle, you know, a minute, two minutes and it cost somebody their life for a school that we -- that we don't need, potentially -- there's no -- no numbers showing that we need another school.

Plummer Grant Road and Old St. Augustine Road was just shy of being an HFC intersection, and that's a high frequency crash intersection. And if you spent any time on Old St. Augustine
23 Road, council representatives, I'll tell you,
24 throughout the day it's almost like a NASCAR
25 race, depending on what time of day you're
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
there. There's cars at 60,65 miles an hour, plus.

So I ask that you vote this down. My neighbors ask that you vote this down. And ask yourself the question I would humbly ask you, is, would you want to buy my house -- as another gentleman stated -- when they put a school in right next door to your neighborhood where you can't get in or get out of your neighborhood because of traffic, people letting out cars or walking children from our neighborhood?

And with that, I yield the rest of my time.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Schmidt.
Next, we have Joseph Rossello, and then Gregory Burton, and then Ruth Burrell.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Rossello, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon, everyone.

My name is Joseph Rossello. I reside at 11979 Lazarette Court.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

And I want to thank all the people who have come here today both on our issue and other issues. It takes a lot of courage to stand up in front of people, especially when we feel like things are rubber-stamped.

I have five issues, many of them have been addressed; safety, quality of life, unnecessary need, environmental impact, and is this really the best use of the land?

Going to a nonprofit school, let's say all that land becomes tax exempt. If you were to put a neighborhood in, it'd increase the tax base, it would actually help the area. That's my biggest concern. All these people don't want it. And what do you need from us, the people that are with me? You want 1,000, signatures, 5,000, 10,000? We'll get it. I mean, I know there's only 50 people speaking, but we can get thousands upon thousands of signatures.

This is a rhetorical question. I have kids that went through \(K\) through 8 on Old St. Augustine Road. What time do you get there for carpool? I can tell you, I'm blessed. My wife generally picks up the children, but the few

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
times I have, it is so stressful, I literally get there as early as possible so I'm on that property and not on the road.

But if you go down Old St. Augustine Road during those times, it's one of the most dangerous places possible. Cars stopped on the side of the road, people -- I mean, human psychology. People are going to do what's easiest. And it doesn't matter what you build in place. Right now they have enough room for, you know, 150 cars for a thousand students. Nowhere near enough. Nowhere near enough.

The quality of life. People talk about different animals. This morning, no joke, under oath, I feed ducks daily in my front yard. They come to the door, literally wait at our door until we feed them. We have wild turkeys. We see deer. We're going to lose all that stuff because of a school that is unnecessary.

That's basically all my points, but I strongly encourage you guys to vote against this. Appreciate it.

Thank you. Have a good day.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Rossello.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) \(821-0300\)

Appreciate you being here.
Next, we have Gregory Burton, Ruth
Burrell, and then Joseph Rink [sic].
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Burton, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Thank you.
My name is Gregory Burton. I reside at 4663 Silverthorn Drive. I'm the HOA president of Silverthorn.

And before I speak, I would like to be -fully disclose -- full disclosure, I am the executive director of the school board police department. I sit on a committee that approves charter schools. I did not know this charter school was coming into Mandarin until I sat in front of -- on the board, and it was known that they were coming into Mandarin. And at that time I did recuse myself and had someone else stand in for me and I had already submitted my application referral.

So I just wanted that to be known, and I let the board know that -- some are here today -- that I would be here to speak on behalf of my HOA.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

I am not a traffic engineer and expert. I have 27 years of law enforcement experience. Fourteen of those years are as a zone commander, as an executive in police. I'm not a traffic engineer and expert, but I am an expert in addressing traffic problems in communities. I do that almost every day.

This will be a big traffic problem in our community, just like it is on Greenland Road, just like it is on Loretto Road, just like it is on Old St. Augustine Road in front of River City Academy, just like it is on Sunbeam Road. All over this county we create these problems and then our neighbors have to deal with them.

I would ask that you not approve this rezoning. The quality of life has been spoken about. I deal with the quality of life with citizens every single day. So I would ask that you don't add the problems of citizens having these issues with quality of life with a decision to approve this today.

I'm a big advocate of education. I have a master's degree in education. I believe in it. But I believe this is the wrong place for this school because I know what's going to happen.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

116
because of the expanded time frames.
As for school, in addition to traffic concerns, there appears to be an oversaturation of them already in the area. These have been mentioned, but I would like to note these schools that are there. Within a two-mile radius of this school, Greenland Pines, Loretto, Promiseland at Hopewell, Freedom School, St. Joseph's, River City Science Academy, Christ Church Academy, San Jose Prep and Academy, Seaside Community Charter School. And I had to include Mandarin High School because this particular charter school does develop into high school.

If you go to a three- to four-mile radius there's also Mandarin Oaks, Bartram Springs, Duval Charter on Shad, Crown Point, Mandarin Middle and Duval Charter at Flagler.

There appears to be more than an adequate choice, 16 of them for families without having another school built.

The builder and charter company presented the proposal, but the concerns of the residents were not adequately answered. Everything was presented from an engineer, traffic, and design

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

118
point of view.
In addition, it was stated that the proposal had been presented to our school board, but when I contacted our member, she was not aware of this proposal at all.

I'd like to address some of the points in the proposal but time constraints won't allow me, other than sections -- I think 4 and 7.

No matter what planning there is, there
will be a spillover awaiting cars onto Old St.
Augustine Road. Witness what happens at
Loretto, St. Joseph, River City Science Academy at drop-off and dismissal. Traffic is quite congested during these times.

And Section 7, St. Joseph's RCA and Christ Church School have hired off-duty police to keep traffic flowing, which is still not successful quite often.

This school on Old St. Augustine Road will cause a backup which would block the abutting neighborhoods and the excessive traffic potential might necessitate police assistance as well.

As you can tell by the above-mentioned issues, I'm in opposition of this zoning

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203

\section*{117}

1 it.
application.
I hope that the zoning board will take into consideration the excess number of schools in the area already and the potential for daily traffic issues on Old St. August Road.

Thank you for your service. I appreciate
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Burrell. Appreciate you being here.

Joseph Fink, and then Colleen Rodriguez, and then Brent Mitchell.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Fink, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
My name is Joseph Fink, and I'm a resident of Arbor Glade. We live on Old St. Augustine. We've been there for about 15 years. We built the home and we bought the home because it was a residential area, and we would like to keep it a residential area, so we are against this -- whatever it's going to be -- school.

It's still a mystery to me as to what this school is going to be. Is it going to be a K through 8 ? Is it going to be a K through 12 ?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

We've got opposing views or opposing statements about what it is.

I went to the meeting on \(4 / 14\) last week, last Thursday night, and I was really stunned. Almost every resident of all of the neighboring areas were there. All of those people were adamantly against this school, adamantly against it for our safety, adamantly against it because of the traffic, adamantly against it because of the fact that it is not needed.

It's that simple. It's not -- a school is not needed and may even be illegal based on the number of schools that are in the area.

The people that you see here - - and there are quite a number of them -- are just a small representative of the people who are absolutely, as I said, against this and who came to that meeting on \(4 / 14\).

I would like to take up just one or two issues about the traffic. By their own admission in that meeting that we had on that Thursday night, they did not at all take into consideration what happens when there is an accident on 295 or a problem or anything on 295.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300 concerns after the break. And then we'll bring it back to the Commission. So that's the game plan. We've got four more speakers.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hello. I'm Colleen Rodriguez. I'm at 12127 Backwind Drive in Arbor Glade.

Everything I'm about to say you've already heard, but I would like my statement for the record.

I want to thank you for giving us the opportunity to share our concerns. The two areas of focus for me and my family are safety and quality of life.

We were intentional, as many of our neighbors, about selecting a neighborhood that was small, doesn't have a community pool or a clubhouse, and where there is limited traffic so that our children can safely ride their bikes and our older residents can take their daily walks.

As the majority of us are parents and grandparents, safety is critical for us. We know that human nature, regardless of all of the mitigation work Summit has done to add

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
additional space for parents to drop off and pick up their students, the addition of this school will result in parents and children using the surrounding neighborhoods and avoiding the long wait times.

The roads in Arbor Glade are not wide and there is almost zero space between Old St. Augustine Road and Watch Tower, which is the main and only road into our neighborhood. So as the parents line up and children run to their cars or wait for their parents to show up, they will literally be blocking the only entrance into our neighborhood. That isn't safe for the students and it will ultimately negatively impact the flow into our neighborhood and will back up onto the flow of Old St. Augustine Road. The worst nightmare for all of us is that an incident will occur.

During the entire presentation we never heard how the school was going to address this. Will JSO be hired? Will the security be hired? Will there be a line item in their budget that will be continued not only for the first year but for years to come?

When the children leave the campus during
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

124
the day -- and let's be real, children leave the campus during the day even when they are instructed not to. Where are they going to go? They're going to wander into surrounding neighborhoods. It's what they do. How will this impact crime rates and vandalism? None of us can predict that.

But as someone who has elderly parents who also live in Arbor Glade that are home during the day, that is a concern. Again, a concern not addressed in the presentation.

There's a charter school directly across from my street and my office. Every day I have to call to say there are students and parents dropping off and picking up. I have big red signs that say we are not a drop-off and pick-up for this charter. The principal kindly says, "I'm so sorry. Parents will be parents. And I don't have the funding." So I'm living that every day. I do not want that in our neighborhood.

The City has done an amazing job of giving our area of town numerous educational opportunities, from public to private to charter schools. We are saturated with

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300 scene of the crime. You will see that they Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
have 950 students. And if we take an assumption of 80 percent being dropped off, that means 760 children will be brought by their parents. That's a potential of 760 cars in the morning and in the evenings.

They say they're going to stagger start times to handle this, but they're only staggering them by 20 minutes, so that's really negligible considering most parents line up up to hours before.

You'll also notice somewhere in their presentation there that they have 2,640 feet of queuing lines. That equals roughly 180 vehicles. So if you have 760 potential cars and you only have room on your premises for 180 , that leaves 580 cars to queue up somewhere either on Old St. Augustine Road, Plummer Grant Road or over in Silverthorn.

So the kids -- the parents will park in these other areas or they will block Old St. Augustine. Kids being kids, they will run across the street to their parents instead of waiting on the lights. And if any of you have ever played the game Frogger, you know how that all ends.
schools. To be frank, an additional school is not needed or wanted.

We want to maintain the safety and quality of life that we thought we were guaranteed when we chose the neighborhoods in which we live.

So I thank you for your time and consideration and I would ask that you would vote no.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Rodriguez. Brent Mitchell.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mitchell, give us your name and address, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hi there.
Brent Mitchell, 4552 Blueberry Woods
Trail.
First of all, I'd like to address a couple of items. As we know, since charter schools don't have bus service, all the children, with the exception of those who walk, must be dropped off by their parents.

This school -- and you'll see it somewhere in the stack of 8 -by- 10 colored glossies with circles and arrows on the back depicting the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Second point is the location of the traffic signal. Why would you put a traffic signal in front of a 47-unit development when you have a relatively main thoroughfare cut-through between Julington Creek Road and Old St. Augustine Road at Plummer Grant? Why would you not put one there? Well, the simple answer is they don't want to put one there because they don't own the property across the street from it. But if you get your City traffic engineers to work on this independently of any input from Summit, I think they will come up with the same assumptions and the same results as I am.

If they don't put in a light at Plummer Grant, the people on Plummer Grant will never be able to get out because there's only 137 feet between where the light is supposed to be and Plummer Grant. That equals eight or nine cars. You get eight or nine cars backed up at the light, people from Plummer Grant can't get out. So people from Plummer Grant, during hours of high traffic, can't go anywhere.

Thank you very much and I hope you turn Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
this down.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Mitchell. Next, we have David Kaufman. (Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kaufman, give us your name and address for the record, please.

After you, we will hear from Kelly
Biringer and then Nataliya.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Dave Kaufman, 4555 Blueberry Woods Circle
North. I live off of Plummer Grant Road and have lived there since 1988.

Like some of the other residents -Old St. Augustine Road back then was a two-lane road. And, frankly, I have advocated in favor of a lot of the residential growth that we've seen out in this part of Mandarin, largely because that kind of growth has brought some major conveniences for us. I no longer have to get up on the interstate to go to San Jose Boulevard to go grocery shopping or downtown to go to a hospital, but we've, during this time, successfully put those commercial uses at the fringe of this corridor between Loretto Road and Bartram Park, about three miles, which to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
this day has very few, if any, commercial uses.
And I would argue that while this is a school, it is very much a private commercial use and is -- the reason -- I believe one of the reasons why it is an exception and not an allowable use under the current zoning, as was stated initially, the schools are permitted under other zones, just not under residential, and this is a largely residential area.

So I would ask, you know, if it's appropriate in some other zoning category, what makes it appropriate there, not here, and why should we accept this exception?

I would also ask if there are 3,000 people on a waiting list for charter schools in this area that really want to go to this school -we haven't heard from one of them today, so I wonder where -- where all that demand really is.

Thank you for your time.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Kaufman.
Next, Kelly Biringer.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Biringer, give us your name and address for the record, please.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

130
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm Kelly Biringer. I'm at 12024 Ariana Elyse Drive.

And this -- this proposal is right next door to our neighborhood. And I think we -- we agree with all the other neighbors. You know, we don't have a problem with the charter school. This is just the wrong location.

If you look at all the different things that we've said, we've said everything from transportation to flooding, but our biggest risk is the traffic and the headaches that will come with all of that and flat-out risk that something could happen to a small child going across that busy street.

And what we're asking you is just please don't make us take that risk. Please let us be safe and not risk any child getting hurt on that street.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Biringer. Appreciate you being here.

All right. Nataliya Safronova.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Give us your name and address, please.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hi. How are you?
My name is Nataliya Safronova, and I am the one of 12265 Old St. Augustine Road, renamed (inaudible).

I really appreciate everybody coming here and raising the concern. I see that most of the people that did come don't have small children or don't actually -- I understand that the concern of the school and the traffic, I -I understand.

I have four children and I don't feel comfortable them going to a public school, so unfortunately I have to jump through my hat and out of my skin to provide so they can go to a public school -- private school, I'm sorry. So they do go to Christ Church Academy, who is actually moving now to a different location.

Two years ago, I lost my child, 13-year-old daughter. And when I was presented -- when I decided to sell my property, when I was presented with a choice, with contracts, the first one was to build a bunch of condominiums, like apartment complexes, that -- (inaudible) shopping centers.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

And when I was presented with a lease school from -- that would be a charter school, it was dear to me, it was dear to my heart. They showed me their plans and how they're going to make recreational area and they're going to leave a lot of greenery, trees.

We do have animals coming through the property, so I really liked how they presented their plans and how a lot of them, they're going towards the whole school and the whole building.

And I believe when it comes to the traffic, they really have a good plan. As you look at the plans, it is going all the way around. They have in and out.

And I personally believe that -- I love Mandarin. I moved here not long ago and I absolutely love it, and I believe that the community and the home values will go up because as a lot of people move in from up North, down South -- we all have children, and we always like to pick a house that is near a very good school.

So I do believe that charter school -which you actually have the test for to get in.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

You can't just be not doing too well at school and get into a charter school. You have to apply, you have to go to a test, and so I do believe that our home values will go up and that we'll -- we will -- at the end of the day, we'll all -- going to gain from it.

Unfortunately, a lot of people came here with negative thoughts, and I'm very sorry you guys feel this way.

Not many of us knew about the meeting today, only the people that have a little bit more time to spare, but I do believe that with a good plan it will all work out and we're all going to be happy.

Thank you so much for your time.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, ma'am. Appreciate you being here.

We have an on-the-record comment from Mr. Randy Gallup who is our Duval County Public Schools representative.

So, Mr. Gallup, I'd like to get your comment. We'll take a break. And then T.R. is going to come back and make us all feel great about this.

MR. GALLUP: Mr. Chairman, thank you.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Mr. Chairman, members of the Planning Commission, my name is Randy Gallup. I'm your school district representative.

I wanted to provide to you all some facts, information regarding our school capacities within the immediate and -- immediate area of this proposed charter school.

You were mentioned today about numerous public, private and charter schools in the surrounding area. Specifically, I want to speak to the public schools that were mentioned as far as our capacities, utilization and portables.

First of all, the first school I'd like to speak about is Greenland Pines, which is an A school. It currently has an enroliment of 658 with a capacity of 957, which puts it at a utilization rate of 69 percent. This is Greenland Pines on Greenland Road, which is just down from Mandarin High, northwest of this charter school location. And zero portables at this school.

The next school is Mandarin Oaks. It has an enrollment of 940 with a capacity of 1,072 , which gives you a utilization rate of

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

88 percent for this current school year. It also has zero portables and is also an A school.

Loretto Elementary, it has enrollment of 964. It has a capacity of 1,208 , with a utilization rate of 80 percent. This school has 13 portables. However, under the master facilities plan which was approved by the board and approved by the half-cent sales tax by the voters of Duval County, those portables will be removed from Loretto and they'll be replaced with a permanent classroom wing to be determined on the number of rooms at a later date. So even without the classrooms, you're still under 100 percent utilization.

The middle school, Mandarin Middle, it is also an A school. It currently has an enrollment of 1,199 with a capacity of 1,615 , which is a utilization of 74 percent. It also has zero portables.

Crown Point, it's a B school. Enrollment is 775 with a capacity of 1,068 , which is a utilization of 73 percent. The district just finished removing the last two portables from that school last summer.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

136
Twin Lakes, another elementary school that services this area on the eastern boundary -Twin Lakes Middle, excuse me. It has an enrollment of 1,154 with a capacity of 1,462 . Utilization is 79 percent and it has zero portables.

Of the charter schools that were mentioned to \(y^{\prime}\) all, there is a -- a new charter school is relocating exactly across the street from another current charter. Seaside, it will be relocating along Old St. Augustine Road, immediately across the street from River City Science Academy. That is because the Christ Church School will be relocating to its property on Greenland Road.

So you have four charter schools in the immediate area and multiple private schools.

One other item that I wanted to bring to y'all's attention was in this packet that was provided to you by the applicant, they talk about the recreational area comparison to other charters. Well, I would like to provide you some recreation comparison to other public schools.

Mandarin Middle has a recreation area of
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
nine acres. Greenland Pines has a recreational area of five acres. Mandarin Oaks has a recreational area of 5.5 acres. Crown Point has a recreational area of 3.34 acres. And Loretto has a recreational area of 2.96 . Erring on the side of caution, I rounded down on all of these numbers.

So I wanted to give you an idea of scale between the .93, 1.44, 2.6 -acre comparisons that you have been given in this packet.

One last item I'd like to provide to you is a comparison in size of comparable facilities. This facility is a \(\mathrm{K}-8\) as it's being proposed at 85,000 square feet, 950 students. Our closest K-8, that is Westview K-8 in Duval County, has a square footage of 153,199 with a capacity of 1,498 . So if this school were to go to a \(\mathrm{K}-12\), as it is rumored, you're going to be adding four additional grades to this current square footage, which would cause your utilization to skyrocket at this facility.

I would just like for you to have these facts in front of you, but the -- the fact of the matter is, is that you are dealing with an

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
oversaturation of educational facilities in this area and it is something that should really be measured.

Thank you.
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (Applause.)
THE CHAIRMAN: No clapping.
All right. Thank you, Mr. Gallup. We appreciate that context.

All right. We're going to take a
ten-minute break. We'll reconvene at 3:35.
And just a reminder, we're still in the middle of hearing all this. No -- we can't talk to anyone from the public about this application we're hearing, so don't bribe us with candy.

Thank you.
(Brief recess.)
(Mr. Schellhorn exits the proceedings.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Folks, let's get started.
All right. I've been reminded twice that
I hold the record, it sounds like, for the
longest public comment, and this didn't happen under Commissioner Garrison or Blanchard. So I'll take that.

We've heard from all the public; we have
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
heard from Mr. Randy Gallup from Duval County Public Schools.
(Mr. Hainline approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: T.R., it looks like you're locked and loaded almost.

So we heard from, I don't know, 50 people or so. T.R., I'm going to give him the time he needs to address all those items that were brought up because there was quite a few.

Sir, you have the floor.
MR. HAINLINE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I'm trying to make it relatively brief.

First of all, T.R. Hainline, 1301 Riverplace Boulevard, representing Summit Construction Group.

First, let me point out that we do have our experts here, Raj Chindalur, our traffic engineer, and Jeremy Callaway, our civil engineer. They are available to answer any of your specific questions about technical issues on traffic, on stormwater, on wetlands, that kind of thing.

And by the way, they were also at the community meeting the other night, and both Raj and Jeremy answered a lot of questions directly

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

140
to people. So we've made our experts available both to the community at the community meeting and to you here today.

Schools are, of course, are a permissible use by exception in all residential land use categories, so are churches, so are daycare centers. All of those things generate some traffic at various points in time, but they are uses which are acknowledged to be appropriate in residential areas and should be near residential areas with the right level of review by this commission as a permissible use by exception.

And schools are a permissible use by exception subject to what the staff calls the Part IV criteria. And those Part IV criteria focus on size -- by the way, the minimum size for school is 2 acres in your code, 2 acres. It focuses on an internal traffic circulation plan. It focuses on light, and it focuses on one or two other things that are there in that Part IV. And there's no suggestion we don't meet those criteria. We meet those criteria.

Let's talk about traffic. A lot, of course, said about traffic; it's still the main

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
issue. The first thing I want you all to realize is what Raj Chindalur goes through when he does a traffic study.

The first thing he does is he meets with Transportation Planning and with Chris LeDew and their folks at Traffic Engineering to get their input on what he should study. That's part of his study that's submitted as part of the record. They have memos to him saying please include all this.

He includes that in his study and then he does a very detailed study that looks at all of these things that have been talked about in a very detailed way based on his expertise and based on the manuals, the ITE manuals, the modeling that's acknowledged by FDOT and everybody else. He goes through this.

And he uses -- in consultation with the City Transportation Planning and City Traffic Engineering, he uses objective, measurable standards and models. That's why people do a traffic study. That's why they want a traffic study done. So that's what he goes through.

Just two little issues that came up that I want to hit on specifically that -- two or Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
three that Raj just mentioned. First of all, Old St. Augustine Road today, if you check it under the City -- and he confirmed all of this with Laurie Santana -- Old St. Augustine Road today is at Level of Service C.

You have dealt with zonings and exceptions that are in \(F\) and \(D\) areas. This is at Level of Service C and is at 57 percent of its capacity. If you look that up on the City, that's what it will say, Level of Service C, 57 percent of its capacity. So that's one little fact.

Another fact, on the COVID issue, Raj did his traffic counts in March of this year, which is past COVID. But in addition to that, what they require now to make sure that COVID isn't influencing his numbers is he has to add 19 percent to the numbers that he got. That's what FDOT requires. So COVID is definitely -not only were counts past COVID, but he also, in addition to that, had to add the percentage that is required of everyone. So there is no, you know, COVID trick going on here.

The traffic light. Someone said, why is this traffic light here? The traffic light is exactly where the City traffic engineer wants

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
it to be. We went in with our study and said, here is our study; it recommends a traffic light. And Chris LeDew said, great, put the traffic light right here. And that's on your ticket.

By the way, the cost data -- what we said at the citizens meeting was \(\$ 800,000\) is the cost of the traffic light and \(\$ 200,000\) is the cost of the right-turn lane. That's where we get the million dollars. But the traffic light is exactly where the traffic engineer said that it should be.

And finally, on traffic, every school has to go to what is called the School Safety Committee to talk about student crossings and how students get to the school. The chair of the Student Safety Committee is Chris LeDew, your City traffic engineer, and the other participants on that School Safety Committee are City of Jacksonville, JSO, and FDOT.

So this school, like every school, is going to have to show its plans and everything it's doing to the School Safety Committee, and it will need to have a policeman or a school crossing guard at the school crossing location

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
there. That's part of what the School Safety Committee requires and does. So I wanted you to be aware, too, of that additional reviewing thing.

So, again, on traffic what we're doing are improvements -- the traffic signal and right-turn lane, a million dollars -- far in excess of anything else in the area, the queuing capacity on site, which there are slides in our handout about that. And then, again, we're delaying the start time to 8:15. Peak hour is at 7:30; we've delayed the start time to \(8: 15\). You will see that other schools in the area start earlier. So we're taking that into consideration.

Let's, next, talk about need. So what we said at the community meeting, what we would say here, too, is that need is not a standard or criterion in your code as to whether you grant an exception or as to whether you grant a school -- an exception to a school. Need is just not one of the criteria or standards that you were looking at.

We did have Mr. Klotz speak to why this site because that was a question that came up a

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
lot at the citizens meeting. And we wanted people to understand just as human beings why this site had been picked.

And I do want to call your attention -because Mr. Gallup went through some of the traditional public school capacity numbers. But I want to call your attention to this, what is a few pages back in the handout, the thing called "Charter School Market Analysis."

And in the far-right-hand column was "Number of Students on Wait List" for all of these charters that are within driving distance of this site. And this data in this far right-hand column, what it shows is -- either it just shows that they are at full capacity or it has a number there of the people on the wait list.

So, for example, the River City Science Academy in Mandarin has 883 people on the wait list. That information is directly from that school, and our people can get up and under oath and say that's where they got it, directly from that school. And what it's from is the DOA data that those schools submit to DOE.

I have here as an example -- which I'm
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

146
happy to submit the data submitted in the accountability report by River City Science Academy in Mandarin, and that number, 883, shows up as the number of students on a wait list.

So this isn't some number that we just made up and plugged in here or that we guessed at. We got those numbers directly from those schools, and I have the River City Science Academy example. They have 883 kids on their wait list. So that's why this site was chosen.

You will see that also in the data we submitted, within a 5 -mile site range from this site, age 5 to 14 population is 17,000 kids. And 17,000 kids, that's a lot of kids. And even if you add up all the capacities at all these schools, it doesn't get to 17,000 .

So that's on this subject of the need. It's not a criterion, and you shouldn't evaluate it on it. But as to why this site, we've given you hard evidence, data reported to DOE as to why this site was chosen.

Just a couple of more issues. K through
8. One of the conditions that we submitted that would be binding on us that we propose to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
you is that this be a K-through-8 school. It's K through 8. I don't know how to make it more clear than to propose a written condition which we have done to you that binds us to it being a K-through-8 school. So that issue, hopefully, is addressed.

The issue of recreation space, what we gave to you, what we submitted to you is we picked eight or ten charter schools here and the recreation space that is provided in those charter schools, and the average being 0.89 acres.

Yes, Mr. Gallup went through some traditional public schools that had additional recreation needs. These schools with this amount of recreation are at a hundred percent capacity or have wait lists. So it's not some flaw. The types of recreation space that we're talking about here, it's not some flaw that makes people not want to go to these schools. People want to go to these schools, and they have good recreation capacity.

As it is here, it's the 1. -- I think it's 1.44 acres, and it includes a gymnasium on site and other -- it includes a basketball court.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

It includes a play field. It includes all kinds of stuff that's shown there on the site plan. So we have adequate recreation.

And remember, that's not -- the minimum size of a site -- that's the other thing Mr. Gallup did. He gave you a bunch of traditional public schools that are larger in size. Remember, your code. There's no standard that says it has to be \(X\) size, except your code, which says minimum of 2 acres. And there's no standard in your code about how much recreation.

But those schools with that average 1.13 acres of recreation, those have all been approved by the City of Jacksonville and by the Duval County School Board. So that's not -what we did -- what we have is we have submitted to you recreation -- a recreation standard, a recreation measure that has been approved at several schools by the City and by the school board, and ours betters that. Ours is more than that. So that's on the issue of recreation.

Again, we have our experts here to answer any questions that you have. We believe -- I

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
guess I also would differ when people said we don't care what the community thinks. We have revised our site plan based on the comments we got last Thursday. We have agreed to a number of conditions that we've handed out to you based on that community meeting last Thursday. This applicant has gone beyond what is required to attempt to address the concerns of the community.

So with that, again, our experts and all are happy to answer any questions, and we appreciate your time very much.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, T.R.
Is there anyone else here today to speak on E-22-18?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, I will close the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve E-22-18.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. We have a motion and second.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
150

Comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Garrison.
COMMISSIONER GARRISON: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

A lot of the comments I heard have an underlying assumption to me. Not all comments, but quite a few, many have underlying assumption that the neighbors are somehow entitled to this property. They don't own this property. This property is owned by private landowners.

There is a gentleman who wants to buy it and improve it, and they have a right to do so. The property is titled with the people who are entitled to it, and others are not entitled to it.

And I'll be supporting this application.
Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Garrison.

Commissioner Elsbury.
COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

I'll just reiterate some of what
Commissioner Garrison said. Yeah, I completely
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
agree. I think that -- I respect the
individuals that are down here testifying that have lived here. But at the end of the day, a private developer has purchased the property.

And just trying to address some of the comments that have been made related to traffic and safety, if people are speeding down Old St. Augustine Road and breaking the speed limits, they are breaking the law. I'm not going to regulate a private developer and say you can't build something here because people are breaking the law and speeding. That's not the role of government.

Also, just commend the developer for going above and beyond as it relates to the infrastructure that you guys are putting in on your own dollar. A lot of that is actually required by statute, that local governments do that for charter schools, so I appreciate the developer doing that.

And just the last piece I'll address -and I know it's -- as Mr. Hainline referenced, it's not something that we consider, but the conversation around need and saturation.

Mr. Gallup and DCPS don't get to determine Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
need and saturation; parents and markets do that. It's pretty clear by the numbers that we have in front of us that there is an unbelievable need in the charter school thing. I'm sorry traditional public schools are seeing declining enroilment. Charter schools aren't. In fact, it's headed in the opposite direction.

So I'll be wholeheartedly supporting this. I ask my fellow commissioners to do the same.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Elsbury.

Further comments?
Commissioner Adkison.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Thank you, Chair.
I support what my other two commissioners have said to the public, but I'm going to put my spin on it, like I normally do.

First thing is, I believe in "We, the people." Bottom line, the people have spoken, the people there. This is a request to change. And I've said it for so many times sitting up here for seven years, that the developer is coming in to change what is already zoned.

To me, it's almost like saying buyer beware. This is what it is. You can buy it,

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
but you're coming here to change it. The people that have lived there moved there because it's residential. And now you're changing it and they're changing the plan and you're not offering them a way out.

I'm okay with the way the thought of the Commission is going, but I cannot move my conscience past "We, the people," nor that this is a request.

Secondly, they talked about traffic. We can't do anything about traffic. I mean, the public -- and I hope the public understands, that's not our concern. Like Commissioner Jordan mentioned a minute ago, we can't control it. But from January 1st to April 14th, my company alone has responded to 22 accidents on Old St. Augustine Road. I'm one of two that work with JSO on that area, so there's a possibility of 44 accidents.

There is a problem, and it needs to be addressed with the police department, maybe get more officers out there. That is not our venue to look at and judge.

Safety. I heard one of the individuals talk about the safety for their elderly

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

1 parents. Yes, but that's still law
enforcement's job. That's not our job. The fact is this land -- this owner is wanting to change something and is asking a request, and he is allowed to ask for the request.

We, as a commission, have to look to see if it's good for the community. Is it good for safety? Is it good for traffic? But we can't vote on traffic and safety because that's not in our purview to look at.

I do want to talk about Mandarin High School. I work out there with a bunch of other entities and the parking with student drivers.

Now, through the Chair to T.R., you said this is going to be eighth grade, so we shouldn't have to worry about teenage drivers parking in the neighborhoods as was previously brought. But if it is a problem, I'm just letting you know -- you've mentioned it up and I'm grateful. And I'll take your word you're only going to eighth grade.

But it was a problem at Mandarin High School to the point we were towing vehicles every day out of these neighborhoods because of the parking and the way they were trying to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

So through the Chair to staff, you know, I don't like to get involved with traffic, and -well, first let me ask this to Mr. Hainline: These conditions, were these intended to be conditions that are added to the exception?

MR. HAINLINE: Yes, sir, Mr. Blanchard.
We would propose that if there is a motion to approve, that it be based -- that it include those conditions -- which also attached to those conditions are the -- is the landscape plan for the buffer and the current site plan as well.

But, yes. Yes, sir. We intend those conditions to be -- if there is a motion to approve, to be part of that motion. And we did send those conditions to the staff for them to look at beforehand.

COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

And thank you, Commissioner Blanchard.
I would like to amend my motion to move to approve application \(\mathrm{E}-22-18\) with the eight conditions proposed by the applicant.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Paige.
MS. JOHNSTON: Would you also reference the revised site plan and revised landscape plan?

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Could you provide me the date of the revised site plan?

MS. JOHNSTON: We'll use today's date as
the date, so that would be April 21st. It was circulated to the Commission at the beginning of the presentation.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Okay. Within that motion I would also like to include the revised site plan and revised written description.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thanks for that update.
We have a motion and second.
MS. JOHNSTON: Mr. Chair, can I just clarify? It's a revised site plan and it's a revised landscape plan that's part of the site plan, not a written description. Just to clarify the record.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Allow me to amend my amendment to move to approve application E-22-18 with the eight conditions proposed by the applicant with the revised site plan and

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
the revised landscape pian.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Blanchard. COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you, Chairman.

Just to finish my thoughts -- and I
appreciate the cleanup there. One of the
conditions references some traffic conditions,
which -- I'm always really hesitant to include
anything traffic-related in our decisions
because some of us know a lot about traffic,
but we don't always know what the traffic
engineer knows. And we don't know whether they need one turn lane or two or whether the light should be 100 feet this way or that way.

It does say in here -- I believe the words "otherwise approved" -- or "subject to the review and approval," and that gives me some comfort knowing that the City staff will really be the one determining locations of things if this were to go through.

The one question I do have is related to traffic. And I don't think Ms. Santana or Chris LeDew are here; is that correct?

But our stunt double for Ms. Santana --
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

157

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

MS. BANNISTER: Correct.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you.
The only last comment that I have -- and I think it's an important differentiation.

And to my colleague, Commissioner Adkison,
the -- I think one of the differences about expectations with neighbors and change and things like that is, if this was a rezoning going to commercial or something else, I think there's a much higher threshold of obligation. But a school is a use that is currently allowed by exception, and so that threshold is much, much smaller.

So if this was a complete rezoning, then I think a lot more of the testimony would be relevant because it's a change; it's a surprise. But schools are allowed in this zoning category by exception, and it is very common.

So I am in favor of this. I understand the concerns and look to the City to help address the traffic concerns of the community. Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Blanchard.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
zoning exception for a school, then it's
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
transferrable. Then any other operator could come in there. They would have to adhere to all the conditions, though.

I need to clarify. I didn't realize what a CDL was. So any charter or public school could go in there, but, no, not a vocational --

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: So the condition
would be that a school -- any other school
going in there would have to be a school from
\(K\) to 8 and not anything higher unless they came
back before the board?
MR. HUXFORD: Right. Is a CDL a
truck-driving school?
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Right.
MR. HUXFORD: I doubt they are training eighth graders to drive trucks, but ...

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: You don't know anymore.

I'm just asking -- I mentioned that --
what type of school is authorized --
MR. HUXFORD: Right.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: -- under this, and does it --

MR. HUXFORD: It would have to be a conventional school, either a charter or a Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203

Commissioner Adkison.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Through the Chair to staff. Based on what Commissioner Blanchard just brought up -- it's a school. Let's say this school gets built and fails. Could we then go open a CDL school on that property then and run trucks in and out of there?

MR. HUXFORD: If there's a concern about a successor use of the property -- of course, if the school fails or leaves, they still can do what they can do under the current residential zoning. And that would include, say, a church could go in there by right because it meets our locational criteria.

If you're concerned about another type of school going in there, you do have the option of making this personal to the license holder, if you wanted to go there.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: All right. So if we didn't make it conditional to the license holder, then the answer is any type of school could go in there if this other school failed, correct?

MR. HUXFORD: Right. If they have a

161
public school.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Those are the only two types of schools that could ever come on this --

MR. HUXFORD: No vocational schools.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: That's, I guess, the word that I was looking for.

MR. HUXFORD: That is a completely different use in our Zoning Code.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: All right. Thank you.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Adkison.

Further comments?
Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, my
initial stance on this -- looking at the
application and the site plan, I see that the
applicant went above and beyond to design this project as best as possible to be complementary to the neighbors.

You see there's an excessive amount of queuing. Most of it is situated to the north side of the property, next to the retention pond. They limit it as much as possible to the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
west because you've got residential abutting that property line.

You know, you guys have -- you've informed us that you deferred the community -- you deferred the application to meet with the community. You're talking about over a million dollars in traffic-improving measures. It looks like you did your best not to impact wetlands.

But, you know, it's not often that I go against staff recommendation. Our staff, they are the experts on these matters. But I'm going through the criteria, and I just -- I beg to differ on some of these. You know, will the proposed use have an environmental impact inconsistent with health and safety? I think it will. I mean, we're looking at quite a bit of impervious material here right next to wetlands. I just think that naturally that's going to cause an issue.

I think that the traffic concern -- you know, I've heard from other commissioners that we're not to consider traffic, but it's one of the criteria here, you know.

Let's see. Bear with me, folks.
Diane M. Tropia, inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

We're talking about hundreds of vehicles converging on this location multiple times a day.

I heard what the community had to say. I try not to take some of the comments personal. We do not rubber stamp things here. You can see we have all differing opinions. We all have different backgrounds. Most of us have different professions and we have different perspectives on each and every application that comes before us.

I feel for the community on this. I don't think that a traffic light at the ingress and egress of a community is appropriate. I think that this reeks of safety concerns.

I know I spoke with Mr. Michaelis on this. You know, I have the utmost respect for you and Mr. Hainline. I know that you guys typically always have fantastic, sound projects that Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
you're representing that come through here.
But, unfortunately, I can't get behind
this due to the reasons I mentioned.
Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner
Moldovan.
Further comments?
Commissioner Porter.
COMMISSIONER PORTER: Thank you, Chairman.
So I initially was agreeing with my fellow
commissioner, Mr. Moldovan. I think the
applicant has gone above and beyond. An
eight-foot sound barrier wall is not cheap, and, you know, it's not required.

As far as drainage, you know, another appropriate use for this property could be RLD-60, and you would have a lot of drainage problems to address, and that's what civil engineering is for. I'm not sure how much property is covered with this school, but it doesn't look like it's more than what RLD-60 would cover.

I'm comfortable with this. I understand the pains of traffic. But any school going in anywhere in the city is going to have traffic

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
concerns.
That's all I got. Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Porter.

Randy, I didn't see you through the glare in the glass. Go ahead --

MR. GALLUP: I have a procedural question.
THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead, Mr. Gallup.
MR. GALLUP: Mr. Chairman, I have a question regarding one of the conditions that is put on this exception. Condition Number 8, which is that this will be a K-8 school, I have a question for staff.

Where is the regulatory oversight if the school were to go to a K-12, since possibly a permit would not be required? I mean, I could switch a room from eighth grade to twelfth grade overnight.

So I just want to see where is the trigger, where is the regulatory oversight if this school were to decide to go to a K-12 model instead of a K-8 since, under the Zoning Code, the school is from K to 12 ?

Thank you.
MR. HUXFORD: Under the terms of the final Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
order that would be issued, it would be conditioned no higher than eighth grade. If they started doing so, it would be a zoning violation and our Code officers could go after them and cite them.

MR. GALLUP: How would you know?
MR. HUXFORD: We would have to be told, like so many things.

MR. GALLUP: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: I'll bet there are some neighbors that would say something.

Guys, I just want to share my initial thoughts, and then I'd like to drill down deeper, T.R., to whoever is the best representative from Summit on this, and then I'll close my thoughts.

Initially, I wanted to -- a couple of our commissioners referenced it, but Rogers Towers approached me on this process. We were supposed to hear this two weeks ago. They put a pause on it, I think, because your councilman said, hold on, we have a lot of people that we need to explain this to.

They had a several-hour-long meeting, and then came out. You know, all this has

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
transpired over the course of two weeks. And then last night we -- or even this morning we get a completely updated landscape plan, a completely updated site plan, self-imposed conditions, all trying to appease the info they got from the community meeting and help the surrounding neighbors feel a little bit better about that.

It's a little frustrating to me that that -- it seems like it didn't help at all. And this is stuff that we don't normally see from applicants. So they really tried to get this -- you guys feeling about this, and it didn't work at all. So I don't feel great about that. I think they did a good job on their approach.

What we heard consistently for an hour was there's no need for these schools and it will have bad traffic. If there's no need for them, there's not going to be students going there and there won't be any traffic. If there is need for them, there will be traffic, but there is a need.

So I don't see how we can have our cake and eat it too. There's either a need and

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

170
there's going to be traffic or there's no need and there's not going to be traffic.

My company, we do a lot of work in -we're new home builders. And a lot of that is going on in St. Johns County. And all the new schools and all the new developments in St. Johns County, all of them -- almost all of them you can walk to, you can ride your bike to, you can ride your golf cart to. And I don't know at what point that became a bad thing.

So I don't quite get that perspective. I think if my kid could walk to school, that would be a good thing. I get that Old St. Augustine is a busy road, but also that they're putting in a light. We've heard that they speed down Old St. Augustine Road, and a light should help slow down the speed. But we also heard that a light is extremely dangerous. So I'm getting some mixed signals here.

So those are my initial thoughts.
T.R., who is the best person for me to talk to from Summit? I just want to go and drill down a little bit more on the need point. I know this isn't your first rodeo of building Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
a school. I would like to talk about what they have done in the past.

Is that you?
MR. HAINLINE: So the question is ...
THE CHAIRMAN: So I know this isn't their first time building a school in Jacksonville and down in Orlando. This is what they do for a living. I would like to hear -- you know, we heard that there's clearly no need. I want to hear from them why there is a need.

MR. HAINLINE: Yes, sir.
THE CHAIRMAN: Based on their prior experience, if that's all right.
(Mr. Klotz approaches the podium.)
MR. HAINLINE: While Chris Klotz is coming down here, I'll say, I can't imagine how a school adds four grades secretly. I mean, I don't -- I mean, they would -- if somebody wanted to change a school, they would advertise and they'd put in that they are now open to these things. They would take applications. It would be pretty conspicuous, I would think. I don't think that's something that can happen secretly. Let me just say that.

Chris can talk about the need.

THE CHAIRMAN: Chris, so I think you guys have built Classical Academy over on McCoy's Creek; is that correct?

MR. KLOTZ: We have, just west of downtown.

THE CHAIRMAN: Have you built any other schools in Jacksonville?

MR. KLOTZ: Sixteen total.
THE CHAIRMAN: Sixteen. I had no idea it was that many.

MR. KLOTZ: Charter schools.
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Sixteen schools.
So tell me what the capacity looks like in general across those 16 schools. Are they filled up or are you guys struggling to get kids?

MR. KLOTZ: For the most part, you know, within two or three years, every school will fill to 100 percent, some much faster. We typically see a very strong demand once the community learns about them and then finds out what they are about and understands charter schools. That's part of the learning curve, as families and parents understand that this is a tuition-free, public choice for their children.
(904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So you've had good feedback from parents. You're going to be where you need to be on capacity for these schools?

MR. KLOTZ: Absolutely. And like I said earlier today, this school is one of the best sites that we've identified based on the significant over-capacity of charter schools in that area, significant growth in school-age children in the area, and it being located very central and very accessible to the community.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Mr. Klotz, I appreciate the perspective on that.

MR. KLOTZ: Certainly.
And I just want to also mention, we'ré headquartered here in Jacksonville, Summit is. I live in Jacksonville, born and raised. We've been in the community for years.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you.
All right. Again, that helps me feel even better about the school here. It's a proven concept. These are professionals. This is what they do for a living. I think there is a need there. I think the need has been underestimated.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300 21 like it's not even a criteria, but I heard it.
22 I think my biggest pause with this one was it's
23 currently zoned RR-Acre and RLD-70. I could
24 see a PUD going in here with 50 - or 60 -foot
lots -- might get you 60 to 80 homes, give or

Guys, I get that you are passionate about where you live. You love where you live. And I get that you don't like change, and this will impact your life and might have caused more traffic, but I do think that there is a need. I think that was underestimated today.

But as I'm sitting here listening to all this testimony and I'm thinking about the next item we have on our agenda, and I think -- you know, perspective probably goes a long way. And there are other parts of town and there's things that can be built in other parts of town that are far, far worse than -- in my opinion, than what we have being applied for here.

So that's my comments.
Any further comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Brown.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: I'll be brief because
I think you guys have your numbers.
I'm not going to go into need. It sounds lots -- might get you 60 to 80 homes, give or
    Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
take.
I know you can do this by exception in residential land use. I get it. I had this notion, like, if this was a church on this same site with this queuing, would I think that's appropriate? Well, I don't think so. Well, why do I like it for a charter school?

So my hesitation is you've got 25 feet to the queuing if you live on, forgive me, Ariana Elyse.

I'll be fast because I think you guys have your numbers.

I don't feel good about taking RR-Acre, RLD-70 and putting hundreds of cars queuing 25 feet behind these people's houses. If it were a spine-road subdivision, 80 new homes, I wouldn't have a problem. I think this is a little much.

So ultimately, my opinion might not really sway, but I'm going to stick with my gut. And it really has to do with the intensity of the exception, particularly on the Ariana Elyse community.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Brown.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Final comments from the Commission? COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.) THE CHAIRMAN: We have a motion and a second for approval of E-22-18 with the conditions and the updated landscape and site plan.

All those in favor?
COMMISSIONER PORTER: Aye.
COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: Aye.
COMMISSIONER GARRISON: Aye. COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Aye. THE CHAIRMAN: Aye.
In favor we have Commissioner Porter, Commissioner Elsbury, Commissioner Garrison, Commissioner Hacker, and Commissioner Blanchard.

All those opposed?
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: (Indicating.) COMMISSIONER BROWN: (Indicating.) COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: (Indicating.) THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Adkison, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Moldovan.

So we have five in the positive direction.
That motion passes.
All right. Thank you all for being here.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300 allows package stores by right. So this is not

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
a use request. This is request for relief from distance.

And according to the criteria, the
Planning Commission may grant the waiver -- may grant a waiver if they find in the affirmative on any one of the five criteria.

The staff has gone through and reviewed the criteria for you. Based on -- and showing you some prior activity on the property, the criteria that we are most concentrating on is the fourth criteria as to whether the affected church is visible from a line of sight from the liquor store and vice versa.

In that, we've noticed that -- we've written that it is not visible from -- they can't see each other. And also that the -while the church property is 401 feet away, the actual church itself is 802 feet away.

So with that, as we did at our last meeting -- I wasn't here, but I think Bruce handled it. Based on that, it is our recommendation to approve.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Folks.
Mr. Harden, give us your name and address, please.

Let's move on to WLD-22-13, please. As these folks are exiting, just a reminder, guys, we're going to keep public comments to three minutes. We will make a motion one way or the other. That doesn't necessarily mean that's how we're going to vote at the end.
(Mr. Harden approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Harden, we'll give you three minutes on the front end and as much time as you need on the back end to address their concerns.

MR. HARDEN: Are you going to have the staff go first?

THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.
Folks, go ahead.
MR. HUXFORD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
This is application for waiver minimum distance requirements for a liquor license location, WLD-22-13, for a property at 5522 Soutel Drive in the northwest part of town.

The request is to reduce the distance from a proposed liquor store from 500 feet to 401 feet. So the property is zoned CCG-2, which

MR. HARDEN: Yes, sir, Mr. Chairman. Paul Harden, 1431 Riverplace Boulevard. THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Go ahead. MR. HARDEN: Again, because we've been through this once, I'll try to move quickly, although I know one of you wasn't here.

But as Mr. Huxford has pointed out, this is not a change of zoning. This is an allowable use by right at this location, and the issue before you is a distance waiver.

And there are five ways to deal with the distance waiver, and I don't think there's any dispute nor was there any dispute two weeks ago that we meet at least two of those five, starting with the first one, that the use is not directly visible in the line of measurement defined in Section 656.

I have the same handout I handed out two weeks ago, and you can see that between this site -- which, by the way, has been here for more than 50 years -- it is an 8 -foot fence, a very wooded area, a second wooded area, and then I have pictures of all the businesses in between. So there's no line of sight at the location.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
(904) 821-0300

The other one that we meet is -- there's an existing facility of similar nature between us and the church location. And I have a picture of that in there. There isn't any dispute about it. The neighbors spoke about it last week. For more than 40 years, there's been a retail sale of alcohol use closer to the church than this proposed location. So there isn't any dispute that we meet the criteria.

The issues that were brought up are not relevant to those criteria, but I want to talk about one more thing we didn't talk about last week. I have a second page in your handout that has some definitions that I want to talk about.

There is a definition of "church." Church means a building. A building. There isn't any building other than that one location that's really more than 1,500 feet, not 800 feet, from the site. So the distance waiver has to be from the building itself.

The Planning Department has asked us to measure using what they've called a "grassy knoll" at the location because they are describing that as the grounds of the church.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

But that is not, in fact, what -- that's not a grounds for the church.

I litigated this issue with the City of Jacksonville in 1997 on this same exact issue. It's cheaper for my client to come here and try to get a waiver in agreement with the Planning Department than spend \(\$ 100,000\) litigating. But the General Counsel of the City of Jacksonville issued an opinion at that time -- and I'm going read it.
"It's the opinion" -- and this is binding on the City of Jacksonville.
"It's the opinion of this office, the mere ownership of property of that church is not sufficient to render vacant property grounds as used by the established church. In the American Heritage Dictionary, grounds means 'the area of land designated for a particular purpose.' Therefore, the land surrounding or forming the buffer part of the house or building including grounds or the lands that surround the building designated for a specific use."

So the grounds are limited to those grounds around that church --

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203

(904) 821-0300

182
182

MR. HARDEN: That was three minutes already? Okay.

So I have that in the file. If you have questions about it, I'll be happy to talk to you.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Harden.
All right. We've going to start with
Tyrona Clark-Murray, and then John Cowser, and then Larry Parker.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good evening -- I said evening. I feel like it's evening.

Tyrona Clark-Murray. My address is on
file. I'm representing the Northwest CPAC, and
we sent a letter regarding this particular application, that it be denied.

So Mr. Harden, the applicant's representative, mentioned something that was very curious to me. He talked about the grounds. So I'm going deviate for just one moment -- and thank you to my lovely (inaudible) who is helping me today.

So he said -- so according to Section 656.806, this says that "the distance shall be

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
measured by following a straight line from the nearest point of the building or portion of the building used as part of the proposed location to the nearest point of the grounds used as part of the church." It does not say church building.

So with that being said, let's look at -this is 5522. This is the church. This is the church grounds. According to the measurement on the straight line, it is 401 feet. The ordinance says that you should not have -allow a waiver of liquor distance less than 500 feet from a church. This says "church grounds."

So just going back for a few minutes -and let's -- I want to remind this body of what took place two weeks ago.

So the applicant -- remember, in his application it's stated that you "shall" grant based on one item, one criteria that the applicant would meet. Remember, that's not the language; it's "may." So I don't know why in his particular application that was dated 2017, and this is 2022, that it said "shall" and he didn't use updated version.

I think there's somewhere in the ordinance -- and I can't recall what the number is -- it says that you must use the updated version. This 2017 is not an updated version.

With that being said as well -- so let's think about the fact that he talked about, first of all, how the distance is or what the distance is. He also talked about traveling onto New Kings Road and then going to Soutel. That's not what this ordinance says.

It says "a straight line from the nearest portion of the building or portion of the building used as part of the proposed location to the nearest part [sic] of the grounds used as part of the church."

Nearest part of the grounds used as part of the church.

So another element is that -- for Criterion 5, he talked about a business being closer. Those two businesses, the liquor store -- the package liquor store and the current liquor lounge, they are in the same building. So how can one be closer to the other? And the nearest point for measurement to the grounds would be this corner that's in

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
purple. And I know it's hard for you all to see, but you can you look it up on GIS.

And so there is no current liquor business that exists closer to this church. That's not true.

This is an auto shop. This is a Metro phone place, and that's a laundromat. And they are not serving liquor at the laundromat.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Clark-Murray.
Appreciate you being here.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: John Cowser, and then we'll hear from Larry Parker, and then Dr. Diana Green.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is John Cowser. I live at 5317 Dostie Drive South.

And my concern is the impact of further facilitating what's going on in the neighborhood, which I would refer to as a Orange Crush weekend. Every weekend.

I work night shifts, and by the time I come home at about 4 a.m., that whole area where this package store is supposed to set up -- 4 a.m., the lots are still full of youth.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Not inside the clubs, but outside taking up all areas with their cars open, open containers, loud music. And that's why I have opposition to it.

As far as the church is concerned, Jesus had a lot to say about alcohol. As a matter of fact, he made wine. But there's a distinction between wine and strong drink. And this package store -- we've got a major distributor in town, and it's called wine and spirits. And I think that the youth should not be subjected to the easy consumption and purchase of these spirits because they might exacerbate the violence and conditions that we don't desire.

Thank you very much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Cowser.
Mr. Larry Parker. Is Larry here?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let the record reflect that
Mr. Parker is in opposition.
Next, Ms. -- Dr. Diana Green. Is she here?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: She left a card in opposition.

THE CHAIRMAN: She did leave a card in
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
opposition. I didn't know if she was here to speak.

Mr. Gallup, do you know if she's coming back or is she --

MR. GALLUP: (Inaudible.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let the record reflect Dr. Diana Green, Duval County Public Schools Superintendent, is in opposition.

Next, we have William Fulton. Is he here?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let the record reflect that William Fulton is in opposition.

Nest, Deborah Caldwell. Is Ms. Caldwell here?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (Inaudible.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let the record reflect she is in opposition.

Vanessa Hopkins.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Here. It's going to take me a little bit, but I'm coming down.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: You take your time.
Ms. Hopkins is coming down. After her we'll hear from Brent Hyskell and then Daryl London.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Ms. Hopkins, good to see you again. Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Vanessa Cullins-Hopkins, 3283 Edgewood Avenue West, Jacksonville, Florida 32209.

THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead, ma'am.
MS. CULLINS-HOPKINS: I, along with countless community and neighborhood residents, request that the City of Jacksonville's Planning Commission oppose WLD-22-13.

At the last Planning Commission meeting, the City of Jacksonville's General Counsel clarified that distance waivers described in Section 656.133(a) of the ordinance code are delineated by "may," and not "shall." Meaning, the Commission has the discretion to not grant waivers that may conform to previously granted waivers.

I'm here speaking for myself, my community, and my family, but I am a member of King/Soutel Crossing Community Redevelopment Advisory Board, and we were bamboozled by the application we received that used the word "shall" and not "may." And that's the only Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
reason why the advisory board recommended passage. The community does not want another liquor store.

To be consistent with the housing element of Jacksonville's 2030 Comprehensive Plan, which was revised December 2013, the waiver must not be approved -- as a reminder, Section 1.4.4 of the housing element states:
"Commercial and other nonresidential uses lying adjacent to residential neighborhoods shall not be expanded into residential neighborhoods unless such uses enhance or do not diminish or degrade residential character of the neighborhood."

The proposed liquor store diminishes and degrades the Dostie Drive/Washington Estates neighborhood, in which low to moderate middle-class people of color, primarily African-Americans, live. The nearest house is less than 10 feet from the back of where the proposed liquor store is to be.

Liquor-selling establishments within a mile radius of the proposed liquor store number more than five. We need whole food, fresh fruits and vegetables, not another liquor

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

190
store. Please stop the structural racism. A
liquor store on every corner in our community
is structural, systemic racism. Please do not
approve this. You have the discretion to not
approve this. Please vote no.
Thank you.
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (Applause.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. OGC says I have
to say no clapping.
Thank you, Ms. Cullins.
Next, Brent Hyskell.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
MS. CULLINS-HOPKINS: Were you speaking to me?

THE CHAIRMAN: No, ma'am.
MS. CULLINS-HOPKINS: Oh, sorry.
THE CHAIRMAN: That's all right.
Thank you.
Mr. Hyskell, come on up, and then we'll hear from Mr. London and then Mahnsan Nyenatee.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Brent Hyskell. Address on file.

I just wanted to simply say I do oppose this -- to be this variance. I'm not in favor of a liquor store really going up in any

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
neighborhood, but when it does compromise a church or a school, and in this case it seems like both are in the picture, I even more oppose it. So I just simply want to say that I'm here to oppose it.

Thank you so much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Hyskell. Next, Daryl London.
Mr. London, are you here?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let the record reflect that
Mr . London is in opposition.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm here.
THE CHAIRMAN: Oh, I'm sorry. Mr. London, you are here.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yeah.
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Is Mr. Nyenatee here?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yeah.
THE CHAIRMAN: Come on down, sir.
Your name and address for the record,
please.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Daryl London. I live at 5023 North Pearl Street,

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Jacksonville, Florida 32206.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
Did we swear you in earlier?
MR. LONDON: Yes, sir.
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.
MR. LONDON: Basically, as a former
alcoholic -- they say there's no consumption of alcohol on that premises. I will tell you, as soon as I get my brown bag, I'm going to take a drink. So to say that no one is going to drink on that property, I wouldn't believe that.

As for a member of the church, our children play out there in that field. We have Easter egg hunts, anything that we can do to keep the kids in movement we do out there on that field and also held church services out there.

So I don't really believe that -- we
already have liquor stores in that area. You have Dollar General, Winn-Dixie, Walgreens, and the gas station -- all in less than a mile -- I wouldn't even say that -- from each other that all sell some form of alcohol. I don't understand why we would need another liquor store in that area.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. London. Appreciate you being here.

Mr. Nyenatee.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Thank you for the opportunity. And I want to thank everybody from the community that are here.

THE CHAIRMAN: Let's get your name and address for the record.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Mahnsan Nyenatee, and I live at 9918 Rosewood Glen Lane, Jacksonville.

I am a member of the Friendship Missionary Baptist Church, a church that has shaped the life and the spiritual well-being of me and my family. For us to have another liquor store or package liquor store pretty close to the church is something that I oppose.

And I wish that we would look at the value that is -- what is in the Code. The Code clearly states -- it does not mention anything about distance from a building. So the premises of the church is way within the line that this should not be approved.

194

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Nyenatee. Appreciate you being here.

Next, we have Tanita Woods.
Ms. Woods, are you here?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let record reflect that
Ms. Woods is in opposition.
Next, we have Ms. Eunice Barnum.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Are you going to be nice today, Ms. Barnum?

Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Eunice Barnum, 9121 Spottswood Road.

And I'm going to be kind because I'm going to educate you today. I must say, I'm tired.
When I look at you all who are supposed to be the leaders, when I look at City Council who is supposed to be our legislators, and how -- how ignorant is it of you when you don't know what the law says. You're making decisions when you haven't read.

Number one, the Neighborhood Bill of

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Rights, you all are violating it. You have attorneys sitting there getting paid, and they have not once mentioned that Neighborhood Bill of Rights. It is a City ordinance since 1995.

Okay. I've had the Attorney General, I think it was I wrote to. And they wrote back, well, it's not codified. Duh. You all were sworn in, were you not? You raise your hand, you put one on the Bible, you raise the other one, and you said that you solemnly swear and affirm that you would follow the United States Constitution, the Florida Constitution, the charter, and City ordinances. Get real.

You're sitting here violating City ordinances, and it isn't cute. It's nothing to grin about. You're playing with people's lives.

I applaud the gentleman that says "We, the people." If you knew anything, that's the first -- that's Government 101. For the people, by the people, of the people.

And you sit in here letting power make decisions. If you had gone to the community in the first place like the Neighborhood Bill of Rights says you're supposed to, you would have

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

196
already known what the neighborhood wanted, needed, and would have requested.

Then I have my City Council members, they sit there a hundred years, serve, get paid, and they don't know nothing either. When I read the law -- the law says you all are -- the waivers goes through the Rules Committee. If you are volunteering and making decisions, I want to volunteer and make some, too, and they better pass.

Have a great day.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Barnum. Appreciate you being here.

Next, we have Kim Perry. Is Ms. Perry here?

While Ms. Perry is coming down, next, we'll hear from Gill Bush and then Keba Roberson.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Perry, good afternoon.
Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
My name is Kim Stevens-Perry and my address is on file.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

I'm a member of the Northwest CPAC. And I'm the chairperson, recently appointed, for the land use and zoning. We submitted a letter to the City in regards to opposing this waiver.

The church should have precedence over a liquor package store. The church is an active organization. They utilize all of their land space. Since COVID, they have been conducting services on the property. They also use the external areas for their youth ministry. They often have activities there for their children.

Meanwhile, the applicant owns the building. As Ms. Barnum mentioned, had you all gone out and taken a look at this site, you would understand that the applicant truthfully is not a good neighbor. There's no dumpster there. Trash accumulates on the curb from his tenants.

So therefore, if this individual is petitioning for a waiver of distance, it should not be allowed merely because he's not a good landlord.

I'm a residential landlord. If my neighbors complain about my tenants, I take action, I follow up with my tenants. If they

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
don't correct their issues, I will terminate the lease immediately or at the end of the term. This applicant is not a good neighbor.

And you've heard it from previous individuals here. As they have spoken about, the parking there when there is activities at the clubs or probably not any activity.

But anyway, as far as the CPAC is concerned, we hope that you would with follow our recommendation. We're volunteers, just as you. And maybe you may own your own business, but a lot of us are taking our vacation time to come here, and this should have been resolved at the last meeting where it was a four-three vote. It should have just been a straight denial.

So with that being said -- and my time is almost up -- I do hope you will follow the instructions and the letter to deny this waiver.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Perry.
Mr. Gill Bush, and then we'll hear from
Keba Roberson, and then Debra Cotton.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Bush, good afternoon.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Give us your name and address, please.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes, sir.
My name is Gill Bush. I stay at 5839
Martin Luther King Drive. I stay in the community nearby the subject of the -- of the situation we're talking about.

I'm a member of the church in the neighborhood not far from that, Philippian Community Church. I'm also a minister there. We work in the community around there, and the things that we're trying to deal with, and that there is the problems of the neighborhood.

One of the things that I would just say -and this will cut it short. Right now we doesn't need a bar in this neighborhood, not in this area. We have one.

We trying to deal with the crime. We're dealing with the City government as far as law enforcement as well as the community as a whole. And we need businesses development, but not one -- because of certain nights that neighborhood, right at that spot, we have criminal activities for our young people. And we're trying to deal with that.

Thank you very much for your time. Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Bush. Appreciate you being here.

Next, Keba Roberson, then we'll hear from Debra Cotton.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
My address is Keba Roberson. Address is
722 Edgewood Avenue West, Jacksonville, 32208.
I'm coming before you today because I oppose, obviously. I have a few questions. One is, did the applicant -- when he purchased this property, did he research what the ordinances were, what the rules to be close to a school, to a church? And now they want to reduce the distance. I'm just wondering. They want to change the rules and laws that's been in place.

I have another question. Did the applicant attempt to deceive the Planning Department and this board by using a waiver of liquor distance application that was last updated January 1st, 2017?

More importantly, the outdated form uses the word "shall," which in legal jargon, interpret to mean "must."

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

However, in the 2022 version of the Section 656.133 waiver for minimum distance requirements for liquor license location states: The waiver for minimum distance requirements from a church or school for a liquor store license location may -- emphasize "may" -- be granted.

I urge this board to deny the waiver.
Lastly, good faith is a part of a fair dealing in contract law. The applicant for this business owns the building; therefore, he should know or should have known about the violent acts and the fatalities that have occurred over the past three months on his property.

Although operating a liquor lounge, package store or a pub is not inherently violent, the liquor lounge on his property is. Adding a liquor package store would exacerbate the current problem, which shows a lack of good faith on the owner's behalf. Lack of good faith.

As lawyers, you realize that bad faith is simply a lack of good faith.

I yield my time.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

202
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Roberson.
Next, Debra Cotton. After Ms. Cotton, we will hear from Aloysious Denard.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hello. My name is Debra Cotton. My address is on file.

City Ordinance Code Section 656.805 point
out the distance limitation. The applicant's
business is 401 feet, less than 500 feet, from
a church. And I'm going to cite, in Arno
versus Alcoholic Beverage Control Commission,
Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court opined as
amended by state -- by Statute 1970,
Section 192, Subsection 1, mandated that
premises do not meet 500 -- the 500 -foot rule
"shall not be licensed for the sale of alcohol
if the governing body of a church or school
file a written objection."
Unlike Massachusetts law, Florida statutes do not require a written objection; oral testimony is sufficient. And Mr. Denard, the pastor of Friendship Missionary Baptist Church, has or will submit one.

You, the Planning Commission, is
fulfilling its mission now regarding
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Section 30.204, which serves as proof of due process

Local zoning ordinances prohibiting the sale of intoxicating liquor within certain areas have been withheld. In Brighton versus Big Standing [sic], the Court stated: The City might be legitimately concerned about the presence of a liquor establishment and its accompanying treasure in the midst of homes, churches, and a school.

The Massachusetts Supreme Court added that -- added and made clear that "Zoning decisions addressed to family needs are permissible ones." It is ample to lay out zones where family values and youth values quietness and seclusion, along with clean air make the area a sanctuary for people.

In conclusion, just like the holdings of Arno versus Alcoholic Beverages, where the Court denied the plaintiff license, I urge this body to deny this waiver of liquor distances as well.

And I'm sorry. I did say that I did not want to speak, but I changed that, if that's okay.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
(904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: You're fine.
MS. COTTON: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: I didn't see that until just now, so you're fine.

All right, Ms. Cotton. Thank you.
Aloysious Denard and then Yahya Shabazz afterwards.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Denard, good to see you again. Give us your name and address, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Aloysious Denard, 16284 Magnolia Grove Way, Jacksonville 32218.

In our last setting I learned a few things, things like there's no room for personal feelings or emotion, that decisions and responsibilities of the Commission is to uphold the law and not do it based on public or personal emotion, crime, or the like. I understand that completely.

But even upholding the law, there's a sense of moral obligation that applies. It was stated that it's not based upon community gripes or frustration but rather to approve or disprove this waiver based on the business owner's rights.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
heard, then as a nation that's under God, we should all agree to show God reverence and respect. Let's uphold the already-implemented law of a minimum distance requirement of 500 feet.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Denard.
Next, Mr. Yahya Shabazz, and then we'll
hear from Leola William.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Shabazz, good
afternoon. Give us your name and address.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yahya Shabazz,
5316 Dostie Drive South.
THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead.
MR. SHABAZZ: Okay. I am concerned with
Anwar's Properties as -- he's renting from
these different tenant areas. Because 5522 is the ICE Lounge. The package store is going to be 5516. And that's one of my concerns. And also some other areas on Washington Estates, which is a store and a minimum distance from the Friendship Baptist Church.

Like, who is the real -- who is the real owner? Or who is it going to be? He says he's not going to pass this license off for one of

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
the conditions, and -- I forgot what the other issue is because I didn't bring that paperwork, but I'm opposed to this.

And because one of my neighbors who was a new neighbor who's a veteran also, she had moved over there. She says it's a nice neighborhood. She bought a home. She lives -she lives 10 feet because her fence is 10 feet from the building. And she told me she got the shock of her life that at night from the noise, the loitering and the -- I know that's not one of the issues.

But I just want to know who the real owner and who this license is going to really be, because, like I said, the ICE Lounge is 5522, which is already an existing club, and the so-called package store is going to be 5516 on my side of the street.

That's one of my issues and I yield. And I oppose.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thanks. We don't have those answers. Mr. Harden might address those --

MR. SHABAZZ: All right.
THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Williams, and then
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

208
we'll hear from Ronald Raysor.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Can you hold the clock while I pass these out?

THE CHAIRMAN: Is Ronald Raysor here?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Leola Williams, address 5012 Princely Avenue.

I live in the neighborhood. I've been in the neighborhood around 14 years. The Bible says the enemy comes in to rob, destroy, and kill. It seems to me that this property owner and the club owner are coming to bring down our community with these activities, such as shootings in the club at 5522 Sherwood Avenue, shootings that result in deaths. There was a shooting in March where three people were shot and two killed.

Loitering. People just drinking in the area, leaving their trash on the ground. You come on Monday morning and you see the trash, you see the bottles, you see the -- when they have eaten, they throw stuff on the ground. I know that's not the issue, but all of this affects our community.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
the tax collector's office showing that he gave

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
a different address of 10999, which I guess is another address for him, but it's not on the application.

So I would just ask you all to deny this variance. It really affects our community. We would like to redevelop in our community, not have stuff to go down, not be a good
representative for our youth, our children.
And we just are all concerned, and we ask you
to deny this variance.
Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, ma'am. Appreciate you being here.

Next, we will hear from Ronald Raysor. Is Ronald here?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Let the record reflect that Ronald is in opposition.

Next, we will hear from Larry Peterson.
Is Larry here?
It looks like Larry is coming up. After
Larry, we'll hear from Jonas Albertie.
Is Jonas here?
Are you going to speak, sir?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes.
Then you have children who need to go to school on Monday morning and they would have to see all of that.

I looked up this owner, Mr. Dakhil, Mr. Anwar Dakhil. I found five businesses for him on Sunbiz. The address listed on the application for Royal House Liquor is 10999 Mandarin Preserve Drive, but that's not what he put on the application. He listed his address in Orlando, and this is discrepancy.

The ICE Lounge Bar and Liquors [sic], in that name it says "bar," so we know they serve liquor. But this has really brought down our community.

The petitions I gave and I'm passing around, they are from churches in the area, Philippian Community Church. We have the Sanctuary of Praise, which is on Soutel Drive. Philippian is on US-1. We have the Master's Touch. These people are in objection, about 133 people are in objection. And we gave you the information about them objecting.

I also sent an email about what I just stated, about the address. It was taken from

THE CHAIRMAN: You're up after Mr. Peterson.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: How are you all doing?
My name is Larry Peterson. My address is 7266 Lancashire Court, Jacksonville, Florida 32219.

And I am here to -- I guess we trying to say that we are opposed to another liquor store in our area. You have a liquor store on New Kings Road about maybe a half mile down the street or a mile. You got another one on Soutel, the same place, just adjacent maybe about -- I guess it got to be about maybe 800 feet -- maybe 5- or less from the building where they are trying to get to put this establishment at.

There's another liquor store right there on Soutel. And the young lady spoke earlier, we got the gas station, you got the grocery stores, all those sell beer and wine. Why do we need another liquor store in our neighborhood?

We have -- we have our church. We have our land. We hold church in the land -- on grounds out there. Especially when COVID done

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
hit us, we've been having -- holding church outside. It's less than the footage that the man gave about it, it's about 1,000. It's not. It's less.

According to where the fence is at, you can walk across our parking lot and be to that establishment within two minutes or a minute because you just walking right from the land to it across the street. It don't make no sense for us to put another liquor store in our community -- in our community.

Now, if you were there trying to put something for the kids to do something after school, the educate them further, that's fine. We need that in our community. We don't need the alcohol liquor stores because once we get that in our community -- we already got guns and violence.

Look at your records downtown to see how many shootings been here at this club just recently. If you come up there on a Sunday, if you say you all did your homework, and go up there on a Sunday evening about 6:30 and see from that place all the way to US-1, cars, people, drinking, liquor bars, smoking -- all

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
that is in that community.
We're trying to get rid of it. Y'all
trying to put more into it. Liquor bring violence. We ask you all to consider that we do not. And I oppose that we put that liquor store in our community. Y'all think about that.

Y'all have a blessed day.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Peterson.
Next, is Jonas Albertie. After
Mr. Albertie, we'll hear from Iris Hinton.
Is Iris here?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Mr. Albertie, good afternoon. Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Jonas Albertie, 10889 Lydia Estate Drive, Jacksonville, Florida.

I wasn't going to say anything, and I don't have too much to say, but I'll tell you one thing, a vote for this waiver is a vote for crime. I live in the neighborhood for some -over 15 years. And we don't need no more

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
crime. Y'all don't live in the neighborhood.
I ain't seen you all there, so I don't know
whether you're good or not. But I tell you one
thing. Like I say, a vote for this means a vote for crime.

Thanks.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Albertie.
Next, is Iris Hinton, and then we'll hear
from Mamie Brightman.
Is Mamie here?
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: How are you all doing? My name is Iris Hinton, and maybe I'm not doing the right -- y'all doing okay?

THE CHAIRMAN: Your name and address for the record, please.

MS. HINTON: My name is Iris Hinton and then my address is already on file.

THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead.
MS. HINTON: I'm here today to ask you
all, again, to not see this go through. And
I'm kind of confused because I want to ask the lawyer who owned that restaurant, is that restaurant with that whole building?

Because today, as I was picking up some
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
resident to bring them here -- that's why I'm going to shut up for a minute because they need to talk. They never been here before. You had wrote a rule up there this morning. And the gentleman told me and I taken pictures that I didn't have time to pull them out for you all that the restaurant has been serving -- doing business without a restaurant. And you've been having people going behind the building using the restaurant. They just put -- just finished the line today. So that's a problem.

And another problem -- one more issue that I have here -- I don't know about none of \(y^{\prime}\) all in this building, but I love God. I love Him with all my soul and my heart. You, uh-uh. We didn't wake ourself up this morning; He did.

So for him to say a building -- he never should disrespect the church. We need our church.

Thank you very much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Hinton.
Is Mamie Brightman here?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Let the record reflect that -- Mamie is here?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

She doesn't want to speak, but she's in opposition.

All right. Is Barbara Delgado here?
After Ms. Delgado, we're going to hear from Van Moy-Henry.

Is Van Moy-Henry here?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: (Inaudible.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Is Van Moy-Henry here?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I am.
THE CHAIRMAN: After Ms. Moy-Henry, we'll hear from Helen Hamilton.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Ms. Delgado, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
I'm Barbara Delgado. My residence is 5264 Dostie Drive. I live five doors from the proposed establishment. I watched the club go up. I'm five doors behind it. I'm here in opposition to it. If they build this, if they use this place as a bar or a club or whatever, it will be three bars within a three- to five-block -- four-block radius. We don't need that.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

\section*{In the late 1970s, I believe, or it could} have been early '80s, the liquor license ordinance came into effect. But just like I said the last time in which I was in a meeting with you commissioners -- during that meeting I said, during that time, you're looking at over 40 years, a lot of change, a lot.

Community growth, new generation, and more than anything, there's a surge in crime in our city. So a lot has changed, a lot.

There's several factors that can add to the deterioration of a community, and I can assure you that an overflow of liquor stores in a small radius can definitely add to this. I heard Attorney Harden, and I have questions. I believe he will come back up again. If so, I do have a few questions.

I know you said that it was 800 feet from the church. Well, that's if you're going west, I assume, then north, then east. If you do that, then maybe it is 800 feet. But that's not a straight shot. That's not a straight shot. And the property is much closer.

It was something mentioned -- also he said about a wooded area. While I'm in the church

And I'm here in opposition. I done raised my children there. It was a quiet neighborhood. I moved in approximately 60 years ago, and I just want to say -- I'm short of breath, but I am in opposition of this variance.

Thank you very much.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Delgado.
Next, Van Moy-Henry.
MS. DELGADO: Oh, and one more thing. I'd like to ask if you all would want it in your neighborhood or next to your house.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
Ms. Moy-Henry, come on up. Next, we'll hear from Helen Hamilton after her, and then Michelle Worley -- I beljeve I'm reading hers for her.

All right. Ms. Moy-Henry, good to see you again. Give us your name and address for the record.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Van Moy-Henry. My address is already on file.

I thank you, commissioners. I oppose item WLD-22-13, another liquor store in the area of Soutel and New Kings Road.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
lot, I can look over at the building. There's no woods there. So I'm wondering, where did the woods come from, the wooded area? It's just not there.

You mentioned about criteria, and I know you're to focus on the criteria, but some of these criteria really have left out a few things such as if there is a license, would that license result in impacting the community? Either it's going to build it up or it's going to add to the downfall.

So these are major criteria that I feel should have been added. That's me.

I have a question. Is it going to be a package store/strip club? Is it going to be a liquor store/strip club? Is it going to be a package store or is it going to be a liquor store? Now, I have a question, just what is it? Because we're hearing so much going on, especially coming from the builders that's doing the renovation out there.

More than anything, again, I oppose WLD-22-13. But I thank you for accepting that mayor's appointment, each and every one of you all, as commissioners, a Planning Commissioner,

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300 public servant looking at ways to build up the neighborhood in the city.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Moy-Henry. All right. Next, Helen Hamilton.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I oppose.
THE CHAIRMAN: Let the record reflect that Helen Hamilton is in opposition.

And then we have Michelle Worley, who is in opposition. And you've got the letter stapled to yours, so I'm going to read that.

Are you here, Ms. Worley? Am I doing the right thing here?

Okay. Here we go.
"I'm here today on behalf of
Representative Angie Nixon in support of constituents of House District 14 who have reached out to us in opposition to WLD-22-13.
"Many residents spoke at the Commission meeting on April 7th, and Representative Nixon provided a letter in support of their objections. Since that time, 130 residents have signed on to this letter.
"While we respect the rights of business owners to do business, we also respect the Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
rights of constituents to be heard on matters affecting their neighborhoods and their daily lives.
"The close proximity of this business to a church field for services, youth sports, a school bus stop, and the surrounding neighborhoods is reason enough to consider whether or not this variance should be granted.
"We urge the Commission, before making a decision, to consider the feedback from concerned citizens who have taken time out of their busy lives to speak out.
"Thank you."
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Is there anyone else -- let's see -- anyone else here today to speak on WLD-22-13?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. With that, Mr. Harden, why don't you come back up and address these concerns.
(Mr. Harden approaches the podium.)
MR. HARDEN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
Paul Harden, 1431 Riverplace Boulevard.
Let me start with the fact that this is a
major commercial area. It's zoned CCG-2. It's
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

222
zoned the most intense commercial zoning in the
Zoning Code of the City of Jacksonville. A
package store is allowed by right at this
location. So the issue is the distance from the church.

There is no proposed consumption on premises. There's no proposed strip club. There's no proposed use other than a package store, which does not allow on-site consumption.

The "grounds" definition is very, very clear. It's in a letter -- the letter I read from you is by the City -- the City attorney of the City of -- Office of General Counsel of the City of Jacksonville. The grounds includes --

And let me apologize to the lady about the issue on the church. I was reading from the Zoning Code where it says a church is a building. So it has to be a building before it's considered a church. It can't be an outside facility. It can't be an open field. A church is a building as defined in the Zoning Code.

Now, that may not be the same as people's spiritual understanding of a church, but I'm

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
reading from the Zoning Code and how it's defined in that Zoning Code, and that is the distance from which we should be measuring.

Another lady complained about the 800 feet. That was a measurement done by the Planning Department, not me. So it's much, much, much, much further than 500 feet to the site.

The "may" versus "shall" issue, that's a document issued by the City of Jacksonville Planning Department. That's not my document. I'm not the one who handed that out. That was a document given to me by the City.

With regard to the Soutel Drive location, or the description of how to get to it on Soutel, that's because in the Planning -- I mean, in the Zoning Code, in dealing with the criteria, if you have to travel a distance more than 500 feet, that should be taken into consideration.

So if you came out the door of the proposed package store, went out to Soutel Drive, went left down Soutel -- right down Soutel Drive, and then left down Old Kings Road, that is the route that you would normally

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
take without trespassing across somebody else's property. And that's an important issue with regard to the criteria.

The first lady that spoke talked about that there isn't anything closer, but it's physically in a building which is between the proposed package store and the church. So by my understanding, means that it's closer. And that facility has been there for more than 50 years. No dispute about it. There wasn't any dispute about it when we talked about it two weeks ago.

The issue of my client's property rights is a major issue today. There are First Amendment rights of religion and being able to worship, but property rights are included in there, too. Sometimes it's not a comfortable situation to be standing up and saying I'm a property rights advocate, and somebody else is saying, well, I'm a religious rights advocate. And you want to be juxtaposed. You can be both.

And today I'm representing property rights, and my client has a property right to use his property as it's zoned. By the way,

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

1 this building was built prior to residences that were built behind it on Dostie drive. I was in that building before any of those houses were built, and there was a club at that time.

I guess the only other issue I want to raise is the issue of crime. There's crime in the area now. That's not being caused by my client. We had an awful weekend of murders in the City of Jacksonville. One of them was in front of a Publix; one of them was in a City park; one of them was in front of a multifamily subdivision. And nobody is saying we should shut all of those businesses down.

I'm sorry for the crime in the area, but my client shouldn't be stuck with the burden of what other people do, particularly not near our property location. But even near our property location, you heard that there's a lot of traffic up and down the area.

So I would ask you to consider the property rights of my client. It's in an area where we -- we're entitled to have the specific uses, CCG-2, and we meet two of the five criteria for the waiver of the liquor distance.

And, again, I would ask you to remind --
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

I'd remind you to look at the definition of "grounds" in the Zoning Code portion I gave you because it says the grounds mean land under the church, not an open area. In fact, it specifically excludes daycare and community recreation facilities as being part of the grounds of a church.

So with that, I'll be happy to answer any questions, Mr. Chairman.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Harden.
Is there anyone else here today to speak on WLD-22-13?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: (Indicating.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Ma'am, I believe we already heard from you.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: But I watched that building come up. I was there before that building.

THE CHAIRMAN: I'll let you and Mr. Harden duke that out after this meeting.

But -- so we're going to go ahead and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

I move to approve application E-22-18. I
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
apologize -- wrong application.
I move to approve application WLD-22-13. COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second. THE CHAIRMAN: We have a motion -COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: My apologies. I need to amend my motion to move to approve application WLD-22-13 with the condition in the staff report.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: We have a motion and a second.

Comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Adkison, why don't we start with you since you weren't here two weeks ago.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: I have a couple of questions to the applicant, through the Chair.

I'm new to this. I wasn't here last week, so I'm catching up.

MR. HARDEN: Yes, sir.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: So if I look up -what I'm looking at on Google here, I see JJ's Crab House. Is that still there?

MR. HARDEN: Yes.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: And what is right next to it?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

MR. HARDEN: You're talking about is the building still there?

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Is the building by that business still there?

MR. HARDEN: The building is still there, and there is a business there, yes.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Is it JJ's Crab Shack?

MR. HARDEN: It's a seafood -- I don't know what the name of it is.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: But there's a restaurant there or something right now?

MR. HARDEN: Correct.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: And then next to that is the Bar and Grill, right? The --

MR. HARDEN: Yeah, which they were referring to as the ICE. It has a different name now. It's --

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: This is a club that serves liquor already in it, right?

MR. HARDEN: Correct.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: So your client is now wanting a liquor license that's on the other side. So there's already liquor being sold closer to the church than this other one?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

MR. HARDEN: Yes, sir.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: So we're already on
the other side of someone already selling it.
MR. HARDEN: Yes, sir.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: All right. And
then, second -- one of the last things is -- I think you addressed it.

It's not going to be a strip club?
MR. HARDEN: No.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: It's going to be a package store; is that correct?

MR. HARDEN: Package store with no on-premises consumption.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: No on-premises.
So, really, what I'm looking at is there's already a use of liquor being sold before -that's closer to the church that's been there for a long time than this one?

MR. HARDEN: Yes, sir. And that's one of the --

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: And these are two different liquor licenses, correct?

Ma'am, you need to -- I'm going to speak out of turn for the Chair. I'm asking the questions to Mr. Harden so I can get a -- and

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
you're disrupting me.
MR. HARDEN: There is two separate businesses, yeah. One of them is an SRX license; one will be a COP license. It's two separate --

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Okay. So it's two separate licenses. So one's already in place, that's closest to the church. That's been operating for -- do you got any idea how long there?

MR. HARDEN: I had my office in that building in 1977.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: And there was a liquor license there at that time or a bar?

MR. HARDEN: An SRX license, yeah.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Probably then y'all made milk shakes, right? Y'all didn't know what liquor was?

MR. HARDEN: I didn't, no.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: All right. So the only thing we're talking about on this thing here is the fact that I'm looking at a blue
23 building, an orange building, and a yellow
24 building. But the blue building is the
25 furthest one over, but, yeah, there is a liquor
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203

store closer to the church that's operating on
a liquor license right now?

MR. HARDEN: Yes, sir. They've been painted. They are not that color anymore. But, yes, you're right.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: But that's the order of it, correct?

MR. HARDEN: Yes, sir.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Okay. So obviously, if -- are they using the building of J -- I'm going to call it JJ's Crab Shack for this one. When you're measuring that, are they measuring that point of the foot or are they going to where your corner of the building is to get that 401-foot or --

MR. HARDEN: They're using the closer one, and that's not how it's supposed to be.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: So I'm clearing up a couple issues at the same time.

MR. HARDEN: Yes, sir.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: So if I use
JJ Crab, which is a different business, a different entity, that's 401 right there to the property line, to the property building?

MR. HARDEN: Yeah, to the church.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

232
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Okay. So the next one, what is the distance between the two? We add another 75 feet?

MR. HARDEN: Well, they have an adjoining wall, so it may be 50 feet, yeah.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: 50 feet?
MR. HARDEN: And then another 50 feet to my proposed location.

COMMISSIONER ADKISON: I think I've heard enough. Thank you.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Adkison.

Commissioner Blanchard.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you, Chairman.

I'd like to announce, I had ex-parte communication. I spoke with Mr. Harden maybe two weeks ago or three weeks ago, and we talked about distances and how they are measured, just on the technical aspect.

And then yesterday I received a call from Ms. Murray, and it was a very good call. She's very, very smart and really understood the issues, and I appreciated the conversation.

The great thing about me having a Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
microphone is that you don't get to just come up here and insult us and then go away because I'm not good at backing down.

And I just want to say to Ms. Barnum -- I believe it was Ms. Barnum who came up and said that we were ignorant. A, that's insulting and inappropriate in this setting.

No, no, no. Please don't speak. You had your turn and it's long gone.

The second thing is that last meeting, you came up and said that you were our boss, the City pays us, and we're employees of the City. And all those things were wrong because you didn't do your research.

Today you got up and said that we're sworn in to uphold the Constitution and all these other things, and that's wrong, too. We're not.

So the only person that's ignorant here today is you, ma'am.

It's not your turn to speak, okay? You speak, we're going to have you removed. I just want you to understand that when you say these things, they are insulting. And they're not taken well by people like us. Okay?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

234
The folks that are dedicating their time
to this community, when you come up and insult us, it doesn't endear us to you, and it doesn't help you get your way. All it does is insult us. Okay? So the ignorant person here is you. Okay?

So the other thing that I want to say is the comments from the community are well heard. And, you know, I feel for you. And I said this last time, too. If I got to vote whether or not a liquor store goes here, I might vote no. But that's not what I'm voting on today.

So what we're voting on is the waiver of liquor distance, and, A, I'd like to see perhaps the way that staff measure or that survey that we do -- it's kind of fuzzy, and there is always debate about how it's measured. And maybe it's better served in GIS or something where we can get different measurements and really see it because those little surveys that the surveyors do are just hard to see.

And so sometimes I wonder if it does meet the requirement, you know. And there's always a little bit of debate, so maybe we can get

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
that noise to go away by changing that somehow.
The other thing is that, you know, you're -- the liquor scenario is -- you know, again, is something that I don't think it should go there, but I'm bound to work within the guidelines of the rules. Okay? So what we're voting on today is the waiver of distance from the church, not whether or not we think there should be one there.

So the crime and all the other things, they are terrible, but they are not conditions that are supposed to be considered for this waiver. The only thing is, does it meet the conditions for a waiver, and I believe it meets two or three of them. And so because of that, I would be in favor of granting the waiver.

I don't think you need another liquor store there, but I'm going to vote for it because it meets the rules. So regardless of what happens today -- and I've told this to Ms. Murray yesterday. Regardless of what happens, go meet with your City Councilperson and talk about changing the rules. That's the problem.

The problem is the rules are what they
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
are, and we're bound to work within them.
But -- and this may be a property rights issue -- and I apologize, Chairman, I'll wrap it up.

This may be a property rights issue for some, but if there's continual issues with liquor stores, maybe there should be no new liquor stores in this ZIP code. Or maybe it should be tied to crime. Or maybe a liquor store by exception only, and then you get to vote on whether or not there should be one.

But none of those things are true, so talk to your Councilperson, change the rules if you think they should be. Some folks may fight you.

But all we're voting on today is that 99 feet and whether that's appropriate. And based on the conditions being met, it is. But I encourage you to look into potentially changing the rules.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I apologize for rambling.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Blanchard.

Commissioner Elsbury.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

And just to my fellow commissioner, Commissioner Adkison, you were going down a similar path that I was going down today. And I said some things in the last meeting. I won't reiterate all of it, but I will some.

You're exactly right. What we're being asked to consider is distance between two properties, really, as opposed to an institution of what I -- and I think everybody's general consensus is, is what is a church, which is the church and the ground it sits on.

The church is blessed to have a very large parcel of land, a parcel of land that extends well down this road, and that's what clips that 500 boundary. We're not talking about from door to door. We're talking about the furthest extent of their property and the absolute closest extent of the applicant's property.

It is a property rights issue for me. But it meets the criteria. I'll support it. But look, they're allowed to operate by right and put various things there. I think they

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

238
meet the criteria to do it.
I'm not a policy maker. As Commissioner Blanchard said, that's a higher body that can determine whether or not liquor stores can go there or not. Right now, they're allowed to, so I'll be supporting the application.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Elsbury.

Commissioner Garrison.
COMMISSIONER GARRISON: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Through the Chair to Mr. Harden.
Mr. Harden, can you explain to me one more
time -- let me make sure I understand the right way about the definition of "building."

So -- and there was a 1997 lawsuit, as you mentioned, with the City, litigation, and you prevailed. You were reading something.

Could you read that for me one more time, a little slower for me? Because I'm from the Westside.

MR. HARDEN: Well, there's three things I read from. One, I read from the Zoning Code, which said by definition a church is a building. So it has to be a building.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

And then the grounds of the church is what I was reading from. It's an opinion written by Fred Franklin, General Counsel, at the request of then-director of Public Works, Sam Mousa. And it's reading from the American Heritage Dictionary.
"Grounds is defined as 'an area of land designated for a particular purpose, the land surrounding or forming part of the building.'"

Clearly, grounds are lands that are surrounding a building designated for a specific use. The grounds end at the point where the actual use ends.

So where the actual building of the -which is the church, it ends where that building ends.

That's Mr. Franklin's opinion in 1997.
COMMISSIONER GARRISON: Thank you.
Am I understanding rightly that in 1997 we determined that we need to use the vertical building as the distance criteria?

MR. HARDEN: Yeah, the facts in that case were similar. That particular church had 52 acres between the facility and the church. And they claimed that whole 52 acres. And

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
additionally, that road access is going up near where a shopping center was located.

And in that particular case, Mr. Franklin said you can't claim all -- Claude Bagwell said, yes -- he was the building inspector at the time. He said, yes, that counts as part of the grounds of the church. Mr. Mousa asked for a ruling, and I had a pending lawsuit.
Mr. Franklin issued an opinion saying, no, that's not part of the grounds. The grounds is where the building is located.

COMMISSIONER GARRISON: Okay. Thank you for that clarification.

So that gives me all the more reason to stick with my vote last time.

And I will just say one thing. Spirituality and Christianity and religion are not -- those are not juxtaposed to this decision for me. I feel no religious burden on myself about this decision. This is a decision about property. This is a decision about the rules of the City of Jacksonville.

People are moral creatures. They make their own decisions whether the liquor store is five miles away or, you know, five minutes

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
away. You know, people make their own decisions, and they do what they do. And it's a hard issue. It's a judgment issue. It's a wisdom issue. This is a place that's going to purvey some goods, and I'm okay with that. And I don't appreciate the spirituality being taken as zero sum, either/or. This is not an either/or decision for me.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Garrison.

Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

I've had two weeks to chew on this and really digest my thoughts and the facts about it. I took note here of some of the biggest concerns from the community. Number one is liquor sales close to a church. I'll probably never be able to run for political office in the South after saying this, but I'm a firm believer that a tax-exempt religious institution should not have first right of refusal when it comes to commerce. I don't think that there's any place for that. I'm

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

242
always going to be on the side of the business when it comes to that.

Current crime rates in the area, I don't
that think they are correlated to liquor
stores. I truly don't. There are multiple
liquor stores in my neighborhood. There's a
very popular liquor store right on St. Johns
Avenue in Avondale, which is one of the most
sought-after communities, historic communities
in Jacksonville, and they're not realizing this same crime rate.

So I would heavily argue that liquor stores have nothing to do with the crime that you're experiencing. Furthermore, I don't see how we could ever deter liquor stores from going in because of historic crime rates.

Late-night hangouts, loitering. Where are these folks coming from? They're not -- you know, they are part of your community, I would take it. Are they coming from another neighborhood and hanging out on Soutel Drive? I don't believe so.

I think that this is part of the neighborhood and, you know, I don't think that this business should be punished. I don't

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
think that we should take punitive -- and we don't have -- honestly, we don't have the authority to take punitive measures because of loitering. That's a matter for JSO. That's a matter for Code Enforcement.

Whatever is going on on properties nearby, people parking in medians, people parking in right-of-ways, we cannot get in the way of commerce because of other jurisdictions, other authorities not upholding the law.

Bad landlord. You know, you have probably seen my place of business. My landlord was on the news last year. She was the young lady who coughed in another human being's face in the height of the pandemic. So if you're basing tenants off of their landlord, well, my business would certainly not exist anymore. And that was one of my major concerns when I saw that news clip. I thought that my business would be judged on my landlord, and I'm glad that it wasn't.

So just trying to make the point that who owns the property, you can't judge their character. You cannot base judgment on their actions and put it on the tenant.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Another concern that several people mentioned are what should go into this building; you know, this should be a grocery store; this should be a school for children; this should be -- you know, we don't -- we're not the applicant. We're not proposing this use. We don't get to decide what should go in there. We have to look at the application and decide whether or not it's fitting.

We discussed criteria last time, and I think Commissioner Adkison brought up a good point. One of the criterion is, is there a place of business in closer proximity that operates in greater intensity? You've got the ICE Lounge here. That's for consumption on premise. That's as intense as it gets. Folks are pulling up in their vehicles, consuming alcohol, getting back in their vehicles, and heading home.

What the applicant's proposing here is off-premises consumption. It's a lesser intensity. It meets the needs of that criteria.

Community rights. You know, you have property rights just like this applicant, but

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
they don't extend beyond your property, you know what I mean? So how can we take your concerns about what's going on a half mile from your house, a quarter mile from your house and make it to where this applicant can't proceed?

I had a tough time with this the first time. I had two weeks to really mull it over, think about it, digest it. I think the
applicant has every right to open their business here, and I'll be supporting it.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Moldovan.

Further comments?
Commissioner Brown.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Thank you.
Through the Chair, I spoke a little longer before. I haven't changed my position from two weeks ago. I'll still be voting against it.

However, there's a chance that the applicant doesn't need this, and I would love for staff in this process to maybe clean this up, and the way this is measured, the direct line, the grounds, the building. It's -earlier, it was "shall" and "may." This has

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

\section*{246}
been a soupy application, to say the least.
One thing that is -- I guess if I had to boil it down why I'm voting against it, usually when you have these applications close to residences -- what we're talking about, you know, a church obviously. But it's the older neighborhoods that have funny combined uses, like San Marco, Riverside, Avondale, Springfield, Murray Hill. And I wrestle with trying to think of another application where the whole community and the representative of the church -- critical -- objected to it.

And if it's in Murray Hill, Riverside, Avondale, Springfield, wherever, where everything is close together, the churches haven't come out, that I can recall in two-and-a-half years, certainly not in any meaningful way in opposition.

This one is quite different. Zero support other than the applicant, and the whole community against it, and the church representative, which is really what matters, against it.

The previous -- the existing user next door and the previous historical, multi-decade

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
use -- staff, you can correct me if I'm wrong -- the application numbers are like E-93, E-95. They have been here a long time. So here we come in with fresh eyes 27 years later or whatever, it's kind of our chance to reconsider, should it be stamped again?

Again, they might not need it. They might work it out and the distance is fine, but since they do need it, and the church did speak out against it, nobody was for it, I'm just going stick with where I was. So I won't be supporting it.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Brown.

Commissioner Elsbury.
COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: Thank you, Commissioner. Last time speaking.

I just wanted to address one point from my -- well, points from both of my commissioners. What you said guarantees that I'll never run for political office. I'll say the same thing.

To go with what Commissioner Brown said, if we're going to base our decisions of what is allowed to go somewhere by right and look at a

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

248
variance based off of a church leader or people from the community coming out and opposing it, that's not our job. Our job is to listen to them, hear their discrepancies with the criteria, and make a decision.

And if a leader from a church shows up or doesn't show up and that's how we're picking and choosing what businesses are by right available to open, I don't think that's what any of us signed up for.

I'll be supporting it.
THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Brown.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Just real quick.
If what Commissioner Elsbury said was true, we wouldn't need to sit here, so obviously they can't just open by right. They need us to vote on it, so that's not really true. By right, yes. But they need this, so they can't just go do it, and what you said is inherently false.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. My thoughts. You know, Mr. Harden, I think if I gave you a number, you could, with certainty, give me the math to get to that number. And I think that's a good party trick you have. And we saw

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
it with the San Marco building height. I'm still trying to wrap my mind around that.

And this the same thing. You might very well be right, and you certainly know more about this than just about anyone in the room. But what we have at hand is a waiver of liquor distance until staff tells us otherwise. We have a waiver of distance from this church. And when the church and community come out in opposition, you know, it's a simple question: Is this going to help or hurt this community?

It's a struggling community as it is. It's not going to help it. It's going to hurt it, in my opinion. And so if you look at the simple facts of the waiver of liquor distance, that's what we're here to answer the question.

You're not entitled to -- if you meet the criteria, you're not entitled to this waiver. We may grant it. I don't think it is going to help the community. We've got to give this community that opportunity. You know, that is what we're here for. So I remain in opposition.

Further comments?
Commissioner Porter.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203

COMMISSIONER PORTER: Thank you, Chairman.
I'm going to stick with my opinion from
last time as well. You know, it comes back to
if they -- if the applicant meets a criteria --
and we may grant a waiver if it seems
appropriate for the community and the area. If
not, these would go through administratively.
There's no reason to vote on these if we're
just sitting here deciding if four and five are
a yes or no. The administration staff can do
that. They're very capable.
This property is within -- the edge of the grounds is within 500 feet. I don't believe it's appropriate for the area, and I'll be voting no.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commission Porter.

Final comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Just briefly.
I'll be quick.
Something I always like to point to is that supply is driven by demand. And I presume that the owner of this application studied the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
demand in the area. These liquor stores exist because there's demand. The quickest way to get something to not succeed is to not support it, you know, so vote with your dollar.

If it goes in, you don't want it there, band together as a community, don't support it, it will absolutely dissolve. I mean, you cannot pay overhead, you can't pay insurance, you can't do that as a business without sales. So I just wanted to add that.

I'll be supporting it.
Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Final comments?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let's call to a vote.
Right now we have a motion and second for approval, with the conditions, of WLD-22-13.

All those in favor?
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Aye.
COMMISSIONER ADKISON: Aye.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Aye.
COMMISSIONER GARRISON: Aye.
COMMISSIONER ELSBURY: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Those in favor, we have Commissioner Blanchard, Commissioner Adkison,

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Commissioner Moldovan, Commissioner Garrison, and Commissioner Elsbury. That's five in one direction, so that does carry.

For the record, in opposition -- all those
in favor -- in opposition.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: (Indicating.)
COMMISSIONER PORTER: (Indicating.)
THE CHAIRMAN: (Indicating.)
All right. Commissioner Hacker,
Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Porter in opposition.

All right. Ms. Tropia needs a break.
This is an excellent stopping point. Man, it's
5:45. We got through the first two items.
Okay. I think I continue to hold the record. Let's give it 10 minutes. Let's just say be back at 6:00, 13 minutes.
(Brief recess.)
(Commissioner Adkison exits the proceedings.)

THE CHAIRMAN: When Commissioner Blanchard was chair, we would always start right on time and now he's the one we're waiting on. That's ironic.

All right. Let's roll to E-22-23.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Is Folks here? Folks is coming too. MR. HUXFORD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
This is application for zoning exception E-22-23 for property at 8206 Philips Highway. Y'all would remember this building as the old GM plant. It was built back in -- around '58, at Philips and Baymeadows. It's now been converted to retail and restaurant use.

The zoning exception is asking for retail sale of alcohol in conjunction with a restaurant. They need the zoning exception because it's zoned Light Industrial.

In the staff report we have noted numerous zoning exceptions for alcohol that have been granted through the years. The reason for so many is because these exceptions are personal to the license holder. And as businesses come and go, the new ones have to get exceptions. This one is no different. We feel this would continue to promote the adaptive reuse of an industrial building, and we are recommending approval.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Folks.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Yancy, good to see you. This is the only card and this is great. So go ahead and give us your name and address.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Lawrence Yancy, 1309
St. Johns Bluff Road North, Jacksonville, Florida 32225.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
Did we swear you in earlier?
MR. YANCY: Yes, sir, you did.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Go ahead.
MR. YANCY: I support -- I just want to
say I support the (inaudible). I know you guys
are pressed for time and everything, and I'll
leave it at that.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you.
Is there anyone else here today to speak on E-22-23?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll close the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve application E-22-23.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
second.
Any comments from the Commission? COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Seeing none, we've got a motion and a second for approval of E-22-23.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes unanimously with the exception of Commissioner Adkison, who has left, and Commissioner Elsbury, who has stepped out, and Commissioner Garrison was in favor.

Okay. Folks, let's move to V-22-05, please.

MR. HUXFORD: Thank you.
This is application for zoning variance V-22-05 for property at 13201 Caldwell Road. This is up near the Pumpkin Hill Preserve, north of Cedar Point Road.

The request is to allow for a variance so they can have a larger accessory structure. The property owner is seeking to replace a barn. They'd like to have a little bit larger structure. This is a piece of property that's

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
about three acres in size. It meets all other zoning requirements and does not have any setback relief or anything.

Given the remote location and the desire to have a workshop and a horse barn seeming appropriate at this location, we have no objections and we're recommending approval.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Folks.

Is the applicant here today for \(\mathrm{V}-22-05\) ?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: (Indicating.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Sir, come on down.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Sir, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Brian Carter, 13201-1 Caldwell road.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Did we swear you in earlier?

MR. CARTER: Yes.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Perfect.
Anything you would like to add about the project?

MR. CARTER: No, I don't think so.
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. We'll take that.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) \(821-0300\)

\section*{V-22-05?}

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll close the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve V -22-05.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We've got a motion and a second.

Sir, Ms. Sales is waving a blue card at you. Get one of those filled out for me, please.

All right. We've got a motion and a second.

Any comments?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we have a motion and a second for approval of V-22-05.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes
unanimously.
Okay. Let's move to MM-22-06.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Bruce.
MR. LEWIS: Thank you, sir.
This is application for a minor
modification to a PUD. MM-22-06 seeks to increase the maximum building height from 50 feet to 66 feet.

During the verification process, it was noted that the maximum building height was 50 but appears to -- during the permitting process, the roof pitch was either overlooked or changed and -- and so the - - the buildings were constructed with a 66-foot building height.

Staff has reviewed this application. We find it does meet the criteria involved. We don't think that the 66 -foot height will be an issue or cause any adverse impacts and we are recommending approval without conditions.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Bruce.
(Mr. Hainline approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Hainline.
MR. HAINLINE: T.R. Hainline, 1301
Riverplace Boulevard, here representing
Chance Jax MS, LLC.
The Planning Department has recommended
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
approval. I also met with the CPAC when they -- when it came before them, and they heard what happened and decided to take no action.

Are there any other speakers, Mr. Chairman?

THE CHAIRMAN: I have about 20 speaker cards here in opposition.

MR. HAINLINE: Oh, okay. So let me just explain --

THE CHAIRMAN: I'm just kidding. I don't. You've been through a lot today. There's just yours.

MR. HAINLINE: You were kidding? I'm so gullible. It's unbelievable.

THE CHAIRMAN: It's only because I don't know what you guys would do if this doesn't go through, so --

MR. HAINLINE: Okay. I'm happy to explain what happened if \(y\) 'all want to hear; otherwise, I don't need to take your time up with it, so --

THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Blanchard wants to hear it.

MR. HAINLINE: Okay. So this is Chance
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Properties. They've developed a number of multifamily projects around town that are doing great. This one got the PUD and we moved forward wonderfully, and the architect goofed and the buildings were built over the maximum height. They were permitted. I mean, it was -- the maximum -- the height it was built was shown on the permits, but it was just missed at permitting.

The developer noticed -- the developer noticed when the as-builts came in and the developer said, okay, we need to initiate a minor mod. So it isn't anything that was caught by violation or a neighbor or something like that. The developer said, all right, we've got to fix this.

You should know that the increased height allowed for some particularly high gables that are consistent with the farmhouse style, it added no habitable space. It added no additional stories or units or any air-conditioned space or anything. In fact, the units developed were four fewer than the PUD permitted.

So it was a goof. The developer stepped Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
forward to fix the PUD. It didn't get him anything except some particularly large gables that the architect, I guess, liked. It's just the architect didn't follow the rules, so --

Anyway, that's -- so they're here to seek a minor modification to allow what has been built to be consistent under the PUD. And, again, we explained all that to the CPAC and they were -- they said, okay, we're not going to take any action on it.

So anyway, I'm happy to take any questions. Oh, and Jeff Rosen from Chance is here as well to answer any questions if you all have any.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thanks for the rundown, Mr. Hainline.

All right. Anyone else here today to speak on MM-22-06?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Seeing none, we'll close the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve MM-22-06.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a second.

Any comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Blanchard.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Through the Chair to staff, was -- did the
City miss the height on the permit? Was it in
the -- on there properly and the City just missed it?

MR. LEWIS: I did try to look through the permits, like I said, during our verification process. It was noted on there that the -- the maximum height was 50 feet. At some point during the permitting process, whether the staff -- whether the plan reviewer missed or just didn't check, I -- that I don't know.

COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: I was just -- the City does a good job in finding the mistakes in my plans. I was just wondering -- perhaps on the things that I do, perhaps if I can just build it and ask forgiveness. That may be a new strategy for me.

Maybe they should pay a million dollar

262
fine or something and then they won't do it again, but I guess it doesn't harm that much being high, but just -- just curious about that.

No -- yeah, just a -- yeah, I'll say that next time, I, you know, build a pond in the wrong spot or in the -- oh, I goofed, sorry. Sorry.

No further comments, Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you for that, Commissioner Blanchard.

COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Sorry T.R. You needed that harassment, so ...

THE CHAIRMAN: T.R., when -- as a subcontractor, when we screw something up, we have never been told that we goofed. There's like ten expletives and then they scream and it's -- it seems way worse than what this is, which also seems way worse than what we normally mess up.

Okay. Any other comments?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. I have a motion and a second for approval of MM-22-06.

All those in favor?
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

264

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821~0300
this site results in a logical and compatible transition of densities and intensities between commercial to the north and Low Density Residential to the south.

For those reasons and the reasons in the staff report, we recommend approval.

MR. LEWIS: Ordinance 2021-0573 is the companion to the land use amendment. It's rezoning approximately 6.6 acres from RR-Acre to PUD for the development of 72 townhomes.

With approval of the land use amendment, this will be consistent with the Comprehensive Plan. We feel with the site plan and the written description, it does meet the internal and external criteria.

We feel this is an appropriate location because it will offer an alternative form of infill housing for the area, and the Department is recommending approval without conditions.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Bruce, and Chief Reed.

Is the applicant here? Is Curtis --. this is Curtis', I believe. Is he here?

MS. REED: I haven't seen him today.
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

266
MR. HUXFORD: This is a recommendation only and we do not have any conditions he needs to agree to. So if you wanted to go ahead and move on this, you could do it. Or if you want to give Curtis a hard time, you could defer it.

MR. HARDEN: If he's not here, I'll cover for him.

THE CHAIRMAN: Nice.
MR. HARDEN: We're moving slow.
Anybody have any questions for Mr. Hart? Honestly, I will, David.

THE CHAIRMAN: That's fine. We'll do that. It's been a long day.

All right. Do we have -- Mr. Harden, why don't you tell us about this application.

MR. HARDEN: It's an LDR to an LDR. Yes, it's a subdivision, single-family subdivision out on the Westside, out in Councilman White's district. We talked to Councilman White about it. He was good with it.

THE CHAIRMAN: This is where the fun ends. You're not an authorized agent is what Paige has told me, so --

MR. HARDEN: I'll get an authorization to you before the next meeting. I'm trying to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
help him not have to be deferred.
THE CHAIRMAN: I do believe that.
Okay. I'm going to -- we're going to move
it. We're going to get through it.
All right. Anyone else here today to speak on 2021-0572?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, let's bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve 2021-0572.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We've got a motion and a second.

Comments from the Commission?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Seeing none, we have a motion and a second for approval.

Before we vote, let the record reflect that Commissioner Blanchard has stepped out. I think he has a history with this property or some such, so --

All right. All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
unanimously.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve 2021-0573.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: Comments from the Commission?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: We have a motion -- an approval for 2021-0573.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
(Commissioner Blanchard not present.)
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes unanimously as well.

It's been a long day. I really don't want to get into the point where we start approving it with people not here, though, so -- we'll give him a mulligan on this.
(Ms. Trimmer approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Ms. Trimmer, it's good to see you here.

Let's move to 2022-0189 and -0190, please.
MS. REED: Thank you.
2022-0189 is a . 15-acre site. It's
located at 1478 Florida Avenue. That's on the
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Eastside, between Martin Luther King, Jr., Parkway and the Springfield Historic District. The request for this is to take the land use from Medium Density Residential to Neighborhood Commercial.

This site was developed with a commercial building constructed in 1913 that is considered both culturally and architecturally
significant. It is one of the few remaining historic commercial buildings in the Eastside neighborhood and is believed to be the location of the longest residentially owned and operated commercial business in the neighborhood.

The amendment would facilitate the reuse of the structure and support neighborhood revitalization efforts. And the intent is to use the site to offer community services, including a grocery store and employment and financial services.

We do find this amendment to be consistent with the Comprehensive Plan because it promotes reuse and revitalization of a historic
structure that is located in the Urban Priority Development Area.

And for those reasons, we recommend
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

270
approval.
MR. LEWIS: Ordinance 2022-0190 is the companion. It's, again, rezoning approximately .15 acres from RMD-A to PUD to allow for the revitalization of an existing structure for commercial uses.

We find it is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and those reasons given previously. We feel it meets the internal and external criteria, and the Department is recommending approval with the one condition in your report.

And I would like to point out that the agent has submitted a revised site plan dated April 21st, 2022, so that will be the -- a revised exhibit.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Bruce, and Chief Reed.

Ms. Trimmer.
MS. TRIMMER: Good evening.
Cyndy Trimmer, 1 Independent Drive, Suite 1200 , on behalf of the applicant.

I have a whole presentation because I am really excited about this project, but it's been a long night. So if there are no other

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
speaker cards, I will simply note that I do have David Garfunkel from LIFT JAX with me tonight, and that this project has actually already been evaluated by City Council and they've awarded over \(\$ 600,000\) to help facilitate development of this store to alleviate food deserts on the Eastside.

So with that, I will answer questions and appreciate your support.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Ms. Trimmer.

Anyone else here today to speak on 2022-0189 and -0190?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Let's move it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve 2022-0189.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: We've got a motion and a second.

Any comments from the Commission? COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: This one did sound out of the ordinary. Give me the one-minute rundown

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
on it, on why we should be excited about it.
MS. TRIMMER: Sure thing.
So for over 90 years, starting in 1921, Deb's Store operated in this location, and it was a very, very traditional local grocer that catered to the community. It closed around 2011, and since that time there has not been any fresh produce options.

This is a food desert. It is more than a mile away from any other accessible fresh produce and grocer access. LIFT JAX came in specifically to focus on this community and the neighborhood. This is their flagship project to revitalize the community.

Like I said, City Council is in full support of it. The neighborhood, the community is in full support of it. They have partnered with Good Will, so it will be expanding the footprint of the historic Deb's Store operation to add jobs and employment services to the community, as well as partnering with VyStar Credit Union to bring an ATM and banking services to this community.

So it has been historically underserved. This is a transformative project and I believe

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
it's really going to bring momentum to the area and cast off everything else LIFT is trying to do in the neighborhood.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Well done. Thank you.

Any other comments from the Commission?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We have a motion and second for approval of 2022-0189.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes unanimously.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I
move to approve 2022-0190 with the one
condition and the revised site plan dated
April 21st, 2022.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a second.

Any comments?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: We've got a motion and a second for approval.

All those in favor?
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

274
(904) 821-0300

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes unanimously as well.

MS. TRIMMER: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Trimmer.
Let's move to 2022-0191 and -0192 on Dunn
Avenue.
MS. REED: Thank you.
2022-0191 is a six-and-a-half-acre site.
This is located on the north side of Dunn
Avenue, about a half mile west of the Dunn
Avenue/I-295 interchange. The request is to
take the land use from the Community/General
Commercial or CGC to the RPI to allow for
multifamily development.
We find the amendment is consistent with
the Comprehensive Plan because the amendment to
the RPI is compatible with the land uses in the
immediate area that include a mix of both the
RPI and CGC commercial. And it's all land
fronting Dunn Avenue, similar to this site.
So for those reasons and the reasons in the staff report, we recommend approval.

MR. LEWIS: Ordinance 2022-0192 is
rezoning approximately 6.4 acres from PUD to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

PUD to allow for a maximum of 112 dwelling units in four buildings.

With approval of the land use amendment, this will be consistent with the Comprehensive Plan. We feel this is an appropriate location because it will support the existing offices, retail, and other uses in the surrounding area near the I-295 interchange.

The Department is recommending approval with a revised written description that's dated April 1st, 2022, and the one condition in your staff report.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Bruce Chief, Reed.
(Mr. Harden approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Harden, give us your name and address, please.

MR. HARDEN: Paul Harden, 1431 Riverplace Boulevard.

May I ask Kristen a question before I start?

THE CHAIRMAN: Sure.
MR. HARDEN: I just discovered through hook and crook that an RPI on the bottom floor, you're not supposed to have residential if it's

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
on an arterial. A newly discovered rule. What can I do to solve that right now?

MS. REED: Through the Chair, I thought I recalled -- I was thinking about that earlier when I looked at it, that your site plan had a recreation center and a commercial structure on the ground floor --

MR. HARDEN: In one of the buildings -four buildings.

Mr. Killingsworth was going to resolve this a couple of weeks ago and nothing's happened, so I'm going to --

MS. REED: So do you have -- I'm sorry, just going -- jumping to the PUD, so on the left side you have a commercial structure, a pond and parking for the commercial. On the right side you have the pool and community building; is that correct? I don't see --

MR. HARDEN: Yeah. Okay. All right. If that's not right, I'll deal with it at LUZ.

MS. REED: Okay. We can talk about it. And if we need to discuss potentially a site-specific policy to associate, we can, but I thought we were okay on this one.

MR. HARDEN: Okay. Thank you.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Sorry, Mr. Chairman. Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Anyone else here to -- do you have -- do you want to give us a rundown or --

MR. HARDEN: Not unless you have questions. I'll be happy to answer them.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Anyone else here today to speak on 2022-0191?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Let's bring it back to the Commission.

Bruce, go ahead.
MR. LEWIS: I'm sorry, I didn't know where -- when to read this. We do have an email from a Lisa King. She asked that this be read into the record, so -- it's short, but let me --
"I have lived within a mile of the property and the above PUD on a Rural Residentially zoned property for the past 23 years. I am in opposition to this proposed PUD to allow multifamily dwellings.
"The properties around this property are single-family homes with a few scattered churches, a vision care and Farm Bureau. There

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
are no multiple-family dwellings west of I-295
and only one southeast of I-295, which is Hidden Oaks apartments on Key Haven. All other multiple-family dwellings are east of the intersection of Dunn Avenue and Lem Turner Road.
"The PUD is not compatible with surrounding land uses and is not a similar use in this area. Allowing apartment complexes, multifamily west of I-295 will ruin the rural character of the area and open the door for more and more density, as we have seen with single-family subdivisions all over Jacksonville. Once we have one, it sets a precedent for more and more. Please keep multifamily east of I-295.
"Thank you."
MR. HARDEN: Mr. Chairman, may I respond to that?

THE CHAIRMAN: Paige, is that -- is this an appropriate enough time to respond to that?

MS. JOHNSTON: (Inaudible.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead, Paul.
MR. HARDEN: It's zoned CGC now. You
could put a gas station there. CGC also allows
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
multifamily use, up to 20 units per acre, but we're going to RPI so we could not do -(inaudible) an \(80 / 20\) split. It's -- already allows that at a much more -- it's a very substantial downzoning, so ...

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Fair enough.
I think we've still got to bring it back
to the Commission, right?
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Right. THE CHAIRMAN: Let's do that. COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve application 2022-0191.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: Comments from the Commission?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we have a
motion and a second for approval of 2022-0191.
All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes unanimously.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve application 2022-0192.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

280
THE CHAIRMAN: We've got a motion and a second for approval.

Comments?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes unanimously as well.

Does someone need to email back Lisa King and let her know Paul's reply? Is that the chair's job? I'm on it.

Let's move swiftly to 2022-0193 and -0194, please.

MS. REED: Thank you.
2022-0193 is a 4.4-acre site located in the northeast quadrant of 103rd Street and Interstate 295. This request takes the land use from the CGC to the CGC but with a site-specific policy to allow conversion of the existing hotel to multifamily. The site-specific policy permits single-use residential and exempts development from the limitation on ground floor residential abutting roads classified as arterials or higher.

The site is located along a commercial
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
corridor with Low Density Residential, an elementary school and a middle school to the north.

We find this amendment consistent with the Comprehensive Plan because the amendment to the CGC, with the policy, will be compatible with and will enhance the mix of commercial, residential and educational land uses in the immediate area and it will facilitate development of additional options to serve housing needs in the city.

So for those reasons, we recommend approval.

MR. LEWIS: Application for Planned Unit Development 2022-0194 is rezoning 4.3 acres from CCG-1 and CCG-2 to PUD. This is to convert the motel rooms into 103 micro-apartments. Again, this will be consistent with the Comprehensive Plan.

With approval of the land use amendment, we feel this is an appropriate location in this area and the Department is recommending approval with the one condition in your report.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, guys.
Mr. Harden.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

282
MR. HARDEN: Paul Harden, 1431 Riverplace.
This -- we had this discussion at LUZ the
other night. You're going to start to see a lot of these. These are relatively rundown hotel/motels, not all rundown, but some, and they're converting into single-family -- or, excuse me, multifamily units. CGC doesn't allow that use, so we're doing site specific -in fact, it looks like T.R. has the next one. It's the same thing. You're going to see a series of 15 or 20 of these come up over the next several weeks -- or next several months, so it's -- it's an opportunity to add some needed housing stock in the area.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Anyone else here today to speak on 2022-0195 [sic]?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Excuse me, -0193.
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Let's bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve 22-0193.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Motion and a
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
second.
Comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Brown.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Real quick.
I actually facilitated a transaction at this property. I know it pretty well, walked it many times.

Out of curiosity to Mr. Harden, a lot of these already kind of function like apartments; you know, people stay -- and maybe it's a staff question, but what triggers the full land use and PUD? A lot of them stay multi-year and never change anything.

MR. HARDEN: The construction criteria for multifamily is different than a commercial facility, so they want to have those standards in them. Typically, what they're going to do on the reconstruction is put kitchens in. A lot of them don't have kitchens, but it's just a function of -- it's classified for the building code purposes.

THE CHAIRMAN: Do they typically stay -- I mean, these would kind of be studios, I guess, right, if it's a --

MR. HARDEN: Well, I think Bruce used the
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
word "micro-apartments." Yeah, they're not going to be big, but you have -- for instance, somebody's coming in to work on a project for a year on a construction that's near there, want a -- an affordable, you know, apartment or -you know, typically you can't have more than one or occasionally two people in them, so ...

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Looking forward to it.

Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Just real quickly, I want to say I like
it. I think that this is a wise use, progressive redevelopment of these properties. It addresses the dire need for affordable housing and I'll be supporting it.

THE CHAIRMAN: Final comments from the Commission?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: We've got a motion and a second for approval of 2022-0193.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
unanimously.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve 22-0194 with the three exhibits and the one condition in the staff report.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: Comments from the Commission?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we have a
motion and approval for 2022-0194.
All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes as well.
MR. HARDEN: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Harden.
All right. Let's move to 2022-0195 and
-0196 on Broward Road.
MS. REED: Thank you.
2022-0195 is a 16.2-acre site. It's located on the east side of Broward Road and it's bounded by Broward Road, Karp (phonetic) Road, Zoo Parkway and Interstate 95.

The request is to take this land use -similar to the last -- from CGC to CGC with a site-specific policy. And the policy allows

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
single-use multifamily development within the CGC category.

Residential is the general trend of the area. The site is located one parcel north of the site pending approval for a similar amendment to permit conversion of a hotel to multifamily. There have also been three other amendments in the general area to promote multifamily development.

We do find this amendment to be consistent with the Comprehensive Plan because the amendment, along with the site-specific policy, will be compatible and consistent with development trends in the area and will also facilitate development of additional housing options.

And for those reasons, we recommend approval.

MR. LEWIS: Application 2022-0196 zoned -rezone approximately 16 acres from CCG-1 to PUD to allow for a maximum of 114 duplexes in 57 buildings. We find it is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan. The subject property is surrounded on two sides by limited access roadways, a retention pond and woods.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

We feel that this proposed development is not expected to create any adverse impacts to the surrounding area, and the Department is recommending approval with the one condition in your staff report.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, guys.
(Mr. Michaelis approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Michaelis.
MR. MICHAELIS: William Michaelis, 1301 Riverplace Boulevard, Suite 1500.

As staff said, this is a land use amendment rezoning to allow for what we like to call "paired villas" on this site. I won't say anything else more about that, but there's -the one condition references a Transportation memorandum, and the first condition in that memorandum is that the front building setback shall be a minimum of 20 feet from the right-of-way.

I spoke with staff after the agenda meeting, and that's a little bit -- the code -our PUD says our front yards will meet code, and there's some nuance in code, depending on where your garage is and your facade is. It's 18 feet or 22 feet, just --

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

288
Anyway, we just want to comply with code. We don't believe that that condition is necessary, so we'd ask for that portion of the condition to be deleted.

And then as to the last bullet point in that Traffic memorandum, it refers to a traffic study. And the last bullet point says that if the traffic engineer does not require a traffic study, provide documentation and the comment will be removed. So we take that to mean do a traffic study if we ask for one, and the client is definitely willing to do that. I just wanted to make that -- that clarification on the record.

So with that, we'd appreciate your support with the modified condition.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Mr. Michaelis.

Anyone else here today to speak on 2022-0195?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
```

move to approve 22-0195.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: Comments from the
Commission?
Commissioner Brown.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: From this day forward
I will never use the word "duplex." It will
forever be a "paired villa."
MR. MICHAELIS: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Paired villa. Fair enough.
All right. Further comments?
Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you,
Mr. Chairman.
Just quickly, day one at my position with
Toll Brothers, I was instructed that they are
not called "duplexes," they are called "paired
villas." And it -- I like it too, yeah.
Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Garrison,
feelings on paired villas?
COMMISSIONER GARRISON: (Inaudible.)
THE CHAIRMAN: No. We're past that.
All right. We've got a motion and a
second for approval of 2022-0195.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

```
            290
        All those in favor?
        COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
        THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes
unanimously.
    And let the record reflect that
Commissioner Elsbury has joined us again.
    COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I
move to approve 22-0196 with the modified
condition read into the record by the
applicant.
    COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
    THE CHAIRMAN: Comments from the
Commission?
    COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
    THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, motion and a
second for approval of 2022-0196.
    All those in favor?
    COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
    THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes
unanimously as well.
    Thank you, Mr. Michaelis.
    Let's move to 2022-0197 and -0198 on North
Main Street.
    MS. REED: Thank you.
    2022-0197 is a 30 -acre site. It's located
        Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
        (904) 821-0300
on the east side of Main Street North, just south of Yellow Water -- Yellow Bluff Road.
The request is to take the land use from Rural
Residential to Low Density Residential, along with an extension of the Suburban Development Area to include the site.

The site is located at the northern boundary of the Suburban Development Area and abuts land in the Low Density Residential land use category, and that land is developed with single-family residential.

We find this amendment to be consistent with the Comprehensive Plan because the request would result in a logical extension of the abutting Low Density Residential land use and the Suburban Development Area and would result in a compatible land use pattern.

So for those reasons, we recommend approval.

MR. LEWIS: Ordinance 2022-0198 is the companion application. This is to allow for a maximum of 108 single-family lots. Again, we find it does meet the internal and external criteria.

There are -- this area -- the subject
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
property is surrounded by other single-family subdivisions, and so we are recommending approval.

The applicant has submitted a revised written description and site plan, which you should have in front of you have. Both of those are dated February 14th, 2022. With those -- with that revised written description and site plan, the staff feels there's no need for Condition Number 1, and so we're recommending that be deleted, but it will have the second condition in there.

MR. HARDEN: Bruce, what is the second condition?

MR. LEWIS: The Transportation Planning memo.

MR. HARDEN: I'll deal with it at LUZ.
MR. LEWIS: Okay.
MR. HARDEN: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Mr. Harden.
MR. HARDEN: I don't have anything to add.
I just wanted to make sure we had the new site plan, which I thought met all the conditions, but ...

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Anyone else here
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
today to speak on 2022-0197?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll close
the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve 2022-0197.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a second.

Comments from the Commission? COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.) THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we've got a motion and a second for approval.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes unanimously.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I
move to approve 2022-0198 with the revised
written description and site plan and the
second condition.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: Comments from the Commission?

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we've got a motion and a second for approval.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes as well. MR. HARDEN: I'm sorry, I turned around. It was approved with the second condition only?

THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.
MR. HARDEN: Okay. I want to applaud
Mr. Michaelis. He prepared pancakes for our
family on Easter for brunch. He's really good at it.

THE CHAIRMAN: He cooked you pancakes for Easter; is that what you said?

MR. HARDEN: For Easter, yes. He prepared the pancakes himself. I saw him do it.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. I don't know.
Well, let's move to 2022-0201, please, Lenox Avenue.

MR. HUXFORD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
This is application for rezoning,
Avenue, as well as 1301 and 1305 Hammond

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Boulevard. This is right at the intersection of Hammond and Crystal Springs on the Westside.

The current zoning is RR-Acre. The proposed zoning -- the top piece would be RLD-50 and the bottom piece would be RLD-40. It consists of a total of 17 acres.

Staff's reviewed the application. We would note that we are starting to see some infill in the area. Immediately to the west of this is the Levverock subdivision that's gone in. The property to the east -- I'm sorry, the property to the west -- Levverock is to the east. And I'm getting turned around here.

Yeah, Levverock is to the east. And to the west, between this property and the Crystal Springs Elementary, there's a PUD that's gone in place for professional and business offices. That has -- that project has not come on line yet. And then to the north, across Lenox Avenue, while it's zoned RR-Acre, there are numerous lots in there that are far smaller, so -- but like I say, we are starting to see infill here. We felt that this was appropriate at this location and we're recommending approval.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

296
(904) 821-0300

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Folks.
(Mr. Michaelis approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Michaelis.
MR. MICHAELIS: William Michaelis, 1301
Riverplace Boulevard, Suite 1500, representing Atlee Development Group.

So as Mr. Huxford said, this site is at the corner of Lenox and Hammond. It's kind of an upside down \(T\), so we are proposing RLD-50 closer to Hammond, with RLD-40 -- or closer to Lenox, with RLD-40 sort of at the -- the bottom side of it, on the horizontal part.

This is heading towards the hard corner, so there is a recent -- I believe it's 2019, professional office, kind of an
office-condo-looking PUD directly adjacent to this site on the corner. And caddy-corner across the intersection is a commercial and retail and office PUD within -- and the school on the other corner, and then residential on the other. So it is moving towards that hard corner.

With that, we view this -- you know, we believe this is a -- a proper site to get, you know, a little bit more denser in this

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
location.
With that, I'm happy to take any
questions.
Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you,
Mr. Michaelis.
I have one speaker's card in opposition, so I'll give you an opportunity to address their concerns when she finishes.

MR. MICHAELIS: Okay. THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Tina Gasson. (Audience member approaches the podium.) THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Gasson, good evening. Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Tina Gasson, and I live at 1416 Sharonwood Lane.

I also own a little strip of land right behind me. It's called Happy Valley Lane. That touches Mr. Bruce Stutsman's land.

I purchased it in 2006. I haven't been able to possess it because Mr. Stutsman will not let me move the fence. And I don't know what's going on. I just would like for you all to know that I own the land and I'd like to be Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
    made whole --
    THE CHAIRMAN: Fair enough. All right.
    MS. GASSON: -- if that's okay.
    THE CHAIRMAN: Well, we'll drill down on
    that.
    All right. Mr. Michaelis, do you got the
    answer we're looking for for that?
        MS. GASSON: Excuse me?
    THE CHAIRMAN: If you're wrapped up, I'm
going to pull him back up to try to answer your
question.
    MS. GASSON: Okay. Do I need to give them
any paperwork or anything?
    THE CHAIRMAN: Possibly after this, but --
    MS. GASSON: Okay. Thank you.
    (Mr. Michaelis approaches the podium.)
    MR. MICHAELIS: Thank you.
    All I would say is I -- I didn't
necessarily hear opposition to the use or to
the zoning. This sounds like a private matter.
And hopefully, maybe when the property changes
hands, if it's a personal dispute between these
parties -- it sounds like maybe this is a good
opportunity for a resolution to the -- to that
dispute to the extent there is anything --
    Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
    (904) 821-0300
matters of record, those will be title issues that need to be worked through from a transactional perspective. If she's allowed to access some portion of the property, that is certainly going to come to light here with this proposed real estate closing.

Again, I -- I believe these are private matters and not a part of this zoning.

I'm happy to take any other questions.
Thank you. This is the first I've heard of it. Thank you.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Michaelis.
Anyone else here today to speak on 2022-0201?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll close the public comment and bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve 2022-0201.

COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We've got a motion and a second for approval.

As a housekeeping matter, ma'am -Mr. Michaelis, do you mind getting with her

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
afterwards and just getting the contact info?
I -- he doesn't -- I don't think he knows about what -- the issue you guys are having. This still has another stop to go through, LUZ. This is the first hearing on it, so there's still time to get this adjusted, but Mr. Michaelis -- you're in good hands with him, so he'll get your info and get that doped out.

Anyone else -- any other comments from the Commission?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Anyone want to ask
Mr. Michaelis about his pancakes on Easter?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Neither do I.
Okay. We've got a motion and a second for approval.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes.
Thank you, Mr. Michaelis.
Let's move to 2022-0199 on Spring Glen
Road.
MR. LEWIS: Thank you.
This is ordinance 2022-0199. Seeks to
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
rezone 3.6 acres from PUD to PUD. This -- the new PUD will retain the -- all the existing uses from the current PUD; however, they are asking for an increase in the square footage of the building.

The current PUD allows for an industrial vocational training facility. As I mentioned, they -- they've now determined they need a larger building than was originally approved in the current PUD.

Staff has no objections to this increase and is recommending approval with the two conditions in your staff report.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Bruce.
(Mr. Duggan approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Duggan.
MR. DUGGAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
Wyman Duggan, 1301 Riverplace Boulevard, Suite 1500.

Do you have any other speaker cards on this one?

THE CHAIRMAN: I don't think so.
Ms. Sales, do I?
MS. SALES: No.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1
```

    THE CHAIRMAN: Nope.
    MR. DUGGAN: Then I'm available for
    questions.
THE CHAIRMAN: There you go.
All right. Anyone else here today to
speak on 2022-0199?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let's bring it back to the
Commission.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I
move to approve 2022-0199.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. I got a motion
and a second.
Comments?
Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I
need to amend my motion. I move to approve
application 2022-0199 with the two conditions
in the staff report.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I've got a motion and a
second for approval.
Commissioner Blanchard.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you,
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL }3220
(904) 821-0300

```
            302

Chairman.
Point of order. I believe the bylaws require that when you get to \(6: 45\), you take an hour and a half dinner break or something like that. Is that -- I think as chairman you could waive that, but I just -- just food for thought. I don't think we would make you do that.

THE CHAIRMAN: I'm inclined to burn through this one, the next one, and then --

COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Perfect. Thank you.

Sorry, Wyman.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Any other comments from the Commission?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Very good. We've got a
motion and a second for approval of 2022-0199.
All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes.
Mr. Duggan, I hope that was late enough
for you. I totally underestimated at saying not before \(3: 00\), so --

All right. Let's move to the last item on
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
the agenda, 2022-0200, on Lem Turner Road.
MR. LEWIS: This is application for Planned Unit Development, 2022-0200. Seeks to rezone approximately 19 acres from PUD to PUD. The rezoning is being sought to allow for a maximum of 300 multifamily apartments. The current PUD from 2006 was approved for a maximum of 350 condominiums or townhomes and 399,000 square feet of commercial uses.

Staff has reviewed this application. It's
in -- this is in the MDR land use category which does allow for the uses. The 300 multifamily dwellings is a density of 15.8 units per acre below the maximum 20 units per acre that's allowed in that land use category.

Since the current PUD already allows for a type of multifamily development, staff feels that this is appropriate at this location and is recommending approval with the one condition in your staff report.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Bruce.
(Mr. Duggan approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Duggan, this one looks like it takes some explaining.

MR. DUGGAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Wyman Duggan, 1301 Riverplace Boulevard, Suite 1500.

So as Bruce referenced, this is a PUD from 2006. It was approved for a mix of uses. It is at the northeast corner of I-295 and Lem Turner. Unfortunately, both the aerial and the site plan crosshatching in your staff report don't show I-295, but it's -- right at the bottom of what you can't see, right below that is I-295, so this is right at the intersection.

It was approved in 2006 in a mixed-use PUD for 400,000 square feet of retail and 350 multifamily units. This application deals only with the multifamily MDR portion of the PUD. It seeks to decrease the number of units from 350 to 300 . It is an express request for apartments, so these will be apartment buildings rather than the townhome form of development.

I'll point out a couple of salient items in your staff report. First of all, the PUD limits the height to 35 feet, which is the same height as a single-family building would be, and it does observe that this is infill

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
development, consistent with the plans, policies and objectives -- goals, policies and objectives, I should say, of the Comprehensive Plan.

I know you -- I'm sure have several speakers, so unless there's any questions, I'll just stand by and -- for rebuttal.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you.
So we'll start with Aritcis Deas and then Willie Alexander and then Tommy Ruffin.

Do you guys want to line up and we'll get moving down the road.

Is Mr. Deas here? Sir, is that you?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm number two.
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Mr. Deas, it looks like he's not here. Let the record reflect that he is in opposition.

So you must be Mr. Alexander.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: That would be me.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Willy "Pop" Alexander, 12698 Sampson Road, 32218. That's here in Jacksonville, Florida.

THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead, sir.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

MR. ALEXANDER: All right. I'm going to forego my remarks at this point in time. I was asked about an hour ago by former president of FCJ, which is now a college, Dr. Darby, to make her remarks. And out of respect for her and what she means to our community, I'm going to do just that. And I'll forego my remarks. Okay?

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So when I call her, you're going to come back up and speak on her behalf; is that right?

MR. ALEXANDER: I'm going to -- if you call her, I'll come back and speak on my behalf.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Fair enough.
All right. So you're in opposition -you're not speaking now. You're --

MR. ALEXANDER: I'm in opposition.
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.
MR. ALEXANDER: Okay. These are Dr. Darby's remarks.

I come before you to request that you support the existing PUD Ordinance 2006-493-E for the property in question and vote no on rezoning Ordinance 2022-200.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

There's no question that the developer has a right to (inaudible) for the development of the property on Percy and Lem Turner Roads. We support that. Having that right should not infringe or be on behalf of the detriment to the rights of existing homeowners on Percy Road and Lem Turner, to also create wealth by maintaining the property values of our homes as well as our quality of life.

The surrounding community to this project are single-family dwellings. It is our request that the proposed developments follow that format.

In 2019, you approved the rezoning -- you approved rezoning 2019-0373 to develop a community on Percy Road and Lem Turner. That project is currently underway. It's
underdeveloped, and we'll -- while we know it is going to impact our egress and ingress on Percy and Lem Turner, we cannot yet determine the full impact.

The development proposed by Ordinance 2022-0200 will only add to the traffic concerns for those of us who travel on Percy and Lem Turner Roads on a daily basis. We have not

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
seen any traffic engineering studies that would tell how the coming congestion from the addition of 350 apartments would be managed.

The current PUD, 2006-493-E, calls for a traffic study regarding proposed access points on Percy Road and states that there would only be one access point to Percy Road. However, I have read that there would be two access points to Percy Road and the proposed PUD request.

As a citizen and a community, we request to receive clear and consistent information about this project from those responsible for advancing this. The developer, the City of Jacksonville's Planning Department and our City Council representative --
(Timer notification.)
MR. ALEXANDER: May I?
THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah. Go ahead. It sounds like you're reading for two people. I'll give you two more minutes.

MR. ALEXANDER: All right.
While we have initiated requests to meet to discuss the project prior to today's meeting, those meetings were not forthcoming before today's meeting.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

310
Additionally, there were to be six rezoning signs placed in the community, but a total of five were clustered in one section of the mile-long stretch on Percy Road and none were replaced -- were placed, rather, on Lem Turner.

As a community, we deserve to be involved in any development that would impact our quality of life and we have not. Our lived experience in the community should not be excluded.

Again, on behalf of Dr. Darby, I make those remarks. And she also wanted me to pass each one of you one of these memos from Marvin Echols of the Planning Department from the (inaudible) --

THE CHAIRMAN: Bring those up to Ms. Sales, Mr. Alexander. Thank you for being here.

All right. Tommy Ruffin, is he here?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: (Indicating.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ruffin, would you like to speak?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: I oppose to the ordinance.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

AUDIENCE MEMBER: I think he wants me to speak for him or for me.

THE CHAIRMAN: I don't want to start pulling these out of order.

Mr. Ruffin, if you want to speak now -- if not, I can just say you're in opposition. I'm not going to start shuffling through all these, though.

All right. So let the record reflect that Mr. Tommy Ruffin is in opposition.

Next, we have Adrianne Lathrop.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: After Ms. Lathrop, we're going to hear from Carl Howell and then Shirley Ealey.

Ms. Lathrop, give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Adrianne Lathrop, 12675 Sampson Road, 32218.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Go ahead.
MS. LATHROP: Okay. So I oppose this application, and the only thing that I'm asking is that you would all consider just deferring this until you get the decision from the State on whether or not they're going to allow access

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
to Lem Turner.
So I'm sure you all know that Percy is -what's it called? A local facility. It's not, like, an arterial or collector road. It's just a local, small, two-lane road.

And I know that there's probably nothing I can say as far as the development because -the way things work, but I would just really appreciate you waiting until -- we know that they're going to be able to -- to -- the egress is going to be on Lem Turner as well as on Percy, because that's just the -- the density on both sides, and they already -- this land was already approved. We've already compromised and compromised, and so now they just want more and more density.

So somebody has to solve the problem or give us a way out. I don't know where, through the back of the community. So that little local road -- I'm not -- like I said, that's going to be a problem for someone else, but at least --

And I didn't understand in the traffic review why they mentioned the capacity of Lem Turner and the trips or whatever, but

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
there's no mention of any type of statistics for Percy Road.

So that's all I'm asking, is that -- that you could just be sensitive and not -- so people aren't spending money also on development when -- if they can't get out -- if we all can't get out, I'm not sure what good it is, but thank you.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Ms. Lathrop.

Carl Howell, and then we'll hear from Shirley Ealey. Is she here?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Howell, go ahead. Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Carl Howell. I live at 125 [sic] Sampson Road, Jacksonville, Florida 32218.

THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead.
MR. HOWELL: Chairman and -- Chairman and body, I ask that you don't approve this request from PUD to PUD.

The existing homeowners at North Lake, they've been there for years. It's a beautiful

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
neighborhood and they have took care of their homes. A lot of them came early because they wanted to get their opinion. You know, for years they have worked so hard and kept the community up. And they couldn't -- you know, this is the last ordinance on the docket for tonight and most of them left. Most of their opinions, I mean, you won't even be able to hear because, you know, some of them came -could barely get here, but they came because their home is something that they work hard for.

And not only that, that's all I did years ago, was build apartments, renovate apartments for Vestcor properties, for Summit
Construction, (inaudible) Construction, South
Carolina, Georgia, all over Florida, Sawgrass, Amelia Island. I seen what apartments do to neighborhoods. Don't let this be changed from a condo/townhomes to apartments.

Respect the community. Respect these people. Respect my neighbors. You know, all the years they worked for this community and you're going to let a developer come in and -and just change his mind that he want to --

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
instead of building what he say he going to build from the first application, now he want to change the application -- request for a change.

I just pray and hope that you make him stick to what he say he going to do when he bought the property. He say he was going to build condos and townhouses. Let him build the townhouses or condos, but no apartments. I mean, I've been in too many bad apartment complexes. You know, condos would be better.

Respect our community. Respect these people. Respect my neighbors. Don't do this.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Howell. Appreciate you being here.

It looks like Shirley Ealey is not here.
Let the record reflect that she is in
opposition.
Next, we have Amos Ealey.
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Also not here. Let the record reflect that he is in opposition.

Betty Hodge, is she here?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay, Let the record
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
reflect that Betty Hodge is in opposition.
Eugene Montgomery.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Here.
THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Montgomery, do you want to come on up?

After Mr. Montgomery, we'll hear from Barbara Darby.

You spoke on her behalf, right?
MR. ALEXANDER: Yes. But I'll speak on my behalf when you call her name.

THE CHAIRMAN: So she -- let the record reflect she is in opposition but had to roll.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Mr.
Montgomery, give us your name and address, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes. Eugene Montgomery. I live at 2911 Percy Road.

I'm in opposition to this proposed zoning.
Across the street from where this is proposed is where they -- originally, they were going to put townhouses and 40 -foot -- square foot lots, single families. We successfully got with the developer a year or so ago and he decided to go ahead and meet our demands and Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
put single-family there. We're just wondering, why can't we have single-family across the street? Because all the other development in the neighborhood is single-family.

As the young lady said before, Percy Road is a dead-end street. Having 350 apartments or 350 cars come through every morning -- and it's at the beginning of the neighborhood, right there at Lem Turner -- is going to cause a serious traffic problem.

And if you look at the site plan for the development, it only shows one outlet, which is right there on Percy Road. There's another marked development -- I mean, marked outlet on Lem Turner, but it's not part of this development and we don't know if that's going to happen or not. So to have 350 cars come in every morning, leaving, just like the neighborhood we have now, it's going to impact us tremendously.

So we would love to compromise and have single-family homes because we have no multi-apartments in the neighborhood. And it's a beautiful neighborhood, as the other residents said. And by adding apartments --

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

318
and I'm not against housing development because
we need it, but 350 apartments is a lot of
apartments right there coming off of a two-lane highway.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Montgomery.
John Darby, did he --
AUDIENCE MEMBER: He left.
THE CHAIRMAN: He left. Okay.
Let the record reflect that he is in opposition.

Valerie Rodgers.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I oppose.
THE CHAIRMAN: You oppose. You want to
add anything else or is that it?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: No, that's it.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. She is here.
She opposes. Thank you, Ms. Rodgers.
Johnny Rodgers.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Here.
THE CHAIRMAN: Would you like to come up, sir?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: I oppose.
THE CHAIRMAN: You oppose.
Okay. Let the record reflect that
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203

Mr. Johnny Rodgers also opposes.
Gary Thomas.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm here.
THE CHAIRMAN: Would you like to speak, sir?
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: After Mr. Thomas we will hear from Ronald Raysor and then Larry Parker.

Mr. Thomas, good evening. Give us your name and address for the record, please.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good evening.
My name is Gary Thomas. I live at 12719 Sampson Road in North Lake.

And I'm here this evening to oppose the ordinance. We have 109 units in North Lake, Phase II; approximately 43 in North Lake, Phase I.

The new development that Mr. Montgomery spoke of, on the north side of Percy Road, I think is scheduled for 74 units. On the west side of Lem Turner, right there in the area of Percy Road on Hemlock, there's another development going on.

And I casually estimated -- we're talking about 600 units, give or take a few, trying to

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

320
access Lem Turner Road, maybe from Hemlock, but mostly from Percy Road on a two-lane highway that -- in that area the speed limit is 60 miles an hour. Something has to give.

We had about 50 people here at 1 o'clock. Our neighborhood is unified in opposition to this ordinance. I hope that -- based on some of the -- all of the comments all the people have made -- and even earlier in the other parts of town people have been expressing basically a lot of the same concerns that we are addressing here tonight.

So thank you for your indulgence and I hope that you guys rule in our favor.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Mr. Thomas.

Is Ronald Raysor here?
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let the record reflect that
Mr. Raysor is in opposition.
Larry Parker.
AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Let the record reflect that Mr. Parker is also in opposition.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

William Roberts.
AUDIENCE MEMBER: In opposition.
THE CHAIRMAN: In opposition. Would you

20 property. And we're not so sure that this is
21 going to happen with the -- with 350 22 apartments, and I just can't even phantom [sic] 23 the traffic. That's already been addressed.
24 But I think what is the integrity in all
25 of this process is that when the developer is
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

30 years, actually. And we've enjoyed a
wonderful rural community. And what's being
proposed really is -- it's just incompatible
with our surrounding area, which is Rural
Residential, agricultural. And, of course, the
recent Percy Oaks of 2019. They're all
residential. We don't -- we don't have any
apartments in our neighborhood, and 350 is
overwhelming for me to even comprehend. It's
totally detrimental. It will be detrimental to
our neighborhood. There's no doubt about it.
We are a residential area. Residents are
fine. Condominiums are okay. You know, people
that own their homes tend to take care of their homes.

We live in a neighborhood of an acre- to two-acre lots. We don't expect people to keep
buying those huge lots, but we do expect to
live in a community that keep up their
trying to do what he agreed not to do. We've already gone through this in 2006 where he agreed to condominiums and townhomes. So we're just against this, all of us are. And I think if you lived in our area, you would be too.

Just build something for homeowners. That's all we're asking. Just somebody to build something for homeowners, not apartments. It's just not -- it's just not right.

I don't even know how to speak to the crime that we might have or any of that, but I -- I think it would be so detrimental to our process. And it's just like one of the councilmen said earlier, we, the people. Don't we matter? We, the people, who already live in the neighborhood, don't we have any say?

We already had a PUD agreement. Why do we have to do this again? Why do we have to keep going through this? I've spoken here before, so please do not vote for this, please, I beg you.

Thank you so much for your time.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Roberts.
All right. Finally, we have Ms. Schumer [sic].

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

324
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good evening. Lavernel Sumlar, 12682 Sampson Road.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
MS. SUMLAR: I decided at the last minute to speak because we love our community. We are proud of our community. We are older homeowners, 30 years.

But three main things I wanted to mention that I didn't hear my neighbors mention was, number one, we are a two-lane road. We don't even have a dividing line. And that's through the entire neighborhood.

Number two, we go out onto a two-lane road, with traffic that is fast, as was stated. There's been several wrecks coming out of our neighborhood through the years, horrible wrecks.

So the last thing I wanted to mention was, if you think about the number that -- of units that we have now, homeowners, and you think about what was just approved, those 75 homes, and you think about 350 more, you are adding about a thousand vehicles coming out of that neighborhood, not including what we already have.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

326
You can think about each unit having two vehicles per unit, 700 on this side, added to 150 on that side. That's a minimum number of vehicles added to what we already have in our neighborhood. That is not conducive to an area that will last without a lot of fatalities if this goes through.

I'm in opposition. And I would like to see homeownership because, as was stated, apartments, people do not take care of the way a homeowner should and does.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, ma'am.
MR. ALEXANDER: Mr. Chairman, could I get those two minutes that you --

THE CHAIRMAN: You had more minutes than anyone else that came up here, so --

MR. ALEXANDER: I spoke for two people.
MS. SUMLAR: I left some time -- excuse me, I'm not --

THE CHAIRMAN: If we had to play that game where we're shifting seconds around, we would be here all night, so let Mr. Duggan come up and address all of y'all's concerns. Y'all had some valid concerns. He's --

MR. ALEXANDER: You're going to give the agent time.

THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah. You guys have a lot of concerns. He's going to have plenty of time to --
(Mr. Duggan approaches the podium.)
MR. DUGGAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
Here are my thoughts: First of all,
again, as a reminder, this is not a greenfill
site. It's MDR today. It's not 350
apartments; it's 300 apartments. It's 350
today. We're going down to 300. It's less density, not more. Somebody said you just keep
adding density. This is a lower density than
what we could do today.
The traffic impacts by definition are going to be less because it's 300 units, max, instead of 350. And under the parking code of Part 6, a townhome requires two parking spaces because it presumes there are two people who live there. The apartments, depending on the number of bedrooms, had a lower parking generation rate because there's typically fewer cars. So whatever traffic impacts they're worried about, that could happen today with 350

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
towns.
We are lowering the density and it should be less -- fewer cars and less trips, but we're certainly going to have to pay a fair share -or, excuse me, a mobility fee that will be spent in that -- I'm sure, in that Lem Turner section between Percy and 295 to address some of the existing site constraints that has been referenced.

In terms of access, there's one in the site plan -- there's one direct access from the property out onto Percy. But if you look at the site plan, you will also see, as I referenced at the beginning, this is a multi- -- a mixed-use approval from 2006.

There's an internal circulation road network and there will be direct access from this apartment development out to Lem Turner through the central internal circulation network. So not every car that comes to or leaves the site is going to go all the way north on Lem Turner to Percy, then all the way down Percy to come in or go out. They'll have access out to Lem Turner from that site. That's an important consideration. That was

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

\section*{approved in the 2006 PUD. We're not changing} that at all.

Again, there's -- the balance of the 2006 PUD is still entitled, will not be subject to this application, it will be developed by others.

I think, lastly, I will just remind you that, again, as your staff report references, this is infill development and it creates a mix of housing product. Both of those are specific, direct objectives and policies under the Comprehensive Plan.

But more importantly, under planning principles, density like this goes at an interstate node, and that what's this parcel is. It's right at an interstate node. This is where you would put higher density. Again, we're lower density than what we could do today, but this is the type of product that goes at an interstate node. That's where we are.

You know, you've heard plenty of analysis, I'm sure, in your roles over the last 18 months, two years, about the growing affordability crisis for folks who would like

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
to buy a home but can't, or, you know, millenniais who move here without a job, they just want to be in Jacksonville and then find a job. This is the kind of product that can help meet that demand.

Every part of town has to contribute to the growth that the city is experiencing. We're not going to just rule some areas off limits. This is not a site well down Lem Turner Road or well down Percy Road. This is right at an interstate node. This is where this type of development goes.

Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Mr. Duggan.

Anyone else here today to speak on 2022-0200?

MR. ALEXANDER: Yea, I am.
THE CHAIRMAN: Sir, we already heard from you.

All right. Let's bring it back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve 2022-0200 with the three exhibits and the one condition in the staff

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
report.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a second.

Comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Brown.
COMMISSIONER BROWN: Thank you.
Through the Chair, I like this. It is a
reduction of density by 50 . It sounds like a
lot of the arguments that the audience has
really were sparred out in 2006. We're not exaggerating, elevating or exacerbating them now.

The applicant is correct, you're going to have less cars per unit with these apartments versus the townhome and there's less of them.

The argument on the fee simple versus rental, it can have validity, but the truth is -- let's leave condos aside because nobody's really doing them right now. Commissioner Blanchard could tell you why. Townhomes are getting built. Many of them are getting built
for rent. So the notion that -- just because
it's a townhome, not an apartment or vice
versa, things are better or worse, it's not
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
really true today. A lot of these are being built for rent. And at the price point you have to rent these out with new construction is not going to be riffraff.

I like the application.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Brown.

I'd like to jump in here too. The -- I totally understand where you guys are coming from. You guys are all homeowners. Y'all have huge lots. You have big, stately houses. And that's one thing we don't see being built very often anymore, large lots, big houses. Even if they have big houses now, they're still really small lots.

You guys would probably go crazy in some of this -- these small lots they're doing now. But we also don't see condos often either, and that's for liability sake. And, frankly, if you saw some of the condos that were built in 2006, that is certainly not what you would want in your backyard, so --

We do see a lot of apartments and they are going for a premium. And as you guys all know, we have a housing affordability issue in town,

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

332
so this does help that.
The thing -- the thing that gives me the most heartburn is, we do have a -- you know, a somewhat dense product in apartments, and then you guys are driving right by those to go to your houses on over an acre that are, you know, large houses. And that's -- that's a pretty stark contrast.

So as this thing goes from here to LUZ, Mr. Duggan, I would just encourage you guys -you know, maybe some sort of visual buffer along Percy Road as these guys are driving. I mean, increased landscaping or something.

That is a stark contrast. I think it makes sense. I get that it's close to the interstate. They're certainly in demand now, but that -- if I were these guys, that would give me some heartburn for sure.

So I wouldn't sweat it, that it's going from townhomes or condos to apartments. There's fewer of them now.

And the final thing I'll say, on the site plan, the pool and the clubhouse are usually the front -- the main entrances of the community, so that pool and clubhouse are

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
coming off of the Lem Turner entrance. So I know you guys have that secondary entrance onto Percy, but that seems very, very secondary and probably just for those buildings that are in that back corner of the lot, so I would -.. my guess would be most of the traffic would come through that main entrance.

Further comments from the Commission?
Commissioner Moldovan.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Just briefly, I want to mention that if you look at the design of Jacksonville, it's -it's sort of a wheel and spoke with -- with the 295 beltway. You can assume that anything on the fringe of that beltway will eventually be developed at a higher density.

If you look at the 2030 Comprehensive Plan, this area is poised for growth. It's Medium Density Residential, which is pretty high density.

I know the applicant came through -- you know, this was entitled in 2006. Correct me if I'm wrong. The market's changed since then.
Condos are off the table. I don't think it's
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
feasible for developers.
But when you look at this site plan, this is not a low-end product. They've got an amenity right at the front entrance. It's a clubhouse with a pool. Tenants have the option to rent garages. There's a big, beautiful retention pond in the middle. I don't think that this is going to be low end. I think it's going to meet a lot of the City's needs for providing more housing. I don't want to call it affordable, but it's certainly less expensive than what you'd see in a fee-simple, stand-alone product.

The concerns about traffic on Percy -- I'd imagine if anybody turns right and heads eastbound on Percy, they're only going to do it once before they realize there's no outlet. And I'd -- I'd imagine that there probably needs to be signs put up. Again, we don't deal with traffic, but I'd imagine that Transportation would -- would probably put some signs to let people know there's no outlet.

I feel for you. I understand you're -you're in a -- what is -- has been a rural area, but that's been changed, and that's not Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
up to our board. That's, I believe -- correct me if I'm wrong, someone. The future land use map is something that City Council hashes out; is that correct?

MR. LEWIS: Yes.
COMMISSIONER MOLDOVAN: Yeah? Okay.
So we're not here to discuss the future land use of this. It's already Medium Density Residential. It's poised for growth. This seems like a pretty respectable product, and I don't see how I couldn't support it.

I feel for you all. I understand where you're coming from. You're living on big lots, what -- what has been very rural, but it's right there on the fringe of 295 and you can probably expect more of this to come.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Blanchard.
COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: Thank you, Chairman.

This was a -- ma'am, the public hearing is closed.

This is an interesting application for me because I'm kind of surprised by the -- the outpouring of the community. I can tell that

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

336
you guys care about your neighborhood and you got matching shirts and things, and -- you know, and I applaud you for that.

The -- I guess the part that confuses me about your opposition is that -- and I think this came before us in 2019; is that true, Bruce, or -- no? Different. Okay. So just the 2006 one.

But they have the ability today to do 350 townhomes. And I think there's a misconception, and -- and Commissioner Brown touched on that a little bit, but there's a misconception that if -- if they do townhomes, that they'll be individual owners.

So what's happening in today's market is that a lot of the townhome communities that you see are all built by one owner and they all stay under one owner and they're all rentals. So there's no prohibition on rentals. And so if this were to stay townhomes, I guarantee you there would be 350 townhomes and they'd all be -- they'd all be rentals. And so it's essentially the same thing.

I think that if the applicant came forward and wanted to argue to go from 350 to 400 units

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
for an apartment complex, I think that would be
an interesting argument. I think he would have standing to do that and you guys would clearly
be upset, but -- but what's happening is just the opposite where he's going from basically a different building type but with less units, and I think that's an enormous win for your community because you're going to have less traffic and less -- and less units.

And -- and I think sometimes when you win, maybe everybody doesn't realize that, but it is a win for you because you're going to have less traffic. The fact that it goes from townhomes to apartments essentially means nothing. It's a technicality. It's going to be rentals either way. So I just want to share that with you.

As far as traffic and those things, the City and the engineers will figure that out, whether you need a turn lane or a light or -or, you know, a three-lane road or whatever, they'll figure that out in the design phase. We don't do that, but they'll figure it out so this is -- that it's safe and reasonable for you -- for you guys and operates and functions

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821 0300
well, but I think it's a win for \(y^{\prime}\) all with
less traffic and less units.
No further questions or comments, Chairman.

THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Blanchard.

Further comments?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Ms. Bannister, have
you been following this one that we're on?
MS. BANNISTER: To the Chair, I was just introduced to it today.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Well, I'm going to put you on the spot for a sec because we've got some concerned folks here.

Guys, she represents the traffic department of the City, and it -- we're not to that point yet, technically, but any initial thoughts on this site plan and -- given the impact to traffic on Percy Road specifically?

MS. BANNISTER: From our department, we did recommend a traffic study before a civil plan set is submitted. So we were going to coordinate that meeting. So -- the details of what would be needed is not there yet.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

\section*{338}

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.
MS. BANNISTER: But as far as the traffic, just to explain the difference between a townhome or the apartment, they would generate -- would generate the same number of trips. It's the same trip rate that is used for apartments and townhomes.

The single-family rates is higher versus an apartment. I just wanted you to know there's a higher trip rate for a single-family home versus an apartment is less. It just depends on number of units.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you.
And do you know if a traffic study was done back in '06 on this?

MS. BANNISTER: No.
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.
MS. BANNISTER: There wasn't anything --
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So we've got one more hurdle for them to jump through and see how that shakes out, but as far as what we're looking for today, that -- just the use.

Okay. Thank you for letting me put you on the spot.

MS. BANNISTER: Yes, sir.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

340
THE CHAIRMAN: Any other comments from the Commission?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Let's call the question. We have a motion and approval for 2022-0200.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: That motion passes unanimously.

Okay. Appreciate all you guys being here and sticking it out.

As far as new business, Director Killingsworth and Folks, this surfaced last meeting that ran late and you had a lot of people that came out and to speak, and --- and their items were final action. Is there -seriously any way we can get some kind of budget to at least validate these people's parking? They're -- I don't know if they know, they're probably going back with \(\$ 50\) tickets, you know, right now for parking.
(Mr. Killingsworth approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Director. I don't mean to put you on the spot.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & 341 \\
\hline 1 & MR. KILLINGSWORTH: That's all right. \\
\hline 2 & Bill Killingsworth, director of Planning \\
\hline 3 & and Development. \\
\hline 4 & It would be something that would require \\
\hline 5 & council action. I mean, we're getting ready \\
\hline 6 & for the budget cycle. I can bring it up to the \\
\hline 7 & administration. \\
\hline 8 & THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. I'd probably \\
\hline 9 & appreciate that. \\
\hline 10 & MR. KILLINGSWORTH: Okay. \\
\hline 11 & MR. HUXFORD: And the reason that City \\
\hline 12 & Council does is because they have built that \\
\hline 13 & into their budget, whereas we don't have it \\
\hline 14 & built into ours, so that's why we can't just \\
\hline 15 & hand them out. \\
\hline 16 & THE CHAIRMAN: I get it. Let's try to \\
\hline 17 & build that in there. I mean, I feel -- \\
\hline 18 & especially with the rate increase in the \\
\hline 19 & garages. I mean, it's -- I'm pretty sure \\
\hline 20 & they're all \$50 is what they've got to pay when \\
\hline 21 & they leave here to -- to, you know, exercise \\
\hline 22 & their right to free speech, so -- \\
\hline 23 & All right. Any other comments? \\
\hline 24 & What was that, Commissioner Blanchard? \\
\hline 25 & COMMISSIONER BLANCHARD: (Inaudible.) \\
\hline & Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

MR. KILLINGSWORTH: That's all right.
Bill Killingsworth, director of Planning
It would be something that would require council action. I mean, we're getting ready for the budget cycle. I can bring it up to the

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. I'd probably appreciate that.

MR. KILLINGSWORTH: Okay. Council does is because they have built that into their budget, whereas we don't have it built into ours, so that's why we can't just

THE CHAIRMAN: I get it. Let's try to build that in there. I mean, I feel -especiaily with the rate increase in the
```

STATE OF FLORIDA)

```
    )
COUNTY OF DUVAL )

I, Diane M. Tropia, Florida Professional Reporter, certify that I was authorized to and did stenographically report the foregoing proceedings and that the transcript is a true and complete record of my stenographic notes.

DATED this 29th day of April 2022.

> Diane M. Tropia

Florida Professional Reporter

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline \$ & \[
\begin{gathered}
207: 8,252: 16 \\
10,000[1]-112: 17
\end{gathered}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 137[1]-127: 18 \\
& 14[8]-32: 18,61: 1
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 20[7]-102: 14,126: 8, \\
& 259: 7,279: 1,
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 285:19, 288:21, } \\
& \text { 289:25 }
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline \$100,000 [1]-181:7 & 10-acre [1]-79:22 & 64:20, 84:1, 109:12, & 282:11, 287:18, & 2022-0196 [2] - \\
\hline \$200,000 [2] - 64:8, & 10-foot [1] - 58:23 & 146:14, 208:10, & 304:14 & 286:19, 290:16 \\
\hline 143:8 & 100[3] - 135:15, & 220:17 & 20-plus [1]-85:23 & 2022-0197 [5] - 5:24, \\
\hline \$30 \({ }_{1}\) - 18:19 & 158:15, 172:19 & 1416[1]-297:17 & 2006 [12]-297:21, & 290:22, 290:25, \\
\hline \$50 [2]-340:21, & 101 [1]-195:20 & 1431 [4]-179:2, & 304:7, 305:4, & 293:1, 293:7 \\
\hline 341:20 & 103 [1] - 281:17 & 221:23, 275:18, & 305:12, 323:2, & 2022-0198 [2] - \\
\hline \$600,000[1] - 271:5 & 103rd [2]-5:23. & 282:1 & 327:15, 328:1, & 291:20, 293:20 \\
\hline \$800,000 [2] - 64:2, & 280:16 & 1478 [1] - 268:25 & 328:3, 330:11, & 2022-0199 [7] -6:1, \\
\hline -143:7 & 108 [1]-291:22 & 14th [3]-50:16, & 331:21, 333:23, & 300:22, 300:25, \\
\hline & 10889 [1]-213:19 & 153:15, 292:7 & 336:8 & 302:6, 302:11, \\
\hline - & 109 [1]-319:15 & 15[7]-15:8, 32:23, & 2006-493-E [2] - & 302:19, 303:18 \\
\hline & 10999 [2]-209:8, & 34:1, 119:18, & 307:23, 309:4 & 2022-0200[7] -6:2, \\
\hline '06 [1] - 339:15 & 210:1 & 213:25, 270:4, & 2007 [1]-100:4 & 304:1, 304:3, \\
\hline '23 (1) - 97:24 & 11 [2]-57:17, 264:18 & 282:11 & 2011 [1]-272:7 & 308:23, 329:17. \\
\hline '58[1] - 253:6 & 110,000 [1] - 61:6 & 15-acre [1] - 268:24 & 2013 [1]-189:6 & 329:24, 340:6 \\
\hline '80s [1] - 218:2 & 11150 [1] - 70:7 & 15.8[1] - 304:13 & 2015[2]-28:14, & 2022-0201[5]-5:25, \\
\hline '99 [1] - 102:13 & 11166 [1]-68:1 & 150[2]-113:11, 325:3 & 100:11 & 294:20, 294:24, \\
\hline 'an [1] - 239:7 & 112[1]-275:1 & 1500 [4]-287:10, & 2017 [3] - 183:23, & 299:14, 299:20 \\
\hline 'the (1]-181:18 & 114 [1]-286:21 & 296:5, 301:20, 305:2 & 184:4, 200:22 & 2022-0220 [6]-5:14, \\
\hline & 117 [1]-1:8 & 153,199 [1]-137:17 & 2019 [4]-296:14, & 22:6, 22:9, 26:2, \\
\hline 0 & 11979 (1)-111:25 & 16[3] - 117:20, & 308:14, 322:6, 336:6 & 26:8, 30 \\
\hline & 12(万) -61:11, 61:16, & 172:14, 286:20 & 2019-0373 [1] - 308:15 & 2022-0221[7]-5:14, \\
\hline 0.89 [1] - 147:12 & 98:2, 98:4, 103:4, & 16-year [1]-19:12 & 2021-0572 [5]-5:20, & 30:16, 30:18, 32:5, \\
\hline 0122[1]-8:6 & 119:25, 167:23 & 16.2-acre [1]-285:19 & 264:4, 264:7, 267:6, & 37:4, 37:10, 42:1 \\
\hline 0190 [3]-5:21, & 1200 [1] - 270:22 & 16284 [1]-204:12 & 267:11 & 2022-200 [1] - 307:25 \\
\hline 268:22, 271:13 & 12024 (1]-130:2 & 17 [1]-295:6 & 2021-0573 [3]-265:7, & 2030 [2]-189:5, \\
\hline 0192 [2] - 5:22, 274:6 & 12051 [1] - 105:25 & 17,000 [3]-146:14, & 268:3, 268:9 & 333:18 \\
\hline \(0193[1]-282: 18\) & 12102 [1]-96:15 & 146:15, 146:17 & 2022[12]-1:6, 2:1, & \(21[2]-1: 6,2: 1\) \\
\hline 0194 [2]-5:23, 280:12 & 12108 [1]-78:5 & 18 [2]-287:25, 328:24 & 4:9, 4:22, 4:25, & 210 \({ }_{\text {(1] }}\) - 116:12 \\
\hline 0196 [2]-5:23, 285:17 & 12121 (1)-65:22 & 180[2]-126:13, & 183:24, 201:1, & 21st [4] - 2:4, 157:8, \\
\hline 0198[2]-5:24, 290:22 & 12124 [1]-108:23 & 126:16 & 270:15, 273:17, & 270:15, 273:17 \\
\hline 0220[1]-23:19 & 12127 [1] - 122:6 & 1829 [1] - 16:3 & 275:11, 292:7, & \(22[2]-153: 16,287: 25\) \\
\hline 0221 [1] - 32:5 & 12148 [1] - 102:8 & 19[2]-142:17, 304:4 & 343:15 & 22-0193 [1]-282:23 \\
\hline 0573 [2] - 5:20, 264:4 & 12265 [2] - 45:12, & 19.1-acre [1]-56:24 & 2022-0122 [8]-5:13, & 22-0194[1] - 285:3 \\
\hline & 131:3 & 1913 [1] - 269:7 & \begin{tabular}{l}
6:17, 6:20, 9:13, \\
10:9, 10:15, 13:19,
\end{tabular} & 22-0195 [1] - 289:1
\[
22-0196[1]-290: 8
\] \\
\hline 1 & 125 [1] - 313:18 & 192 [1]-202:1
1921 [1] - \(72: 3\) & 14:15 & \[
23[1]-277: 21
\] \\
\hline 1 (6]-52:8, 147:23, &  & 1970 [1]-202:13 & 2022-0170 [6] - 5:13, & 230 [1] - 80:5 \\
\hline 202:14, 270:21, & 75:16 & 1970s [1]-218:1 & 15:5, 15:7, 17:16, & 24-hour [1] - 80:7 \\
\hline 292:10, 320:5 & 12675 [1]-311:18 & 1977 [1]-230:12 & 17:22, 21:23 & 25[7]-24:5, 24:17, \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 1,000[2]-112: 16 \\
& 212: 3
\end{aligned}
\] & 12682 [1]-324:2 & 1983 [1] - 102:12 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 2022-0189 [6] - } 5: 21, \\
& 268: 22,268: 24,
\end{aligned}
\] & 59:15, 83:10, \\
\hline 1,068 [1] - 135:22 & 12698 [1]-306:23 & 1988 [1] - 128:12 & 271:13, 271:18 &  \\
\hline 1,072[1] - 134:24 & 12719 [1]-319:12 & 199 & 273:9 &  \\
\hline 1,154 [1] - 136:4 & 13 [3] - 70:13, 135:7 252:17 & 238:16, 239:17, & 2022-0190 [2]-270:2, & 27 [2]-115:2, 247:4 \\
\hline 1,199 [1]-135:18 & & 239:19 & 273:15 & 290 (1)-52:7 \\
\hline 1,208[1]-135:5 & \[
\begin{gathered}
\text { 13-year-c } \\
\text { 131:19 }
\end{gathered}
\] & 1998 [1] - 82:21 & 2022-0191 (6)-5:22, & 2911 [1] - 316:18 \\
\hline 1,462 \({ }_{[1]}\) - 136:4 & 130 [1]-220:22 & 1:00 [2] - 1:7, 2:1 & 274:6, 274:9, 277:8, & 295[8]-120:24, \\
\hline 1,498 [1]-137:17 & \[
1301 \text { [o] - 47:5, 49:14, }
\] & & 279:12, 279:18 & 120:25, 121:2, \\
\hline \[
\begin{gathered}
1,500[2]-98: 5 \\
180: 19
\end{gathered}
\] & 139:14, 258:22, & 200:22, 275:11 & 2022-0192 [2] -
274:24, 279:24 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 121: 6,280: 17 \\
& 327: 7,333: 15
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline 1,615[1]-135:18 & \begin{tabular}{l}
287:9, 294:25, \\
296:4, 301:19,
\end{tabular} & 2 & 2022-0193 [4]-5:22, & 335:15 \\
\hline 1,700[1]-52:10 & \[
1305[1]-294: 25
\] & & 280:12, 280:15, & 29th []] - 343:15 \\
\hline 1.13[2]-58:3, 148:14 & \(1309[1]\) - 254:4 & 2(4) - 79:9, 140:18, & 284:22 & \\
\hline 1.4.4 [1]-189:8 & 13201 [1]-255:18 & 148:10 & 2022-0194 [2] - & 3 \\
\hline \(1.44[3]-57: 8,137: 9\),
\(147: 24\) & 13201-1 [1]-256:17 & 2,640[1]-126:12 & \[
\begin{gathered}
281: 15,285: 10 \\
2022-0195[6]-5: 23,
\end{gathered}
\] & \\
\hline \(147: 24\)
\(10(5)-59: 13,189: 20\), & 133 [2]-27:4, 209:21 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 2.6-acre }[1]-137: 9 \\
& 2.96[1]-137: 5
\end{aligned}
\] & 282:16, 285:16, & \[
62: 11,129: 14
\] \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline 3,257 [1] - 61:24 & 4154 [1] - 60:14 & 286:21 & 8,000 [1] - 57:6 & abutting [4] - 118:20, \\
\hline 3,322 [1] - 52:12 & 421 [1] - 56:14 & 580 [1] - 126:16 & 8-by-10 [1] - 125:23 & 164:1, 280:23, \\
\hline 3,800 [1] - 83:15 & 43[1]-319:16 & 5839 [1] - 199:3 & 8-foot [1] - 179:21 & 291:15 \\
\hline 3.34 [1]-137:4 & 43-count [1] - 92:8 & 5:45 [1] - 252:14 & 8-foot-high [1]-59:1 & academy [1] - 28:19 \\
\hline 3.6 [1] - \(301: 1\) & 43-house [1] - 71:22 & & 8-foot-wide [1] - 33:17 & Academy [16] - 78:18, \\
\hline 3.9 [1] - 57:24 & 44[1] - 153:19 & 6 & 80[4]-126:2, 135:6, & 78:20, 81:1, 81:6, \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{\[
\begin{aligned}
& 30[3]-321: 25,322: 1 \\
& 324: 7
\end{aligned}
\]} & 45[2]-81:16, 121:6 & & 174:25, 175:16 & 88:15, 115:12, \\
\hline & 4525 [1] - 88:8 & 6[3]-16:4, 33:23, & 80/20 [1] - 279:3 & 117:10, 117:11, \\
\hline 30-acre [1] - 290:25 & 4552 [1] - 125:15 & 326:19 & 800 [5] - 180:19, & 118:12, 131:16, \\
\hline 30.204 [1]-203:1 & 4555 [1] - 128:10 & 6.4 [1]-274:25 & 211:14, 218:18, & 136:13, 145:19, \\
\hline 300 [6] - 304:6, & 46[2] - 66:12, 82:24 & 6.6 [1]-265:9 & 218:21, 223:5 & 146:3, 146:10, 172:2 \\
\hline 304:12, 305:17, & 4609 [1] - 63:18 & 6.7-acre [1] - 264:7 & 802 [1]-178:18 & accept [1] - 129:13 \\
\hline 326:11, 326:12, & 4638 [1] - 92:24 & 60 [8]-81:16, 95:4, & 8206[1]-253:4 & accepting [1]-219:23 \\
\hline 326:17 & 4639 [1] - 90:24 & 100:10, 107:20, & 85,000 [1] - 137:14 & access [21] - 62:19, \\
\hline 32206 [1] - 192:1 & 4663 [1] - 114:9 & 111:1, 174:25, & 8714 [1] - 294:24 & 64:22, 68:16, 68:18, \\
\hline 32208 [1] - 200:8 & 47[1] - 57:24 & 217:4, 320:4 & 88 [1] - 135:1 & 68:21, 69:11, 80:7, \\
\hline 32209 [1] - 188:6 & 47-unit [1] - 127:3 & 60-foot [1] - 174:24 & 883 [3]-145:19, & 81:17, 240:1, \\
\hline 32218 [4]-204:12, & 4704 [1] - 71:8 & \(600[1]-319: 25\) & 146:3, 146:10 & 272:11, 286:24, \\
\hline 306:23, 311:19, & 4917[2]-95:13, 99:23 & \[
65_{[1]}-111: 1
\] & \[
89[1]-58: 7
\] & \[
299: 4,309: 5,309: 7
\] \\
\hline 313:19 & 4933 [1] - 116:10 & 654 [2]-30:19, 30:21 & 8:15 [3]-53:2, 144:11, & 309:8, 311:25, \\
\hline 32219 [1] - 211:6 & & 656 [2]-30:20, 179:17 & 144:13 & 320:1, 327:10, \\
\hline \(32225[1]-254: 6\)
32257 [2]-68:1, 88:9 & 5 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 656.133[1]-201: 2 \\
& 656.133(\mathrm{a}[1]-188:
\end{aligned}
\] & 8s [1] - 57:19 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 327: 11,327: 17 \\
& 327: 24
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline \[
\begin{gathered}
32258[3]-82: 18, \\
95: 13,108: 24
\end{gathered}
\] & \[
\begin{gathered}
5[6]-4: 11,32: 11 \\
60: 25,146: 14
\end{gathered}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 656.805[1]-202: 7 \\
& 656.806[\uparrow]-182: 25
\end{aligned}
\] & 9 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { accessibility }[1]- \\
& 62: 16
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline 32801 [1]-56:15 & 184:19, 211:14 & 658 [1] - 134:16 & 9,081 [1] - 57:7 & accessible [2] - \\
\hline 3283 [1] - 188:5 & 5,000[1]-112:17 & 66 [1] - \(258: 6\) & \(90[1]-272: 3\) & 173:11, 272:10 \\
\hline \(35[3]-91: 4,91: 5\), & 5-mile [1] - 146:13 & 66-foot [2]-258:12, & 9121 [1]-194:16 & accessory [1] - 255:22 \\
\hline 305:23 & 5.5 [ 7 - 137:3 & 258:16 & 93 [1]-137:9 & accident [2] - 81:25, \\
\hline 350 [18] - 304:8, & 50[14]-54:20, 112:18, & 69 [1]-134:18 & 940 [1] - 134:24 & 120:24 \\
\hline 305:13, 305:17, & 139:6, 174:24, & 6:00 [1] - 252:17 & 95[2]-121:2, 285:22 & accidents [2] - \\
\hline 309:3, 317:6, 317:7, & 179:21, 224:10, & 6:30[1]-212:23 & 950 [2] - 126:1, 137:14 & 153:16, 153:19 \\
\hline \begin{tabular}{l}
317:17, 318:2, \\
\(322.8,322.21\)
\end{tabular} & 232:5, 232:6, 232:7,
\(258: 6,258: 8\) & 6:45[1]-303:3 & \[
957[1]-134: 17
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { accommodate [4] - } \\
& 4: 19,89: 14,90: 12,
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline 322:8, 322:21, & 258:6, 258:8,
262:15, 320:5, \(330: 9\) & 7 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 964[1]-135: 5 \\
& 99[1]-236: 17
\end{aligned}
\] & 105:5 \\
\hline 326:11, 326:18, & 500 [11] - 67:2, 177:23, & & 9918 [1] - 193:12 & accompanying [1] - \\
\hline 326:25, 336:9, & 183:13, 202:9, & 7 [2] - 118:8, 118:15 & & 203:9 \\
\hline 336:21, 336:25 & 202:15, 205:3, & 700 [1] - 325:2 & A & \begin{tabular}{l}
according \([4]-178: 3\), \\
\(182 \cdot 24,183.9,212.5\)
\end{tabular} \\
\hline 399,000 [1]-304:9 & 206:5, 223:7, & 72 [2] - 264:16, 265:10 & & 182:24, 183:9, 212:5 \\
\hline 3:00 [1] - 303:24 & 223:19, 237:18, & 722 [1] - 200:8 & a.m [4]-52:24, 52:25, & account [2] - 106:5, \\
\hline 3:35 [1] - 138:10 & 250:13 & 7266 [1]-211:5 & 185:23, 185:25 & 107:21 \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{3rd [1] - 4:9} & 500-foot [1] - 202:15 & 73 [1] - 135:23 & abiding [1]-28:4 & accountability [2]- \\
\hline & 5012 [1]-208:8 & 74 [2] - 135:19, 319:20 & ability [3]-24:11, & 76:21, 146:2 \\
\hline 4 & 5023 [1]-191:25 & \(75[2]\) - 232:3, 324:21 & 25:11, 336:9 & accounted [1] - 72:10 \\
\hline & 5171 [1] - 80:20 & 760 [3] - 126:3, 126:4, & able [13] - 16:18, & accumulates [1] - \\
\hline \(4[5]-32: 11,45: 17\), & 52 [3]-59:17, 239:24, & 126:14 & 40:21, 51:6, 55:19, & 197:17 \\
\hline 118:8, 185:23, & 239:25 & 775 [1] - 135:22 & 87:10, 95:1, 127:17, & accurate [1] - 3:1 \\
\hline 185:25 & 5264 [1] - 216:18 & 79 [1] - 136:5 & 159:20, 224:15, & accusations [ \({ }^{\text {] }}\) - \\
\hline 4.3 [1] - \(281: 15\) & 5316 [1] - 206:13 & 7:28[1]-342:4 & 241:20, 297:22, & 43:16 \\
\hline 4.4-acre [1] - 280:15 & 5317 [1] - 185:17 & 7:30 [2] - 53:1, 144:12 & 312:10, 314:8 & acknowledge [1] - \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{\[
\begin{aligned}
& 4 / 14[2]-120: 3 \\
& 120: 18
\end{aligned}
\]} & 5349 [1]-82:17 & 7th [4]-4:22, 4:25, & above-mentioned [1] & 46:1 \\
\hline & 54,028 [1] - 57:4 & 50:13, 220:20 & -118:24 & acknowledged [2] - \\
\hline 40[2] - 180:6, 218:7 & \(55[1]-81: 16\) & & absolute [1] - 237:20 & 140:9, 141:16 \\
\hline 40-foot [1] - 316:22 & 5516 [2] - 206:19, & 8 & absolutely [4] - & acre [14] - 25:10, \\
\hline 400 [1] - 336:25 & 207:17 & & 120:17, 132:18, & 27:22, 79:16, 80:2, \\
\hline 400,000 [1] - 305:13 & 5522 [5] - 177:20, & 8 [10]-62:3, 84:2, & 173:5, 251:7 & 264:15, 264:16, \\
\hline 401 [5] - 177:23, & 183:8, 206:17, & 98:1, 103:3, 112:22, & abundance [1] - 9:9 & 264:18, 274:9, \\
\hline 178:17, 183:10, & 207:15, 208:15 & 119:25, 146:24, & abundant \([1]-86: 3\) & 279:1, 304:14, \\
\hline 202:9, 231:23 & \(56[2]-96: 18,110: 11\) & 147:2, 162:10, & abuts [2]-264:20, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 304: 15,322: 16, \\
& 322: 17,332: 6
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline 401-foot [1] - \(231: 15\) & 57 [3]-142:8, 142:10, & 167:11 & 291:9 & 322:17, 332:6 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}





\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline 296:17 & carpool [1]-112:24 & 67:20, 67:25 & 48:1, 48:5, 48:7, & 191:21, 192:2, \\
\hline cafes [1]-29:18 & carry (1) - 252:3 & central [2]-173:11, & 48:15, 49:6, 49:20, & 192:5, 193:2, 193:9, \\
\hline Cahoon (1)-264:10 & cars [25]-84:14, 98:9, & 327:19 & 50:8, 53:14, 53:22, & 194:2, 194:7, \\
\hline Caitlyn [4]-69:22, & 105:6, 111:1, & certain [9]-24:6, & 54:2, 54:10, 54:14, & 194:11, 196:12, \\
\hline 73:16, 73:19, \(73: 22\)
cake [1]-169:24 & 111:11, 113:6,
113:11, 116:24, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 31: 12,32: 25,44: 20, \\
& 68: 7,69: 3,94: 18,
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 54: 17,55: 10,56: 8, \\
& 56: 11,59: 18,59: 21,
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 196:20, 198:21, } \\
& \text { 198:25, 200:1, }
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline cake [1]-169:24 calculate [1] - 23:24 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 113:11, 116:24, } \\
& \text { 118:10, 121:11, }
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 68:7, 69:3, 94:18, } \\
& 199: 21,203: 4
\end{aligned}
\] & 56:11, 59:18, 59:21,
60:1, 60:4, 60:7, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 198:25, 200:1, } \\
& \text { 202:1, 204:1, 204:3, }
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline calculated [1] - 89:22 & 1:13, 123:11 & Certainly [1] - 16:1 & 60:15, 62:23, 63:4, & 204:9, 206:6. \\
\hline calculations [1] - & 6:4, 126:14, & certainly [13]-41:17, & 63:8, 63:16, 63:20, & 206:10, 206:14, \\
\hline 77:10 & 6:16, 127:20 & 66:12, 67:16, 82:9, & 63:23, 64:5, 65:1 & 207:21, 207:25, \\
\hline Caldwell [5]-5:19, & 175:14, 186:2, & 173:14, 243:17 & 65:19, 67:18, 69:19, & 208:5, 210:12, \\
\hline 187:13, 255:18, & 2:24, 317:7 & 246:17, 249:4, & 69:25, 70:4, 70:9 & 210:17, 211:1, \\
\hline 256:17 & 7:17, 326:24 & 299:5, 327:4 & 70:22, 70:25, 71:5 & 213:9, 213:15, \\
\hline Callaway \([2]-48: 12\), & 327:3, 330:15 & 31:21, 332:16 & 73:14, 73:19, 73:24, & 214:7, 214:15, \\
\hline 39:18 & cart [1] - 170:9 & 34: & 75:8, 75:13, 75:1 & 214:19, 215:21, \\
\hline campus [5] - 103:3, & Carter [1] - 256:16 & certainty [1] -248:23 & 77:23, 80:15, 82:3, & 215:24, 216:8, \\
\hline 103:10, 103:13, & CARTER [2]-256:20, & CERTIFICATE \({ }_{[1]}\) - & 82:7, 82:14, 82:1 & 216:10, 216:13, \\
\hline 123:25, 124:2 & 256:24 & & 85:1, 85:10, 85:13, & 217:8, 217:13, \\
\hline Candace [ 3 ]-69:24 & case [10]-22:14, & certify [ \([1]-343: 8\) & 87:25, 88:5, 90:1 & 220:4, 220:7, \\
\hline candy [1] - 138:15 & :24, 38:12, 45:24, & cetera [1]-73:1 & 90:22, 92:18, 94:22, & 221:14, 221:18, \\
\hline cannot [7]-71:17, & 3:6, 73:9, 94:1, & CGC [11]-274:14, & 94:24, 95:15, 95:19, & 226:10, 226:14, \\
\hline 80:9, 153:7, 243:8, & 191:2, 239:22, 240:3 & 274:20, 278:24 & 95:25, 96:8, 96:12, & 226:19, 227:4, \\
\hline 243:24, 251:8, & cast [1]-273:2 & 3:25, 280:18 & 99:6, 99:10, 99:20, & 227:10, 232:11, \\
\hline 308:20 & casually [1] - 319:24 & 81:6, 282:7, & 101:24, 102:5, & 236:23, 238:7, \\
\hline canopy [3] - 59:9, & catching \({ }_{\text {[1] }}\) - 227:18 & 285:24, 286:2 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 102:10, 105:17, } \\
& \text { 105:22, 108:18, }
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 241:10, 245:12, } \\
& \text { 247:13, 248:12, }
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline \begin{tabular}{l}
83:6, 87:7 \\
capable [1]
\end{tabular} & categories [1] category [6]-1 & 55:22, 143:16, & 111:16, 111:20, & 248:21, 250:17, \\
\hline capacities [3]-134:5, & \[
160: 18,286: 2
\] & 157:17, 252:22 & 113:25, 114:5, & 251:13, 251:15, \\
\hline 134:12, 146:16 & 291:10, 304:11, & Chair [ 18 f - 1:13, 12:6, & 116:2, 116:7, 119:8, & 251:24, 252:8, \\
\hline capacity [32]-46:12, & 15 & 19:2, 19:8, 53:18, & 119:13, 121:21, & 252:21, 253:23, \\
\hline 46:23, 52:10, 52:11, & cater [1]-109:20 & 2:14, 154:14, &  & \[
1,254: 7
\] \\
\hline 52:13, 52:18, 61:13, & catered [1]-272:6 & 6:1, 159:12 & 128:2, 128:5, & 254:10, 254:15, \\
\hline 61:14, 61:17, 64:14, & Catholic [3] - 45:15, & 1:2, 227:16, & 30:20. \(130: 24\) & 55:4, 255:9, 256:8 \\
\hline 64:16, 64:19, 91:15, & 78:16, 78:25 & 29:24, 238:12 & \[
130: 20,130: 24,
\] & 255:4, 255:9, 256:8, \\
\hline 104:3, 134:17, & caught [1] - 260:14 & 45:17, 262:8, & 133:16, 138:6, & 256:12, 256:14, \\
\hline 134:24, 135:5, & caused [3]-23:8, & 276:3, 330:8, 338:11 & 138:19, 139:4, & 256:18, 256:21, \\
\hline 135:18, 135:22, & 174:4, 225:7 & chair's [1]-280:11 & 149:14, 149:18, & 256:25, 257:4, \\
\hline 136:4, 137:17, & caution [2]-9:9, & CHAIRMAN [480]-2:3, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 9: 24,150: 19, \\
& 52: 10.155: 15
\end{aligned}
\] & 257:10, 257:19,
257:23, 258:19, \\
\hline 142:8, 142:11, & 137:6 & 2:13, 5:2, 5:6, 5:10, & 156:19, 157:15, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 257: 23,258: 19, \\
& \text { 258:21, 259:7, }
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 144:9, 145:6, } \\
& \text { 145:15, 147:17, }
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { CCG-1 [2]-281:16, } \\
& 286: 20
\end{aligned}
\] & 7:18, 7:24, 8:21, 9:2,
\[
9: 5,9: 8,10: 2,10: 8
\] & \[
158: 3,160: 24,
\] & 259:11, 259:16, \\
\hline 147:22, 172:13, & CCG-2 [4]-17 & 10:11, 10:17, 12:2, & 163:12, 166:5, & 259:23, 261:16, \\
\hline 173:3, 173:8, 312:24 &  & 12:20, 13:8, 13:18, & 167:8, & 61:21, 262:2, \\
\hline car [1] - 327:20 & 281:16 & 14:9, 14:13, 14:23, & 168:10, 171:5, & 263:10, 263:14 \\
\hline card [7]-3:4, 60:5, & CDL [3] - 161:6, 162:5, & 15:1, 15:16, 15:21, & \[
72: 6,172: 9,
\] & 65:20, \(265 \cdot 25\) \\
\hline 186:23, 186:25, & 162:12 & 7:13, 17:18, 17:24, & 172:12, 173:1, & 266:8, 266:12, \\
\hline 254:2, 257:12, 297:7 & Cedar [1]-255:20 & 7, 21:5, & 173:12, 173:19 & 266:21, 267:2, \\
\hline cards [6]-3:5, & cell [9]-15:9, 15:10 &  & 175:24, 176:3, & 267:8, 267:13, \\
\hline 301:21 & 16:8, 16:15, 16:23 & \[
25: 24,26: 4
\] & 176:12, 176:21, & 267:17, 267:25, \\
\hline care[7-36:25, 1 & & :14, 26:23, 28:6, & 177:14, & 68:5, 268:8, \\
\hline 277:25, 314:1, & cent \([1]-135:\) & 28:23, 29:3, 29:8, & 178:23, 179:3, & 271:10 \\
\hline 322:14, 325:10, & Center [1]-68:18 & 29:24, 30:3, 30:12, & & \[
17,271: 1
\] \\
\hline 336:1 & center [5] - 33:8 & 30:14, 32:1, 37:2, & 5:13, 186:16,
\[
36: 19.186: 25
\] & 71:15, 271:20,
71:24, 273:4, \\
\hline career [2]-19:13, & 100:14, 116:14, & :6, 37:12, 40:2, & 187:6, 187:11, & \[
273: 8,273: 12,
\] \\
\hline 20:7 & 240:2, 276:6 & , 4 & 187:16, 187:22, & 273:19, 273:23, \\
\hline careful \({ }^{\text {c }}\) ]-81:19 & centered [1] - 46:5 & 4:4, 42:6, 44:9, & 188:7, 190:8, & 274:2, 274:5, \\
\hline Carl [3] - 311:14, & centers [2]-131:25, &  & 190:15, 190:17, & 275:13, 275:16, \\
\hline 313:11, 313:17 & 140:7 & 47:1, 47:4, 47:7 & 191:7, 191:11, & 275:22, 277:2, \\
\hline Carolina [1] - 314:17 & Centerwall [3] - 63:10, & 47:10, 47:17 & 191:14, 191:18, & 277:7, 277:10, \\
\hline
\end{tabular}


\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline 303:16, 303:20, & 161:3, 163:12, & 174:18, 176:8, & 168:18, 217:23, & 246:21, 248:2, \\
\hline 338:8, 340:3, 340:8 & 163:15, 166:5, & 176:9, 176:10, & 218:5, 219:25, & 249:9, 249:11, \\
\hline Commission [85] - & 166:8, 167:3, & 176:11, 176:18, & 247:20 & 249:12, 249:20, \\
\hline 1:14, 1:15, 1:15, & 174:17, 175:24, & 176:19, 176:20, & commitment [1] - & 249:21, 250:6, \\
\hline 1:16, 1:16, 2:5, 3:22, & 176:13, 176:14, & 226:23, 227:3, & 35:22 & 251:6, 269:17, \\
\hline 4:4, 4:6, 4:21, 5:4, & 176:15, 176:21, & 227:5, 227:9 & commitments [1] - & 272:6, 272:12, \\
\hline 8:16, 8:17, 10:13, & 176:22, 219:25, & 227:15, 227:20, & 51:1 & 272:14, 272:16, \\
\hline 10:19, 12:4, 14:11, & 227:13, 232:11, & 227:24, 228:3, & Committee [10]-4:1, & 272:21, 272:23, \\
\hline 17:20, 18:1, 20:19, & 232:13, 236:23, & 228:7, 228:11 & 4:7, 14:3, 36:19, & 276:17, 307:6, \\
\hline 26:6, 26:12, 28:13, & 236:25, 237:4, & 228:14, 228:19, & 143:15, 143:17, & 308:10, 308:16, \\
\hline 29:9, 30:1, 30:23, & 238:2, 238:7, 238:9, & 228:22, 229:2, & 143:19, 143:23, & 309:10, 310:2, \\
\hline 37:8, 37:14, 39:20, & 241:10, 241:12, & 229:5, 229:10, & 144:2, 196:7 & 310:7, 310:10, \\
\hline 41:23, 44:22, 46:3, & 244:11, 245:12, & 229:14, 229:21, & committee [ 1 ] - & 312:19, 314:5, \\
\hline 122:3, 134:2, & 245:15, 247:13, & 230:6, 230:13, & 114:14 & 314:21, 314:23, \\
\hline 149:20, 150:1 & 247:15, 247:17, & 230:16, 230:20, & common [1] - 160:19 & 315:12, 322:2, \\
\hline 153:7, 157:9, & 247:23, 248:12, & 231:6, 231:9, & communication [5] - & 322:19, 324:5, \\
\hline 174:16, 176:1, & 248:14, 249:25, & 231:18, 231:21, & 15:9, 17:6, 18:6, & 324:6, 332:25, \\
\hline 178:4, 188:11, & 250:20, 251:25, & 232:1, 232:6, 232:9, & 47:15, 232:17 & 335:25, 337:8 \\
\hline 188:12, 188:17, & 252:1, 252:2, 252:9, & 232:14, 237:1, & communications [2] - & Community [5] - 1:20, \\
\hline 202:11, 202:24, & 252:10, 252:19, & 238:10, 239:18, & \[
16: 21,48: 24
\] & 117:11, 188:22, \\
\hline 204:16, 220:19, & 252:21, 255:10, & 240:12, 241:13, & communities [6] - & 199:9, 209:17 \\
\hline 221:9, 226:22, & 255:11, 255:12, & 245:16, 247:16, & 77:8, 94:5, 115:7, & community's [1] - \\
\hline 227:12, 250:17, & 259:23, 262:5, & 248:13, 250:1, & 242:9, 336:16 & 155:22 \\
\hline 250:19, 254:21, & 263:11, 267:20, & 250:21, 251:19, & community [121] - & Community/General \\
\hline 255:2, 257:6, & 268:12, 283:3, & 251:20, 251:21, & 38:17, 39:21, 49:1, & [1]-274:13 \\
\hline 261:23, 262:4, & 284:10, 289:5, & 251:22, 251:23, & 50:15, 50:19, 51:2, & companies [2] - \\
\hline 267:9, 267:15, & 289:12, 289:20, & \[
252: 6,252: 7
\] & 51:7, 58:12, 58:23, & 15:10, 17:6 \\
\hline 268:6, 271:16, & 290:6, 302:16, & 254:22, 254:24, & 68:3, 71:22, 71:25, & companion [4] - \\
\hline 271:22, 273:6, & 302:24, 330:6, & 257:7, 257:9, & 72:19, 73:8, 74:2, & 264:16, 265:8, \\
\hline 277:11, 279:8 & 330:20, 331:6, & 261:24, 262:1, & 74:14, 74:19, 74:24, & 270:3, 291:21 \\
\hline 279:15, 282:21 & 333:9, 335:18, & 262:6, 262:19, & 84:5, 93:1, 93:4, & company [5] - 60:21. \\
\hline 283:2, 284:19, & 336:11, 338:5, & 263:12, 267:10, & 96:18, 103:23, & 109:10, 117:22, \\
\hline 285:7, 288:24, & 341:24 & 267:12, 268:2, & 104:1, 107:19, & 153:16, 170:3 \\
\hline 289:4, 290:13, & COMMISSIONER [176] & 268:4, 271:17, & 107:20, 115:9, & comparable [1] - \\
\hline 293:5, 293:11, & -4:23, 5:1, 10:14, & 271:19, 273:14 & \[
116: 17,122: 17
\] & \[
137: 12
\] \\
\hline 293:25, 299:18, & \[
10: 16,10: 21,12: 6
\] & \[
273: 18,279: 9
\] & \[
132: 19,139: 24
\] & compared [2] - 37:20, \\
\hline 300:10, 302:9, & 12:24, 13:12, 13:17 & 279:11, 279:13 & 140:2, 144:17 & \[
85: 24
\] \\
\hline 303:15, 329:22, & 13:22, 14:17, 14:18, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 279: 23,279: 25, \\
& 287.72 \text { 287.24 }
\end{aligned}
\] & 149:2, 149:6, 149:9, & comparison [3] - \\
\hline \[
330: 5,333: 8,340: 2
\] & 14:19, 14:20, 14:21, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 282:22, 282:24, } \\
& 283: 4,284: 11 .
\end{aligned}
\] & 154:7, 159:9, & 136:21, 136:23, \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { commission's }[1] \text { - } \\
& 2: 23
\end{aligned}
\] & 14:22, 14:25, 17:21,
17:23, 18:3, 19:1, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 283:4, 284:11, } \\
& 285: 2,285: 5,
\end{aligned}
\] & 160:22, 164:4 & 137:12 \\
\hline Commissioner [121] - & 19:9, 20:5, 20:21, & 288:25, 289:2, & \[
165: 18,165: 20
\] & \[
137: 9
\] \\
\hline 10:20, 12:2, 12:5, & 26:7, 26:9, 29:11, & 289:6, 289:13, & 169:6, 172:21, & compatible [6] - \\
\hline 12:20, 12:23, 13:1, & 37:9, 37:11, 37:16, & 289:22, 290:7, & 173:11, 173:18, & 265:1, 274:18, \\
\hline 13:8, 13:11, 13:21, & \[
38: 4,38: 10,38: 15
\] & 290:11, 293:6, & 175:23, 188:9, & 278:7, 281:6, \\
\hline \[
14: 9,15: 2,18: 2
\] & \begin{tabular}{l}
\[
47: 16,47: 18,47: 21
\] \\
\(48 \cdot 2,48 \cdot 6,48 \cdot 8\)
\end{tabular} & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 293: 8,293: 19 \\
& 293: 23.299: 19
\end{aligned}
\] & 188:21, 189:2, & 286:13, 291:17 \\
\hline \[
20: 20,21: 5,29: 10
\] & \[
48: 21,149: 21
\] & \[
99: 21,302: 1
\] & 190:2, 193:8, & complain [1] - 197:24 \\
\hline 29:24, 37:15, 40:2, & \[
149: 23,150: 3
\] & \[
302: 12,302: 1
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 195: 23,199: 5 \\
& 199: 10.199: 19
\end{aligned}
\] & complained [1] - \\
\hline \[
47: 12,47: 14,47: 17
\] & \[
150: 22,152: 14
\] & \[
302: 21,302: 25
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 199:10, 199:19, } \\
& \text { 204:22, 205:1, }
\end{aligned}
\] & \begin{tabular}{l}
223:4 \\
complaints [1] -
\end{tabular} \\
\hline 47:19, 48:1, 48:5, & 155:18, 156:18, & 303:11, 329:23, & 205:25, 208:14, & \[
205: 25
\] \\
\hline 48:15, 48:17, 49:6, & 156:20, 157:5, & \(330: 2,330: 7\),
333.10, & 208:25, 209:14, & complementary [ 1 - \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 55: 22,138: 23, \\
& 150: 2.150: 19
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 157:11, 157:14, } \\
& \text { 157:22, 158:2, }
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 333: 10,335: 6 \\
& 335: 19,341: 26
\end{aligned}
\] & 210:5, 210:6, & 163:20 \\
\hline \[
150: 21,150: 25
\] & 158:4, 159:22 & commissioner & 212:11, 212:15, & complete [4]-12:1, \\
\hline 152:10, 152:13, & 160:2, 161:2, & 166:11, \(237: 3\) & 212:17, 213:1, & 74:24, 160:14, \\
\hline 153:13, 155:15, & 161:19, 162:7, & Commissioners [2] - & 218:12, 219:9, & \begin{tabular}{l}
343:10 \\
completely (5) -
\end{tabular} \\
\hline 155:17, 155:20, & 162:14, 162:17, & 2:14, 8:5 & 226:5, 234:2, 234:8, & \[
150: 25,163: 8
\] \\
\hline 156:19, 156:22, & 162:22, 163:2, & commissioners [9] - & 241:18, 242:19, & \[
169: 3,169: 4,204: 19
\] \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 158: 3,160: 5 \\
& 160: 24,161: 1
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 163: 6,163: 10, \\
& 163: 16,166: 9
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 21: 10,152: 9 \\
& 152: 15,164: 22
\end{aligned}
\] & 244:24, 246:11, & \[
\text { complex [1] - } 337: 1
\] \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline ```
    271:4, 272:15,
    309:15, 335:3,
    341:12
Council's [1]-4:1
Councilman [10] -
    11:23, 18:7, 19:3,
    20:25, 30:24, 50:14,
    51:4, 116:13,
    266:18, 266:19
councilman [5] - 7:15,
    10:25, 12:16, 15:21,
    168:21
councilmen [1] -
    323:14
Councilperson [2] -
    235:22, 236:13
councilperson [3]-
    7:12, 11:14, 11:18
Counsel [10]-1:21,
    2:22, 8:3, 23:7,
    23:15, 32:4, 181:8,
    188:13, 222:14,
    239:3
count [1]-79:8
countless [2]-75:1,
    188:9
country [3]-86:4,
    87:17, 205:21
Country [1] - 28:18
counts [6]-51:20,
    52:25, 72:10,
    142:13, 142:19,
    240:6
COUNTY [1] - 343:4
county \({ }^{[1]}\) - 115:13
County [21] - 1:22,
    2:17, 60:23, 65:1,
    86:14, 86:16, 91:5,
    97:8, 104:8, 104:12,
    104:15, 104:22,
    133:19, 135:10,
    137:16, 139:1,
    148:16, 170:5,
    170:7, 187:7
couple [16]-10:23,
    18:9, 23:20, 26:15,
    48:3, 56:18, 57:19,
    58:25, 78:8, 125:17,
    146:23, 168:17,
    227:15, 231:19,
    276:11, 305:21
courage [1]-112:3
course [9]-16:6,
    39:1, 83:13, 96:7.
    140:4, 140:25,
    161:9, 169:1, 322:5
court [2] - 3:9, 147:25
Court [8] - 80:21,
    100:4, 111:25,
    202:12, 203:6,
``` & ```
    203:11, 203:20,
    211:6
courtesy [1]-2:6
Cove [2]-106:2,
    107:7
cover [5] - 44:15,
    51:10, 98:6, 166:22,
    266:6
covered [2] - 57:5,
    166:20
covering [1] - 100:18
covers [1]-33:4
COVID [9] - 121:11,
    142:12, 142:14,
    142:15, 142:18,
    142:19, 142:22,
    197:8, 211:25
Cowser [4]-182:9,
    185:13, 185:16,
    186:16
CPAC [5] - 182:15,
    197:1, 198:8, 259:1,
    261:8
CRA [8]-25:9, 27:5,
    27:12, 27:20, 28:9,
    29:5, 33:11, 33:12
Crab [4]-227:22,
    228:7, 231:11,
    231:22
CRAs [1]-26:20
crash [1]-110:21
crazy \([2]\) - 101:6,
    331:16
create [3] - 115:13,
    287:2, 308:7
created [2]-34:4,
    100:5
creates [2]-93:19,
    328:9
creating (4)-9:13,
    11:21, 83:6, 84:11
creation [1] - 165:2
creatures [1] - 240:23
Credit [1]-272:22
creek [1]-77:5
Creek [4]-95:13,
    99:23, 127:5, 172:3
crew [1]-55:1
crime [19]-124:6,
    125:25, 199:17,
    204:18, 205:23,
    213:24, 214:1,
    214:5, 218:9, 225:6,
    225:14, 235:10,
    236:9, 242:3,
    242:11, 242:13,
    242:16, 323:11
criminal [1]-199:23
crisis [1] - 328:25
criteria [45]-25:17,
``` & ```
34:18, 34:20, 35:10,
41:10, 41:21, 45:18,
140:16, 140:23,
    144:22, 161:14,
    164:13, 164:24,
    165:1, 174:21,
    178:3, 178:6, 178:8,
    178:10, 178:11,
    180:9, 180:11,
    183:20, 219:5,
    219:6, 219:7,
    219:12, 223:18,
    224:3, 225:24,
    237:23, 238:1,
    239:21, 244:10,
    244:23, 248:5,
    249:18, 250:4,
    258:15, 265:15,
    270:10, 283:14,
    291:24
Criterion [1] - 184:19
criterion [3]-144:19,
    146:19, 244:12
critical [2]-122:23,
    246:12
crook [1]-275:24
crosshatching \([1]\) -
    305:7
Crossing [1] - 188:22
crossing (4)-52:6,
    81:24, 143:25
crossings [1]-143:15
Crosstie [1] - 88:8
crown [2]-135:21,
    137:3
Crown [2]-79:8,
    117:17
Crush [1] - 185:21
Crystal [2]-295:2,
    295:15
cul [1]-107:7
cul-de-sac [1]-107:7
Cullins [2]-188:4,
    190:10
CULLINS [3] - 188:8,
    190:13, 190:16
Cullins-Hopkins [1] -
    188:4
CULLINS-HOPKINS
    [3]-188:8, 190:13,
    190:16
culturally [1] - 269:8
curb [2]-30:6, 197:17
curiosity [2] - \(26: 15\),
    283:8
curious [2]-182:20,
    263:3
Current (4)-1:19,
    6:22, 8:9, 9:15
current [19]-13:15,
``` &  & \begin{tabular}{l}
116:24, 140:6, 226:5 \\
days [2]-12:12, 48:3 \\
Daytona [1]-67:2 \\
DCPS [i] - 151:25 \\
de [1] - 107:7 \\
dead [1] - 317:6 \\
dead-end [1]-317:6 \\
deal [13]-18:20, \\
43:11, 87:1, 87:18, \\
115:14, 115:17, \\
179:11, 199:11, \\
199:17, 199:24, \\
276:20, 292:17, \\
334:19 \\
dealing [6] - 6:25, 30:20, 137:25, \\
199:18, 201:10, \\
223:17 \\
deals [1]-305:14 \\
dealt [1]-142:6 \\
dear [2] - 132:3 \\
Deas [3]-306:9, \\
306:13, 306:15 \\
deaths [1]-208:16 \\
Deb's [2] - 272:4, \\
272:19 \\
debate [2]-234:17, \\
234:25 \\
Debbie [1]-88:7 \\
Deborah [3]-85:5, \\
88:2, 187:13 \\
Debra [4]-198:23, \\
200:4, 202:2, 202:5 \\
decade [1]-246:25 \\
deceive [1] - 200:19 \\
deceiving \([1]-61: 19\) \\
December [1] - 189:6 \\
decide [6] - 39:24, \\
76:23, 167:21, \\
205:6, 244:7, 244:9 \\
decided [5]-109:1, \\
131:20, 259:3, \\
316:25, 324:4 \\
deciding [1] - 250:9 \\
decision [9] - 115:21, \\
221:10, 240:19, \\
240:20, 240:21, \\
241:8, 248:5, 311:24 \\
decisions [11]-3:21, \\
3:23, 158:10, \\
194:23, 195:23, \\
196:8, 203:13, \\
204:15, 240:24, \\
241:2, 247:24 \\
declare [3]-47:11, \\
47:15, 48:23 \\
decline [1]-75:21 \\
declining [1] - 152:6 \\
decorative [1] - 59:1 \\
decrease [1] - 305:16
\end{tabular} \\
\hline
\end{tabular}






\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline 332:3, 332:18 & 328:17, 333:17, & 80:18 & horse [2]-109:12, & hunts [1]-192:14 \\
\hline heaven [2] - 83:9, 86:5 & 339:8, 339:10 & Hollingshood [2] - & 256:5 & hurdle [1] - 339:20 \\
\hline heavily [1]-242:12 & highest [4]-27:21, & 85:4, 85:15 & hospital [2]-66:15, & hurt [3] - 130:17, \\
\hline heck [2] - 30:5, 83:13 & 58:5, 70:3, 70:10 & home [23]-41:16, & 128:22 & 249:11, 249:13 \\
\hline hedges [2] - 59:9, & highlight [1] - 62:5 & 72:15, 82:22, 82:23, & hotel [2]-280:20, & Huxford [9]-8:7, 8:8, \\
\hline 59:10 & highlighted [1]-56:23 & 82:24, 83:3, 85:22, & 286:6 & 9:16, 24:7, 27:24, \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { height }[13]-243: 15, \\
& 249: 1,258: 5,258: 8
\end{aligned}
\] & Highway [2]-5:18, 253:4 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 93: 16,100: 6 \\
& 101: 14,109: 2
\end{aligned}
\] & hotel/motels [1] 282:5 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 32: 21,36: 2,179: 7, \\
& 296: 7
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline 249:1, \(258.5,158\)
258:13, \(258: 16\), & \({ }_{\text {highway [2] - } 318}\) & 119:19, 124:9, & hour [14]-52:25, 53 :1 & HUXFORD [25]-1:19, \\
\hline 260:6, 260:7. & 320:2 & 132:19, 133:4, & 53:9, 81:16, 90:8, & 6:19, 22:8, 30:17, \\
\hline 260:17, 262:9, & highways [2]-62:19, & 170:4, 185:23, & 93:10, 111:1, 121:6, & 43:21, 44:17, 44:23, \\
\hline 262:15, 305:23, & 64:22 & 7:7, 244:19, & 144:12, 168:24, & 45:1, 45:10, 161:8, \\
\hline 305:24 & Hill [3]-246:9, & 314:11, 329:1, & 169:17, 303:4, & 161:24, 162:12, \\
\hline held [2]-1:6, 192:16 & 246:13, 255:19 & 339:11 & 307:3, 320:4 & 62:15, 162:21, \\
\hline Helen [4]-216:11, & himself [1] - 294:18 & homeowner [1] & hours [5] - 50:18, & 162:24, 163:5, \\
\hline 217:15, 220:5, 220:8 & hinterlands [ \([1]\) - 36:6 & 25:1 & 51:20, 83:1, 126:10, & 8, 167:25, \\
\hline hello [2]-122:5, 202:5 & HINTON [2]-214:17, & homeowners [9] & 127:23 & 168:7, 177:16, \\
\hline help [18] - 27:11, 28:3, & 214:20 & 03:24, 104:16, & house [15]-89:10, & 253:2, 255:16, \\
\hline 31:24, 48:19, 49:24, & Hinton [5] - 213 & 308:6, 313:24, & 92:13, 92:14, 95:4, & 266:1, 294:22, \\
\hline 112:13, 160:21, & 214:8, 214:13 & 323:6, 323:8, 324:7, & 100:1, 100:10, & 341:11 \\
\hline 169:6, 169:10, & 214:17, 215:2 & 324:20, 331:10 & 101:16, 107:3, & Hyskell [5] - 187:24, \\
\hline 170:18, 234:4, & hired [ 3 ]-118:16, & Homeowners [1] - & 111:6, 132:22, & 190:11, 190:19, \\
\hline 249:11, 249:13, & 123:21 & 105:9 & 181:20, 189:19, & 190:21, 191:7 \\
\hline 249:20, 267:1, & hiring [2] - 97:23, & homeownership [1] - & 217:12, 245:4 & \\
\hline 271:5, 329:4, 332:1 & 103:4 & 325:9 & House [3] - 209:7, & \\
\hline holped [1] - 42:21 & Historic [1]-269:2 & homes [19] - 62:11, & 220:17, 227:22 & \\
\hline helping [1] - 182:23 & historic [5] - 242:9, & 67:12, 84:18, 89:6, 98:19, 100:5, 107:8, & housekeeping [2]43:19, 299:24 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& l-10[1]-264: 20 \\
& 1-295[8]-275: 8,
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline Hemline [1]-84:4 & 242:16, 269:10 & \[
110: 11,174: 25
\] & houses [12]-41:14, & 278:1, 278:2, \\
\hline Hemlock [2] - 319:22, & historical [2] - 76:1, & 175:16, 203:9, & 83:12, 83:15, 96:18, & \begin{tabular}{l}
278:10, 278:16, \\
305:5, 305:8, 305:10
\end{tabular} \\
\hline 320:1 & 246:25 & 277:24, 308:8, & 116:12, 175:15, & 305:5, 305:8, 305:10 \\
\hline Henry [13]-85:5,
88:3, \(90: 19,90: 24\), & historically [1] -
272:24 & 314:2, 317:22, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 225: 3,331: 11, \\
& 331: 13,331: 14,
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { I-95 [2] - 83:14, } 104: 10 \\
& \text { IAN [1] - 1:14 }
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline \begin{tabular}{l}
88:3, 90:19, 90:24, \\
216:5, 216:6, 216:8,
\end{tabular} & 272:24 & 324:21 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 331: 13,331: 1 \\
& 332: 6,332: 7
\end{aligned}
\] & ICE [5] - 206:18, \\
\hline 216:10, 217:9, & hit [2] - 141:25, 212:1 & homework [7] - & housing [12]-61:7, & 207:15, 209:11, \\
\hline 217:14, 217:18, & hitting [ \(1 \mathrm{]}\) - \(33: 15\) & 212:22 & 189:4, 189:8, & 228:17, 244:15 \\
\hline 217:22, 220:4 & HOA [2]-114:9, & honestly [2]-243:2, & 265:18, 281:11, & idea \([8]-20: 2,20: 4\), \\
\hline Heritage [2]-181:17, & 114:25 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 266:11 } \\
& \text { hook [2] - 7:4, 275:24 }
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 282:14, 284:17, } \\
& \text { 286:15, 318:1, }
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 30: 4,36: 12,74: 8 \\
& 137: 8,172: 9,230: 9
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline \begin{tabular}{l}
239:5 \\
hesitant [1] - 158:9
\end{tabular} & Hodge [2] - 315:23, 316:1 & hook [2] - 7:4, 275:24 hope [10] - 75:3, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 286:15, 318:1, } \\
& \text { 328:10, 331:25, }
\end{aligned}
\] & 137:8, 172:9, 230:9 identification [1] - \\
\hline hesitation [1] - 175:8 & \[
\begin{gathered}
3 \\
\text { ho }
\end{gathered}
\] & \[
119: 2,127: 25
\] & 334:10 & 16:19 \\
\hline HFC \({ }_{[1]}\) - 110:20 & \[
80: 11
\] & 153:12, 198:9 & Howell [5]-311:14, & identified [2]-77:17, \\
\hline Hi (1) - 94:25 & Holberg [4]-102:2 & 198:18, 303:22, & 313:11, 313:14, & 173:7 \\
\hline hi [4]-73:22, 78:4, & 102:5, 102:7, 105:18 & 315:5, 320:7, 320:14 & 313:17, 315:14 & identify \([3]\) - 16:18, \\
\hline 125:14, 131:1 & HOIBERG [1] - 102:11 & hopefully [5] - 31:24, & HOWELL [1] - 313:21 & 56:25, 155:11 \\
\hline Hidden [1] - 278:3 & hold [8] - \(94: 13\), & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 43: 13,51: 5,147: 5 \\
& 298: 21
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{gathered}
\text { huge }[9]-27: 7,28: 21, \\
36: 15,39: 9,83: 5,
\end{gathered}
\] & \begin{tabular}{l}
idling [1] - 84:14 \\
ignorant [4] - 194:22,
\end{tabular} \\
\hline \begin{tabular}{l}
high [11] - 25:4, 57:19, \\
\(58 \cdot 21,61 \cdot 5,103 \cdot 7\)
\end{tabular} & 99 & Hopewell [1]-117:8 & 100:19, 101:20, & \[
233: 6,233: 19,234: 5
\] \\
\hline 110:21, 117:14, & 208:3, & hoping [1] - 45:5 & 322:18, \(331: 11\) & \(\mathrm{II}_{[1]} \mathbf{3 1 9 : 1 6}\) \\
\hline 127:23, 260:18, & 252:15 & Hopkins [4] - 187:18 & human (4]-113:7, & illegal [2]-120:12, \\
\hline 263:3, 333:21 & & 187:23, 188:1, 188:4 & 122:24, 145:2, & 155:14 \\
\hline High (4) - 117:12, & 161:21, 253:17 & HOPKINS [3]-188:8, & 243:14 & imagine [7] - 33:14 \\
\hline 134:20, 154:11, & holding [1] - 212:1 & 190:13, 190:1 & humbly [2] - 87:21, & 6:23, 86:6, 171:16, \\
\hline 154:22 & holdings [1] - 203:18 & hopping [1]-30:6 & 111:5 & 334:15, 334:18, \\
\hline high-intensity \({ }_{[1]}\) - & hole [1] - 108:15 & horizon []]-31:18 & hundred [4]-79:16 & 334:20 \\
\hline 25:4 & Hollingshead [2] - & horizontal [ 4\(]\) - 296:12 & 80:2, 147:16, 196:4 & immediate [7]-47:20, \\
\hline higher [12]-24:18, & 85:12, 88:1 & Hornoi [1]-67:25 & hundred-acre [2] -
\[
79: 16.80: 2
\] & 94:7, 134:6, 136:17, 274:19, 281.9 \\
\hline 58:3, 87:15, 160:10, & HOLLINGSHEAD [1] - & Hornoi-Centerwall \(\left.{ }^{1} 1\right]\) & \begin{tabular}{l}
79:16, 80:2 \\
hundreds [3]-84:13,
\end{tabular} & 274:19, 281:9 immediately [5] - \\
\hline 162:10, 168:2, & :14 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& -67: 25 \\
& \text { horrible }[1]-324: 16
\end{aligned}
\] & hundreds \([3]-84: 13\),
\[
165: 7,175: 14
\] & \[
\begin{gathered}
\text { immediately }[5] \text { - } \\
31 \cdot 18 \cdot 34 \cdot 16
\end{gathered}
\] \\
\hline 238:3, 280:24, & Hollingshode [1] - & & & \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline 136:12, 198:2, 295:9 & 68:17, 106:16, & 104:17, 151:16 & interest [1] - 155:6 & 103:17, 103:19, \\
\hline impact [14] - 76:20, & 181:21, 269:18, & infringe [1] - 308:5 & interesting [2] & 104:9, 112:3, 112:6, \\
\hline 112:8, 116:22, & 324:24 & ingress [4] - 109:21, & 335:23, 337: & \[
115: 20,118: 25
\] \\
\hline 123:15, 124:6, & incompatible [1] - & 109:24, 165:19, & internal [6] - 140:19, & 119:5, 120:20, \\
\hline 164:8, 164:15, & 322:3 & 308:19 & 265:14, 270:9 & 121:8, 139:20, \\
\hline 174:4, 185:18, & inconsistent [1] - & inherently [2] - & 291:23, 327:16, & 141:24, 146:23, \\
\hline 308:19, 308:21 & 164:16 & 201:17, 248:20 & 327:19 & 180:10, 198:1, \\
\hline 310:8, 317:19, & incorrect [1] - 102:22 & initial [4] - 163:17, & interpret [1] - 200:25 & 207:12, 207:19, \\
\hline 338:20 & increase [6]-22:22, & 168:12, 170:21, & intersection [11] - & 231:19, 232:24, \\
\hline impacted [2] - 93:2, & 112:12, 258:5, & \[
338: 18
\] & \[
71: 23,81: 3,88: 19,
\] & 236:6, 299:1 \\
\hline 93:4 & 301:4, 301:11 & initiate [1] - 260:12 & 92:7, 110:20, & it'd [1] - 112:12 \\
\hline impacting [1] - \(219: 9\) & 341:18 & initiated [2] - 7:15, & 110:21, 264:9, & ITE [1]-141:15 \\
\hline impacts [5] - 159:7, & increased [7]-59:6, & 309:22 & \[
278: 5,295: 1
\] & \[
\text { Item }[13]-50: 3,54: 1
\] \\
\hline 258:17, 287:2 & 87:4, 87:16, 103:5, & initiating [1] - 6:23 & 296:18, 305:11 & 54:24, 55:9, 55:11, \\
\hline 326:16, 326:24 & 104:13, 260:17, & input [3]-51:9, & Interstate [2] - 280:17, & 123:22, 136:18, \\
\hline impedes [1] - 93:18 & 332:13 & \[
127: 12,141: 7
\] & 285:22 & 137:11, 174:9, \\
\hline impervious [2] - 77:9, & increases [1] - 264:13 & inside [1] - 186:1 & interstate [6] - 128:20, & 183:20, 217:23, \\
\hline 164:18 & Independent [1] - & inspector [1] - \(240: 5\) & 328:15, 328:16, & 303:25 \\
\hline implemented [1] - & 270:21 & install [3] - 31:5, 31:6, & 328:20, 329:11, & items [13]-4:5, 4:15, \\
\hline 206:3 & independently [1] - & 31:10 & 332:16 & 4:17, 39:22, 54:2, \\
\hline important [10]-3:1, & 127:11 & installation [1] - 52:4 & intoxicating [1] - & 54:19, 56:18, \\
\hline \[
3: 9,11: 8,34: 1
\] & India [1] - 72:22 & instance [3]-24:13, & 203:4 & 125:18, 139:8, \\
\hline 57:10, 68:16, 73:12, & indicating [10] & \[
39: 8,284: 2
\] & introduce [2] - 76:15, & 159:17, 252:14, \\
\hline 160:4, 224:2, 327:25 & 14:25, 100:2 & instances [3]-16:11, & 77:8 & \[
305: 21,340: 17
\] \\
\hline importantly [2] - & \[
176: 18,176: 19
\] & 39:9, 39:12 & introduced [1] - & \[
\begin{gathered}
\text { itself [4] - 66:1, 93:21, } \\
178: 18.180: 21
\end{gathered}
\] \\
\hline \[
200: 23,328: 13
\] & \[
176: 20,252: 6
\] & Instead [8]-6:6, 9:24, & \[
338: 12
\] & 178:18, 180:21 \\
\hline imposed [1] - 169:4 & \[
252: 7,252: 8
\] & \[
39: 18,106: 19
\] & invest [1] - 22:24 & IV [3] - 140:16, 140:22 \\
\hline impossible [1]-69:4 & \[
256: 11,310: 21
\] & 126:22, 167:22, & invite [1]-105:14 & \\
\hline improve [1] - 150:13 & Indicating [1]-226:13 & \[
315: 1,326: 18
\] & Inviting [1] - 104:4 & J \\
\hline improvements [7] - & individual [4]-35:8, & institution [2] - & involved [3]-156:2, & \\
\hline \[
29: 15,52: 3,52: 8
\] & 109:10, 197:19, & \[
237: 11,241: 23
\] & \[
258: 15,310: 7
\] & \begin{tabular}{l}
JACKSONVILLE [1] - \\
1:1
\end{tabular} \\
\hline \[
52: 18,53: 6,64: 3
\] & \[
336: 14
\] & institutional [3] - & Iris [5]-213:11, & 1:1 \\
\hline \[
144: 6
\] & individuals [3] - & \[
46: 16,46: 22,92: 5
\] & 213:12, 214:8, & \begin{tabular}{l}
Jacksonville [43] - \\
1.8, 2.5, 24.25, 33.2
\end{tabular} \\
\hline improving [1] - 164:7 & 151:2, 153:24, 198:5 & institutions [1] - 68:23 & \[
214: 13,214: 17
\] & 1:8, 2:5, 24:25, 33:2, 33:24, \(35: 15,38: 18\), \\
\hline inappropriate [1] - & indoor [1] - 57:6 & Instructed [2] - 124:3, & ironic [1] - 252:24 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 33: 24,35: 15,38: 18 \\
& 60: 14,65: 7,75: 20
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline \[
233: 7
\] & indulgence [1] - & \[
289: 16
\] & Island [1]-314:18 & \[
82: 18,88: 8,91: 3
\] \\
\hline inaudible [15] - 98:13, & \[
320: 13
\] & Instructions [1] - & \[
\text { issue }[37]-17: 7 \text {, }
\] & 82:18, 88:8, 91:3,
108:24, 108:25, \\
\hline \[
98: 20,104: 20
\] & industrial [3]-38:23, & \[
198: 19
\] & 19:11, 41:12, 85:21, & 143:20, 148:15, \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 131: 24,182: 23, \\
& 187: 5,187: 15,
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 253:21, 301:6 } \\
& \text { Industrial [1]-253:12 }
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{gathered}
\text { insult }[3]-233: 2, \\
234: 2,234: 4
\end{gathered}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 100:6, 109:22, } \\
& \text { 112:2, 141:1, }
\end{aligned}
\] & 171:6, 172:7. \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 187: 5,187: 15 \\
& 216: 7,278: 22
\end{aligned}
\] & Industrial [1] - 253:12 infill [13]-32:11, & \[
234: 2,234: 4
\] & 112:2, 141:1, & 173:16, 173:17, \\
\hline 279:3, 289:22 & 32:16, 35:3, 35:8 & \[
233: 24
\] & \[
147: 7,148: 22
\] & 181:4, 181:8, \\
\hline 308:2, 310:16, & 36:9, 38:9, 40:10, & insurance [ 1 ]-251:8 & 164:20, 179:10. & 181:12, 188:5, \\
\hline \[
314: 16,341: 25
\] & 41:14, 265:18, & Intangible [1] - 83:24 & 181:3, 181:4, 207:2, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 192:1, 193:13, } \\
& \text { 200:8, 204:12, }
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { inaudible) [2] - 131:4, } \\
& 254: 12
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 295: 9,295: 23 \\
& 305: 25,328: 9
\end{aligned}
\] & integrity [1] - 322:24 & 208:24, 215:12, & 211:6, 213:20, \\
\hline incident [ 1 ] - \(123: 18\) & infinite [1]-97:9 & tended [1] - 156: & 223:9, 224:2, & 222:2, 222:15, \\
\hline inclined [1] - \(303: 9\) & influencing [1] - & Intends [1] - 54:5 & 224:13, 224:14, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 223:10, 225:9, } \\
& \text { 240:22, 242:10, }
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline include [9]-46:11, & 142:16 & intense [2]-222:1, & 225:5, 225:6, 236:3 & \[
254: 5,278: 14
\] \\
\hline 117:12, 141:10, & Influx [1] - 104:19 & \[
244: 16
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 236: 5,237: 22, \\
& 241: 3,241: 4
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
306: 24,313: 18
\] \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 156: 8,157: 12 \\
& 158: 9,161: 12
\end{aligned}
\] & ```
info [3] - 169:5, 300:1,
    300:8
``` & intensities [1] - 265:2 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 241: 3,241: 4 \\
& 258: 17,300: 3
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
329: 3,333: 13
\] \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 158: 9,161: 12, \\
& 274: 19,291: 6
\end{aligned}
\] & 300:8 & intensity [5] - 25:4, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 258: 17,300: 3 \\
& 331: 25
\end{aligned}
\] & Jacksonville's [4] - \\
\hline included [3]-52:19, & & \(46: 5,175: 21\),
\(244 \cdot 14,244.2\) & issued [4] - 168:1, & 188:10, 188:13, \\
\hline \[
78: 24,224: 16
\] & 17:9, 64:17, 116:14, & & 181:9, 223:10, \(240: 9\) & 189:5, 309:14 \\
\hline includes [7] -79:17, & 134:5, 145:20, & & issues [34] - 17:2, & January [2] - 153:15, \\
\hline 141:11, 147:24, & 209:22, 309:11 & & 23:2, 33:12, 51:10, & 200:22 \\
\hline 147:25, 148:1, & informed [3] - 48:25, & 122: & 51:14, 72:18, 74:1, & jargon [1] - 200:24 \\
\hline 222:15 & 49:3, 164:3 & & 77:1, 77:6, 79:1, & jasmine [1] - 83:7 \\
\hline including [6]-51:20, & infrastructure [2] - & 274:12, 275:8 & 84:16, 103:15, & JASON [1] - 1:16 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline Jax [1] - 258:24 & Jr [1] - 269:1 & kids [19] - 62:20, & Kristen [1] - 275:20 & landscaping [4]- \\
\hline JAX [2]-271:2, & JSO [4]-123:21, & 64:24, 67:11, 83:20, & KRISTEN [1] - 1:20 & 24:24, 29:18, 59:6, \\
\hline 272:11 & 143:20, 153:18, & 88:25, 98:4, 98:7 & KV [1] - 80:5 & 332:13 \\
\hline JEA [2] - 80:5, 98:22 & 243:4 & 112:22, & & Lane [5] - 193:13, \\
\hline Jeff [1] - 261:12 & JU [2] - 29:14, 30:6 & 126:19, 126:21, & L & 297:17, 297:19, \\
\hline jeopardize [1] - 84:18 & judge [2] - 153:23, & 10, 146:14, & & 321:24 \\
\hline Jeremy [3] - 48:12, & \[
243: 23
\] & 146:15, 172:16, & lack [4]-104:18, & lane [15]-52:7, 66:2, \\
\hline \[
139: 18,139: 25
\] & judged [1] - 243:20 & 192:15, 212:13 & 201:20, 201:21, & 79:2, 83:5, 128:14, \\
\hline Jesus [1]-186:5 & judgment [2] - 241:3, & kill [1] - 208:12 & 201:2 & 143:9, 144:7, \\
\hline Jimmy [4]-73:17, & 243:24 & kilted [1] - 208:18 & ladies [1]-87:20 & 158:14, 312:5, \\
\hline 75:9, 75:13, 75:15 & Judicial [1] - 202:12 & KILLINGSWORTH [2] & lady [8] - 93:9, 98:15, & 318:3, 320:2, \\
\hline JJ [1] - 231:22 & judicial [1] - 3:19 & - 341:1, 341:10 & 211:18, 222:16, & 324:10, 324:13, \\
\hline JJ's [3] - 227:21, & Julington [1] - 127:5 & Killingsworth [4] - & 223:4, 224:4, & 337:20, 337:21 \\
\hline 228:7, 231:11 & jump [3] - 131:13, & 276:10, 340:14, & 243:13, 317:5 & lanes [1] - 83:12 \\
\hline job [16] - 11:6, 11:12, & 331:8, 339:20 & 340:23, 341:2 & Lake [5] - 116:10, & language [1] - 183:22 \\
\hline 11:23, 23:20, 25:18, & jumping [2] - 67:11, & \(\operatorname{Kim}[2]\) - 196:14, & \[
313: 24,319: 13
\] & large [ 8 - 61:3, 77:1, \\
\hline 85:19, 124:22, & 276:14 & 196:24 & \[
319: 15,319: 16
\] & 108:9, 109:7, \\
\hline 154:2, 169:15, & jurisdictions [1]- & \[
\text { kind }[24]-17: 2,18: 9
\] & Lakes [2] - 136:1, & 237:15, 261:2, \\
\hline 248:3, 262:20, & 243:9 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 23: 5,24: 20,33: 8 \\
& 35 \cdot 11,40 \cdot 20
\end{aligned}
\] & 136:3 & 331:13, 332:7 \\
\hline 280:11, 329:2, 329:4 & justified [1] - 97:14 & 36:11, 49:22, 65:3, & Lancashire [1] - 211:6 & \[
\text { Large }[1]-1: 10
\] \\
\hline jobs [2] - 61:6, 272:20 & justify [2] - 66:20, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 66: 9,72: 11,72: 20 \\
& 128: 18,139: 22,
\end{aligned}
\] & land [58]-3:24, 35:14, 35:20, 65:9, 72:24 & largely [4] - 19:23, \(68: 6,128: 17,129\) \\
\hline Joe's [1] - 78:25 & 66:21 &  & & \\
\hline John [7]-92:21, 96:9, & juxtaposed [2] 224.21, \(240 \cdot 18\) & 234:16, 247:5 & 101:17, 107:5, & \[
50: 1,59: 16,148
\] \\
\hline \[
185: 13,185: 16
\] & & 83:9, 283:23, & 112:9, 112:11 & \[
255: 22,255: 24
\] \\
\hline 318:7 & K & 96:8, 296:15, & 140:5, 154:3, 175:3, & 301:9 \\
\hline John's [1] - 27:15 & & 29:4, 335:24, & 181:18, 181:19, & Larry [11] - 182:10, \\
\hline John-Pierre [3] - & K-12 [3]-137:18, & \(340: 18\)
kindly [1]-124:17 & 197:3, 197:7, & 185:14, 186:17 \\
\hline 92:21, 96:9, 96:14 & 167:15, 167:21 & kindly [1] - 124:17 & 211:24, 212:8, & 210:19, 210:20, \\
\hline Johnny [2] - 318:19, & \[
K-8[5]-137: 13
\] & kinds [1] - 148:2 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 226: 3,237: 16 \\
& 239: 7,239: 8
\end{aligned}
\] & 210:21, 210:22, \\
\hline 319:1 & 137:15, 137:16, & King [4]-199:4, & \[
239: 7,239: 8
\] & \[
211: 5,319: 8,320: 22
\] \\
\hline Johns [11]-64:25, & 167:12, 167:22 & 269:1, 277:15, 280:9 & 264:11, 264:13, & last [61] - 15:12, 18:7, \\
\hline \[
65: 6,97: 8,104: 8
\] & \[
\begin{gathered}
\text { K-through-8 [2] - } \\
\text { 147:1, 147:5 }
\end{gathered}
\] & King/Soutel [1] -
188:22 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 264: 20,265: 8 \\
& 265: 11,269: 3
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 30: 15,36: 13,43: 12 \\
& 43: 17,52: 21,62: 14
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 104: 12,104: 15 \\
& 104: 22,170: 5
\end{aligned}
\] & 147:1,
Karen [3] - 26:18, & Kings [4] - 184:9, & 274:13, 274:18, & \[
62: 15,63: 2,64: 2
\] \\
\hline 170:7, 242:7, \(254: 5\) & 27:3, 81:18 & \[
211: 10,217: 25
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 274: 20,275: 3, \\
& 278 \cdot 8,280 \cdot 17
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
64: 8,64: 13,71: 1
\] \\
\hline JOHNSTON [9] - 1:21, & Karp [1] - 285:21 & 223:24 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 278: 8,280: 17 \\
& 281: 8,281: 20
\end{aligned}
\] & 74:10, 82:8, 94:10, \\
\hline 53:18, 53:24, 54:3, & Kaufman [5] - 121:23, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { kitchens [2] - 283:18, } \\
& \text { 283:19 }
\end{aligned}
\] & 283:11, 285:23, & 96:25, 98:24, 100:24, 106:5, \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 54: 11,157: 2,157: 7, \\
& 157: 17,278: 22
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 128: 3,128: 5 \\
& 128: 10,129: 2
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\text { Klotz }[9]-53: 1
\] & \[
287: 11,291: 3
\] & 107:14, 120:3, \\
\hline join [1] - 2:9 & Keba [4] - 196:17 & 59:24, 60:2, 60:13, & 291:9, 291:10, & \[
120: 4,135: 24
\] \\
\hline Joined [1] - 290:6 & 198:23, 200:3, 200:7 & 62:23, 144:24, & \[
97: 18,297: 20
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 135: 25,137: 11, \\
& 149: 4,149: 6,
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline joke [1] - 113:14 & keep [12] -6:14, & 171:14, 171:15 & \[
297: 25,304: 11
\] &  \\
\hline Jonas [4] - 210:22, & 83:16, 95:20, &  & 304:15, 312:13, & \[
169: 2,178: 19
\] \\
\hline 210:23, 213:10, & 118:17, 119:20, & \[
\begin{gathered}
\text { KLOTZ [7] - 60:16 } \\
172: 4,172: 8
\end{gathered}
\] & 335:2, 335:8 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 169: 2,178: 19 \\
& 180: 6,180: 12
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline 213:18 & 177:3, 192:15, & 172:4, 172:8, & Land [2]-4:1, 14:2 & 188:12, 198:14, \\
\hline JORDAN [1] - 1:16 & \(278: 15,322: 17\),
\(322: 19,323: 18\), & \[
173: 5,173: 14
\] & landlord [6]-197:22, & 200:21, 204:13, \\
\hline Jordan [1] - 153:14 & 322:19, 323:18, 326:13 & Kmart [1] - 97:5 & 197:23, 243:11, & 218:4, 227:17, \\
\hline Jose [4] - 81:6, 97:5, & 326:13
Kelly [3]-128:7 & knocking [1] - 155:12 & \[
243: 12,243: 16
\] & 229:6, 233:10, \\
\hline 117:10, 128:20 & Kelly [3] - 128:7 \(129 \cdot 22 \quad 130 \cdot 1\) & \begin{tabular}{l}
knocking [1]-155:12 \\
knoll [3] - 180:24
\end{tabular} & \[
243: 20
\] & 234:10, 237:6, \\
\hline Joseph [12]-78:15, & 129:22, 130:1 & \[
205: 8,205: 9
\] & landowners [1] - & \[
240: 15,243: 13
\] \\
\hline 95:13, 99:23,
\(105: 20,108 \cdot 19\) & kept (6]-3:2, 3:14 6:8, 98:25, 101:2 & knowing [1] - 158:1 & \[
150: 11
\] & 244:10, 247:17, \\
\hline 105:20, 108:19, 111:17, 111:24, & \[
314: 4
\] & known [6] - 22:15, & lands [2] - 181:21, & 250:3, 285:24, \\
\hline 114:3, 116:4, & Key [1]-278:3 & 98:12, 114:17, & 239:10 & 288:5, 288:7, \\
\hline 118:12, 119:10, & \[
\text { key }[1]-56: 18
\] & 114:22, 196:1, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Iandscape }[9]-24: 4, \\
& 24: 5,107: 23,
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 303: 25,314: 6, \\
& 324: 4,324: 18
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline 119:16 & kick [4]-109:11 & 201:12 & \begin{tabular}{l}
24:5, 107:23, \\
156:10, 157:3,
\end{tabular} & \[
325: 6,328: 23
\] \\
\hline Joseph's [4]-45:14, & kid [2] - 65:2, 170:13 & knows [2] - 158:13, & 157:19, 158:1, & \[
340: 14
\] \\
\hline \[
46: 19,117: 9,118: 15
\] & kidding [2] - 259:11, & Kohl's [1]-89:25 & \[
169: 3,176: 5
\] & lastly [2]-201:9, \\
\hline
\end{tabular}






\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline 49:21, 54:21, 55:2, & 288:11, 289:15, & 213:5, 217:23, & 205:24, 218:3, & 167:20 \\
\hline 55:5, 56:20, 59:23, & 297:7, 301:22, & 219:22, 220:6, & 265:7, 270:2, & overwhelming [3] - \\
\hline 60:18, 61:12, 61:21, & 303:10, 304:19, & 310:24, 311:21, & 274:24, 291:20, & 60:24, 75:1, 322:9 \\
\hline 62:14, 64:11, 64:15, & 304:23, 309:7 & 318:13, 318:14, & 300:25, 310:25, & own [15] - 11:8, 83:14, \\
\hline 68:12, 78:16, 79:11, & 310:3, 310:14 & 318:23, 318:24, & 314:6, 319:15, 320:7 & 86:22, 120:20, \\
\hline 79:22, 85:15, 85:24, & 317:12, 321:13, & 319:1 & Ordinance [9]-6:20, & 127:9, 150:9, \\
\hline 87:9, 87:18, 90:6, & 323:13, 324:10, & opposed [ 9 - 14:24, & 8:6, 22:9, 30:18, & 151:17, 159:15, \\
\hline 90:16, 93:23, 94:7, & 327:10, 327:11, & 15:3, 22:1, 30:12 & 202:7, 294:24, & 198:11, 240:24, \\
\hline 94:18, 103:1, & 329:25, 331:12, & 42:4, 176:17, 207:3, & 307:23, 307:25, & 241:1, 297:18, \\
\hline 107:17, 109:24, & 336:8, 336:17 & 211:8, 237:10 & 308:22 & 297:25, 322:14 \\
\hline 113:5, 120:19, & 336:18, 338:10, & opposes [2]-318:18, & ordlnances [8]-5:13, & owned [4] - 86:17, \\
\hline 127:7, 127:8, 129:4, & 339:19 & 319:1 & 5:15, 6:17, 42:8, & 150:10, 214:23, \\
\hline 129:17, 131:3, & one's [1] - 230:7 & opposing [4]-120:1, & 195:13, 195:15, & 269:12 \\
\hline 131:22, 136:18, & one-minute [1] - & 197:4, 248:2 & 200:13, 203:3 & owner [19] - 16:19, \\
\hline 137:11, 140:21, & 271:25 & opposite [3] - 74:24, & ordinary [2]-21:13, & 17:12, 21:16, 31:8, \\
\hline 142:11, 144:22, & one-sided [1] - 87:18 & 152:7, 337:5 & 271:2 & 35:1, 35:11, 61:7, \\
\hline 146:24, 153:17, & onerous [3] - 18:19, & opposition [49] - & organization [1] - & 87:13, 154:3, 205:7, \\
\hline 153:24, 158:7, & 19:10, 37:20 & 42:13, 42:16, & 197:7 & 206:24, 207:13, \\
\hline 158:14, 158:20, & ones [4]-11:4, 20:7, & 118:25, 186:3, & originally [2] - 301:9, & 208:12, 208:13, \\
\hline 158:22, 160:6, & \[
203: 14,253: 18
\] & 186:20, 186:24, & 316:21 & \[
209: 4,250: 25
\] \\
\hline 164:23, 167:10, & online [1]-97:23 & 187:1, 187:8, & Orlando [3] - 56:15, & 255:23, 336:17, \\
\hline 173:6, 174:22, & open [14]-57:14, & 187:12, 187:17 & 171:7, 209:10 & 336:18 \\
\hline 177:4, 178:6, 179:6, & \[
58: 9,61: 13,61: 17
\] & \[
191: 12,194: 8
\] & otherwise [4]-53:20, & owner's [2]-201:21, \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 179:15, 180:1, } \\
& \text { 180:12, 180:18, }
\end{aligned}
\] & 161:6, 171:20, & \[
210: 18,216: 2
\] & \[
158: 17,249: 7
\] & 204:25 \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 180: 12,180: 18, \\
& 182: 21,183: 20,
\end{aligned}
\] & \(186: 2,222: 21\),
226.4, & 216:21, 217:1, & 259:20 & owner-occupled [1] 617 \\
\hline 184:23, 192:10, & \[
248: 16,278: 11
\] & \[
220: 10,220: 18
\] & \[
215: 16
\] & owners [7]-16:15, \\
\hline 194:25, 195:9, & openings [1] - 109:17 & 46:18, 249:10, & out-of-control [1] - & 16:24, 17:5, 27:11, \\
\hline 195:10, 199:13, & operate [ 1 - \(237: 24\) & 249:23, 252:4 & 104:17 & 28:24, 220:25, \\
\hline 199:16, 199:21, & operated [2]-269:12, & 252:5, 252:11, & outdated [1]-200:23 & 336:14 \\
\hline 200:11, 202:23, & \[
272: 4
\] & \[
259: 8,277: 21
\] & outfall [1] - 77:4 & ownership [4]-16:17, \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 205: 15,206: 19 \\
& 206 \cdot 25 \\
& 207 \cdot 4
\end{aligned}
\] & operates [2] - 244:14, & 297:7, 298:19 & outlet [4] - 317:12, & \[
20: 3,82: 23,181: 14
\] \\
\hline 206:25, 207:4, & 337:25 & 306:17, 307:16 & 317:14, 334:17, & owns [3] - 197:12, \\
\hline 211:11, 213:23, & operating [4] - 52:1, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 307: 18,311: 6 \\
& 311: 10,315: 18
\end{aligned}
\] & 334:22 & 201:11, 243:23 \\
\hline 214:3, 215:12 & 201:16, 230:9, 231:1
operation [1] - 272:19 & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 311: 10,315: 18 \\
& 315: 22,316: 1
\end{aligned}
\] & outline [1] - 49:22 & \\
\hline \[
217: 10,219: 24
\] & operation [1]-272:19 operator [1] - 162:1 & 316:12, 316:19, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { outpouring [1]- } \\
& 335: 25
\end{aligned}
\] & \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 223: 12,225: 9 \\
& 225: 10,225: 11
\end{aligned}
\] & opined [1] - 202:12 & \[
318: 11,320: 6
\] & outside [4]-186:1, & \[
\text { p.m }[4]-1: 7,2: 1,4: 11,
\] \\
\hline \[
228: 25,229: 6
\] & opinion [14]-12:1, & \[
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 20:21, 320:25, } \\
& 21: 2,321: 3,321: 8,
\end{aligned}
\] & \[
205: 10,212: 2
\] & \begin{tabular}{l}
342:4 \\
Pack [6] - 90:20
\end{tabular} \\
\hline 229:18, 229:19, & 74:7, 74:22, 174:13, &  & 222:21 & \[
92: 2
\] \\
\hline 230:3, 230:4, & 175:19, 181:9, 181:11, 181:13 & option [2]-161:16, & over-capacity [1]
\[
173: 8
\] & 99:17, 99:23 \\
\hline 230:25, 231:12, & \[
239: 2,239: 17
\] & 334:5 & overall [1] - 74:5 & pack [2] - 99:8, 101:24 \\
\hline 231:16, 232:2, & \[
240: 9,249: 14
\] & options [6]-61:4, & overbearing [1] - 17:7 & PACK [5] - 95:17, \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 235: 9,236: 11, \\
& 238: 13.238: 19
\end{aligned}
\] & 250:2, 314:3 & \[
61: 10,74: 5,272: 8
\] & overburdened [1] - & \[
95: 24,96: 7,99: 19
\] \\
\hline \[
238: 23,240: 16
\] & opinions [2]-165:13, & 281:10, 286:16 & 121:3 & 99:22 \\
\hline \[
241: 18,242: 8
\] & 314:8 & oral [1] - 202:20 & overflow [2] - 105:13, & package [26] - 6:18, \\
\hline 243:18, 244:12 & opportunities [2] - & orange [1] - 230 & 218:13 & 8:12, 8:13, 9:19, \\
\hline 246:2, 246:19, & 76:13, 124:24 & 65:6, 185 & overflows [1] - 99:1 & \[
42: 14.177: 25
\] \\
\hline 247:18, 252:2, & \begin{tabular}{l}
opportunity [11] - \\
6.11, 39.5, 73:13
\end{tabular} & order [11] - 4:16, 4:18, & overhead [1] - 251:8 & \[
184: 21,185: 24
\] \\
\hline 252:23, 253:19, & \[
75: 19,85: 20
\] & \[
5: 11,5: 16,27: 21
\] & overlay [10]-22:11, & 186:9, 193:18, \\
\hline 257:13, 260:3, & 122:12, 193:7, & \[
32: 20,45: 8,168: 1,
\] & \[
5: 17,27: 5,27: 9
\] & 197:6, 201:17, \\
\hline 269:9, 270:11, & 249:21, 282:13, & \[
231: 7,303: 2,311: 4
\] & \[
27: 17,29: 13
\] & 201:19, 206:18, \\
\hline 271:24, 271:25, & \[
297: 8,298: 24
\] & ordinance [25] - 8:8, & overlooke & 207:17, 219:15, \\
\hline 273:15, 275:11, & oppose [21] - 74:1, & \[
9: 12,11: 3,11: 20
\] & \[
258: 10
\] & 219:17, 222:3, \\
\hline 276:8, 276:24, & \[
88: 10,91: 2,188: 11
\] & 11:21, 11:25, 24:2, & overnight [1]-167:18 & 222:8, 223:22, \\
\hline 278:2, 278:14, & 190:23, 191:4, & \[
32: 9,40: 17,183: 11,
\] & overnight [1] - 167:18 & 224:7, 229:11, \\
\hline 281:23, 282:9, & 190:23, 191:4,
191:5, 193:19, & 184:2, 184:10, & oversaturation [2] - & \[
229: 12
\] \\
\hline \[
284: 7,285: 4,286: 4
\] & 191:5, 193:19, & 188:15, 195:4 & 117:3, 138: & \\
\hline 287:4, 287:15 & 200:10, 207:20, & 188:15, 195:4, & oversight [2] - 167:14, & packet [4]-60:17, \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

















\title{
Duval County, City Of Jacksonville \\ Jim Overton, Tax Collector \\ 231 E. Forsyth Street \\ Jacksonville, FL 32202
}

\section*{General Collection Receipt}

Account No: CR635224
Date: 5/12/2022
User: Smith, Bernadette
Generic CR
Name: Legislative Services Division
Address: 117 W. Duval Street, Suite 430, Jacksonville, FL 32202
Description: Received check in the Amount of \$1,784.00 (\#1213) for Appeal WLD-22-13 from Cobb \& Gonzalez, P.A.
\begin{tabular}{c|c|c|c|c|c|c|c|l|} 
Fund & Center & Account & Project & Activity & Interfund & Future & Debit Amount & Credit Amount \\
\hline 00111 & 000000 & 104001 & 000000 & 0000000 & 0000 & 0000000 & 1784.00 & 0.00 \\
00111 & 221001 & 369050 & 000000 & 0000000 & 00000 & 0000000 & 0.00 & 1784.00
\end{tabular}


Total Due: \(\mathbf{\$ 1 , 7 8 4 . 0 0}\)

> Jim Overton, Tax Collector
> General Collections Receipt
> City of Jacksonville, Duval County

Account No: CR635224
Generic CR

Date: 5/12/2022
Name: Legislative Services Division
Address: 117 W. Duval Street, Suite 430, Jacksonville, FL 32202
Description: Received check in the Amount of \(\$ 1,784.00\) ( \(\# 1213\) ) for Appeal WLD-22-13 from Cobb \& Gonzalez, P.A.

Total Due: \(\mathbf{\$ 1 , 7 8 4 . 0 0}\)

On File


Cobb \& Gonzalez, P.A.

5/12/2022
Duval County Tax Collectors Office
\begin{tabular}{llllc} 
Date & Type & Payee & Description & Payment \\
\(5 / 12 / 2022\) & Check & Duval County Tax Collectors & Appeal Filing Fee 0629.000 & \(1,784.00\)
\end{tabular}

IOTA

Cobb \& Gonzalez, P.A.

\section*{\(\cdot\),}
```


[^0]:    

[^1]:    
    PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \longrightarrow$

[^2]:    SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER

    SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
    PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad \longrightarrow$

[^3]:    SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
    PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\quad$

[^4]:    SPEAKING TIME IS LIMITED TO THREE (3) MINUTES PER SPEAKER
    PLEASE READ THE RULES ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS CARD $\Longrightarrow$

