City of Jacksonville Landmark Designation Report

1217 Walnut Street

LM-23-02 May 24, 2023



Application Prepared By:

Historic Preservation Section
Planning and Development Department
214 North Hogan Street, Suite 300
Jacksonville, FL 32202

Property Owner:

Artemis Management Company 3781 San Jose Place, Suite 30 Jacksonville, Florida 32257

TABLE OF CONTENTS

l.	Planning and Development Department – Findings, Conclusions, and Recommendation
II.	Legal Description and Location Map
III.	Proof of Public Notice
IV.	List of Property Owners Located within 350 Feet of the Proposed Landmark
V.	Photographs and Images

I. Planning and Development Department – Findings, Conclusions, and Recommendation

REPORT OF THE PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT APPLICATION FOR DESIGNATION AS A CITY OF JACKSONVILLE LANDMARK

LM-23-02 1217 Walnut Street Jacksonville, Florida 32206

GENERAL LOCATION: East side of Walnut Street, between 2nd Street East and 3rd Street East in the Springfield Historic District

Prepared in accordance with the JACKSONVILLE ORDINANCE CODE, SECTION 307.104, the Jacksonville Planning and Development Department hereby forwards to the Jacksonville Historic Preservation Commission, its "Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations" on the Landmark Designation, <u>LM-23-02</u>, sponsored by the Jacksonville Historic Preservation Commission. The owner of the property is:

Artemis Management Company 3781 San Jose Place, Suite 30 Jacksonville, Florida 32257

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

- (A) Consistent with the JACKSONVILLE ORDINANCE CODE, SECTION 307.104(d), the Planning and Development Department determined that the application for designation of the property at 1217 Walnut Street as a Landmark was complete.
- (B) As required, the Planning and Development Department had signs posted in front of the property being considered for designation, as well as sent notices by U.S. Mail to each owner of real property within three hundred and fifty (350) feet of the proposed landmark. Notice of the public hearing on the designation of the property at 1217 Walnut Street as a Landmark was published in the *Financial News and Daily Report*. Proof of publication is attached to this report.
- (C) Once designated, any activity affecting the exterior of the building and site of the proposed landmark at 1217 Walnut Street will require a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA). All proposed work will be reviewed for consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings. The review of most routine work scopes including repairs, maintenance, alterations of previously altered features, small additions and size-limited new construction that would not impact significant historic elements or would not be readily street visible can be processed by the Historic Preservation Section (HPS) of the Jacksonville Planning and Development Department, but certain

activities like alterations, additions, new construction, relocation and demolition that would be visible from the public right-of way, as well as any work the HPS determines to be potentially in conflict with the *Secretary of the Interior Standards*, will require review by the Jacksonville Historic Preservation Commission.

The purpose of the historic designation of this site is to provide protection to the residential structure at 1217 Walnut Street and not to discourage or prohibit the future development of the site. The review of work through the COA process is to preserve the historic character, architectural features and materials of this significant structure, as well as, to ensure any future development of the site is compatible with and sensitive to this primary historic resource.

(D) In preparing the application, the Planning and Development Department has found the application to meet three of the seven criteria. The three criteria include the following;

A. Its value as a significant reminder of the cultural, historical, architectural, or archaeological heritage of the City, state or nation.

Springfield is one of the oldest subdivisions in the City of Jacksonville and contains a large collection of historic residential buildings with a wide variety of architectural styles. The Springfield Subdivision was platted in 1882 by the Springfield Company and was incorporated into the City of Jacksonville in 1887. The neighborhood expanded in 1909 with the development of the North Springfield and New Springfield subdivisions. It wasn't until 1987 that the Springfield Historic District was listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The City of Jacksonville designated Springfield as a City of Jacksonville Historic District in 1992.

There are over 1,800 contributing buildings in Springfield. These buildings were constructed between 1880 and 1940, and include varying architectural styles that were popular between the 1880s and the 1930s. Springfield contains 1,890 structures built before 1940 and only 12 structures in the entire District reflect the Dutch Colonial Revival architectural style. 1217 Walnut Street is one of the remaining few Dutch Colonial Revival style buildings in the District. This building, along with the two-story building at 1215 Walnut Street, are the only examples of this style on the block.

The Colonial Revival style was used by architects between the 1880s and 1940s. This was a period where America was interested in its own history and the accomplishments of the country's forefathers, which was sparked by the Philadelphia Centennial of 1876 exhibition celebrating the 100th anniversary of America's independence¹. The architectural style of 1217 Walnut Street is identified as Dutch Colonial Revival based on the distinguished principal subtype of gambrel roof². The structure's character-defining features are the front-facing gambrel roof with a cross gambrel, an almost full second-story floor space, and a full-width porch under the main roof line with columns. It is considered an eclectic home because it was built around

¹ Article titled, "Colonial Revival Style 1880s - 1940s." National Park Service. 2019. https://www.nps.gov/articles/colonial-revival-architecture.htm

² A Field Guide to American Houses by Virginia & Lee McAlester. 1986. Page 322.

1908 within the Eclectic movement and it mimics the architectural traditions of structures from the New World colonies³. The Dutch Colonial Revival style of 1217 Walnut Street, along with that of neighboring property 1215 Walnut Street to the south, stand appropriately in Springfield. This block of Walnut Street contains a mixture of Dutch Colonial Revival, Queen Anne, and Frame Vernacular home styles. These architectural varieties found on this block, and other architectural varieties found throughout other blocks of Springfield, are character-defining styles of the District. Architectural styles that are noticeably different from adjacent and neighboring structures are the basis of the Eclectic movement in the history of architecture⁴.

The first documented homeowner of 1217 Walnut Street was Jacob Croissant in 1908⁵. He was married to Jennie Croissant and he worked at a wholesale meats business located at 17-21 South Ocean Street. Originally, the structure was constructed as a one-and-a-half story single-family dwelling with a rear detached stable located towards the eastern property line⁶. Its original assigned address was 1417 Walnut Street, and it was situated on the northern-half of Lot 2, Block 90. Another separate one-and-a-half story single-family dwelling, with an original assigned address of 1415 Walnut Street, was built on the southern-half of this parcel. The parcel abuts an "H" patterned alley along the rear property line, which are commonly found throughout Springfield. The 1913-May 1951 Sanborn Map shows both the original addresses (1415 Walnut Street and 1417 Walnut Street) and the present addresses (1215 Walnut Street and 1217 Walnut Street) located at this parcel⁷. The whole parcel was split into two separate parcels presumably after 1951, and each dwelling retained its present address on each property.

B. Its location is the site of a significant local, state or national event.

It is the determination of the Planning and Development Department that the subject property at 1217 Walnut Street does not meet this landmark criterion.

C. It is identified with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the development of the City, state or nation.

It is the determination of the Planning and Development Department that the subject property at 1217 Walnut Street does not meet this landmark criterion.

D. It is identified as the work of a master builder, designer, or architect whose individual work has influenced the development of the City, state or nation.

It is the determination of the Planning and Development Department that the subject property at 1217 Walnut Street does not meet this landmark criterion.

E. Its value as a building is recognized for the quality of its architecture, and it retains sufficient elements showing its architectural significance.

³ A Field Guide to American Houses by Virginia & Lee McAlester. 1986. Page 319.

⁴ A Field Guide to American Houses by Virginia & Lee McAlester. 1986. Page 319.

⁵ City Directory Archives. Jacksonville Public Library, Main Library. 2023.

⁶ 1913 Sanborn Map. Jacksonville Public Library, Main Library. 2023.

⁷ 1913-May 1951 Sanborn Map. Jacksonville Public Library, Main Library. 2023.

The building at 1217 Walnut Street has not been significantly altered and still has most of its original character-defining features such as its front-facing gambrel roof with a cross gambrel, a second-story floor space, and a full-width porch under the main roof line with columns. The Colonial Revival style period between the 1880s and 1940s was a time where buildings were designed with the idea that the original colonial era style should be apparent but not imitated exactly⁸. It is evident that 1217 Walnut Street was designed in the Colonial Revival style period because it does not exactly imitate original colonial era buildings. Original Dutch Colonial buildings only contained gable-front gambrel roof forms and 1217 Walnut Street contains a front-facing gambrel roof with a cross gambrel, which is an architectural element that is only found in the Dutch Colonial Revival architecture style⁹. Additionally, Dutch Colonial Revival style structures with a gable-front gambrel roof are not as prevalent compared to the typical eaves-front gambrel roof forms during this period¹⁰. Out of all American houses that are considered Colonial Revival, only 10% have gambrel roofs¹¹. 1217 Walnut Street is considered a valuable building because its unique and original character-defining features are still intact. It retains sufficient elements of the Dutch Colonial Revival architectural style and therefore, it is considered architecturally significant.

F. It has distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials.

It is the determination of the Planning and Development Department that the subject property at 1217 Walnut Street does not meet this landmark criterion.

G. Its suitability for preservation or restoration.

In utilizing this criterion, it has been the practice of the Planning and Development Department to evaluate proposed landmarks based on evidence of significant exterior alterations that have negatively impacted character-defining features, as well as represent alterations difficult, costly, or impossible to reverse. Further, the degree and nature of any exterior deterioration, as well as the evidence of long term and potentially ongoing neglect are also a factor in evaluating potential landmarks for their suitability for preservation or restoration. Not having any evidence of significant exterior deterioration, the structure has been well maintained over the years. There are no records on file for any major alterations that have occurred to the original building. The only alterations on file for the building include electrical and plumbing work.

The owner has future plans to make alterations to the structure. COA-22-28466 was administratively approved for exterior alterations. This includes wholesale window replacement of 22 wood windows that are deemed irreparable or shattered. The new windows will be vinyl windows. The applicant will also be replacing just over half of the wood siding due to wood rot

https://glcp.uvm.edu/landscape new/dating/residential architecture/dutch.php

⁸ Article titled, "Colonial Revival Style 1880s - 1940s." National Park Service. 2019. https://www.nps.gov/articles/colonial-revival-architecture.htm

⁹ A Field Guide to American Houses by Virginia & Lee McAlester. 1986. Page 323.

 $^{^{\}rm 10}$ Article titled, "Dutch Revival." University of Vermont. 2011.

¹¹ A Field Guide to American Houses by Virginia & Lee McAlester. 1986. Page 322.

and termite damage. The new wood siding will match the existing siding dimensions. Lastly, the two non-functioning chimneys on the roof will be removed.

COA-23-29108 was administratively approved for replacing the existing silver metal shingled roof with new grey architectural shingles. The owner intends to make this alteration in the future.

Recently, the owner has submitted a new Certificate of Appropriateness application for a rear addition and for window rearrangement on the right and rear second floor elevations.

Once the administratively approved alterations are completed, 1217 Walnut Street will continue to remain as a recognizable Dutch Colonial Revival residence. This 115-year-old building is a significant physical feature of the Springfield Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

In reviewing the application, the Planning and Development Department has found the application to meet three of the seven criteria. Based on the findings of this report, the Jacksonville Planning and Development Department recommends that the Jacksonville Historic Preservation Commission <u>APPROVE</u> the designation of 1217 Walnut Street (<u>LM-23-02</u>) as a City of Jacksonville Landmark.